In what ways does the creativising of central Auckland reveal the workings of Bormann’s (1973) shared fantasy themes?

Stephanie R. Macmillan
No suits allowed: In what ways does the creativising of central Auckland reveal the workings of Bormann’s (1973) shared fantasy themes?

Stephanie Rachel Macmillan

A thesis submitted to the Auckland University of Technology in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Communication Studies.

2014

School of Communication Studies
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ATTESTATION OF AUTHORSHIP ...................................................................................... 5

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .................................................................................................... 6

ABSTRACT .......................................................................................................................... 7

1. WELCOME TO THE CREATIVE AGE ........................................................................ 9
   1.1 Auckland and the creative city concept ................................................................. 11
   1.2 Enlarging the research concept ............................................................................ 15
   1.3 Thesis outline ....................................................................................................... 16

2. EXPLORING THE CREATIVE CITY CONCEPT .......................................................... 17
   2.1 The retirement of the assembly line ................................................................. 17
   2.2 Florida and the popularisation of creativity ...................................................... 19
   2.3 The new class ..................................................................................................... 24
   2.4 Post-modernism and the Knowledge Wave Conference .................................. 30
   2.5 New Zealand and the creative city dream ......................................................... 31

3. THE BEDROCK OF THE CREATIVE CITY ................................................................. 33
   3.1 Policy and the making of the creative city ....................................................... 33
   3.2 Place, space and time in the creative city ....................................................... 36
   3.3 Creative city, creative identity ......................................................................... 44

4. SYMBOLIC CONVERGENCE THEORY IN ACTION ................................................... 50
   4.1 Origins and purpose of symbolic convergence theory ..................................... 52
   4.2 Underlying assumptions in symbolic convergence theory ............................. 53
   4.4 Basic concepts .................................................................................................... 54
       Fantasy theme analysis ......................................................................................... 55
       Symbolic cues ...................................................................................................... 55
       Fantasy Type and Saga ....................................................................................... 56
4.5 Dramatic Structural Concepts ........................................................................... 56
Dramatising ............................................................................................................. 57
Rhetorical vision .................................................................................................... 58
Action ...................................................................................................................... 59
Shared group consciousness ................................................................................ 59
Rhetorical vision reality link ................................................................................ 60
Fantasy theme artistry .......................................................................................... 60

4.6 Tracking a rhetorical vision: methodology becomes method ......................... 60
Finding the archive ............................................................................................... 61
Working with the corpus ....................................................................................... 61

5. BUILDING CREATIVE AUCKLAND ................................................................. 65

5.1 Dramatic Structural Concepts ........................................................................... 66
Dramatis personae .................................................................................................. 67
Master analogue ...................................................................................................... 68
Sanctioning agent .................................................................................................. 69
Scene ....................................................................................................................... 70
Plotline .................................................................................................................... 71

5.2 Basic Concepts - The Reports: Towards Shared Consciousness ...................... 73
The Crisis – Concept One: Thinking our way into the future ................................ 74
Creative Economy – Concept Two: The real assets of the modern economy will
come out of our heads .............................................................................................. 76
Creative Class – Concept Five: People in the creative sector have highly
transferable skills .................................................................................................... 79
Creative City – Concept 10: A chance to refresh our economic paradigm ......... 85

5.3 Critical Evaluation Concepts ............................................................................. 87
Fantasy theme artistry ............................................................................................ 87
Shared group consciousness ................................................................. 90
Rhetorical vision reality link ................................................................. 92

6. AUCKLAND: CREATIVE BUT NOT ORGANIC ............................................. 93
   6.1 Limitations and recommendations for further research ......................... 94
   6.2 Auckland’s creatification ..................................................................... 95
   6.3 Rhetorical vision in practice .................................................................. 99
   6.4 Symbolic Convergence Theory ............................................................ 101

REFERENCES ................................................................................................. 104

APPENDICES ................................................................................................. 122
   Appendix A: Quality of living index .......................................................... 122
   Appendix B: Auckland’s creative budget ............................................... 129
   Appendix C: Auckland’s creative wards ................................................. 133

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1: Visual representation of symbolic convergence theory ..............54
Figure 5.1: Victoria Park Market website homepage display ........................83
Figure 5.2: Victoria Park Market website homepage display ........................83

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: Summary of coding sheets .......................................................64
ATTESTATION OF AUTHORSHIP

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person (except where explicitly defined in the acknowledgements), nor material which to a substantial extent has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institute of higher learning.

Stephanie Macmillan
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I was introduced to the creative city by the School of Communication Studies during my undergraduate studies of creative industries at AUT. I remember the moment I realised this is where my passion was and appreciate that AUT facilitated this important insight for me.

Thank you to my family, friends and colleagues for the support you have given me.

To my supervisor, Dr Frances Nelson. The kindness you have shown me, the wisdom, guidance and experience you have shared with me so freely and often is greatly appreciated.
ABSTRACT

Against the backdrop of the failing extractive era, global economies are given a salvation: creativity.

The concepts of the creative economy, the creative class who produce the creative economy, and the creative city that houses the creative class, are the three factors a buoyant contemporary economy must have in order to be based on the knowledge, ideas and technological output of people.

The rejuvenation of certain areas of central Auckland, New Zealand, exhibit telltale signs of following the ideas laid out by scholars who introduced the creative city concept. (Florida, 2002, 2005, 2007, 2009; Landry, 2000). Because of my familiarity with these works, and because I am in Auckland city every day, I often wondered about a link between what I was witnessing happening to my city, the concept of the creative city, and the globally growing desire for a creative economy. This thesis is my amalgamation and analysis of these subjects.

Vital to the success of the creative city are creative people being creative. Their creative output represents the commercial productivity on which the creative
economy is based. In order to grow, a creative city needs to attract and retain creative people.

A handful of cities around the world possess the creative tools that make them organically creative, for example San Francisco and Paris (Florida, 2002). Other cities, such as Auckland, must become creative inorganically, through policy intervention. As a part of this intervention process, there are numerous elements that must be included in research such as community, space, place, time, creative infrastructure, and commercial viability.

In order to establish whether there was a link between the theories of the creative city and the city of Auckland I used Bormann’s (1972) symbolic convergence theory to chain the key concepts of the creative city to ideas identified in Auckland City Council documents that promoted policies of working towards a shared rhetorical vision of Auckland having an economy that is based on creativity. The three key reports I focused on were Starkwhite (2002), Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2007). Four areas of central Auckland were identified as precincts targeted to become manufactured creative areas. Fantasy theme analysis allowed me to link successfully the concepts laid out in Landry (2002) and Florida’s (2003) introductory ideas to aspects of the Starkwhite, Snapshot and Blueprint reports, and then to link them again to the real life examples of development in Auckland city today.
1. WELCOME TO THE CREATIVE AGE

The chief function of the city is to convert power into form, energy into culture, dead matter into the living symbols of art, biological reproduction into social creativity.

Lewis Mumford

This thesis records my systematic examination of the flows of official\(^1\) communication that “creativised” a small, particular part of the material world, the central business district (CBD) of Auckland. My research applies Bormann’s (1972; 1973; 1982) theory of symbolic convergence to a range of policy documents produced by the Auckland City Council during the decade from 2002 to 2012. In the abstract, my research will show the way groups respond to a perceived crisis, and how they use the impetus gained from powerful shared symbols to change their social and (in this case) their material world. In the specific, my thesis will record the implementation of policy to develop Auckland as a “creative city”, following the model promulgated by Florida (2002, 2004, 2005, 2009) in his influential books: ‘The rise of the creative class: And how it’s transforming work, leisure, community and everyday life’ (2002), ‘Cities and the creative class’ (2004), ‘The flight of the creative class: The new global competition for talent’ (2005), and ‘Who’s your city?: How the creative economy is making where to live the most important decision of your life’ (2009).

\(^1\) By “official”, I am referring specifically to documents compiled on behalf of, and published by, the Auckland City Council. These include the reports Starkwhite (2002), Snapshot (2005), and Blueprint (2007).
The origins of the research project

Because my main interest is in group communication patterns, there is a sense in which I could have chosen almost any case study and have been perfectly satisfied with the research. However, I am in Auckland’s CBD every day, and I have been fascinated by its slow transformation into the image of a “creative city” (Florida, 2002; Landry, 2000). My interest in my immediate environment led me to maintain a more than casual reading of press releases and media coverage of the central city projects, and by degrees, I began an increasingly forensic examination of the Council’s cascade of policy documents and the visions compressed within them. I began to observe the connections between the words in the documents and the making of the physical world around me. The systematic communication of the Council’s vision for central Auckland, expressed in reports, policies and plans, combined my interest in communication and the cityscape I move through daily, and accordingly, I developed a research question that would allow me to frame the changing city within Bormann’s (1972, 1973; 1982) methodology. The question which this research sets out to answer is therefore, “In what ways does the creativising of central Auckland reveal the workings of Bormann’s (1973) concept of shared fantasy themes?”

My research question is based on an assumption, namely that the major works carried out in the Auckland CBD (commencing in 2008 with the Britomart Precinct, at an estimated cost of $350 million for this corner of the city alone (Bingham, 2008)) have been a drive towards building a creative precinct, or to use my neologism, to “creativise” the inner city. When I saw the developments in Aotea Square, the newly created “shared” pedestrian and vehicle spaces such as those around the Auckland City Library, and the stylish refurbishing of the Auckland War Memorial Museum, the Auckland Art Gallery and the Britomart Precinct, I could not help but wonder, as any ratepayer might, what reasons the Council had to spend
money so lavishly on those projects when there are pressing infrastructure needs such as transport, housing and so on. Growing, therefore, from my observations of my rapidly and purposively changing city, my research is grounded in the concept of the “creative city”, which is argued both in academic literature and policy initiatives as being more than merely an urban area that happens to contain some expressions of creativity. In terms of this research, the “creative city” is a concept that is about the creation of wealth and well-being for all citizens by attracting the “creative class” (Florida, 2002, XV), whose harnessed talent will create sustainable economic advantage.

1.1 Auckland and the creative city concept

A city is more than merely a physical happenstance of buildings, roads and parks. It is also a cultural, and sometimes, often perhaps, a spiritual construct. As Sheldrake (2006) points out, cities are now the places where the large majority of the world’s population carry out the engagements and functions of everyday life. He contends that as a consequence of this profound urbanisation of the human race, cities should be designed to address not just practical matters such as food supply, clean water, sanitation and trade, but also “deeper questions of meaning and purpose” (p. 107). The words from Mumford with which I opened this chapter portray cities as organisms in a constant state of becoming, and for Mumford that “becoming” is powered by creativity. For Auckland’s policy makers, the dogma of Florida’s “creative city” seems to have answered questions about how to develop a city in more than a merely mechanical way: creativising appears to be about not just the cosmetic appearance of the city, but also about the material world and the human stories that can be told in it (Sheldrake, 2006).

The Auckland CBD has been going through a process of systematic creativising to enhance and emphasise the creativity that was already there (Florida, 2002), and
also to develop and attract new forms of creativity. The CBD may or may not be on its way to becoming a creative city (or at least a creative precinct within a wider environment of Greater Auckland). The results of the Council’s efforts have yet to be measured. What can now be said, however, is that if the Auckland CBD can indeed be placed among the creative cities of the world, it has not earned its place because of organic development.

Florida’s (2002) work provided the rationale for the concept of the inorganically creative city. He classifies the organically creative cities as those in which economic stability and success have been based on naturally occurring “organic” creative output such as arts, fashion and theatres, without deliberate policy intervention to enhance the creativity of the city. His examples of organically creative cities include San Francisco, Paris and London. The creative energy of these cities marks them out in particular ways: San Francisco with its high-end, demanding technology industry in Silicon Valley; Paris with its centuries of dominating the creative worlds of luxury couture and perfume; London with its long West End history of theatre. This is not, of course, even an attempt at a definitive list of “organic” creative cities. It is more an attempt to unpack Florida’s (2002) argument that extravagant, successful and economically valuable creative activity has sometimes occurred in localised pockets. That “outbreak” of creativity has then attracted other artisans and businesses with complementary skills (Porter, 2000), and in this way a city becomes “organically” creative.

Landry (2000) and Florida (2002, 2005, 2009) see creative cities as desirable, because the “creative class” (Florida, 2002, p. 68) that populates them will hold the power to build new forms of economic stability when the extractive economies fail and all that is left is ingenuity and innovation. This may seem an overstatement, but there is a sense of almost evangelistic fervour about the concept of moving cities along some spectrum from the non-creative and chiefly industrial at one end, to vibrant, artistic city scenes full of innovation and creativity at the other.
Certainly, many cities around the world, faced with the downturn in their traditional industrial sources of wealth, have leapt on the “creativising” bandwagon in the hopes that if they build a creative city, wealth will come. Several cities, including but not limited to Melbourne (Yigitcanlar, O’Connor & Westerman, 2008), Detroit (Florida, 2002), Quebec and Catalonia (Bonet, Colbert & Courchesne, 2011) have adopted variations of Florida’s creative city suggestions. Thus a city that is not “organically” creative can be made creative by various inorganic means, such as policy intervention, redistribution of resources, and refocusing on driving the creative industries within a city (Florida, 2002, p. 298).

The same thinking that says that a city can be made creative (Florida, 2002) proposes that the creative city will be inhabited by a new type of worker: the “creative class” (p. 68), whose work requires them to identify and solve problems using ingenuity and creativity (Florida, 2002; Hubbard, 2006; Landry, 2000; Markusen & Shrock, 2006). The talents of the creative class are seen as essential to overcoming the looming problems of economic downturns, environmental issues, and dependence on manufacturing goods from non-renewable resources (Clark, 2001; Hesmodhalgh, 2002; Tauss, 2012; Tonkiss, 2006). The knowledge and creativity of the new class are being touted as the key to building a strong base in contemporary economies, principally because knowledge, ideas and creativity are promoted as needing very little capital. In the economy of the creative city, people are the most valuable commodity, not for physical labour, as in the service sector, but for their inexhaustible brain power. As Clark (2001) pointed out, people and their ideas, will never run out. The deliberate and focused “creativising” of Auckland, then, seems to be connected to notions of a newly creative economy with promises of financial benefits from investing in the creative industries.

Florida’s (2002) work provided the rationale for the concept of the inorganically creative city. In ‘The rise of the creative class’, he argues that it is no accident that some cities have higher levels of creative workers in their population. He studied
what causes creatives to cluster, and produced a list of preferences that almost constitutes a guide to ‘How to develop a creative city’ that is confidently underpinned by the refrain that ‘If you build it, they will come’. The consequence of this refrain is, of course, that if you do not build it, they will not come, or at least, they will not stay. It is part of Florida’s (2002) hypothesis that creative individuals will not remain in an unappealing, unsupportive locale; it is easy to relocate to somewhere that does offer the attributes of a creative city. If the end goal of creativising is a buoyant economy, then, according to Florida (2002), creative people need to become an integral part of society and of the “creative city”, bringing the associated economic benefits to their chosen area.

It is this aspect of Florida’s (2002, 2004, 2005, 2009) theories that interests me: the city and the methodical production of urban features that might attract creatives to the area. As I have already said, according to Florida, if it is built, the creatives will come (or stay, if they are already here), attracted by the bright colours, enhanced accessibility, rejuvenation of historical buildings, and a renewed focus on the arts. My view is that the redevelopment projects in central Auckland, such as the upgraded Aotea Square, the renovated Auckland City Library, the redesigned Auckland Art Gallery and the rejuvenated Britomart Precinct, are the outcome of New Zealand’s overriding goal of creating a strong economy based on creativity (Clark, 2001), and that the creative city concept is being deployed. I contend that the argument about how to build a creative city falls within what Bormann (1982, p. 52) called a ‘fantasy theme’. A fantasy theme is a story about characters with an envisioned future. Florida’s (2002) argument that a creative economy will be the new defining criteria of a successful city is the envisioned future, while the new ‘creative class’ are the characters of the creative city story. I will explore Florida’s work with particular reference to the recent redevelopment of the Auckland CBD with the aim of showing how a fantasy theme has been enacted to generate a creative economy in an identifiably creative city.
1.2 Enlarging the research concept

Since the early 2000s, Richard Florida has arguably been the most popular pundit of the concept of creativity as a means of maintaining wealth and economic vigour in the age of the knowledge economy. Florida’s writings (2002, 2004, 2005, 2009, 2010) invented and defined the creative class and popularised the creative city. His theories have proven so appealing that city, state and national governments around the world have consulted with him and used his ideas as the basis of policy (University of Texas at Arlington, The Atlantic Start-up City, Halifax Regional Municipality, Creative Class, 2002). This is why I have focused so heavily on his publications in this chapter and throughout my thesis.

As I have already indicated, I will use Bormann’s (1973) fantasy theme analysis as my mode of inquiry. One of the key focuses of fantasy theme analysis is the examination of the communication that spreads a rhetorical vision developed by a single individual or a small group. A key tenet of fantasy theme analysis is that the initial rhetorical vision, or shared fantasy theme, must be very persuasive or it will not spread. It has to appeal to people so that they believe the message and in turn help to spread it. Bormann’s (1973) fantasy theme analysis states that fundamentally a rhetorical vision is born out of a moment of crisis, or when a crossroads has been reached, and a new direction is unclear. In relation to this research, I propose that the moment of crisis is the putative ending of the extractive economy era and the danger to the stability of the global economy.

I have already alluded to Florida’s (2002) insistence that “if you build it, they will come”, and this refrain is a good example of Bormann’s (1973) shared fantasy theme. Building it so they will come has become the driving idea of several of the Auckland City Council’s policies for the development of the inner city (Auckland City Council, 2006, 2009a, 2009b, 2010a, 2010b, 2011, 2012a, 2012b, 2013a, 2013b. Waterfront Auckland, 2012). Fantasy theme analysis offers a methodology that
allows any idea to be tracked from its beginning in a moment of crisis, through its communicative life and on to its outcomes and effects.

1.3 Thesis outline
Following this introductory chapter, chapter two provides background information relevant to the ideas touched on in describing the concept of the creative city, creative class and the creative economy. This includes discussing economic shifts that have occurred in recent history, giving creativity the option it has to become the foundation of contemporary fiscal security, further research into the creative industries, and the introduction of the concepts of the creative economy, the creative city and the creative class to Auckland and to New Zealand. Chapter three is a more intensive review of the existing academic literature surrounding my emerging key themes, including cultural policy and policy intervention, the relationships of space, place and time, and national identity and the imagined community. Chapter four explains my methodology of symbolic convergence theory, leading into chapter five where I apply my methodology to selected published texts. In chapter six I will address all the ideas I have explored, and the conclusions reached in previous chapters will be drawn together. I will also answer my research question, explore any limitations of my research that I may have found, and provide any recommendations for further research.
2. EXPLORING THE CREATIVE CITY CONCEPT

From their earliest origins, cities have exhibited a conspicuous capacity both to generate culture in the form of art, ideas, styles, and ways of life, and to induce high levels of economic innovation and growth, though not always or necessarily simultaneously. (Scott, 2000, p. 2)

What Scott (2000) describes here is the basis for the creative city. By introducing economic discussions, Scott directs focus to the main goal of this research: to explore whether, by generating creativity, a city can enjoy “high levels of economic innovation and growth” (p. 2). This chapter will explore the development of the economic city throughout Fordism, the post-industrial crisis, further discussion of the creative city, and the eventual recognition of the creative economy in New Zealand via the Knowledge Wave Conference in 2001.

2.1 The retirement of the assembly line

As mentioned in my opening chapter, it is my belief that the concept of the creative economy, and therefore that of the creative city, was developed from a moment of crisis in recent history, namely the end of the extractive economy. In the 1920s the global economies and the manufacturing industry went through a systematic change
with the introduction and development of Fordism. It is important to explore the basis for the crossroads reached before the creative economy philosophy was developed in order to understand the reasoning, thoughts and importance behind it.

Fordism refers to “the mode of industrial organisation which came to characterise advanced capitalist economies” (Tonkiss, 2006, p. 88). Original Fordism developments date back to the early 20th century and are based on the production practices of Henry Ford. His car factory in Detroit, Michigan is an often cited example (Tonkiss, 2006). The composition of Fordism is based in mass production line created goods, and has become a social structure and political policy reference (Tonkiss, 2006, p. 87). Harvey (1990, as cited in Tonkiss, 2006, p. 88) suggests Fordism began when Henry Ford introduced his 9 to 5 working day in 1914 for his Ford factory workers. The standardising and routinisng of the manufacturing process provides “a model for what would become a more general form of industrial organisation on a number of levels” (Tonkiss, 2006, p. 88). The mass production of Ford’s assembly lines replaced specialised, smaller manual production options. This paradigm shift demonstrates the increased economic power of large-scale corporations (Tonkiss, 2006; Tauss, 2012). Mechanisation and division of labour allowed Ford successfully to produce more in less time and with less cost. This in turn lowered the price of commodities, allowing a larger market to enjoy accessibility to Ford’s cars. The level of efficiency demonstrated by Ford’s factories allowed the assembly line production system quickly to be adopted throughout the world. During the post World War 1 period this system enjoyed an especially robust period of growth. Fordism quickly evolved from being a developmental production process and became more a way of life (Tonkiss, 2006; Tauss, 2012).

By the mid-1970s the Fordism movement hit a crisis point. Fordism was based heavily on national markets and relied on the relationship between domestic production and the domestic consumption. The oil shock, along with the rise of multinationals and deregulation in the 1970s, undermined the processes Fordism had built and stabilised
(Glyn, 1990; Tauss, 2012; Tonkiss, 2006). This, together with an increasing number of economic competitors, triggered what would become the crisis of Fordism, namely the retirement of mass production and eventually an “increased emphasis on non-tangible resources” of larger corporations and firms (Hasemondhalgh, 2002, p7. Tauss, 2012). This development is the ‘crisis point’ Bormann (1973) states all rhetorical visions are born from. The end of Fordism and the industrial revolution produced a crossroads regarding what actions were necessary to ensure economic longevity.

2.2 Florida and the popularisation of creativity

It is against the backdrop of the (arguably) failing Fordism that Florida offers up the creative industries as the solution to the economic ‘crossroads’ faced by global economies following the downturn of the industrial era. This is the first indication of the development of the rhetorical vision for the creative economy (Bormann, 1973). Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) both consider knowledge to be society’s most valuable resource and a key tool to aid development of a successful and regenerative economy. Accordingly, they assert that economies of the future will no longer be based solely on capital resources, natural resources or human labour but will be successfully rebuilt around knowledge. That said, Florida suggests that the term knowledge-economy should in fact be retitled to ‘creative economy’, as he argues that knowledge and information are the tools of creativity and that innovation is their product.

In order to have a creative economy, there must exist a creative city to house it. Cities have traditionally been negatively stereotyped as dirty, dangerous, and crime-ridden urban areas, but in the age of creativity Landry (2002) suggests that cities should be reconceptualised according to their capacity for innovation. To be ‘truly’ creative then, cities need to meet seven preconditions, which are networking dynamics, local identity, personal qualities, will and leadership, human diversity and
access to varied talent, urban spaces and facilities, and organisational culture\(^2\). The inclusion of just a few of these factors is said to stimulate and inspire creative people to generate new ideas, but cities will operate better and maximise their creative output when they are all present. Such a position has prompted Florida (2002, p. 11) to define a creative city as “regions that offer a variety of economic opportunities, a stimulating environment and amenities for every possible lifestyle”. His definition hinges on the belief that the ‘ideal’ creative city possesses talent, tolerance and technology; new categories which, nevertheless, encompass Landry’s (2000) initial seven conditions. The perspectives of both Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) have led Hubbard (2006) to conclude that cities have the potential to be efficient producers of creative-based economic ideas and activity, provided cities and their businesses are willing to embrace the creative class.

However a critique of this is that Florida has ignored traditional economic development indicators in the evolving of his own ideas (Donegan et al, 2008). The traditional factors used to explain and predict economic growth may have been neglected by Florida and those he has overexcited in the rush to adopt his philosophies. Factors such as “educational attainment, total population size, industrial mix and measures of entrepreneurship” (Donegan et al, 2008, p. 181) have been glossed over and, as Donegan et al claim, no city “has demonstrated that attracting the creative class drives regional growth more effectively” (p. 181) than these factors listed above. Donegan et al and Malanga (2004) base much of their critical argument of Florida’s claims on the studies he conducted. They criticise the cities he has selected to use as successful examples of the creative city and suggest

---

\(^2\) Networking dynamics: Physical areas lending themselves to networking.
Local identity: A sense of belonging to a group or groups. Closely linked with national identity and relation to place.
Personal qualities: Certain characteristics of creatives.
Will and leadership: Personality traits of those who are encouraging creativity and change.
Human diversity and access to varied talents: The stereotypical descriptions of creatives and how a ‘creative’ workplace is designed to get the most out of these workers.
Urban spaces and facilities: Suitable physical areas are provided that will aid, enhance and encourage networking between groups and individuals that otherwise may not cross paths.
Organisational culture: Organisations that encourage ‘creative’ workplaces. (Landry, 2000, p. 105)
that the economic success of these cities is due to more factors than that they are “creative”. The issue here is that “there are radically different views of what culture can do for a city” (Griffiths, 2006). While these claims relate to what I am doing, I am interested in the underlying theory of the creative city. Auckland, like other cities around the world has adopted many of the ideas Florida has put forward, and I am interested in how this has led Auckland to evolve. What works in Auckland may not work somewhere else therefore I am focusing on the theory of the creative city and not the results of Florida’s case studies of inorganic creative cities.

To explore a separate case study that builds on Landry (2000) and Florida’s (2002) conceptualisations of creative cities, Yigitcanlar, O’Connor and Westerman (2008) analysed the city of Melbourne, Australia, to define what made it a ‘knowledge city’. Their work, carried out in 2008 when there was a “rapid evolution of the ‘knowledge city’ concept from early articulations of the ‘technopolis’ and ‘ideapolis’ into the ‘digital, intelligent or smart city’” (p. 63), found that to achieve “more viable, vibrant, and sustainable form of urban development” (p. 63) policy makers needed to encourage and cultivate local ideas, entrepreneurship and innovation as well as creativity to aid the knowledge economy and local society (p. 63, 2008). They concluded that knowledge cities (the equivalent of Florida’s creative cities) required “knowledge corridors, knowledge harbours, knowledge villages and knowledge religions” (Yigitcanlar et al, 2008, p. 64), and determined that Melbourne typified the knowledge city because it provided and encouraged a knowledge base, industrial structure, quality of life, urban diversity, accessibility social equity and inclusion, and because of the scale of the city.

3 Knowledge base: including educational institutions and R & D activities;
Industrial Structure: affects progress and initial development of a knowledge city;
Quality of life and urban amenities: ensures a knowledge city has necessary elements knowledge workers are attracted to build a strong knowledge base;
Urban diversity and cultural pix: as in instrument in encouraging creativity;
Accessibility: encourages and facilitates the transfer and movement of knowledge;
A guide of ‘how to’ construct environments where creatives will physically want to be, and that will mentally and emotionally stimulate them to become more productive in their creative output, was consequently developed by Yigitcanlar et al, (2008), yet as Flew (2013) points out there is “no single business or production model that encompasses all of the creative industries sectors: nor are they sectors that typically speak with a common voice” (p. 3). By its very nature creativity is undefinable, subjective, and unique, which suggests that attempts to quantify something that follows no method or equation guidelines are futile. In other words, local councils and governments can seek to emulate what is posited in these lists for ‘ideal’ creative cities but they can never be completely sure that their efforts will eventuate in the desired goal of social and economic improvement. Compounding the issue further is that these lists lack definitive suggestions about how a city might, for instance, practise “tolerance, diversity and innovation” (2005, p. 403). Despite these limitations “urban areas are racing ahead to brand themselves as creative cities” (Leslie, 2005, p. 403).

An additional problem with urban development strategies is that they can have the unwanted effect of creating homogenised cities “rather than preserving what distinguishes them from other cities” (Carr & Servon, 2009, p. 28; Prince, 2009). In the quest for economic development ‘amenity-based’ strategies are being adopted by competing cities in the hopes of “not only making themselves more attractive places for industry to locate, but by offering amenities that continue to attract new residents” (Carr & Servon, 2009, p.28). Carr and Servon identify the issue here as being how to manage to create these cities without compromising or losing the ‘vernacular culture’ already found in these places. You can build whatever you want, and call it whatever you like but what the space becomes to people and how

Social equity and inclusion: minimizes social disparity and negative tensions;
Scale of a city: larger knowledge cities may tend to offer a greater knowledge pool, greater diversity and choice for knowledge workers and businesses. (Yigitcanlar et al, 2008, p. 64)
the public use it will inevitably dictate what it is. Local councils and governments provide the physical structures in an area that are triggers for creative growth. Inevitably they can never be completely sure that this will work but they can put amenities in place that will help to achieve their desired goal.

The two characteristics of will and leadership are identified as key to any situation of change and progression, including the quest for the creative city, and this suggests that cities need both innovative and visionary leaders (Landry, 2000). Leaders “must develop a story of what their creative city could be and how to get there” (Landry, 2000, p. 109). With successful leaders, cities will find themselves in a situation of change and progress, and closer to achieving the end goal of a creative city. As Landry points out in his purpose of research, he hopes the reader will take away information and start to implement the key concepts of the creative city into their own working and personal daily lives. Thus he is using the influence his readers may have over their community, social and work groups, and his readers’ skill of re-telling a story, to maximise the chance of more individuals hearing about the creative city and in turn, telling the story themselves, in keeping with Bormann’s (1973) fantasy theme analysis. Additionally, Landry (2002) hopes to ignite debate amongst policy makers and in this situation will and leadership are both critical skills. An example in New Zealand is the then Prime Minister Helen Clark appointing herself Minister of the Arts and following this ignited debate, for example by organising the Knowledge Wave Conference in 2001 and developing the subsequent policies (Starkwhite 2002; Snapshot 2005; Blueprint 2007). If this is a direct result of Landry’s (2000) philosophy is unknown, but the outcome has still had the desired result.

Similar to Landry’s claims that will and leadership are key characteristics for city leaders wanting to instigate change, personal qualities also play an important role (Landry, 2000). It is important to understand creative workers as individuals and what their personal strengths and skills are according to Landry. To recognise the
talents of those who inhabit the city is to use their skills to maximise effect and efficient output. Landry discusses the merit of identifying individuals in an organisation, industry or city and using their skills for specific tasks in which their skill-set lies. Having the skilled people in areas that suit them will create better communication and output levels. An example of this is a band of musicians hiring a financial adviser to manage their business. This way the band’s income is tracked carefully and can be reinvested if they so wish, creating more revenue for the industry, and creating a successful business using the creative product of the music produced.

2.3 The new class

The creative class is a concept that is introduced in Florida’s first published book ‘The Rise of the Creative Class’ (2002). Here, Florida aims to investigate growth within the industries he dubs as ‘creative’, the industries that will provide the economic stability for the future. Along with growth of the creative industries, there will develop a new class of individuals who work within these industries. This new creative class is made up of individuals who use creativity to produce economic output. Florida deepens his description of the creative class with the explanation that there is a concentrated core of super creatives, made up of those who work in “science and engineering, architecture and design, education, arts, music and entertainment, [and] whose economic function is to create new ideas, new technology and/or new creative content” (p. 102).

Not only does Florida contend that the knowledge economy be considered a creative economy but, as previously explored, Florida also suggests that it is accompanied by the emergence of a new and growing group of people he refers to as the “creative class” (p. 8). Florida describes the emergence of the new social class he claims will appear along with the development of the creative city: “As with other classes, the defining basis of this new class is economic. … Only by understanding the rise of this new class and its values can we begin to understand
the sweeping and seemingly disjointed changes in our society and begin to shape
our future more intelligently” (Florida, 2002, p. xxvii). Armed with the knowledge
that the creative class move around, and seek to live and work in an environment
that not only accepts their creativity but embraces and encourages it (Florida, 2002,
2005), governments, regional councils and businesses have attempted to rebrand
as ‘creative friendly’. For instance, organisations that perceive creativity to offer a
competitive advantage and financial success have amended their management
strategies to afford the creative class more autonomy and flexible work
environments, in the hopes of acquiring and keeping creative talent (Amabile,
cities must offer a variety of economic opportunities, a stimulating environment
and amenities for every possible lifestyle.

Despite many of these ‘rebrands’ essentially producing uniform and standardised
methods of enticing creative talent (Florida, 2002), some cities for instance San
Francisco and Silicon Valley, have become economically successful by luring
creative workers to the area and then capitalising on their creative output. Such
developments have led Landry (2000) to conclude that creative cities “seem to have
made economic and social development work for them”.

The ‘super creative core’ (Florida, 2002, p. 69) includes cultural figures, analysts and
opinion makers. Florida defines the highest order of creative work as “producing
new forms or designs that are readily transferable and widely useful ... along with
problem solving, their work may entail problem finding: not just building a better
mouse trap, but noticing first that a better mouse trap would be a handy thing to
have” (Florida, 2002, p. 69). Similar to Landry’s description of creatives and the
characteristics and skill set they have, Florida (2002) states that creative individuals
can also add a creative value. More and more organisations and councils are
valuing creativity for “the results that it can produce and individuals value it as a
route to self-expression and job satisfaction” (Florida, 2002, p. 71). Florida suggests
that society depends on the creative class comprised of people who engage in “complex problem solving that involves a great deal of independent judgment and requires high levels of education or human capital”, (2002, p. 8). He lauds these people as the hope for a bright economic future in a world facing the loss of traditional wealth sources such as timber, coal and oil. Of course, Florida’s decision to segregate according to classes ultimately creates a sense of exclusivity (Leslie, 2005), which is later undermined when he suggests that anyone has the potential to be a member of the creative class, through their initiative and innovation (Peck, 2005). Nevertheless, the labelling of the economy and this distinct group of people as ‘creative’ has led to a range of economic and social impacts, including rebrands.

This discussion highlights the growing opinion that ‘creative’ workers are one of the most valuable tools of the growing economy. By identifying what creative workers can bring to industries at an output and produce point of view, the reader starts to get an idea of why a creative city is important to help the local economy. Florida discusses the side effect the growth of the creative class has on the service sector. With the freedom of work hours and work places that creatives are afforded, they can end up working unsocial and unpractical hours, so they need one or more people to ‘take care of them’. Housekeepers and gardeners, for example, may be hired as creative workers and may find it hard to keep on top of these tasks themselves. These tasks are very autonomous and require little to no creativity. The creative class is therefore boosting other aspects of the economy alongside their actual creative work (Florida, 2002).

Creativity, the ‘product’ of the creative class, is erected as the future of wealth creation and security. Despite Florida’s boosterish claims however, nine years on this definition can be strongly contested (as this is a long period of time for a definition such as the creative class to change), but it is where Florida began his explanation of creativity as a fiscally imperative tool for future economic developments. In his attempts to explain and define the creative industries, Florida does not actually give an
example in the traditional sense of the word ‘industry’. Rather, what he has discussed is individuals pulled haphazardly from many different faculties, based on their day to day tasks and job descriptions. Flew (2005) acknowledges the difficulty in giving a clear and exact definition of the term creative industries, and that one of the given difficulties is that there is no “single business or production model that encompasses all of the creative sectors; nor are they sectors that typically speak with a public voice” (p. 3). The true and exact definition of the creative industries, and indeed the name creative industries, can be debated heavily in small detail. However, it is broadly accepted that the creative industries are those that fall within the slightly wider terms of heritage, arts, media and functional creations (Flew, 2005, p. 5).

Having defined the creative class, Florida (2002) then moves on to focus on studying this new group of people and seeks to understand what inspires them, learn their goals, become educated about where they want to live and why, what they do with their free time, their career patterns and their commitment choices. Florida extends his research information into advice for companies, industries, cities and countries – they can ‘harness and channel’ the creative output from this newly discovered, evolving class in order to efficiently produce creative output. Florida’s images for controlling creativity “channel and harness” which are frequently used in his writing, echo that of an earlier champion of control, Francis Bacon (1620). Bacon is noted for his enthusiasm for the idea of subduing and controlling nature in order to gain wealth (1620). Like nature, creativity has been thought to be free and unfettered. Like Bacon, Florida seeks to bridle and direct creativity. Bacon’s revolutionary ideas can arguably be seen as the original ground work for Florida and Landry (2000) identifying that creativity can be used as an alternative source of economic stability. For this to occur, there must be enough understanding about the subject, be it nature or creativity, resulting in the recognition of certain elements that must exist in order for nature or creativity to be used in a most efficient capacity. It is from this concept that one of the key points for my thesis is derived: will the creativity to which Florida and Landry have dedicated their studies only be realised if these creative people have an environment that allows them to be creative?
This idea is further explored in ‘The Flight of the Creative Class’ (Florida, 2005). This book explores the global recognition of the creative class and subsequent high demand for creatives. Florida discusses the competition between any two entities, including cities, to attract and retain the valuable creatives who will ensure a strong and prosperous economic future. Florida has purposely written his books outlining the key factors needed to attract creatives so that this theory can be applied to any organisation, industry, city, region, state or country. This has provided readers of his work with different options and showed them the way to implement his ideas. This is another reason why I selected the methodology of fantasy theme analysis. It allows me to endeavour to trace Florida’s ideas from his books and articles, down through different organisations, to tangible examples throughout cities all over the world. I will discuss my methodology further in chapter four.

By examining high dwelling urban areas and American cities that have shown an increase in the number of people employed in the creative industries, Florida (2002) identifies three key factors a city must possess in order to attract and retain a creative class: technology, talent and tolerance. Florida argues that cities that celebrate the ‘3-Ts’ are the ones that will have greater economic rewards from exploitation of intellectual property produced by creatives. Technology refers to the use of contemporary technology in both the workplace and home life and the ease of use. Tolerance refers to the way different groups of people are made to feel as though they are one within their communities, and the way different groups with different backgrounds and core beliefs happily and peacefully work and play alongside each other. Civil unions are often used as an example of tolerance within a city. This is potentially not a great example for Auckland city as I hope that the city’s tolerance is far above having issues with the legalisation of same-sex unions. Talent is the third factor because Florida argues that talent attracts more talent. Once a city is known for attracting and keeping creatives, more will follow, creating an environment that includes a creative hub of individuals. Florida suggests that the 3-Ts formula can apply
at the micro, meso and macro levels. In other words, organisations, cities and countries can all profit from his formula. Because my research is concerned only with Auckland city, in this thesis the 3-Ts formula will always refer to the meso level unless stated otherwise.

In 2002, when Florida’s first book was published, the idea of a creative city was new. He has since extended his research significantly, and has looked at cities the world wide, (‘Who’s Your City’, 2008). He ranks the cities he studies based on the 3-Ts and how much they have grown as a creative city. In order to do this, he establishes how creative the cities were in previous years and how creative they are now. The Quality of Living Index published a similar list at the beginning of 2011 (see Appendix A page 122 for full list). The list was based on 221 cities and they were evaluated on 39 factors, including “political, economic, environmental, personal safety, health, education, transportation and other public service factors”. Auckland city was named fourth equal with Vancouver, and followed Vienna, Zurich and Geneva. Although the criteria for this list and the rankings Florida produces differ, the fact that Auckland achieved fourth equal place further justifies my chosen topic and the decision I made to focus on Auckland city as my research area.

As stated above, Florida’s earlier work (2002) is the basis for the idea of the creative city. In ‘The Rise of the Creative Class’ he identifies the growing clusters of creative people, and in his later works he develops this to examine just where it is the creative people dwell, and studies the minute details about these places. The outcome of this is almost a ‘how to develop a creative city’ guide, with a ‘if you build it they will come’ vision. This is the specific aspect of his theories that interests me, and I have looked in depth at Auckland city, using it as a case study, to identify possible factors that may link back to Florida’s fantasy theme theory. Florida’s book “Who’s Your City?” (2005) implores the reader to think about themselves, what is important to them and their needs when selecting a city to live in. It is this area of discussion that helps me place myself into this research. I live in central Auckland, and every day I walk down Queen
Street, Auckland’s busiest street, both to work and to University. I would have to try very hard not to notice that it is an urban area that is changing every day. There are new developments the entire length of the street. Aotea Square, the Auckland Central Library, the Auckland Art Gallery and Britomart Precinct are some examples of Auckland trying to make the central city more creative. According to interviews conducted for the ARC Snapshot report, Auckland city’s creative industries are lacking leadership, creative vision, celebration and infrastructure. The interviews also showed that Auckland needs more markets, development finance, skilled labour and brokers/producers. However customers, collaborators and cultures are ranked as higher than satisfactory (p. 42). These results can be construed as indicative of the current developments throughout the city and the quest to build a more creative Auckland.

2.4 Post-modernism and the Knowledge Wave Conference

Following the post-industrial crisis, the global economy found itself in an undesirably unstable state. At this point the focus began to shift from the traditional manufacturing sector and, as Hesmondhalgh discusses, the creative industries globally became more central to the ‘real’ economy where physical goods and services have historically been produced (2002).

The Knowledge Wave Conference was held at the University of Auckland in August 2001. One of the key reasons given for the conference at the time was the inability of the current economic climate to sustain the current quality of life in New Zealand (University of Auckland, 2001). The conference was designed to bring experts from different industries together, individuals who ordinarily would not cross each other’s paths, in order to discuss and debate the need for economic evolution. As the then Prime Minister Helen Clark described in her opening speech (Clark, 2001), there were obvious reasons for the economic situation we were in. “While others have been transforming their economies and societies through the application of knowledge and innovation, we haven’t kept up with them” (Clark, 2001). Traditionally New Zealand,
like its Commonwealth counterparts, has relied heavily, and based the bulk of economic security and success, on non-renewable natural resources. Throughout previous decades New Zealand’s endowment of natural resources was a suitable base for the country’s economic wellbeing for the immediate future. However, by the end of the 1990s it was becoming clear, as outlined by Helen Clark, that global-warming was not just a popular fad, but a very real problem that New Zealand had to face; the environment could not sustain the level of depletion coupled with great levels of carbon waste. As habitual sources of wealth were being consumed, and non-renewable resources depleted, New Zealand found itself in the uneasy situation of a very unstable economy.

The long reaching side-effects of an unstable economy were also impacting on society by way of fewer jobs and more limited “career prospects and family security”, meaning New Zealand was under-investing in people, their development and social inclusion (Clark, 2001). New Zealand in 2001 had the opportunity to discuss economic options before fiscal crisis hit, which was the primary reason why the Knowledge Wave Conference was organised in the way that it was. Everyone included “knew our country could do better” (Clark, 2001) and came together in order to contribute proposals and visions and discuss how they might be achieved. The New Zealand Government co-sponsored the conference, an initiative which now can be counted as the Government’s first long-term investment in the creative economy and the starting point of the creative city chronicle in New Zealand.

2.5 New Zealand and the creative city dream
While this chapter has referred to New Zealand thus far, this research will focus on Auckland city and the creative industries found in the city. Following on from the Knowledge Wave Conference, Auckland city produced a report introducing the creative city concept and how it would be applied to the city (Starkwhite, 2002). The Snapshot report published in 2005, as a follow up to Starkwhite, suggests and justifies several reasons why Auckland city has been identified as a district deserving of funding
and the dedication of resources, and lists these reasons as ‘important things to know about Auckland’:

- Auckland’s creative industries are concentrated in Auckland city itself;
- Auckland city is the national leader based on creative sector size and employment;
- Auckland city is the fastest growing centre of the creative industries in New Zealand;
- Creative employment in Auckland city is concentrated in the CBD and CBD fringe; and
- Auckland city’s creative sector is a significant contributor to city GDP (Snapshot: Auckland’s creative industries. Understanding our city).

These points are not only used by Snapshot to justify the allocation of resources, but also serve as further reasons why I decided to focus my studies on this area. For the purpose of my research I will define the areas I am studying (see Appendix C page 133 for maps of areas).

The areas of infrastructure I have previously mentioned, (Aotea Square, Auckland Central Library, the Auckland Art Gallery and Britomart Precinct) are examples and indications that the Auckland City Council has recognised the need for shared community places that give all individuals a place where they can go and look for inspiration, or meet up with friends and colleagues, right in the middle of this dense urban area. The Council’s reasons behind these projects will be explored throughout this thesis to try and establish whether these areas are in fact a result of fantasy theory and Florida’s persuasive ideas.
3. THE BEDROCK OF THE CREATIVE CITY

In the weightless knowledge economy, wealth is created by turning data into information, knowledge, even judgement. Competitiveness no longer lies in immobile, physical resources like coal, timber or gold but in highly mobile brain power and creativity. There is less value in labour, even in capital and more in applied creativity as software embeds information in every product transforming every manufacturing and service process (Landry, 2000, p. 33).

Florida’s (2002) belief that human creativity can and will be responsible for creating a stable, healthy and regenerative economy is central to the development of the concept of the creative city. The core assumption leading to his theory, as Landry (2000) states above, is that human creative output from creative individuals and groups will provide creative cities with desirable financial results. This belief has both social and economic implications which will be explored in this chapter.

3.1 Policy and the making of the creative city

In the quest to build the creative city, a place to house the creative class that will produce the creative economy, policy intervention is a key resource used by councils and governments. The term ‘creative industries’ was originally a policy
concept itself, created in the UK in the late 1990s (Prince, 2009, p.3) and has since been adopted by policy actors and is widely used to refer to the commercialisation of the arts (Craik, 2005; Prince, 2009). The notion of creative output having a positive economic effect has elements reminiscent of the Third Way. The Third Way is a political position combining socialism and capitalism, taking the social values of the left, and merging them with the economic goals of the right. While there is no one singular ‘way’, in New Zealand, the Third Way is the “simultaneous embrace of economic dynamism and social cohesion” (Skilling, 2005, p. 21). On the surface it does seem as though the Third Way is similar to a creative economy in that it takes creativity produced by artists and musicians and links it with the economic focus of the right. However while there are similarities, the arts in question are not necessarily representative of truly left wing values. While social accessibility is important, many art endeavours have traditionally been the activities of the privileged, such as opera and theatre (Craik, 2005, p. 8). One of the key debates for governments is to establish why to allocate funds to cultural activities, meaning the issue for the “arts lobby is to demonstrate the democratising effect of cultural funding and refute the claim that cultural funding merely props up the cultural cognoscenti” (Craik, 2005, p. 8). While “ordinary people may respect ‘elite’ art forms...they do not wish to consume them in their everyday lives. This remains the central conundrum for the governments in formulating and implementing cultural policy” (Craik, 2005, p. 8).

In 1963 artistic endeavours were counted among things of the “mind and spirit that helped to mould the greatness of a nation” (Skilling, 2005, p. 20), unifying and enhancing national identity as well as fostering a society rich in artistic endeavours. Cultural policy intervention aiming for accessibility of the arts can help with both social cohesion (Skilling, 2005, p. 20) and economic gains. Florida (2002) and Landry (2000) both discuss these two aspects also, but in terms of using a cohesive and unified society to achieve a creative city, class and therefore creative economy instead of a simultaneous development.
During the period from 1998 to 2002 New Zealand experienced a reversal of neoliberal doctrine, with the creative industries being applauded for their commerciality rather than the “grudgingly state-protected Oliver Twist of market forces” (Lawn, 2006, p. 2), with an increase of NZ$138.2 million as addition funding for the arts (Lawn, 2006, p. 2; Hesmondhalgh & Pratt, 2005). This concept, while new to New Zealand was not a global first, with the Australian Victorian state government in 2003 and the Australian Council both establishing policies aiming for “a culture of participation, an innovative economy and a creative place” (Craik, 2005, p. 10). Alternately, rather than interpreting the rapid and rampant development of cultural policy as a result of the “creative industries being at the frontline of the rising global knowledge economy”, it has been suggested that the globalisation of the creative industries has occurred due to the “complex processes of engagement in political and technical spheres as various policy actors and networks have sought to enrol the concept in their own political projects” (Prince, 2010, p. 1). This ignites the debate of what came first? Did the creative industries organically grow and develop into the knowledge economy, or was policy intervention the reason for inorganic growth of the creative industries thus bolstering the knowledge economy? Or does each city have a different starting point and therefore need different levels of intervention, as Florida (2002) suggests.

The concept of achieving a creative economy by utilising the creative industries was central to Helen Clark’s Labour government, with Clark appointing herself Minister of Culture and Heritage. Soon after Clark and her caucus were elected an attempt at a ‘cultural policy solution’ was made. The ‘Heart of the Nation’ project aimed to make the concept of the creative industries central to its policy solution “through a deep engagement with the methods and practices of the CIMD applied to the New Zealand context”. While this project was rejected government (Lawn, 2006, p. 8), it
is an example of the glocal concept in practice (Prince, 2009, p. 4; Lawn, 2006, p. 8). The Heart of the Nation project took a global concept and tried to apply it locally.

In general, introductory policies around developing the desired creative city, creative economy and creative class are aimed at generating a competitive advantage for creative industries, by crafting clusters in certain areas (Hesmondhalgh & Pratt, 2005). Clusters of likeminded creatives aid each other’s motivation, sense of unity and community and ultimately help to draw other creatives to their area. This manufactured result of policy intervention can be a perceived negative, and introduces the concept of manipulation in terms of the political economy. Once local governments or councils have identified that an increased creative population is something that would benefit them and that they desire, policies are put in place to ensure it happens. It is irrelevant whether this is actually what creative people want, once the infrastructure and area are built, designed with them in mind, they will love it. Creative industries have their competitive advantage and creative people are surrounded by like-minded people. The ‘if you build it they will come’ concept (Florida, 2002) proves to be a shared vision of the cities which are committed to building a creative precinct. But it does, and always will, start by using manipulation as a tool. This is not necessarily a bad thing, but unfortunately the term has negative, dictatorial connotations attached to it.

3.2 Place, space and time in the creative city

In a time where global accessibility of ideas, places and time restraints are rapidly dissolving, between “35 and 70% of international travellers are now considered cultural tourists” (McKercher & du Cros, 2002, p.1 as cited in Carr & Servon, 2009). Neighbourhoods are defined and known by their local culture or ‘vernacular culture’, and it is these features that cultural tourists come to particular areas to visit. These neighbourhoods and spaces with their own strong characteristics have the ability to attract the tourism dollars and pull these cultural travellers to them to
earn more profit. Carr and Servon (2009) state that cultural tourists want to see different types of areas and embrace these neighbourhoods’ quirky characteristics. As certain areas grow in popularity it is a part of the normal progression for city councils to identify these areas and to help them grow and enhance their reputation and appeal to both global and domestic visitors. This concept is similar to the creative city, in that if, by way of policy intervention, the city has spaces designated for creative enhancement, areas that are tailor-made to help networking, motivation and inspiration, they are more likely to attract and retain creative individuals. One of the key challenges that neighbourhoods and organisations face is finding the balance between the global influences and maintaining local identity (Craik, 2005, p. 13). Glocalism is a concept that many different areas are battling, while the increase in technology enables global influences to reach a local level at an exaggerated speed. An additional challenge with this form of policy intervention is to successfully achieve the desired economic, cultural or environmental outcomes, while not losing the individualism and vernacular culture that makes the area unique and possesses the pull factor for tourists.

To address the challenge of maintaining the identity of a place, Carr and Servon (2009) suggest that local planners and policy makers should “consider incorporating an urban economic development agenda based on vernacular culture into their work”, for the following reasons:

1) Neighbourhoods that are rich in individual, local and vernacular culture are generally home to a disproportionate number of small businesses with the ability to grow, while other businesses without the same growth potential serve key niche markets.

2) As discussed above, these neighbourhoods have the ability to attract cultural tourists, who will pour money into the local economies. Local artists and art-friendly spaces will also help to attract cultural tourists, “generating urban income flows that feed back into artists’ livelihoods” (Markusen & Schrock,
The issue then is to use these added resources in a way that will retain and grow the vernacular culture of the area and not detract from their individuality and turn the area ‘mainstream’. As Carr and Servon point out “failure to nurture the authentic flavour of these neighbourhoods will ultimately arrest the cities’ abilities to attract these tourism dollars” (2009, p. 29).

3) Carr and Servon (2009) claim that the economic contribution of “culturally authentic urban neighbourhoods, such as arts districts” (p. 29) are under-recognised and undervalued. This is where the importance of the creative class needs to be stressed, the unique and vibrant neighbourhoods are viable commercial contributors to the creative economy (Craik, 2005).

4) Taking advantage of and preserving a city’s uniqueness can result in one of the identified key goals of a creative city, namely economic competitiveness. “Several researchers make the link between economic competitiveness and playing up a city or region’s uniqueness” (Carr & Servon, 2009, p. 29).

A side effect of the organic gentrification process and enticing creative people into the city by way of the 3-Ts, is that inner city dwellings will slowly be rejuvenated (Florida, 2002). Previously, cities had grown so high-up and been purpose industrial built so that the average office worker would get into their car at the end of the day and drive home to the suburbs (Florida, 2002). At night the streets of the inner-city were dangerous and unattractive, which is what prompts Landry’s (2000) discussion of the dirty and negative reputation of industrial city centres. Florida discusses how the changing dynamics of the family unit, with many more people remaining single for longer and having children later, means they are happier to live in the city than previously. They move into areas that are close to their inner-city jobs with cheap rent – areas that artists and musicians have long inhibited, making them ‘cool’ and ‘edgy’. More and more creative class members seek to individualise themselves and move away from the mainstream, a key way in which they do so is by moving out of suburbia and into these bohemian areas. As these gentrifying areas start to become more popular and in demand with the creative class and their increasing
salaries, local rent prices rise driving out the artists and musicians who created the areas and made them cool.

To use the gentrification in Manhattan as a case study, it was noted (Zukins, 1988 as cited in McGuigan 1996, p. 101) that in this postmodern landscape old, disused industrial buildings were turned into spacious, lofty apartments for artists, later becoming predominantly occupied by advertising executives and stockbroker types. Zukin (1991, as cited in McGuigan, 1996, p. 101) identifies the spending habits of an identified “college educated generation engaged in reflexive consumption” as a crucial part of forming the “taste and ideas of the good life” (McGuigan, 1996, p. 101). This description is comparable with the creative class Florida (2002) lauds as the new ruling cluster of people and power. McGuigan (1996) says this group has the power of forming what is now considered cool and desirable in terms of lifestyle and material goods. This adds emphasis to the importance of the creative class argument Florida has penned and what it all comes back to, the building and stability of the desired creative economy.

There is a continuing debate among authors dedicated to exploring the economic issues surrounding place, space and time. As Sheppard (2002) discusses, due to globalisation there is a growing argument that space is losing out on importance to time. I also see this argument as simultaneously debating the merits and importance of technology versus place. Kirsch (1995) discusses the “dramatic restructuring of space and time in recent decades, associated with new high speed geographies of production, exchange and consumption”. Conversely, Haussmann’s (2001) argument that a country’s geographic location is key to its natural resource endowment, refuses to discuss the developments in technology. Environmental factors such as being landlocked and changing atmospheric pressure bring unique problems to certain countries (Haussmann, 2001), but technology is not affected by either of these important environmental factors. Is this another argument in favour of an intellectually based output strong society? Arguably then, land mass and
location are rendered irrelevant. Markusen (1996) furthers this argument and suggests that as advances in transportation and information “obliterate distance, cities and regions face a tougher time anchoring income-generating activities” (p. 293). This argument is again technology versus the more traditional exporting of local produced goods that Haussmann argues geography is important for. It seems there is an ongoing argument between not only place and time, but authors and economists who are focusing either on traditional economic factors goods and services or those discussing the creative economy and the important this to note is that the two clearly need different things.

With the ease and increasing availability of travel people can readily move to different cities and countries and isolation is no longer a barrier to the creative output (Florida, 2002). However as Hislop (2008) states, the other side of this argument is that technology advances also offer mobile working stations and people can connect with colleagues and clients anywhere in the world. There are two strong sides to the argument of place and the creative economy, however Florida (2002) states that creatives must cluster to become their most efficient producing selves and therefore the creative city is a key tool to building the sustainable creative economy.

Porter, like Markusen and Schrock (2006) and Hislop (2008), questions the importance of location in the wake of technological advancements that now allow developed cities and countries to take many traditional tasks, such as shopping, online. In addition, the developments in technology allow “resources, capital technology, and other inputs” (Porter, 2000, p. 1) to be sourced in the global market. These factors can detract from previously explored arguments that big city living is all important if people want to work in and enjoy the creative industries.
If the city is where creatives need to be in order for their creative output to flourish, Porter (2000) discusses the concept of clusters, and the role they play in locational economics. His definition of an economic cluster is similar to what Markusen and Shrock (2006) allude to with their discussion of clusters of artists as the “geographic concentrations of interconnected companies” (Porter, 2000, p. 1). The existence of clusters, and their strength and size reveal “important insights about the microeconomics of competition and the role of location in competitive advantage” (p. 1). Similar to the discussion above about clusters of artists being in one place and the consequential crossover of different art forms, economic clusters provide the same opportunities such as increased networking, cooperation between competitors for more substantial resources, and higher recognition of this group of individuals’ wants and needs. It is then up to local city councils and governments to identify the benefits of these clusters and put measures in place to retain them (if they already exist in their area), or to look at ways to attract clusters to form.

While the study of clusters has been explored in the literature and the concept lends itself well to my study of the creative city, it has traditionally been used in conjunction with “a broader theory of competition and competitive strategy in a global economy” (Porter, 2000, p. 2). While it is important to recognise that I am not exploring clusters in their entirety they do offer a lot more to locational economics than I have touched on as this broader approach is beyond the scope of my thesis.

A creative milieu, a physical area that is designed to generate the creative flow of ideas and innovation is ideally suited to house ‘clusters’ (Landry, 2002). The area can be a mixture of building clusters that can be a whole city or parts of a city. The goal of the creative milieu is to create an environment where a ‘critical mass’ (Landry, 2000, p. 133) of creative individuals can operate in “an open-minded, cosmopolitan context and where face to face interaction creates new ideas,
artefacts, products, services and institutions and as a consequence contributes to
economic success”.

The term “flaneur” is a concept that, in its traditional understanding, describes the
activity of walking around a city in order to learn about and discover it. It was a
bourgeois class leisure activity popular in the 16th and 17th centuries (Larousse,
1872). Flaneur, allows the character of a city, the personality of the city, the
essence of the city to reveal itself slowly to someone as they gently explore it. This
relationship with the city, I believe, is similar to what Florida claims cities must
capitalise on in order to attract creative individuals into its creative clutches. If a
city, or areas of a city, are able to reveal their personality and individuality to
creatives, those creatives are more likely to form an attachment to the area and
move there, or stay if they are already there.

Flaneur eventually became an architectural style where as people walk along or
through a structure they will be greeted with surprises of style or objects. The
development of architecture immersed in flaneur is a concept which has parallels
with the creative milieu. A space is built with a purpose of creating certain
thoughts, engaging emotions and prompting reactions from the individuals who
inhabit or pass through it. Flaneur is now described as a ‘complex and philosophical
way of living’ which once again echoes the statements of the creative city
ambassadors who claim that entire cities and societies need to adopt and change
the way they live, work and play. Building on the traditional meaning of this term,
there is an emergence, according to Craik, (2005) within global culture of local
communities building and enhancing their own cultural identity and cultural capital.
Bringing culture out of the opera houses and theatres and the Shakespearean
performances, and making it accessible to everyone, “proliferating across cultural
spaces and cultural actors” (p. 13).
These ideas and concepts are now becoming a “mainstay of cultural planning and urban development”. As new communities are developed they are being required not only to provide dwellings, roads and schools but also cultural spaces, local art pieces and “even community newsletters” (Craik, 2005, p. 13). In established areas, such as Auckland’s CBD, there are similar policies being introduced to repurpose areas, upgrade facilities and help enhance the sense of a creative community. Florida touches on the importance of one of the elements of the social needs of creativity, namely introducing a ‘supportive social milieu’ (2002, p. 55). Once again likening creativity to nature, a creative milieu can provide the “underlying ecosystem of habitat in which “multidimensional forms of creativity take root and flourish” (Florida, 2002, p. 55). By supporting the local art scene, lifestyles and cultural institutions, industries, councils and government can help to attract and maintain the desirable creative workers. The creative milieu is also a large factor in cross pollination of ideas, communications of different social groups and business networks (Landry, 2000).

Traditionally cities were core hubs for communication and networking simply because this was where there were large numbers of individuals all clustered together and the technology of the time was limited. Through the development of technology the number of work tasks that can be performed away from the office is continuing to grow. Distance and geography are no longer obstacles to effective communication. New tools allow the virtual office to take a bigger role in contemporary organisations. Public internet access in public areas and increased mobile phone coverage and connectivity speed are also key to adding communication options and furthering networking opportunities. This includes both local and international networking. Another outcome of the technological advances is the communication between overlapping communities and networks that “criss-cross the city” (Landry, 2000, p. 126) generating multiple contacts once again both locally and internationally. These networks are strengthened by the freedom or unleashing provided by the virtual office. Individuals and their creative artefacts can be located virtually anywhere in the world yet group meetings and
communications are still as effective as if everyone were present in the same room. This allows individuals with desired skills to be of benefit even if they live in another country (Landry, 2000, p. 126).

3.3 Creative city, creative identity

The concept of the imagined community refers to groups within an area that individuals identify with (Anderson, 1983). Individuals living in cities and countries will never meet most of the other people they exist with, so they imagine that they have commonalities between them. Events such as the Rugby World Cup and the Olympics help to strengthen these imaginary bonds and allow individuals to identify more strongly with their national identity, once again strengthening the feeling and illusion of the community. A ‘community’, Anderson (1983) argues, can be based on anything that a group of individuals have in common. While general communities are based on locations and national identity, communities can also be based around sexual orientation, work and family life.

Urban renewal, aside from making a city more aesthetically pleasing, has the desirable side effect of creating and enhancing regional identity and thus contributing to national identity. The term ‘national identity’ has a highly debateable meaning, but for the purpose of this research, it is assumed that national identity means the different ways in which individuals can define themselves by the nation, referring to their homeland, that they most strongly connect with (Burke & Reitzes, 1991; Smith, 1991; Skilling, 2010). National identity has “long been associated with ideas of social cohesion and political legitimacy” (Skilling, 2010, p. 2), explaining why policy intervention is important. Identity is shaped by policy (Skilling, 2010) and as policy is one of the few tools the government and local body councils have to influence desired cultural outcomes, it is important to explore these concepts further.
A strong national identity is of benefit to an area, city or country when it is advertising itself in the tourism realm. A strong identity provides marketers with core ideas and values to communicate with their target audience. Whether on a global or local scale, the key things that members of a society relate to and feel strongly about are the things that will attract outsiders to these areas in order to experience this culture for themselves. Once again, cultural policy has the ability to influence and control certain aspects of this, and a creative city is one such aspect.

Cities with a varied and tolerant population are found to be much more creative than cities with a homogenised and xenophobic society (Landry, p. 118). Florida’s statements are very similar as he claims that the more diverse a city is in terms of ethnicity and sexual orientation the more creative it is, and thus the bigger the potential economic gain the city may enjoy. A large part of Florida’s discussion in his 2002 book surrounding what is needed for the creative city emphasises tolerance (Florida, 2002, p. 252). This in part is referring to cities being open to immigration, willing to put resources into accommodating minority religions, and willing to celebrate events significant to other cultures such as Chinese New Year or Diwali. Societies that embrace these differences within their city create a community spirit that encourages and entices like-minded individuals to move to the area. This includes individuals of different races, religions, beliefs, sexual orientation and family situations. Florida identified tolerance as a key factor of the creative cities with the example of the hi-tech organisations. Those organisations were, at that stage, becoming more and more desirable places of employment, and the cities where they were located were the same cities in which gay individuals chose to live. Creative individuals, by nature, are more open to diversity and new experiences.

Landry (2000) applies one of Florida’s (2002) three key concepts, tolerance, to aid the description of community identity. With a truly diverse society, tolerance is key in aiding the identity of a group and place so that fragmentation and conflict are
completely avoided. The more peaceful and tolerant any group is, the more easily and quickly the feeling of identity and belonging will evolve (Landry, 2002, p. 118). Landry suggests that making this identity visible in community areas, neighbourhoods, suburbs and cities through symbols that celebrate diversity and not homogenisation will aid building the sense of belonging (2002, p. 118). Along with food, songs and manufacturing, creating new traditions and images is important to make certain the city continues to evolve. Stagnation is extremely undesirable for a city seeking a creative state. Furthermore, once individuals start to associate with different areas of the city and different groups of people, they will start to feel more relaxed and at one with the city. At this stage the city has a better chance of catering to their needs and retaining their creative output for its own benefit.

Artists are unevenly spread throughout different cities. The first reason may be that size matters. Markusen and Schrock (2006) suggest that residents who love the characteristics of big cities may display a “higher penchant for arts consumption and producers may enjoy increasing returns to scale, especially in art forms such as Opera” (Markusen & Schrock, 2006, p. 1664). Referring to previous research, Markusen and Schrock discuss evidence that proves the point above but make clear their surprise that the effect “is greater for popular arts than high culture; only at the very high thresholds does the demand for elite arts activities show sensitivity to size of place” (p. 1664). Markusen and Schrock suggest that the demand for art based activities is higher in traditional, elite cities, giving American cities Los Angeles, New York City, Chicago and San Francisco as examples, because these areas house a high number of top-end earners resulting in these cities boasting an ‘income cluster’. An income cluster in turn leads to wealthy individuals choosing to patronise the arts through “philanthropy, attendance and collecting” (p. 1664).

Industries that cluster around big cities, such as advertising and media-based organisations, provide a significant source of income and have a demand for artists
and creatives. This links back to Florida (2002) and one of the ‘Ts’ that stands for talent – where there is talent, that will attract more talent. Artists and other creatives are not going to move to a city or area where there are no other like-minded people. Large cities also offer the crossover of the arts and this is another drawcard to artists, for example Markusen and Schrock (2006) refer to research that has found there is some synergy between opera and chamber music ensembles. These different types of art-based activities create “agglomerative tendencies” that enhance the draw factor of large cities as a place for creatives to come and live, work and play (p. 1664).

Large cities, by default, have the ability to cater for the entertainment factor of people’s downtime. As mentioned above, there must be a pull to a city that provides a fun aspect as well, the ‘play’ side of life. Creatives may be drawn to the plethora of cultural offerings in a big city, as well as the diversity, modernisation and technological forwardness (Markusen & Schrock, 2006; Florida, 2002). In addition, artists themselves are highly likely to patronise the arts, thus creating or adding to an existing sense of community and support, increasing the future likelihood of more artists choosing to come and live in these areas, growing these networks even more (Markusen & Schrock, 2006).

While there are many factors that will pull creatives to a city, there are still a number that can force them to stay away. The first and potentially biggest obstacle to creatives dwelling in urban areas is the cost of living. Traditionally artists “tend to earn low incomes and be self-employed, away from the largest cities” (Markusen & Shrock, 2006, p. 1664). The traditional, ‘elite’, established cities such as Los Angeles, New York, Boston, Chicago and San Francisco as previously mentioned would cost much more to move to and live in than smaller, less densely populated areas.
As another thought, many creatives who dabble in the non-performing arts may not actually have the temperament to suit a large city. As Markusen and Schrock (2006) suggest, they may actually prefer the slightly smaller areas as they are, by nature, “loners and value the solitude available in non-urban settings” (p. 1664) along with the amenities that smaller areas are able to offer over large cities such as less populated recreational areas and space for creating their art. Markusen and Schrock cite previous research when stating that although there are always artists of every type to be found in every area, the performing artists are more likely to be in the cities, the visual artists and writers in less urbanised areas, and musicians falling into both categories (Markusen & Schrock, 2006, p. 1664). It is important to note here that the ‘artists’ to whom Markusen and Schrock continue to refer to are the equivalent of the ‘creative core’ (Florida 2002) and not all the individuals who work in the creative industries, a much larger group than this small group currently being discussed.

Markusen and Schrock (2006) then go on to suggest that with technological developments it is easy for artists to sell their wares online and thus be located wherever they may choose. This is interesting as it almost rebuffs Florida’s (2002) claim that one of the ‘three Ts’, technology, is what is needed by large cities in order to pull creatives into it. I think this point may be argued both ways, as the development in recent years of the internet and online buying has evolved since Florida’s initial identification and explanation of the ‘three Ts’, and it is much easier to run a website, advertise, buy and sell online. However, once again Markusen and Schrock (2006) are only discussing the ‘creative core’ and the same claims about the development of the internet may not be relevant to the rest of the individuals who work in the creative industries.

There are critiques of the concept of community, Revill (1993) suggests that instead of fostering and enhancing a sense of identity and shared obligations, the idea of community can have negative connotations (p. 119). Perhaps this is due to the fact
that if an individual does not fit into the ‘ideal’ of their community they feel even more of an outsider with their community actually becoming a threat to their identity (Nisbit 1962, 1967). Wright (1988) and Hewison (1987) suggest that community still exists, but perhaps only because people still want it to, based on romanticised traditional ideals of community of an industrial and pre-industrial time that has passed. This links up to Florida’s argument for the creative city, and that the power of what people want can be strong, ‘if you build it they will come’, if people want to exist in a sense of community, creating one with a target group in mind surely makes the job much easier.
4. SYMBOLIC CONVERGENCE THEORY IN ACTION

Symbolic creativity and/or information is increasingly central to social and economic life. (Hesmondhalgh, 2002, p. 7)

Despite its detractors (see for instance Gunn, 2003), symbolic convergence theory (SCT) has enjoyed something of a resurgence of popularity in recent years (Bormann, Knutson & Muslof, 1997; Cragan & Shields, 1992; Olufowote, 2006; Shields, 2000), possibly because of its capacity to allow explanations that are, as Olufowote (2006, p. 1) says, “both ideographic and transhistoric and transcultural”. There is appeal in a methodological framework that allows social development to be traced through time, across cultures and through different rhetorical expressions which show “communication as creatively constructing, and being constrained by, reality” (Olufowote, 2006, p. 1). SCT has been used to track group communication patterns via several different mediums and situations, such as the cold war (Bormann, Cragan & Shields, 1994) where SCT was used to evaluate the communication patterns of the past and link action with reason. While SCT can be used to explain past communication patterns, it can also be used to manipulate the shared group consciousness of real-time communication: Cragan and Shields

---

4 Gunn (2003) argues that SCT valorises the imagination and lacks rigour, producing “‘cookie-cutter’ or formulaic criticism” (p.50).
(1992) describe an example of a corporation that used SCT to achieve their desired goal and strategic planning through people sharing fantasy themes. This will be explored further later in this chapter but it is the second example that is similar to how I propose to analyse my work. By taking the publications of the last decade of the Auckland City Council and attempting to chain the ideas identified in the documents with the developments in Auckland city and establishing if the results can be chained. It would be possible to witness the changes to the Auckland CBD and dismiss them as simply the Council’s desire to beautify the inner city. More cynically, the extensive works could have been seen as merely the provision of an environment conducive to making tourists spend largely. Or they could be a part of a larger rhetorical vision, with each change and development playing a very specific part of the plot. This is what SCT will allow me to explore.

These and other theories about the improvements seem to hold some plausibility, but at best, they can be only part of the reasons for the cost of Auckland’s creativisation (see Appendix B page 129 for breakdown of costs). It would be easy to settle for simplistic explanations such as those I have sketched above, but I seek a more satisfying account for the cause that is producing the effects I see around me. SCT is a useful tool for researchers who wish to connect and trace messages through a range of both social groups and communication media in order to obtain a deep understanding of cause and effect in social life. It is therefore a suitable match for my research purpose because it allows the understanding of shared sense making through the analysis of shared symbols and a shared vision that emerges from the perception of a crisis.

I am conscious as I begin my explanation of SCT that it illuminates the culture of groups as much as it explains the communication that produces action and outcomes, and this connection is not surprising, given Bormann’s (1982, p. 50) statement that “culture in the communicative context means the sum total ways of living, organising and communing built up in a group of human beings and
transmitted to newcomers”. The link between communication and the
development of culture is the stability and survival of the group. The stories or
narrations told within groups will begin to be “a shorthand way to tap old meanings
and verities, to arouse and share emotions and motives, and to interpret new
experiences in terms of old scripts” (Bormann, 1982, p. 52).

In this chapter, I will set out the fundamentals of SCT and show how I applied the
principles to my chosen documents. In doing so, I will demonstrate the way in
which SCT allows the exploration of communication and the symbols that are
adopted to bind groups together in action.

### 4.1 Origins and purpose of symbolic convergence theory

SCT is a communication theory that “provides a universal explanation of human
communication” (Bormann, 1982, p. 50), allowing the exploration of patterns of
social interaction within groups and the interpretation of the symbols important to
the groups. The method was developed by Bormann (1972, 1973, 1982, 1983,
1985) from work carried out by Bales (1950, 1970) on communication patterns in
small groups and is founded on two principles. The first of these principles is that
communication creates reality as people come to terms with events around them
and frame those events with meaningful symbols held in common by a group. An
individual’s acceptance of a group’s meaning for a particular symbol will create a
sense of membership, but it will also create reality because the shared
understanding will direct and shape perceptions of experience. The second
principle is that shared realities are created when people want to understand one
another and allow certain processes in their “private symbolic worlds” (Bormann,
1983, p. 102) to intersect.
Bormann (1985) sets out his conceptualisation of SCT in three tiers. He argues that at the macro level SCT will reveal the “recurring communicative forms and patterns that indicate the evolution and presence of a shared group consciousness” (p. 129). The meso level of SCT analysis occurs at the level of group interactions, showing how and why issues assume and lose importance to the group, and the micro level of analysis reveals the factors that cause people to share fantasies.

4.2 Underlying assumptions in symbolic convergence theory

SCT has existed for several decades and is based on six basic theoretical assumptions, clarified by Cragan and Shields (1994). First, the true meaning of any action is in the obvious content of the message. Discovering the emotion or motive that any action is sending is often, according to Bormann, Knutson and Musolf (1997), hidden within the action. Secondly, “reality is created symbolically” (Cragan & Shields, 1992, p. 200). When people believe something to be true, they act as if it is true. If someone believes that the room in which they sit is a prison, they will act like a prisoner. If they believe the room in which they sit is a palace, they will act like royalty. Thirdly, the process of ‘chaining’ fantasy themes is a part of the storytelling process, it is highly dramatised and people assume a character.

Fourthly, in order to research and “capture” (Cragan & Shields, 1992, p. 200) the symbolic convergence process, fantasy theme analysis is the basic methodology. Fifthly, all discourse provides some element of fantasy themes and therefore the chaining of fantasy themes. Finally, there are three master analogues competing as alternating explanations for symbolic reality, namely; righteous, social and pragmatic.

SCT has thirteen technical areas that fall into three different concept areas. These will be explored in the next few sections. Figure 4.1 gives an overview of these areas.
4.4 Basic concepts

There are four basic concepts that provide coherence to SCT. I will explore these concepts now as they are the building blocks to my methodology and upon which my data and discussion chapters will be built.
**Fantasy theme analysis**

The first concept to SCT is fantasy theme analysis. This first concept is the unit of analysis provided by, and in order to explore, SCT. This analysis provides the structure that leads to a rhetorical vision. A rhetorical vision is the desired goal of a shared group consciousness and is a key part of fantasy theme analysis. Fantasy theme analysis exists to present a common experience within a group and to create that experience into symbolic knowledge via the use of the shared rhetorical vision. Bormann maintains that interconnections of shared symbols become themes that a group may adopt or discard as members speak of the past and then go on to speculate about the future, essentially building a shared reality, a fantasy theme\(^5\), about what might come to be. Fantasy themes, in fact, are stories about characters and an envisioned future. A fantasy theme may be “chained out” (Bormann, 1985, p. 131) to the rest of the group and then on to outsiders, spreading the fantasy theme widely throughout society.

**Symbolic cues**

The second concept upon which SCT analysis works is the hypothesis that social groups and individuals bond over the meaning of symbolic cues, which can be a common experience or situation, an emotion, a key word or phrase, a non-verbal sign or an action (Cragan & Shields, 1992). The focus of analysis in SCT, therefore, is a group’s shared consciousness of a symbol and a comparison of the meaning it holds with the reality around (Cragan & Shields, 1992). For the purposes of this research, I have taken the symbol that triggered the shared fantasy themes to be the perception that the world’s economies have reached a crisis point because of over-dependence on non-renewable resources. It is possible to argue that the crisis symbol of diminishing resources and loss of lifestyle, with its associated fantasy themes, underpinned the Knowledge Wave Conference that took place in Auckland.

---

\(^5\) Here, a fantasy is not an untruth or a fairy tale, but rather, the knowledge held in common by the group that are used to establish and build unique identity and cohesiveness.
in 2001, and in turn became the symbol that triggered the fantasy themes of the creative city.

**Fantasy Type and Saga**

Fantasy types serve as the third concept on which SCT is established. A fantasy type is a fantasy theme that is repeated within one rhetorical vision or across many differing fantasy themes. The fantasy type contains an element of scripted tools to members of the symbolic community that allow them to reference the fantasy theme and rhetorical vision quickly via the fantasy type. An often cited example is “Watergate”, which progressed to “Irongate” and now in everyday society, if a ‘gate’ suffix is added to the end of a word the saga being alluded to is clear (Bormann, 1972, p. 398; Cragan & Shields, 1992, p. 201).

The fourth concept is the saga. Saga is created by group communication. A saga is created by members of the symbolic community repeating over and over the achievements or an event of a person or a group. The repetitiveness of the message being retold creates the saga and results in a ‘catch phrase’, such as “number eight wire”, which for many New Zealanders triggers a sense of national pride in Kiwi ingenuity. This concept is strengthened because it is such a common ideal and globally recognised.

**4.5 Dramatic Structural Concepts**

Fantasy themes have certain recognised structural elements such as scripts, which are “essentially, a personal way of organizing experience” (Bormann, 1985, p. 132) characters, who can be heroes, villains or chorus, plot lines, a rhetorical vision and scenes. Fantasy themes can also fall into certain stock types which have an inherent meaning for the community. A church group, for instance, may tell several variations on the theme of the sinful majority and the need to evangelise; a group of high school teachers may have a stock type of fantasy theme about how current
students do not read, cannot write accurately, and will not use the library at all. In these fantasy themes, specific heroes and villains or settings may change with each new iteration of the narrative, but the role they play in the fantasy theme will be interchangeable. Additionally there is always a master analogue for a fantasy theme, there are three types master analogue: ‘pragmatic’, practical and factual; ‘righteous’, the concerns with right or wrong; and ‘social’, the concerns of trust, friendship and personal responsibility. The master analogue can help to set the agenda of the fantasy theme. A sanctioning agent is another necessary aspect to legitimise an idea and is someone who gives backing to an innovative idea. As the concepts in this field of research are new, the use of sanctioning agents is vital as they give credibility to an idea that is otherwise void of references.

**Dramatising**

“Dramatising”, is communicating in a style that allows the confrontation of difficulties and release of tension in group processes (Bales 1950, 1970). The six structural concepts needed to construct fantasy theme as identified in figure one are all necessarily dramatic by nature. Bormann (1972, 1973, 1982) picked up on Bales’ (1950) concept of dramatising in small group communication and applied it to the rhetorical action of larger groups and wider society. His (1972, 1973, 1982) conceptualisation of dramatising focuses on the way stories are told and re-told, using fantasy themes that may relate to a problem within the group’s own internal processes, or may, instead, unite the group against an external phenomenon or threat.

Messages may be dramatised by the use of all sorts of rhetorical devices:

Dramatising comments are rich in imaginative language and consist of the following: puns, word play, double entendres, figures of speech, analogies, anecdotes, allegories, parables, fables, jokes, gags, jests, quips, stories, tales, yarns, legends, and narratives. (Bormann, Knutson & Musolf, 1997, p.4)
Rhetorical devices create interest and excitement in the audience, and an engaged audience is more likely to begin the “chaining process” (Bormann, Knutson & Musolf, 1997, p. 4) by passing the message along to other groups who “reiterate and reconfigure, repeat and embellish, and take the themes as their own” (Shields, 2000 p. 398). Bormann (1982, p. 51) remarks that “The fossilised remains of shared group fantasies can be found in texts of oral or written messages, and it is these “fossilised remains” that will form the bulk of my data.

The elaborate theatrical metaphor in SCT theory lends itself to analysis that explores the dramatising elements of a message. The construction of the theory around scripts and characters (heroes, villains), settings, dramatic tension, and denouement and resolution, suggests that Bormann saw social life as a series of overlapping dramas enacted because human beings cannot stop themselves from telling stories. In Bormann (1985, p. 125), in fact, he argues for the understanding of humans as homo narrans. Thus, SCT requires a sensitivity to, and an awareness of, the presence of the dramatic in everyday life.

**Rhetorical vision**

In SCT the rhetorical vision is a:

unified putting-together of the various scripts that gives the participants a broader view of things. Rhetorical visions are often integrated by the sharing of a dramatizing message that contains a master analogy, which pulls the various elements together into a more or less elegant and meaningful whole. (Bormann, 1985, p. 133)

Often a rhetorical vision will be marked by the emergence of an identifying slogan or meme which will work as a symbolic cue for the group, who may reach such a point of familiarity and maturity that they need only allude to the symbol in part to invoke its unifying power. I tend to the view that a rhetorical vision is likely to evolve from fantasy themes that grow out of perceptions of an undesirable
situation. Adverse conditions simply offer more scope for dramatising, somewhat along the lines of the old journalism adage that “If it bleeds, it leads”. In a less extreme example of this attitude, for instance, Bormann (1972) uses Bales’ (1950, 1970) studies of small group interactions to demonstrate that battles over leadership or disagreements about the task provide the group with their source of dramatising.

**Action**

For a rhetorical vision successfully to chain out to a wide audience, it has to form the foundation of group and society-wide fantasies (Bormann, 1985; Hensley, 1975) and to cause emotional arousal sufficient to impel participants into action that will achieve the dream in the rhetorical vision. There is a sense in which action is instigated by what Bormann (1985, p. 135) calls “anthropomorphic forces and imagined and historical personages in dramatic confrontations”. In this regard, the actors of the fantasies are all-important, because the wider public is most likely to understand and accept troubling messages from “players” who dramatise the matter and present it in organised scripts. The persuasiveness of a rhetorical vision is therefore dependent on the skill of the actor, and a social issue may be unfolded with complex characters and a subtle plot, or with dull characters and a hackneyed plot, but the intention is always to shape the social reality of participants such that the rhetorical vision becomes part of the consciousness of the individuals with whom it is shared (Bormann, Knutson & Musolf, 1997, p.5).

**Shared group consciousness**

The final aspect of SCT comprises the critical evaluation concepts, of which there are three. The first, shared group consciousness, must exist in order for the fantasy theme, rhetorical vision, saga and symbolic cue to manifest appropriately. It is important to note that not all fantasy themes will chain out or “converge” (Bormann, 1972, p. 202) into a rhetorical vision. If fantasies do not chain out, a
saga does not appear or symbolic cues appear meaningless, a rhetorical vision does not exist and a group does not have a shared group consciousness.

**Rhetorical vision reality link**

The second critical evaluation concept is a rhetorical vision reality link. Assuming shared group consciousness and a rhetorical vision are accounted for, this concept allows for fantasies still to chain even when there is “no clear observational impression of the facts” (Bormann, 1972, p. 202). As an example, gossip, rumour and panic may become parts of messages that chain out when there is no evidence to support otherwise.

**Fantasy theme artistry**

The third critical evaluation concept is fantasy theme artistry. This focuses on the “rhetorical skill” (Bormann, 1972, p. 202) needed to present situations, events or scenarios in an attractive and persuasive way in order to gain the dramatisation and saga elements needed for a fantasy to chain successfully and for shared group consciousness to form.

**4.6 Tracking a rhetorical vision: methodology becomes method**

As I explained in chapter one, I intend to examine the Auckland’s “new” CBD to see whether it is the realised accomplishment of a rhetorical vision built from Florida’s (2002) shared fantasy themes about building a creative city. In order to achieve my research purpose, I will analyse public documents in the form of Council publications, policies and the texts of speeches because I see such texts as the final tier of the communication of a rhetorical vision before the persuasion it contains is transformed into a tangible reality, which, in the case of this research, is the shift from Auckland as simply New Zealand’s biggest city, to Auckland-the-creative-city.
The research question that framed my work is, “In what ways does the creativising of central Auckland reveal the workings of Bormann’s (1973) shared fantasy themes?” The question shows that I have no doubt that Auckland’s CBD has been remodelled to conform to the notion of a creative city made popular by Florida (2002, 2004, 2009). As I have already said, the impetus for my research was never to question whether or not Auckland was being re-made in the image of a creative city; that was a given. My interest lay much more in the way the Council promoted and implemented the idea that it was necessary for Auckland to be a creative city.

**Finding the archive**

Over a period of seven weeks, I read my way through the archives of reports written for the Auckland City Council, using 2001 as the starting date of my investigation because that was the year the Knowledge Wave Conference took place at the instigation of the 5th Labour Government. My specific search was to find documents that expressed the goal of building a creative economy, because this is what Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) had identified as the key aspect of the rhetorical vision which, arguably, convinced Auckland to become a creative city and acquire the “creative class” (Florida, 2002, 2004, 2009) as a necessary side-effect.

**Working with the corpus**

I finally selected three documents out of the archive to form the corpus of texts that I would analyse: Starkwhite (2002), Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2007). My choice was based on the fact that these documents are not the regular kind of annual papers the City Council publishes, but rather, are three reports commissioned to explore the creative economy and the ways that Auckland could be situated at the heart of it. Although the three reports are driving towards the same goal, each serves a different purpose: Starkwhite delivers an introduction of the creative economy to Auckland, Snapshot provides more detail, a few tangible ideas and substantiates theories with creative individuals from Auckland acting as
sanctioning agents, while Blueprint provides actual examples of real spaces in Auckland that will be creativised. The three documents appeared to be a cascade of ideas about the policies and resource allocations that bring about the reality of the material form of Auckland. Together, they seemed to show a single-minded articulation of the shared fantasy theme of the creativised CBD.

I took nearly six weeks to analyse the texts using Bormann’s (1973) fantasy theme analysis. My primary process was to search the three documents for key words and phrases associated with action and scripts, characters and settings. This coding process, simple though it sounds, required intense connection with the documents, noting the language and rhetorical devices used in the drive towards the creation of a rhetorical vision. A summarised and somewhat sanitised version of my coding follows on the last page of this chapter.

Once the documents were analysed, I was able to start searching for fantasy themes associated with the dramatic elements embedded in the reports, and I found (somewhat unsurprisingly) that they were the creative class, the creative city and the creative economy, with the most powerful – or at least the most mentioned – being the creative economy. When these three clear dimensions began to emerge from the raw data, I began to realised that the creative economy dimension was functioning both as a controlling rhetorical vision and also as a fantasy theme. On the one hand, it was the “driving force” uniting the fantasy themes and on the other, it flicks in and out of the data as a fantasy theme, depending on the character and the script being delivered.

In this chapter I have laid out the basics of SCT, and have sketched the way I found and analysed key documents about the creativising of Auckland’s CBD. The purpose of the chapter was to make explicit the approach I took to obtaining my raw data.
In the next chapter, I set out the data analysis, which is organised according to the ten concepts in the original report (Starkwhite, 2002).
Table 4.1: Summary of coding sheets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions of the rhetorical vision</th>
<th>Concepts from Starkwhite (2002)</th>
<th>Key words &amp; phrases</th>
<th>Associated words &amp; phrases</th>
<th>Auckland Example</th>
<th>Desired outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Crisis</td>
<td>Concept One: Thinking our way into the 21st century.</td>
<td>Thinking, knowledge, future plans, creative economy.</td>
<td>Creatives, city, learning quarter, Britomart Precinct</td>
<td>Learning Quarter, Britomart Precinct</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Economy</td>
<td>Concept Two: The real assets of the modern economy will come out of our heads</td>
<td>Technology, physical location, clusters</td>
<td>Global, creativity, clusters of creativity.</td>
<td>Britomart Precinct, Learning Quarter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Class</td>
<td>Concept Five: People in the creative sector have highly transferable skills.</td>
<td>People, creatives, creative class, skills</td>
<td>Education, knowledge, entrepreneurial, intellectual tools, new class</td>
<td>Victoria Quarter, Aotea Quarter</td>
<td>Creative Auckland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative City</td>
<td>Concept 10: A chance to refresh our economic paradigm.</td>
<td>Creative city, economic growth, planning, place</td>
<td>Real life, tangible</td>
<td>Auckland City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. BUILDING CREATIVE AUCKLAND

[Symbolic convergence theory] explains the emergence of a group consciousness, with its implied shared emotions, motives, and meanings, not in terms of individual daydreams and scripts but rather in terms of socially shared narrations or fantasies. It is thus a social theory of communication. (Bormann, 1985, p. 128)

Appropriate to the above quote, this chapter will identify if a shared group consciousness exists in Auckland City which encapsulates the ideas of a creative economy, creative city and creative class. These, I believe, are three key concepts, all of which must be present for the others to exist. If such a group consciousness does exist, symbolic convergence theory (SCT) will allow me to identify “socially shared narrations or fantasies” (Bormann, 1985, p. 128). To engage SCT and seek to answer my research question using Bormann’s fantasy theme analysis branch of SCT, I focus on three Auckland City Council reports, Starkwhite (2002), Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2007). These three reports are used as the public introduction to the concepts of the creative economy, the creative class and the creative city. Each report serves to introduce Auckland’s public to new policy initiatives for the CBD and I contend that each in its own way built towards a rhetorical vision that was responsible for the shaping of Auckland CBD. I will use other public documents in my analysis, but they are less important to my argument than the three reports specified above.
Starkwhite is a public introduction to the concept of the creative economy from the Auckland City Council. It discusses at length the new class of creatives. Although not using these terms at the outset, it does very much state and reiterate the basic ideas and movements on which the creative economy is founded. In order to establish a creative economy there must be a creative city for the new creative class to live and work in. Starkwhite, while not yet linking these two elements of the creative economy and the creative city, does discuss them both and goes to some lengths to explain both as brand new ideas right from the start.

5.1 Dramatic Structural Concepts

The dramatic structural concepts of SCT that build the rhetorical vision, need only to be elucidated once in my analysis as their use throughout all the texts I use is the same. I will do this first, and seek to identify a clear rhetorical vision from the outset of this chapter via the dramatic structural concepts of dramatis personae, plotline, scene, sanctioning agent and master analogue, using all three reports as examples. I will then move to explore the three key fantasy themes of the creative economy, creative class and the creative city using concepts born in Starkwhite and follow their development through the reports chronologically, aiming to finish with examples of Auckland city reality. I will end this chapter with the analysis of the three critical evaluation concepts; the shared group consciousness, rhetorical vision reality link and fantasy theme artistry.

The rhetorical vision is one of the most important components of this research. There are five dramatic structural concepts that need to be present for a rhetorical vision to occur. If dramatis personae, master analogue, sanctioning agent, scene or plotline is missing, there is no rhetorical vision (Bormann, 1972). These elements of
SCT are designed to be able to be applied to any of my texts as the base for each of them is the same throughout my data.

**Dramatis personae**

The language the reports use makes a powerful attempt to form opinions in readers and by doing so, identifies the dramatis personae, the actors, players, individuals and groups who give life to the rhetorical vision. One of the most notable features of the language is the way it draws a line around “us” and creates an in-group that is united against the threat of “they”. All through Starkwhite “we” are juxtaposed against this “other”, who (presumably) might be old-fashioned enough to oppose the proposed shift into the knowledge economy. “We” are written of wherever possible in approving terms. Thus, Starkwhite claims that “We have the capacity to produce original thinkers and innovative, cost-effective solutions and applications” (p. 12) and “…we have not been doing badly at this [making the city attractive] to date” (p. 31). On the other hand, “we” are often spoken of in terms of what we need: on p. 14, for instance, “We need a culture that values forward thinking,” and on p. 17, “We need to understand what could be called the research and development end of the arts production model”. The first person plural, in these scripts, no matter how it is used, is intended to build an intimate sense of all-being-in-this-together.

Although the use of the first person plural stands out, it is not such a marked feature of language as the verbal forms. Starkwhite often uses the imperative mood: “New Zealand’s knowledge economy must be based on not only the recognition of the value of creativity and innovation, but …” (p. 14). The tone is often exhortatory, depending on verbal forms such as “should”: “...we should embrace it” (p. 17). Perhaps the most marked feature of the verbal forms, however, is the way the simple present and the simple future tenses are used to make confident assertions of truth. Page 11 claims that “New Zealand faces a
future characterised by an accelerating rate of change and unpredictability”. There is no data to back up this claim, and similarly, p. 12 asserts that “Today’s global economy is evolving into a ‘knowledge economy’...”. And again: “Increasingly the arts are also a significant platform around which city and regional branding is constructed...” (p. 18). Almost every section of Starkwhite contains such claims, built not from facts but on declarative verbs that sound as though information is provided and argument made, when in fact, the material is opinion and persuasion.

**Master analogue**

Starkwhite’s (2002) argument is formulated with the desired end result of a stable, creative based economy for Auckland City clearly defined. This goal suggests pragmatism as the base for the master analogue from the outset of this research. Using Starkwhite (2002) concept two as an example, the title ‘The Real Assets of the Modern Economy Will Come out of our Heads’ indicates this concept is introducing the potential basis of a future economy. The focus on the economy, and the steps that will be taken to secure its buoyancy, straightaway suggests pragmatism. Here is a guide based on actual ideas that will directly aid the goal of a strong and stable economy, it is only pragmatism that applies. The echoes of the Third Way and the similarities this political concept has with the creative economy additionally strengthens the argument for the pragmatic master analogue. Snapshot (2005) takes the concept of the knowledge economy and identifies sub-sectors of the creative industries that will make up this knowledge economy, namely design, screen production and radio, publishing, visual arts, crafts and photography, and performing arts and music (p. 24), further justifying the pragmatic master analogue. These identified areas once again highlight that the key areas of the creative economy are productions of creative people’s creativity and initiative.

As discussion of the knowledge economy continues, the remaining two options for the master analogue, ‘righteous’ and ‘social’ can be dismissed, leaving no doubt that the fundamentals of this fantasy theme align with a pragmatic master analogue. While
there are certainly moments in each text that touch on social and righteous options for
the master analogue, they are rare and fleeting and only reveal themselves as a
secondary option to pragmatism, aiding persuasive conversation. The pragmatic
analogue is a constant presence. By 2005 the figures published in Snapshot are
demonstrating that the creative sector’s contribution to Auckland City’s GDP is 6.3%.
Interestingly, the creative city’s contribution percentage is disproportionate to the
percentage of employment the sector provides, with this sitting at 5.1%. What
Snapshot (2005) does not tell us is which sectors provide the rest of the GDP, and the
percentages of these. These facts back up the legitimacy of the creative economy
script and enhance the strength and relevance of the rhetorical vision and persuasive
argument surrounding this, while simultaneously strengthening the pragmatic master
analogue.

_Sanctioning agent_

Given the existence of a pragmatic master analogue, which gives a purpose to the
documents and provides clarity of theme, the sanctioning agent provides credibility
to the new ideas and concepts introduced in these three reports. Since these ideas
are new to New Zealand, there are no case studies that can be used to base
credibility on, so this authority must come from elsewhere. Starkwhite (2002) uses
sanctioning agents more frequently and, as it is the first report, naturally relies on
them more than Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2007). Starkwhite refers to, and
directly quotes several academic researchers of the subject the creative economy
and its surrounding facets. Leadbeater et al (p. 12), Landry, (numerous times),
Flew, (numerous times), and Cunningham (p. 25) among others. There are also
references to Helen Clark, New Zealand’s then Prime Minister and to Tony Blair,
then Prime Minister of the United Kingdom. By aligning the report with these
figureheads and authorities on the umbrella topic of the creative economy,
legitimacy is proven to the audience that the topics being discussed have been
thoroughly researched and backed up by experts.
Snapshot (2005) uses sanctioning agents in a similar way, but relies less on academic references and starts to shift focus to members of the creative class in New Zealand. Florida (2002, 2005) is referenced throughout the report, but so is Russell Brown, Media Commentator (p. 7) along with Commercial Art Photographer (p. 47), Radio Station CEO (p. 49), Film Producer (p. 51) and Record Label Managing Director (p. 48). Relying on commentary from locals instead of mainly international experts, as in the Starkwhite report, demonstrates the development of the shared group consciousness and audience members becoming active players in the rhetorical vision of Auckland as a creative city. By the time Blueprint was published Landry (2006) and Florida (2002) were still depended on to be sanctioning agents but more local examples were also used. Differing to Snapshot (2005), Blueprint (2007) named the local sanctioning agents: Barbara Holloway, Karangahape Road Business Association Manager (p. 18), Pitsch Leiser, Manager of Festivals and Community Events for the Auckland City Council (p. 17) and Pieter Stewart, Founder and Managing Director of New Zealand Fashion Week (p. 16). Most importantly however, is the referencing of the Starkwhite and Snapshot reports throughout Blueprint as sanctioning agents, showing the esteem that these reports are held in by the Auckland City Council (publisher of all three). This suggests, at the time Blueprint was created, Snapshot and Starkwhite had been instrumental in the telling of the creative city story, were key players in establishing the rhetorical vision, and were spreading the shared group conscious.

**Scene**

The Auckland CBD is the scene and is the heart of my research which has been a constant theme throughout this thesis. Now that I am in the analysis stage of research, it is more important to identify the areas of study within Auckland’s CBD. I use four areas of the city as identified in Blueprint (2007) as case studies to evaluate whether the fantasy themes have successfully ‘chained out’. These areas are the Learning Quarter, Britomart Precinct, Victoria Quarter and Aotea Quarter, (see Appendix C page 133 for maps of areas). These specific areas, while small, will allow me to demonstrate whether the fantasy theme has chained successfully, a
group consciousness does in fact occur, and therefore identify whether or not the rhetorical vision has been realised in the physical city.

**Plotline**

The plotline of the story of ‘creativising’ Auckland City can be followed throughout the main three reports I am exploring and the application of this method allows the story to reveal itself in a clear way. The introduction to Starkwhite (2002) states that “creativity and innovations will be the future drivers of the global knowledge economy” (Starkwhite, p. 4, 2002). This is the first aspect of Starkwhite that is identifying the rhetoric vision of a stable economy for Auckland as the basis of the fantasy theme analysis methodology. The rhetoric vision is stated clearly at the start of this report and Starkwhite uses 10 concepts to explain the accepted wisdom around the link to this vision. These are ideas and practicalities for Auckland’s CBD to start thinking about and moving towards in order to achieve the identified vision.

The introduction to the Starkwhite report briefly establishes the key themes it examines, discussion of the arts sector, cultural environment and technology, the ways Auckland means to “capitalise on the links [between these factors] and the shifting of New Zealand’s commodity based economy to becoming knowledge based” (Starkwhite, p. 5). By utilising words and phrases such as ‘embracing’, ‘maximising’, ‘well-being’ and ‘highlighting the key factors’, the report is trying to promote the idea to the audience of the importance of the wholly consuming concept of the knowledge economy.

The specific ‘wishes’ of the Auckland City Council are outlined as:

- research and identify existing and potential benefits of arts and culture;
- liaise with business to identify opportunities to increase investment in Auckland-based arts enterprises;
- encourage collaboration between the arts and business sector based on recognising the contribution arts can make to industry and industry can make to the arts; and
- Promote the value of the arts and culture and their contribution to the social, cultural and economic well being of Auckland (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 5).

The story and plotline have a good foundation created by the Starkwhite report (2002), and the next aspect of the plotline is the revealing of three fantasy themes. They are: creative economy, creative class and creative city. The creative city may seem that it feeds directly into the rhetorical vision of having an economy in Auckland that is buoyant, and it does, but the creative economy does just as much, and the creative class is equally as important. I argue that in order to reach the rhetorical vision of having a stable economic base for Auckland city, all three of these fantasy themes need to exist. Without one, the story will be incomplete and the rhetorical vision will not be realised in the physical city of Auckland. At the risk of foreshadowing the rest of my data analysis, I am going to discuss the plotline as it progresses throughout Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2007) as well. Snapshot takes the theory and abstract ideas introduced in Starkwhite and provides some tangible real-life-Auckland examples of how the entire realm of the creative city (including the creative economy and the creative class) may work for Auckland and its citizens. The section titled ‘Why the Creative Industries Matter to Auckland’ (p. 6) where the report acknowledges that while creativity is not a new concept, the potential economic power it has, is. The report also states that the focus of Snapshot (2005) was to give the Auckland Council a good understanding of the different sectors in Auckland’s economy and that a more detailed action plan will follow. This is a great bridging report between the theory-based Starkwhite (2002) and the detailed, tangible example-based Blueprint report (2007). Blueprint takes certain areas of Auckland city and case studies them, taking the original ideas discussed in Starkwhite (2002) and applying them in the city in the hope of creating a creative city to home the creative class and the creative economy.
Many of the images in the language have to do with movement. In Starkwhite, New Zealand ‘must carve’ its future, knowledge ‘drives’, a ‘dynamic culture takes New Zealand forward’, branding is ‘constructed’ (2002). The sense of action and progress created by these verbs of motion is essential to the persuasive power of the scripts. The persuasion seems to assume that whereas inaction is passive and creates victims, action will save. These verbs of actions are also couched in forms in which they appear to be statements of truth, but they are not substantiated with any data for verification of the claims.

Overall, the language in Starkwhite is simple and easy to read quickly. In fact, the report is ‘a good read’ in the sense that a novel is good read. Because of the light and lively style, the report is entertaining, but the problem is, should it be entertaining? I cannot help but think that it should be set out as a solid argument. As a series of scripts designed to persuade, Starkwhite’s language is ideal. It is harder to see merit in the language when the report is considered as the basis of serious decisions.

5.2 Basic Concepts - The Reports: Towards Shared Consciousness

Starkwhite (2002), was the report that initiates thinking and introduces the hefty ideas of the creative economy, creative class and creative city gradually and gently via 10 concepts. As Starkwhite was the originating document for the introduction of these creative concepts to Auckland, I have based the organisation of this section around three of these key concepts, one for each of the main ideas of the creative economy, the creative class and the creative city. Following an exploration of a selection of Starkwhite’s concepts I have explored relevant public documents chronologically under the umbrella ideas of the creative economy, creative class and the creative city. More recent publications include case study documents to specific parts of Auckland. Using these three examples from Starkwhite, I will do so via the four basic concepts of
Bormann’s (1972) fantasy theme analysis. I have aligned the themes of the creative economy, the creative class and the creative city to one of Starkwhite’s 10 concepts that introduce these fresh, new, unexplored ideas to Auckland. Additionally, I first use Starkwhite’s concept one to illustrate where the ‘fantasy theme’ beings in reference to my research.

As I approach these documents that show the plan of the remodelling of Auckland as a creative city I am reading the plans as a shared fantasy theme in keeping with the overriding rhetorical vision of a creative economy which originated in the writings of Landry (2000) and Florida (2002).

The Crisis – Concept One: Thinking our way into the future

Bormann (1972) dictates that all fantasy themes will emerge from a ‘crisis’ or crossroads. A situation needs to occur where a new solution will be searched for. A situation where a fantasy theme is born to solve the crisis or to make clear which direction the crossroads should take. Starkwhite begins by focussing on the fast rate of economic change and an unpredictable economic future, identifying the ‘crisis point’ (Bormann 1972). Starkwhite (2002) begins the script at the point where it is time to make a change and plan for the future (even though it is unpredictable) in New Zealand to avoid economic instability. Starkwhite’s concept one introduces the key idea that the creative economy is suggested as a solution to a potential economic downturn. Immediately, a fantasy theme is identified with the disclosure of the envisioned future, which is hinting at the rhetorical vision. The creative economy fantasy is introduced, the first dramatic structural concept of the rhetorical vision, at the moment of crisis for New Zealand’s economy. The persuasive language of the script communicates the threat of being left behind and left out of the knowledge economy is near and the audience and nation need to act now in order to avoid this. The discourse here is promoting the audience into a quick reaction, trying to communicate that unless there is action now New Zealand will miss out.
In keeping with Monroe and Ehniger’s (1967) motivation sequence, the language used in the creative economy script is persuasive and at this stage seeks to gain the audience’s attention through the use of strong language as symbolic cues such as chaos, inspiring the audience to take action. Starkwhite does not develop the chaos idea and the audience are left unsure what will happen if they do not take on this vision, except chaos. As Starkwhite does not give the answer of what the chaos is in the script, the audience must produce their own answer and thus they will relate to it more than if it was provided for them. Starkwhite (2002) twice threatens chaos (introducing the element of saga) and the script compares chaos with terms such as possibility and challenge. Of the two options given (chaos or possibility and change), on the surface it is clear where the audience would choose to go. Thinking is the act identified as the single thing that will save the nation from chaos. The audience ‘should’ use thinking as a tool to create a better future. The creative economy script is already at work, subtly pointing to the fantasy theme of the creative economy by dramatising the crisis and provoking the audience to act.

Following on from identifying the crisis and scaring the audience into opening their minds with the threat of chaos, the creative economy script moves from threat to an opportunistic outlook and the possibility of a new future. The challenge alluded to previously in the creative economy script is identified: “to provide opportunities for our most talented people to formulate designs for better living and better business in the 21st Century” (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 11). Starkwhite’s concept one is successfully developing the creative economy plotline to identify creatives as key characters in the action plot, and is hinting to the opportunity of ‘creatives’ as the pinup saviours of New Zealand’s economic future. This threat is etched in Starkwhite’s concept two also in relation to the ‘rapidly advancing technologies’ which are credited with creating the global sharing of goods and services. From the introduction of technology at the beginning of concept two, the discourse extends to the fast rate of development of technology again linking to the theme of concept one of everyone needing to hurry in
case chaos catches us, using the motivating sequence of communication in order in
elicit action (Monroe & Ehniger, 1967). This ‘saviour’ title puts a lot of pressure on the
creative industries and enhances the importance of them and the role they have to
play in the rhetorical fantasy, seeking the audience to identify with the need for action
and for change.

Creative Economy – Concept Two: The real assets of the modern
economy will come out of our heads

A fantasy theme is a story about characters and an envisioned future. The three
fantasy themes presented in the Starkwhite report; creative city, creative class and
creative economy, may mean different things to different fields of study, or, may not
be understood at all. Throughout this chapter I will explore, in turn, the basis of the
three fantasy themes. Concept two in the Starkwhite (2002) report illustrates the
development of the creative economy fantasy theme. Concept two places the
knowledge economy into the rhetorical vision via the plotline and scene dramatic
concepts through the script language. It is this language that will also identify the
symbolic cues of my research which present themselves mainly as overused words and
phrases. I find within this realm of research there are a number of words and phrases
that are new, and have a specific definition because of being a part of this research.
Two such examples, that can be used to demonstrate different points in different
areas of study to this are ‘knowledge’ (intellectual property) and ‘technology’ which,
according to concept two, will be ‘key drivers of productivity and economic growth in
the new millennium’ (Starkwhite, 2002, p.12). These, along with other key words and
phrases, are used repetitively throughout Starkwhite to help explain the fantasy theme
and are used further through the Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2007) reports. The
use in Starkwhite’s concept two of ‘technology’ and the ‘new millennium’ are symbolic
cues that, in this context, point to the goal, to the rhetorical vision. The use of ‘new
millennium’ not only gives an idea of time frame but also helps reinforce the idea of
the future and leaving behind the past providing further context for the creative
economy fantasy theme. Concept two has so far shown the plotline demonstrating
development in technology and used the new millennium as a time marker and reference point.

Snapshot (2005) revisits the push of technology and once again enhancing the development of it. By the creative economy script being explored further in Snapshot, along with a similar use of language, a fantasy type is slowly and steadily being built. The fantasy theme is appearing in different places as it progresses. This is also creating the saga surrounding the fantasy theme. Snapshot states that technology, along with information and learning are the ‘most recognised elements of this new economy’ (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 12). The script here has provided the audience with three very clear aspects of the economy that are the most important and communicated them in a very straightforward way. ‘Creativity’ and ‘innovation’ are quickly identified as being extremely important too, with them both being identified as ‘watchwords in contemporary understandings of this new economy’. This is another demonstration of the fantasy theme of the creative economy developing, as Starkwhite (2002) itself is identifying that there are ‘watchwords’ developing, giving the reader a literal example of script advancements. Technology is now a key factor in the new economy, and information and learning have been introduced alongside it. But the audience is now clear that creativity and innovation are the key things that need to be achieved and technology, information and learning are the tools to help us get there. The relevance of technology now to helping the goal of a creative economy is mirrored in the script as new focus and time discussing technology has been allocated.

The importance of the creative economy and the role it plays in the rhetorical vision is further unveiled as the audience are told that while new technology and knowledge will be the drivers of the economy, ideas will be the “most valuable resource in the market place” (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 12) enhancing the saga of the story even more. Aside from the script identifying the drastic development of technology, the audience is also given an example of how the new knowledge economy will work by comparing it with the existing market place. Previously, in New Zealand’s ‘old’ and chaotic
economy, tangible commodities were New Zealand’s key product to drive the economy. Moving forward the script explains, the new focus will be resources. Instead of farming to produce products for the market place, New Zealand will now use new technologies, learning and information to create ideas for the market place. Here the script is explaining what is happening, the idea is being explained to the audience, then the script provides an example of this idea by using a situation the audience will be able to relate back to themselves and their personal daily lives once again, using persuasive aspects of motivation sequencing (Monroe & Ehniger, 1967).

Due to the reiteration of the ideas the audience understands thus far where the exciting new millennium economy is coming from. At this stage in Starkwhite, two of Florida’s 3-Ts (2002) have been identified as vital elements of the new economy: technology and talent. The rhetoric strengthens as the script is starting to be pulled directly from the macro level of the identification process of fantasy theme analysis.

Snapshot (2005) takes the concept of the knowledge economy and identifies sub-sectors of the creative industries that will make up this knowledge economy. Namely, design, screen production and radio, publishing, visual arts, crafts and photography, performing arts and music (p. 24), these identified areas once again highlighting that the key areas of the knowledge economy are productions of people’s creativity and initiative. By 2005 the figures published in Snapshot are demonstrating that the creative sector’s contribution to Auckland City’s GDP is 6.3%. Interestingly, the creative city’s contribution percentage is disproportionate to the percentage of employment the sector provides, with this sitting at 5.1%. What Snapshot (2005) does not tell us is which sectors provide the rest of the GDP and in what percentages. These facts back up the legitimacy of the creative economy script and enhance the strength and relevance of the rhetorical vision and persuasive argument surrounding this.
The description given earlier of ‘concentrations of creatives’ used in the creative class-focused area of the script, is beginning to reveal itself in the real life of Auckland city. The area of Britomart Precinct is described in Blueprint (2007) as having several buildings being used by the creative sector and it is predicted that more creatives will become tenants once the proposed eight new structures have been built. It is also home to the HQs of some of New Zealand’s leading creative and corporate organisations (Britomart, 2013). The realised vision from the start of Starkwhite (2002) is making an appearance in reality, using Britomart Precinct as the medium of communication. The persuasiveness of the rhetorical vision has created a reality as promised from the beginning of the creative city aspect of the script.

**Creative Class – Concept Five: People in the creative sector have highly transferable skills**

Starkwhite’s (2002) Concept five starts to move the discussion towards the second fantasy theme of the creative class as Starkwhite (2002, p. 19) acknowledges that the arts as a whole include not only the physical act of making art and the finished product of art work but also include “generic creativity, skills and talent ... central to all art forms” (Starkwhite, 2002, p 19). Linking to the ideas proposed and discussed by Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) regarding the creative class, this is the basis on which the idea is founded. Starkwhite discusses the generic creative skill base that can be taken and applied to creative areas away from the traditional physical act of creating art and the art works. Instead here Starkwhite starts to build the idea of the ‘creative core’ as Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) spoke of, identifying the language and symbolic cues of this fantasy theme. The skill sets are all intellectual tools that lend themselves to many of the industries developing at the time Starkwhite was written. Some of the example industries that will benefit most from this creative skill set are film, television, radio, design, fashion, architecture, landscape architecture, software, animation and website design (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 20). Here, the audience is given a small idea of how creative industries will actually be able to make a noticeable difference to the economy. Discussion of these specific industries and the use of
actual examples allows the audience to relate the concept back to themselves and their personal daily lives, engaging the audience more and creating stronger dialogue, and the audience slowly begins to link the theory of the knowledge economy to the reality of life in Auckland.

Starkwhite (2002, p. 21), provides a list of the key characteristics creative people have in common:

- are dreamers and visionaries;
- think imaginatively;
- are capable of making big conceptual leaps;
- are a source of original ideas;
- give form and structure to their thinking in innovative ways;
- are inventive, speculative, forward thinking, aiming to generate new forms of knowledge, new applications and open up new possibilities;
- have transferable creativity, skills and talents – developed and refined in a field of practice (e.g. art making) – that can be used in other fields; and
- develop clever, elegant solutions to clearly defined problems (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 21).

Here, the audience has learnt what to look for in a creative person, what the creative industries are, and again can start to see the link between the vision of a knowledge economy in Auckland and how to actually go about creating this. This type of example is vital for the chaining process to continue to be as successful as it is persuasive, and gives active audience members scripted tools to help spread the message and increase the shared group conscious.

By the time Snapshot (2005) was published, the Auckland City Council’s understanding of creatives and their needs has demonstratively increased. After discussing in the previous sections the importance of the creative industries and selling the idea to the audience, Snapshot (2005) now move their focus to talent. This discussion is an
example of the fantasy theme becoming a fantasy type as the discourse is continuing in multiple places. “Creative talent is the core resource for the creative industries” (p. 83). Here Snapshot (2005) is showing that the single key resource needed is the creative people. Once again repetition is playing a part in the sharing of the script. This statement naturally leads to the question, if creative people are the most important tool, how does a city get them? The predictability Bormann (1972) discusses of fantasy theme analysis starts to appear. It is predictable that the Auckland City Council will suggest that a creative city is what is needed to lure and keep the creative class. What is not clear is whether it will happen or not (Bormann, 1972).

Snapshot states “creative sector agencies are interested in developing strong cultural and creative communities, the fertile stew that cooks creative talent and distinctiveness” (2005, p. 83). Similarly to Starkwhite (2002), Snapshot (2005) has a strong statement leading back to the rhetorical vision of needing a creative economy and a creative city will help to achieve this but it is left to the last section of this report. Snapshot (2005), like Starkwhite (2002), has spent a great deal of time discussing the ideal of the creative city, why it is so important and everything that needs to be done. This pattern is becoming typical with the way the Auckland City Council is approaching this activity, while the repetitiveness is enhancing the saga of the creative class story.

The Auckland City Council’s recognition of the creative class and the needs of the creative individuals who comprise this group is demonstrated in Blueprint (2007). Discussion in the Blueprint report of the planned Victoria Quarter demonstrates this recognition and understanding by the announced plan of multiple ‘creative spaces’. This emphasises the script of the creative city in terms of creating and building areas and spaces that can be utilised by the creative class for their needs as discussed previously in this concept. Descriptions such as encouraging new creative businesses and planned specifics such as parks and open public spaces are textbook answers to how to create a creative city (Landry, 2000; Florida, 2002). Once again, this aids the
audience in the retelling of the creative city script and is more persuasive as the storyteller now has a tangible example to use in the communication.

The Victoria Quarter is based around the historical Freemans Bay, central Auckland location of Victoria Park Market. The Victoria Park Market website home page (Figure 5.1 and Figure 5.2, page 83) declares a message that pushes the development of the creative city script into one message in relation to this area; “Auckland icon returns to its former glory” (Victoria Park Market, 2013). The website acknowledges that $20,000,000 was spent on the upgrade of this area that was completed in February 2013. The website promotes shopping, dining and events happening in the rejuvenated space. While there is less of a ‘creative city’ script evident here than there is on the Britomart website, the Victoria Park Market website is still showing evidence of the desired creative city as identified by Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) by taking an area of the city with historical meaning and rejuvenating it into shared spaces for shopping, dining, meeting friends and open outdoor spaces. It is the definition of a creative space that creatives are drawn to (Florida, 2002).
At the time of Snapshot’s publication in 2005 the creative sector in Auckland is “sizeable and significant” (p. 16). The script provides tangible evidence of the size of the creative sector’s contribution towards the Auckland economy. The script develops into actual examples of theory and this aids to convince audience members of the legitimacy of the rhetorical vision and adds to the persuasiveness of the argument that in order to gain the coveted creative economy there first needs to be a creative city. In 2005 the creative sector had 14,000 employees (5.1% of total employment) in Auckland city. That is similar to employment levels of the construction and financial sectors in Auckland (Snapshot, 2005, p. 16). These figures provide the audience with an example of the theory of the creative industries and creative economy development into action since its introduction to the city in 2002 via Starkwhite.
The identified Learning Quarter in Blueprint (2007) is focused on developing a “place based plan to guide the social, economic, cultural and environmental development of the area over the next 10 year” (p. 13). This area of the city encompasses both Auckland University of Technology and the University of Auckland, and Blueprint names them as a key part of the Learning Quarter and the 10 year plans including establishing a distinctive “urban hub of learning, teaching and research” in the centre city. Concept six has focused on furthering the creative class ideas of the script by introducing the creative sector as a concept and term (Starkwhite, 2002), justified the sector as economically viable (Snapshot, 2005), and now in Blueprint identifying a long term plan for the viability of this sector by focusing resources into research and learning.

The following extract from the Auckland City Council’s 2009 report on the Learning Quarter demonstrates use of clusters, open spaces, commitment to learning and entrepreneurship as developed in the creative class aspects of the script so far, and uses repetitive language to create a natural flow from Blueprint (2007) to The Learning Quarter Plan (Auckland City Council, 2009).

Covering 63 hectares, The Learning Quarter has New Zealand’s largest concentration of students, researchers, teachers, innovators and creators, clustered in and around the university campuses. It is a vibrant place, characterised by significant heritage buildings, open spaces (such as Albert Park in the heart of The Quarter), rich cultural assets, a diverse range of events, and a growing residential community (Auckland City Council, 2009).

The above description is indicative of how far the script and the rhetorical vision have come. While showing how far the communication chain has come, it is also joining in and becoming an actor as the description given here is very persuasive. This makes The Learning Quarter sound so attractive I’m unsure why anyone would want to study away from The Quarter after reading this.
Creative City – Concept 10: A chance to refresh our economic paradigm

Concept 10 (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 31) is the introduction of term and realisation of the creative city idea. Starkwhite discusses what economists refer to as the ‘holy grail’ of economic growth, innovation, population and institutions, and leads into the potential Auckland has to “harness” (2002, p. 31) these factors. Once again the use of the term harness is an example of the symbolic cues of language and key words developing from the initial rhetorical vision.

Auckland is actually doing well in being one of the most “liveable, lively and attractive cities of its size in the world” (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 31). After the repeated threat of chaos if the audience did not act imminently, the claim that Auckland has “not being doing badly” (Starkwhite, 2002, p. 31) seeks to negate the groundwork laid by the beginning concepts. As this is the first concept where the creative city has been introduced, I think it is interesting that it is done so with a gentle sabotage of the previous ideas. Is this to invoke relief in the audience? To get the audience to focus more on this concept than the previous ones? A pure accident? It is unclear at this stage if the concepts of the creative city is an underlying assumption of Starkwhite or if this is part of a build up for a dramatic unveiling.

The research report Snapshot (2005) is focused purely on the creative industries in Auckland. Once again, the time limit and urgency is discussed: “we need some kind of consensus about what we want Auckland to stand for, the urgency of the situation, the need to make some tough decisions” (Michael Barnett as quoted in Snapshot, 2005, p. 4). By revisiting the urgency and chaos that will fall upon the city if Auckland does not immediately embrace the idea and reality of what is needed to achieve the creative economy by way of getting the creative class to some and stay in a creative Auckland, Blueprint (2007) is providing the audience with both relief, as they are demonstrating...
that the Auckland City Council are taking the ‘threats’ seriously and have provided examples of what they are doing to combat the impending chaotic disaster of not having a creative economy, and also another facet to the story of the journey to the creative city. Based on more council reports (such as Auckland City Council, 2009) and individual precinct websites, Auckland has provided creative spaces for creative people with the objective of enhancing the creative economy. The continuation of the script is evident in each of these examples as discussed in previous concepts and in particular Florida’s (2002) vision of creating a place where creative people can live, work and play.

As an example of Auckland as a creative city, Blueprint (2007) identifies an area of midtown Auckland as the Aotea Quarter, as a part of an arts rejuvenation project. The Council has positioned this area for “transformation as a key part of the revitalisation of Auckland city’s CBD” (p. 13). Blueprint (2007) identifies the Aotea Quarter as including the city’s arts and entertainments central ‘hub’ comprising the Auckland Art Gallery, the Auckland Town Hall, the Aotea Centre, the Civic Theatre and the Central City Library. These are actual examples from Auckland City of what has been referred to throughout the script as an elusive illustration falling under the generic term ‘arts infrastructure’. The identified physical places above will provide “economic value” for the city via a home where the performing and visual arts can rehearse, perform, display and sell their artistic endeavours (Blueprint, 2007, p. 13). At this point in the creative city script the audience are given a dramatically more evidential example on which to base the ideas proposed so far. By giving the audience physical examples in Auckland city that are historical and well known sites, such as the Auckland Town Hall, the rhetorical vision is making it much easier for the audience to share the script with others by utilising these real life examples, allowing further social groups to relate to their own experiences with these places.

In 2009 the Auckland City Council defined the Aotea Quarter as ‘our own unique arts, cultural and entertainment hub ... home to the Auckland Art Gallery, Auckland Central
City Library, Aotea Square and Civic Theatre. People visit this part of the city to go to a show, catch a movie or immerse themselves in the visual arts” (Auckland City Council as cited in The Big Idea, 2009, *The Aotea Precinct*). This description the Council gives to the Aotea Precinct sounds almost like a perfect area for a city seeking to be creative. This is an area that creative individuals can go to be inspired, to meet others and to be with like-minded creatives. The use of descriptive words and more repetition of the creative economy rhetorical vision is further developing the script focusing on a creative city. Unique, cultural, entertainment and becoming immersed in the visual arts are all options for this area of town now. The description also literally defines the area by naming the streets around the perimeter of this precinct. The Auckland City Council have built a space, defined the space, and the description of the space conjures a very creative idea in the audience’s mind. By now the audience can use the entire Aotea Precinct as a place to visit themselves and be active users of the fantasy. They can also help share the vision with further communication groups, using a large section of the Auckland CBD as an example.

5.3 Critical Evaluation Concepts

Using Bormann’s (1973) fantasy theme analysis I will next focus on the three critical evaluation concepts of fantasy theme artistry, shared group conscious and the rhetorical vision reality link. I mainly focus on the Starkwhite (2002) report in this section.

**Fantasy theme artistry**

In this section, I will analyse the Starkwhite Report in terms of its “scripted” quality, taking account of factors such as the initiating crisis, dramatising devices, setting, characters and narrative arc. The purpose of this section is to show how a crisis can be identified, defined, scoped and solved by way of the rhetoric in public documents.
The body of the Starkwhite report contains ten concepts which each tell a different story about Auckland, or perhaps, more truly tell the same story from a different angle. It is clear from even a cursory reading that a formula has been designed for the telling of the stories, and that Starkwhite does not deviate from the formula. Adherence to the pattern is so rigid that although the separate elements are not numbered, they might as well be.

Each concept is numbered and delineated in bold block letters, followed by a heading that indicates the nature of the story. Thus concept one is called ‘Thinking our way into the future’ and it is fair to say that all the titles are similarly ambitious. Concept two asserts that ‘The Real Assets of the Modern Economy will Come out of our Heads’ and concept eight offers ‘A Chance for ‘Joined Up’ Thinking Between Business and the Creative Sector’. What is clear about the titles of these different stories is that, apart from the forceful way they are placed on the page, they add up to a new way of seeing the world and a new way of operating.

The title is followed by a summary of the main points, also produced in heavy bold type. The concept stories are neither long nor complex, which suggests that the summary is less an aid to the reader’s concentration, and more a chance to reiterate the punchlines of each script. Written in a form of truncated English, the summaries use language as bold and as assertive as the font: point five in concept two states definitively, “Niche markets will expand and develop”, and in concept seven, the summary claims that, “Creative industries are substantial components of most sophisticated economies”. The summaries seem to be the punchlines of the stories, hitting hard with what appear to be factual statements. A reader who did not examine the content of the stories very closely, and did not consider the sources of the “truths” on offer, could well form an opinion that creative thinking was the last bastion of economic survival.

6 The “change-to-creative-thinking-is-necessary story.
After the summary, the scripts usually include a relevant quote (sometimes more than one) from some well-known person acting as sanctioning agent. Once again formatted in bold font and separated from their context, the quotes appear more boosterish and aspirational than informative. Concept four, which has the title ‘Seeing the Value in Our Arts, Artists and Arts Industries’ uses a quote from The Listener about Sir Peter Jackson’s work: “He shows us the magic in our own country”. The ideas embedded in the quotes are of the sort it is difficult to oppose: they are high-minded and worthy, but on close analysis, are opinion and not useful in terms of providing information about the topic. That is not to say that the people whose ideas are quoted are lightweight. Quite often, the quotes are taken from respected academics like Landry (2000) and Charles Handy (1995), whose research and thinking has informed the development of creative industries thinking.

After the quote, the scripts embark on telling their particular stories. This section is short, reducing complex concepts, such as the creative economy (concept seven) to a few paragraphs and tabulated lists. The stories are written in a journalistic style, using short paragraphs. The longest paragraph is nine lines but they average four lines. The impression created from this aspect of the template is that Starkwhite was written for an audience that is understood to be too busy to read deeply on a topic in a sustained acquisition of a complex topic.

Overall, the template is an effective servant of persuasion. Its typographical features draw the reading eye to the points the writer want to emphasise, and the repetition of the pattern throughout the ten concepts means that the scripts are read with a degree of familiarity and expectation. The template establishes a regular rhythm in the story that works like all formulae to ground readers in the narrative and possibly reassure them about the content that is offered.
**Shared group consciousness**

The indications that a shared group consciousness exist is marked by the change in the language of the scripts, and in this case the Auckland City Council Reports, moving from a feeling of ‘I’ or ‘me’ to ‘us’. The reports are written in such a way that they become templates and inasmuch as the predictability and “rhythm” of the template plays its part in forming a persuasive document, the language of the scripts makes a powerful attempt to form opinions in readers. One of the most notable features of the language is the way it draws a line around “us” and creates an in-group that is united against the threat of “they”. All through Starkwhite “we” are juxtaposed against this “other”, who (presumably) might be old-fashioned enough to oppose the proposed shift into the knowledge economy. “We” are written of wherever possible in approving terms. Thus, Starkwhite claims that “We have the capacity to produce original thinkers and innovative, cost-effective solutions and applications” (p. 12) and “...we have not been doing badly at this [making the city attractive] to date” (p. 31). On the other hand, “we” are often spoken of in terms of what we need: on p. 14, for instance, “We need a culture that values forward thinking,” and on p. 17, “We need to understand what could be called the research and development end of the arts production model”. The first person plural, in these scripts, no matter how it is used, is intended to build an intimate sense of all-being-in-this-together (Starkwhite, 2002).

Although the use of the first person plural stands out, it is not such a marked feature of language as the verbal forms. Starkwhite (2002) often uses the imperative mood: “New Zealand’s knowledge economy must be based on not only the recognition of the value of creativity and innovation, but...” (p. 14). The tone is often encouraging, depending on verbal forms such as “should”. “...we should embrace it” (p. 17). Perhaps the most marked feature of the verbal forms, however, is the way the simple present and the simple future tenses are used to make confident assertions of truth. P. 11 claims that “New Zealand faces a future
characterised by an accelerating rate of change and unpredictability”. There is no data to back up this claim, and similarly, p. 12 assert that “Today’s global economy is evolving into a ‘knowledge economy’ ...”. And again: “Increasingly the arts are also a significant platform around which city and regional branding is constructed...” (p. 18). Almost every section of Starkwhite contains such claims, built not from facts but on declarative language that sound as though information is provided and argument made, when in fact, the material is opinion and persuasion.

Another feature of the language is the how figurative it is. A report on which decisions will be based might be supposed to be objective and factual, but the language of Starkwhite is highly dramatised. An example of such language occurs on p. 11, where it is written that, “As we face this swirling intersection of change we must chart a new course into the future”. Before this sentence, no “swirling intersection of change” was established. Such language is designed to make the reader uneasy: change creates a sense of vertigo and of being unsafe, but solid ground is nearby, in the proposals in the report.

Many of the images in the language have to do with movement. In Starkwhite, New Zealand “must carve” its future, knowledge “drives”, a “dynamic culture takes New Zealand forward”, branding is “constructed”. The sense of action and progress created by these verbs of motion is essential to the persuasive power of the scripts. The persuasion seems to assume that whereas inaction is passive and creates victims, action will save. These verbs of actions are also couched in forms in which they are appear to be statements of truth, but they are not substantiated with any data for verification of the claims.

Overall, the language in Starkwhite is simple and easy to read quickly. In fact, the report is “a good read” in the sense that a novel is good read. Because of the light
and lively style, the report is entertaining, but the problem is: should it be entertaining? I cannot help but think that it should be set out as a solid argument. As a series of scripts designed to persuade, the Starkwhite’s language is ideal. It is harder to see merit in the language when the report is considered as the basis of serious decisions.

*Rhetorical vision reality link*

Concept two once again appeals to the personal lives of the audience and using motivation sequence communication provides examples they can relate back to themselves, once more ensuring the audiences active by-in to the ideas being identified in the script. Starkwhite (2002) uses some of New Zealand’s greatest (arguably) achievements, allowing the audience to place the new ideas into situations that they already understand. The Americas Cup is used as an example with little said about the actual placing in the competition but the focus is on the design innovations and technologies that were used to create magical boats for much less money than American and European competitors. New Zealanders have now been placed above American and European counterparts, and it has been proven that New Zealand has achieved success of the knowledge based economy with the Americas Cup. So while Auckland’s move to the new economy is a challenge, it can be done because it has similarly been done before.
6. AUCKLAND: CREATIVE BUT NOT ORGANIC

The fact that we might think of community as an important means of influencing the social order is interesting precisely because it forges links between individual action and society; it links personal responsibility, commitment and identification with other people. (Revill, 1993, p. 128)

As Revill states, the influence individuals and communities have over social order makes people identify more with these communities and groups. And as Anderson (1983) explains, this sense of belonging, even if you do not know the other members of the group, binds people together, strengthening the cause and therefore links back to Revill’s claims of these groups influencing society. This idea is firmly placed in my concluding discussion: moving forward, the future of Auckland city is now rests with those who live, work and play in this city.

My research question is “in what ways does the creativising of central Auckland reveal the workings of Bormann’s (1973) shared fantasy themes?” Using that question to guide my study and based on my findings I believe that the creativising of Auckland city is chained to policy documentation, compliant with Bormann’s 1973 fantasy theme
analysis. I will discuss three main ways in which this occurs: Auckland’s creatification, rhetorical vision in practice and methodology revisited.

6.1 Limitations and recommendations for further research

As I open my concluding discussion I am mindful of the limitations to my research that I have encountered. One minor limitation is the fourth concept in Snapshot, (2005), namely ‘Positioning and Perception’. This section opens with an interesting statement that “participants believe that Auckland is a creative city”. This leads to a discussion based on Snapshot interviewing 375 people who work in the creative sector. In my opinion 375 is not sufficient number of interviewees to obtain an accurate view of any industry’s opinion. In addition, I would expect the opinions of those in the screen production sector to differ from those in the publishing area. This was, after all, one of the key points of the 2001 Knowledge Wave Conference, to bring in individuals from different areas who would not normally interact in the business world. Different creative industries have different needs, and therefore opinions sought from those working in those industries will also vary. Snapshot (2005) also does not disclose who these 375 individuals are so there are no assurances that those surveyed are appropriately qualified to express an opinion on the burgeoning creative industries in New Zealand. This is especially of concern given the acknowledgement in Snapshot (2005) that the creative industries are still not completely or correctly understood.

As I have carried out this research, a question I have continually come back to is, does New Zealand have a creative economy? This was not part of my research question, which seeks to establish whether the changes occurring in Auckland city are due to Bormann’s (1973) symbolic convergence theory. The focus of my research was to trace the idea of the creative city from birth to reality. At the end of each of my three concluding points below I reached the same junction; Auckland city, physically, is creative. I have answered my research question with numerous examples of how the physical developments of my city are linked to the ‘chaining’ process Bormann (1973) has set out. But the next question that naturally arises is, does Auckland have the
coveted creative economy? As stated, I cannot answer this but I consider it is a natural progression for this topic, and it is therefore my recommendation for further studies. I strongly recommend that, as a natural next step from this thesis, this chain of inquiry be continued into further study and further that the definition of what constitutes a ‘successful’ creative economy is explored.

As well as recommending further research into the question whether Auckland’s economy is, or is becoming, creative, I feel that this area of study is so closely linked with my research that not answering this question is a limitation of my research. I want to know what happens next, I want to know how the story ends, or at least the next instalment. Additionally, this would be an opportunity to explore further the critiques of Donegan et al (2008) and Malanga (2004) that cities may be economically successful for more than just the attributed ‘creative factors’. However, my methodology, research question and entire thesis do not seek to answer this, they seek to establish using fantasy theme chaining whether Auckland city is a physically creative city and, if so, in what ways. This research would have been enhanced by the addition of a second part to my research statement, which allowed me to explore whether Auckland does have a creative economy and if so, to what extent. However, for a Masters level thesis, this would not have been a realistic question, given the time and resource constraints. However, if this were a doctoral thesis, then it would have been an appropriate and exciting study scope.

6.2 Auckland’s creatification

In considering the policy in the creativising of Auckland city, Skilling’s (2005) suggestions of policy intervention achieving social cohesion and a creative economy is very much in keeping with my discussions about how the creative city and creative class are necessary to the creative economy. While there is debate about whether one needs to come first, I believe that policy intervention needs to address all three - the creative economy, the creative city and the creative class - as it is my opinion that a place cannot successfully have one without the others. This became
apparent to me very early on in my studies as the three key aspects of my research revealed themselves and it became clear that all three, not just one or two, must exist in order for the rhetorical vision to be realised; the creative city must be built, it must hold a creative class, and the creative class produce the creative output that provides for the creative economy. My discussion in this section and the following sections are based on this.

The first concluding principle I found within my data analysis is that Auckland city demonstrates the physical attributes of an inorganic creative city. Tracked back through policy documents, each development has been strategic and planned, thus linking or chaining the physical developments of Auckland city to an overriding rhetorical vision, as Bormann (1973) dictates it should. One of the key areas of discussion I found during my research is the organic vs inorganic city debate, and what this means for the city. I found this debate emerged during my background research, literature review and in my data analysis. While the actual terms organic and inorganic may not have been used, and they may not have been pitched against each other, I feel that one of the underlying and most vital themes I have from this research is that the idea of the creative city, creative class and creative economy will always link back to the organic or inorganic creative city.

Whereas an organic creative city has naturally occurring large clusters of creatives, or a pre-existing desired physical infrastructure that enhances creativity, or an existing economy strongly based on creativity, I believe Auckland is a product of deliberate policy intervention. An inorganic creative city. As a city, it has ‘checked the boxes’, I believe that Florida’s 3-Ts of technology, talent and tolerance have been addressed throughout the policy documents analysed by the building of communities and specific areas for learning. But what does that mean for the success of the creative city? The reasons behind the physical changes as explored in my data analysis chapter are in keeping with the theory of the inorganic creative city as outlined by key theorists including but not limited to Landry (2000) and
Florida (2002). The locality examples discussed in my data, the Aotea Quarter, Britomart Precinct, Learning Quarter and Victoria Quarter are all demonstrative of the rhetorical vision having reached actuality by way of the physical environment. These areas all represent a different, important aspect of creating the creative city. Aotea Quarter represents the arts in the most traditional understanding of the concept; it houses the Civic Theatre, the Aotea Centre, the Auckland Town Hall as well as the smaller Silo Theatre and Q Theatre facilities. The Learning Quarter represents education and knowledge while the Victoria Quarter and Britomart Precinct between them represent history, commerciality and entertainment. Every space is representative of the rhetorical vision in a physical sense. Each space has the features required to enhance the city and be the catalyst for change; to house the creative class and therefore the creative economy.

To address a concern surrounding the development of new areas in terms of space, place and time, with the added influence of global accessibility that technology increases have allowed, one of the concerns that Carr and Servon (2009) have is that places may lose the vernacular culture that makes them unique. In terms of Auckland city I think that, actually, the opposite has happened. To look at Britomart Precinct and Victoria Quarter, the most commercial of the case studies I have looked at, the redevelopments have enhanced the tradition and historical character of these areas by their rejuvenation. These areas have been restored to their former glory, not torn down and a completely new precinct built.

I believe Auckland is physically creative city, but can a manipulated creative city function as a natural creative city can? As creativity itself is such a natural, unprocurable act that cannot be forced or willed into being, does that detract from the creative city? Can creativity flow freely from creatives, in Auckland, enjoying their new manufactured creative city if the physical city was not a natural free flowing process? By purposely producing an area that is to foster a naturally occurring process, is it still able to achieve the same creative experience? It is my
belief that while Auckland is a manufactured creative city, it is now time to step back from intervention and hope that the city takes on a natural growth and become a creative city. The seed is planted, now it needs to flourish. As with nature, creativity still needs some input, such as water, sunlight and fertiliser. Some input is natural, but some is manufactured. But the growth process from now is a naturally occurring one even if it is given some help, it cannot be forced to flourish. Auckland has built the creative city physically, and now creativity needs to prosper and harvest creativity.

For each of the four Auckland city wards I closely examined, there are policy documents to back up my findings as identified in my data. Outlined goals and objectives are demonstrative of the spreading of the rhetorical vision as explored throughout chapter five. These physical changes are the deliberate and specific result of intervention at a city council level. It is my opinion that Auckland city has successfully “built it”, but the second part of this quote tag line “they will come”, is still debateable (Florida, 2002). But if Auckland city has indeed built it, will they come? It is interesting that, after discussions in my first two chapters of research about the differences between the organically creative city and the inorganic, it seems to me, that now that Auckland has the created space for creativity to breed, this actually needs to happen alone and independently of policy intervention and Council manipulation.

Perhaps it is because of the very undefinable nature of creativity that ‘man made’ environments can only do so much and go so far and after that comes pure and natural creativity. And if the creative class do come, or if they do not, what happens to the manufactured creative city next? If creatives flock to the city can it be ‘set free’ of the policy control and intervention? Will Auckland prosper and become an economically successful creative city? That is now up to the creatives who are found in the physical inorganic creative city and the natural flow and growth that their creativity will take on. There is physically no reason why not, but whether it will happen or not cannot be
answered from this research. Auckland has produced a shell, but does it have a spirit? It is built, will they come? As Donegan, et al. (2008) and Malanga (2004) claim, if a city is economically successful it is important to establish if this is due to the creative facets or if it is because of more traditional economic growth factors that are largely overlooked in the realm of creative city discussions. This is another point that, going forward, Auckland city will need to make clear in any positive results contributed to the creative city. Going back to my research question, however, the purpose of this research was to trace ideas to reality, not to question the reasons for the change.

### 6.3 Rhetorical vision in practice

As proven in my data analysis, and as argued above, the rhetorical vision of Auckland being a creative city is very much present in the creative facets of Auckland city due to the faithfully followed step-by-step instructions given right back at the time of the crisis by Landry (2000) and Florida (2002). All of the actions in this thesis have stemmed from the moment of crisis, linking back to my research question and Auckland city as a way for fantasy theme analysis to reveal its workings. The rhetorical vision is that Auckland needed to become a creative city in order to have a buoyant, creative economy. Throughout the process of analysing my data it became apparent that the term ‘creative city’ was not clear enough to explain what was happening in Auckland. And, as explored in the section above, while there is a physical creative city, it remains to be seen if there is a creative city that houses a creative class and creative economy. An important aspect moving forward for Auckland city is a strong leader or leaders who will continue to drive the creative city, creative class and creative economy goals. To enjoy success, a leader “must develop a story of what their creative city could be and how to get there” (Landry, 2000, p. 109).

As discussed by Anderson (1983) in chapter three, a community can be built on anything individuals have in common. I propose that Auckland city has created numerous shared physical spaces throughout the city to encourage creative people to spend more time in these places and together, in order to strengthen the creative
community residing in Auckland. These shared areas are providing the vital common
ground, physically and literally, of creativity. This provides an example of the shared
group consciousness too, as creatives are sharing space and sharing ideas as well as
demonstrating an example to my research question, this is a way that the creativising
of Auckland City is demonstrating a shared fantasy theme. As Florida (2002) and
Landry (2000) both have stressed throughout their works, creatives are attracted to
cities where there are large clusters of other creatives. When these creatives get
together and share their experiences, they are strengthening the community feeling,
the idea of creatives within the city, and the networking of that city. Even if individuals
know very few other creatives in their area of the city, the mere fact that they know
there are others and the creative community exists, strongly binds them into this
community and therefore city (Anderson, 1973). This aspect will aid the hopes that
the creative class ‘will come’ to the city that has been built. And if they do come, and
Auckland realises its rhetorical vision of having a creative economy, it will be an
inorganic creative economy. Is an inorganic creative economy a real economy? I
believe so. Even if it is not a naturally occurring economy that does not mean it is not
real, the manufacturing and industrial economic strongholds can hardly claim to be
naturally occurring. But because I am discussing something that is a natural
occurrence, there is much more emphasis on it. A creative or knowledge economy is
based on the ideas that come out of people’s heads, their creativity. I therefore
believe that it does not matter if it is a ‘real’ economy or not because if it is based on
the creative output of people, and it is successful then the goal is achieved.

What would happen if Auckland did have a successful creative city, housing the
creative class who produce the creative economy? Once it is ‘successful’, will funding
be cut? Once the city is seen as economically viable is it then ‘successful’? What is the
measure of success? Is it when the creative process no longer needs policy, funding or
resource intervention? Have the resources afforded to this project of creativisation
acted as training wheels, and now the city is free to ride on its own, set up for
‘success’. Or if it is set free, will it wilt? Since Auckland was not an organically creative
city, is there meant to be a creative city at all? Are there fundamental factors that
have been ignored working against the creativising of Auckland? If a creative city does not happen naturally but grows creative through acts of policy, what does that mean for the future? Policy intervention has existed for generations to aid economic development, in the case of Auckland, time is the only thing that can answer these questions.

6.4 Symbolic Convergence Theory

In this case, Bormann’s fantasy theme analysis (1973) methodology of symbolic convergence theory has revealed itself to be a beneficial way to explore a process like the creativising of Auckland city. This is because this particular symbolic convergence theory methodology has allowed me to track the concept of the creative city from the establishing premise (Landry, 2000; Florida, 2002) through Council documents, into mainstream media and then to real life examples.

This chaining of events simultaneously developed a script that I have referred to throughout my data analysis in chapter five. This script started as key words and catchphrases from Landry (2000) and Florida’s (2002) introductory works. These then grew to a longer list, with the catch phrases becoming more widely used and recognised. A script is the natural progression of this, and giving the audience a guideline of how to retell persuasively the story of the creative city and be able to explain why it is so important. In this particular case, I believe a script lends itself to this fantasy theme as there are many new ideas that the audience needs to be persuaded of. This is not a requirement of symbolic convergence theory or of fantasy theme analysis, however I believe it has been extremely helpful in this case study.

One aspect I have found surprising during this research is the number of lists and checklists that I have come across, been provided with, and created myself. Landry (2000) and Florida (2002) both provide checklists for what a creative city will need. Starkwhite (2002), Snapshot (2005) and Blueprint (2009) all include multiple checklists.
Symbolic convergence theory was a list of eleven different aspects. I have found this interesting and I suspect it is a tool to aid the ‘telling of the story’, to help the actors understand. If a checklist is provided, the actions that need to be taken are very clear, providing coherency and grounding a new theory into a logical layout.

As shown in my data analysis, Auckland’s creative economy needs a certain environment in order for the planted creative economy seed to flourish. It seems that while Auckland City will never be organically creative, there is only so much that can be put in place before policy interventions and resource allocations must step back and allow the city to become what it will. This links back to Florida’s “if you build it they will come” motto (2002) and exemplifies the creative script, as identified using fantasy theme analysis (Bormann, 1972). My data demonstrates that Auckland city is physically representing everything it needs to be in order for a creative class to live, work and play within the city walls and be motivated by their physical surroundings into becoming efficient creative producers. Auckland has built it, as for the ‘will they come’ part, this needs further discussion. Fantasy theme analysis focuses on the chaining of events, and links communications to track the development, and spread an acceptance of a rhetorical vision from origin into reality (Bormann, 1973). What fantasy theme analysis does not seek to know is whether Auckland city actually has a creative economy and at what level of contribution to the Auckland GDP it can be considered a creative city with a successful and buoyant creative economy, or what will happen next. What I can draw from my data, by way of fantasy theme analysis, is that Auckland has all the outlined physical attributes required in order to have the best possible chance of becoming a creative hub.

Perhaps, tellingly, the three concluding principles I discuss in the coming sections have terminated their discussions at a very similar place, ‘what next’. This allows me to strengthen my argument when revisiting my research question. In what ways does the creativising of Auckland City reveal the inner workings of Bormann’s (1973) fantasy theme analysis? Auckland city displays many physical attributes of what Landry (2000)
and Florida (2002) state a city needs to be creative. There are strong and obvious links from this academic idealism steaming from the ‘moment of crisis’; the end of the industrial era. Tracing academic theorists’ exact words and quotes from their original work through research papers, policy documents, unitary plans, media and then to physical real life, allows me to strengthen the chains of the fantasy themes of the creative economy, creative city and creative class, culminating in the shared rhetorical vision of a creative Auckland.

Auckland has been creativised. Physically, Auckland has a creative city. As Bormann states, symbolic convergence theory allows the researcher to trace messages and estimate the future of them, but the researcher’s role ends there. There is no control over the message, or over the communication between groups and individuals (1982, p.50). Similar to nature, studying creativity must be done as an observer. If the goal is to observe events, and chain activities and communications, then this must be done from an ‘outsider’s’ point of view. If influences come from outside, that changes the natural course of growth. As Bacon (1620) established, intervening factors can be used to manipulate the course of growth, and this is what has occurred in Auckland’s physical city. By using fantasy theme analysis, I have been able to track these changes, and link them back to original, establishing ideas while looking at the situation as a whole from the ‘outside’. In keeping with this, it is my opinion that everything needed to have a creative economy is in place; this is what I expect if the theories I have discussed throughout this research are correct. However, at this point in my research, it cannot be determined whether Auckland’s quest for the creative economy has been successful. What I can be sure of is that fantasy theme analysis has allowed me to track the development of this city up to this point through documents and chain progresses to the creative advancement of the Auckland CBD.


doi: 10.1177/016001799761012334


APPENDICES

Appendix A

Quality of living index

10 Best Places to Live In 2011 (Quality of Living Index)

2011 has just begun with many New Year resolutions and plans as we all are hoping for a better and brighter future. If you plan to shift to some better place, this list is your guide. This list ranks 10 cities out of 221 as the “10 Best Places to Live In 2011 (Quality of Living Index)”. The cities were evaluated on 39 factors including political, economic, environmental, personal safety, health, education, transportation and other public service factors. Cities were compared to New York City which was given a base score of 100. Vienna tops the list with an index of 108.6.

10. Sydney, Australia

Sydney makes it to # 10 in our list of 10 Best Places to Live In 2011 with a Mercer score of 106.3. The city has an average life expectancy of 80.73 years. It has a population of 4,504,469. The city is known for tourism, entertainment and outdoor sports. Sydney has grown to become a wealthy and prosperous city, ranking as the second wealthiest city in the world in terms of per Capita purchasing power. The GDP of Switzerland is $494.6 billion. Sydney has a temperate climate with mild winters and warm winters.
9. Bern, Switzerland

The city at #9 is Bern from Switzerland. Bern is the fourth most populous city of Switzerland with a population of 123,466. Bern is a beautiful city with a rich culture and creative infrastructure. The city has a well-established transportation system. The life expectancy in Bern at birth is 80.3 years. Switzerland has a stable economy with a GDP of $491.4 billion making Bern an ideal place to live.

8. Frankfurt, Germany

Standing at #8 is Frankfurt am Main also known as Frankfurt, the largest city in the German state of Hesse and the fifth-largest city in Germany, with a population of 672,000. There is a tie between Frankfurt and Munich as both have a Mercer score of 107.0. It is the business and financial centre of Germany. Frankfurt is a city of contrasts with wealthy bankers, students and granola drop-outs coexisting in a city. The sky scrapers of the city give the city a beautiful modern look on a cultural background. The GDP of Germany is $3.673 trillion making Frankfurt an ideal place to move to. Life expectancy of Frankfurt at birth is 79.26 years.
7. Munich, Germany

Munich is the capital city of Bavaria (Bayern), Germany. It is located on the River Isar, north of the Bavarian Alps. Munich has a Mercer score of 107.0. The GDP of Germany is $3.673 trillion. Munich is a financial and publishing hub, and a frequently top-ranked destination for migration and expatriate location. Munich has a continental climate, with a strong impact due to the proximity of the Alps. City’s architecture is a mix of ethnic and cultural architecture and modern architecture. The average life expectancy of Munich at birth is 79.1 years.

6. Dusseldorf, Germany

Again from Germany is Duesseldorf with a Mercer score of 107.2. Today’s Duesseldorf is quite different from the Duesseldorf of the past. Modern day Duesseldorf is an important international business and financial centre, renowned for its fashion and trade fairs. The GDP of Germany is $3.673 trillion. The city has a population of 586,217. It has brilliant health care system and a stable political situation.
5. Vancouver, Canada

The amazing city of Vancouver is a coastal city located in the Lower Mainland of British Columbia, Canada. It is a perfect place to live with a well-developed and well-established infrastructure, brilliant tourism spots, high educational standards and great health care system. The Mercer score of the city is 107.4. It is the largest metropolitan area in Western Canada. The city has a population of 578,041 and an average life expectancy at birth of 81.16 years. The GDP of Canada is $1.522 trillion.

4. Auckland, New Zealand

Standing at #4 is Auckland. There is a tie between Vancouver and Auckland as both the cities have a Mercer score of 107.4. New Zealand’s most beautiful and biggest city, Auckland has breathtaking scenery, beautiful beaches, idyllic holiday islands, outstanding food and wine, great shopping and exciting nightlife.

Auckland has a warm-temperate climate, with warm, humid summers and mild, damp winters. The city has a population of 1.18 million and an average life expectancy at birth of 80.24 years. GDP of New Zealand is $119.549 billion.
3. Geneva, Switzerland

Geneva, Switzerland is the second most populous city of Switzerland with a population of 185,958. The city is catching the attention of more and more people due to its wonderful quality of life. It has gained a Mercer score of 107.9. Geneva is a city of prime importance being a major centre of international diplomacy. The city has excellent health care and education system. It is stable politically and economically as the GDP of Switzerland is $491.4 billion.

2. Zurich, Switzerland

The largest city of Switzerland, Zurich is the 2nd best city with a Mercer score of 108.0. The cities total population is 365,098. The city has a life expectancy of 80.74 years. GDP of Switzerland is $491.4 billion. Zurich is the financial centre of Switzerland and houses the stock exchange and the headquarters of a large number of national and international companies. The city is known as “Portal to the Alps” due to its close distance to tourist resorts in the Swiss Alps and its mountainous scenery. The city is also famous for its famous watchmakers. It is a beautiful city with an elegant infrastructure, a warm and cosy environment offering a unique mix of discovery, pleasure, nature and culture.
1. Vienna, Austria

Vienna, Austria tops the list and stands at #1 as the best place in the world to live with a Mercer score of 108.6. Vienna is Austria’s primary city, its capital. It is its cultural, economic, and political centre with a population of about 1.7 million. The city has its own unique colours. Vienna experiences four season in a year with a mild summer season and a rather windy and rainy winter season. GDP of Austria is $361.791 billion. Vienna has an extensive transportation system and a very reliable health system. The country’s political stability also makes it a place worth living. Life expectancy in Vienna is 79.5 years.
### Appendix B

**Auckland’s creative budget**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Estimated Budget</th>
<th>Additional Notes</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Britomart Precinct</td>
<td>$350,000,000</td>
<td>The main features of the project agreement are that the Council:</td>
<td>Bingham, 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Acquires a transport centre, a traffic underpass (Quay Street East) and public areas at a fixed cost of $100 million, with the developer being responsible for the completion of these facilities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Contributes $23 million to heritage protection and infrastructure services and $2.3 million towards associated works.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sells Britomart properties to the developer for $56 million, with the sale proceeds providing a loan to the developer for the same amount.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Provides a &quot;Standby Takeout Facility&quot; for unsold development sites. The maximum possible exposure is $230 million on the basis that</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Auckland City Council, 1999</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
unsold sites are held by the Council as a security.
- Obtains resource consents for the project, and forgoes development levies and rates for up to five years.  
  (Auckland City Council, 1999)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aotea Quarter</td>
<td>$22,300,000</td>
<td>The redevelopment will restore the square to its former status as the city’s leading public open space and events venue. The project also includes repairing and strengthening the Civic car park roof ($16.1 million in 2008/2009 and $29.5 million in 2009/2010-2010/2011), and alterations to the front of the Aotea Centre ($1.9 million in 2008/2009 and $8.2 million in 2009/2010-2010/2011). $22.3 million (excludes 2008/2009 budget of $2.9 million; excludes Civic car park roof replacement budget and Aotea Centre alterations budget) The redevelopment will increase recreation options by providing a major venue for everyday activities for Aucklanders and visitors to enjoy. It will enable the hosting of major big screen events, music concerts and cultural events.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Auckland City Council, 2009c</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Learning Quarter | $800,000 | Auckland city’s tertiary institutions are part of our competitive edge and play a fundamental role in the city’s economic future. The council works with these institutions in a number of ways, including the Learning Quarter project which aims to maximise the benefits of New Zealand’s leading tertiary institutes being located in Auckland’s CBD. Our capital investment of around $0.8 million in the Learning Quarter will, among other things, enable the city to benefit from opportunities for the commercialisation of research.

AUT University, The University of Auckland and Auckland City Council have formed a partnership to develop a plan to guide the social, economic, cultural and physical development of the area around the universities. The initiative will provide significant potential for the partners to work together to leverage the economic and social opportunities provided by the two universities, including the commercialisation of research. $0.8 million. The project will result in a | Auckland City Council, 2009c |
A world-class centre for education, research and commercial development, attracting students, researchers and businesses to base their work here. Greater economic and social opportunities will be available due to the stimulus of education, cultural, research and business experience.

Auckland City Council. (2009c).

| Victoria Quarter | $20,000,000 | Victoria Park Market, 2013 |

Notes quoted directly from reference listed.
Appendix C

Auckland’s creative wards

Map of Identified Aotea Precinct

Auckland City Council, 2004
Map of Identified Britomart Precinct

Auckland City Council, 2004
Map of Identified Learning Quarter

Auckland City Council, 2012b.
Auckland City Council, 2009a
Map of identified Victoria Quarter

Auckland City Council, 2012a