Customers’ expectations of hotel green marketing: A New Zealand quantitative study

Noor Amalina binti Mat Yusof

A dissertation submitted to
Auckland University of Technology
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of International Hospitality Management (MIHM)

2014

School of Hospitality and Tourism
# Table of Contents

List of figures ........................................................................................................ iv
List of tables ........................................................................................................... iv
Attestation of Authorship ....................................................................................... v
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................. vi
Abstract ................................................................................................................ vii

## Chapter One – Introduction

1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
1.2 Background of the research ......................................................................... 1
1.3 Purpose of the research ............................................................................... 2
1.4 Green marketing ......................................................................................... 2
    1.4.1 Green marketing definition and concept ........................................ 3
1.5 Synopsis of the method ............................................................................... 4
1.6 Outline of the structure ............................................................................. 4
1.7 Summary ....................................................................................................... 5

## Chapter Two - Literature review

2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 6
2.2 New Zealand tourism industry .................................................................... 6
2.3 History of green consumers ........................................................................ 8
2.4 Customers’ perspectives of green hotels ..................................................... 9
2.5 Hoteliers’ commitment to green marketing strategies ......................... 10
2.6 Customers’ perceptions of green marketing ............................................ 12
    2.6.1 Green products ............................................................................ 13
    2.6.2 Green pricing ............................................................................. 15
    2.6.3 Green promotion ......................................................................... 16
    2.6.4 Green place or distribution ....................................................... 19
2.7 Theory of Planned Behaviour ................................................................... 20
2.8 Summary ....................................................................................................... 21

## Chapter Three – Research methodology

3.1 Introduction ................................................................................................. 22
3.2 Research objectives ................................................................................. 22
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Research paradigm</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Research design</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Research instrument and structure</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Population and sample size</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Ethical considerations</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Data collection process</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Response rate</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Data analysis</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10.1</td>
<td>Frequency distribution technique</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10.2</td>
<td>Central tendency technique</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10.3</td>
<td>Comparative analysis</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Four - Results ........................................................................ 32

4.1 Introduction ................................................................................. 32

4.2 Results ....................................................................................... 32

4.2.1 Respondents’ characteristics .............................................. 32

4.2.2 Green marketing ................................................................. 34

4.2.3 Demographic profiles and 4 Ps of the marketing mix ............. 42

4.2.4 Expectations of environmentally friendly practices within green hotels ........................................................................ 43

4.3 Summary ...................................................................................... 45

4.3.1 Respondents’ characteristics (see Section 4.2.1) .................. 45

4.3.2 Green marketing (see Section 4.2.2) .................................... 45

4.3.3 Demographic profiles and 4 Ps marketing mix (see Section 4.2.3) ........................................................................ 46

4.3.4 Environmentally friendly practices in green hotels (see Section 4.2.4) .............................................................. 46

Chapter Five - Discussion .................................................................... 47

5.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 47

5.2 Respondents’ characteristics ..................................................... 47

5.3 Customer perceptions of green-marketing strategies ................ 48

5.3.1 Green products ........................................................................ 48

5.3.2 Green prices ........................................................................... 50

5.3.3 Green promotion ...................................................................... 51

5.3.4 Green place or distribution .................................................... 53

5.4 Expectations of hotel environmentally friendly practices .......... 54

5.5 Theory of planned behaviour and findings .................................. 57
Chapter Six - Conclusion

6.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 58
6.2 Conclusion and implications for hoteliers ................................................................. 58
   6.2.1 Customer intention to purchase green products ...................................................... 59
6.2.2 Commitment of hoteliers in instituting green practices ........................................... 60
6.2.3 Internet technology ......................................................................................................... 60
6.2.4 Pricing strategies ............................................................................................................. 60
6.2.5 Eco-labels ......................................................................................................................... 60
6.2.6 Overall image of the green hotels ................................................................................. 61
6.2.7 Best practices in the green hotels ................................................................................ 61
6.3 Limitations ......................................................................................................................... 61
6.4 Recommendations / Indication for future research .................................................... 63
6.5 Summary ............................................................................................................................ 65

References .................................................................................................................................. 66

Appendices .................................................................................................................................. 72

Appendix A – Questionnaire .................................................................................................... 72
Appendix B – Participant Information Sheet ......................................................................... 77
Appendix C – AUTEC approval ............................................................................................... 79
Appendix D - Table of frequency distribution of respondents’ expectations of business practices within green hotels ............................................................................................................. 80
Appendix E - Table of central distribution (mean and 95% Confidence Interval of the mean scores) for each attributes with questions .................................................................................................................. 81
Appendix F-Table of central distribution (mean and 95% Confidence Interval of the mean scores) for each attributes .................................................................................................................. 84
Appendix H - Table of central tendency (mean and 95% Confidence Interval of the mean scores) for product, price, promotion and place ...................................................................................... 87
Appendix I – Table of Comparison of means for product, price, promotion and place . 88
List of figures:

Figure 2.1: Schematic overview of a typical hotel facility’s interaction with the environment and negative externalities generated

Figure 2.2: Four Ps of the marketing mix

Figure 2.3: Theory of planned behaviour

Figure 4.1: Central distribution tendencies of green products related statements

Figure 4.2: Central distribution tendencies of green prices related statements

Figure 4.3: Central distribution tendencies of green promotion related statements

Figure 4.4: Central distribution tendencies of green place or distribution related statements

Figure 4.5: Mean scores of product, price, promotion and place

Figure 4.6: Frequency distributions of respondents’ expectations of business practices in green hotels

List of tables:

Table 1.1: A comparison of traditional and green marketing

Table 3.1: Divisions of the statements based on the four P’s of the marketing mix

Table 3.2: Selection criteria for respondents

Table 4.1: Frequency analysis of respondents’ demographic characteristics

Table 4.2: Individuals items within graphs (for Figure 4.2, Figure 4.3, Figure 4.4, Figure 4.5 and Figure 4.6)

Table 4.3: Central distribution tendencies of green product-related statements

Table 4.4: Central distribution tendencies of green prices-related statements

Table 4.5: Central distribution tendencies of green promotion-related statements

Table 4.6: Central distribution tendencies of green place- or distribution- related statements
Attestation of Authorship

“I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person (except where explicitly defined in the acknowledgements), nor material which to a substantial extent has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning.”

...................................................

Noor Amalina binti Mat Yusof
October 2014
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deepest appreciation to all those who provided me the possibility to complete this dissertation. Special respect and gratitude are due to my academic supervisors, Dr Jill Poulston and Dr Claire Liu, who helped me patiently, especially in writing this dissertation. Their advice, field expertise and continuous encouragement were invaluable; therefore my sincere thanks to Dr Poulston and Dr Liu for their supervision and mentorship.

Furthermore, it is a great honour to thank my family for the support they have provided me throughout my entire life and I must acknowledge my husband, parents, parent-in-law and siblings. This important undertaking would not have been achievable without your motivation, encouragement and valuable input.

I would also like to thank Dr David Parker for his guidance so I could better structure this dissertation. Rodney Wilson deserves my salute for his patience in proofreading my work.

Very special thanks to Dr Richard Turner and Kaye Watson who provided me with permission to offer the questionnaire to their delegates.

Finally, Thank You, God for guidance and strength to complete this study!

This research was approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee on 18th March 2014. AUTEC Reference number 14/36.
Abstract

Tourists’ perceptions of destination impacts and environmental consequences of their visits to destinations likely play a central role in travel decision-making (Lee, Hsu, Han, & Kim, 2010). Their demands for environmentally friendly products encourage hotels to react accordingly by participating in the ‘green movement’ and committing to green marketing strategies that require both financial and non-financial support. With a developing demand for environmentally friendly products and hotels, the purchasing of green products by customers should be increasing, but recently the actual purchasing of these products seems to have declined. Green marketing is proposed to neutralise negative perceptions towards green practices (Rex & Bauman 2007). This study therefore investigates customer perceptions of green marketing strategies and activities.

Particularly, this study examines green marketing related activities with two main objectives: (1) explore hotel customers’ opinions of green marketing strategies and (2) explore hotel customer expectations of environmental best practices within green hotels. Focusing on the New Zealand context, this study aims to assist green hoteliers to better develop green marketing to improve such initiatives in the hotel industry. Customer perceptions are explored utilising the four Ps of the marketing mix: product, price, promotion and place.

A quantitative case study approach to the research is used. In particular, a self-administered questionnaire was given to delegates who attended an environmental-related conference in Auckland in 2014. Respondents were expected to have informed knowledge about the environment and hotel green marketing programmes. This knowledge was expected to provide insights to help marketers develop better green marketing strategies.

As explained in the results chapter, respondents acknowledged certain green marketing strategies as effective, neutral or ineffective. Effective strategies were those in which green products were seen as special, those that used internet technology to disseminate green initiatives to customers, where green practices were undertaken at the premises, where appropriate business partners were used, where environmentally friendly distribution channels (from vendors to customers) were used, and where the overall image was believed to encourage customers to purchase green products at a green hotel.
The functionality of eco-labels in green promotions was perceived neutrally. Some respondents acknowledged the importance of these eco-labels as quality assurance, while others perceived them as uninteresting promotional strategies. The ineffective green marketing strategy was pricing strategy; respondents expressed their particular dislike of being charged extra for green products. The results also produced a surprise finding; in spite of viewing green products as special, respondents also believed green products may harm human health. In terms of green practices, generally respondents favoured tangible practices. However, they mostly preferred practices in which they could participate (e.g. recycling programmes, linen and towel re-use programmes), those which they were involved with at home (e.g. recycling programmes, linen and towel re-use programmes, using green cleaning products) and those which were convenient for them while staying at a hotel.

These findings can assist hoteliers to review their current green marketing strategies and develop better ones to persuade green customers to purchase green products. In terms of the academic literature, results of this study were successful in their aim of adding new knowledge to the green marketing research area.
Chapter One – Introduction

1.1 Introduction
This chapter provides an overview of the research, starting with background information about the challenges associated with green marketing which underpin this study. It then briefly explains the purpose of the study and its two main objectives. The synopsis of the method will be presented together with brief outlines of the chapter structures.

1.2 Background of the research
The green marketing concept emerged in the late 1980s when people became aware of the destruction of the environment resulting from economic growth (Peattie & Crane, 2005). This destruction, caused by pollution, global warming and deforestation, resulted in the emergence of a new type of consumer concerned about the well-being of the environment. Because of increased environmental awareness, some people changed their lifestyles and decision-making to accommodate environmental concerns. These consumers also demanded products and services which support environmental conservation or at least have a minimal negative impact on the environment. Their demands encouraged companies to launch new products and services labelled ‘environmentally friendly’ or ‘green’ (Peattie, 1995).

The tourism sector has also been affected by these changes. Demands for environmentally friendly products encourage hotels to react appropriately, by participating in the ‘green movement’ (Lee, Hsu, Han, & Kim, 2010). With the stronger demand for environmentally friendly products and hotels (Kang, Stein, Heo, & Lee, 2012), actual purchasing was expected to increase, but purchasing of green products seems to have declined over time (Peattie & Crane, 2005). The inconsistency between the perceived willingness to purchase environmentally friendly products and actual purchasing habits requires further exploration.

In terms of the hotel sector, green marketing seems to be one innovation that helps promote green products sold by hotels. Thus, many hotels have a firm commitment in their green marketing strategies to convince customers to purchase their products (Chan, 2013). However, purchasing of green products seems to have declined over time (Peattie & Crane, 2005). Another inconsistency therefore exists, between the increased commitment of hoteliers and the decreased consumption by customers.
Rex and Baumann (2007) highlighted the weaknesses of hotel green marketing, as it has not succeeded in increasing the consumption of green products. In comparison, the food sector is able to attract people and increase consumption over time (Ginsberg & Bloom, 2004), while this has not happened in the hotel sector. Thus, the study of customer perceptions of hotels’ green marketing is crucial in order to understand this conundrum.

Review of previous literature shows that there is a lack of research in the green marketing area (Myung, McClaren, & Li, 2012). This study intends to add to the knowledge of green marketing, especially from a customer perspective, in a New Zealand context.

1.3 Purpose of the research
As noted, additional information is required in the green marketing area. This study aims to add to the knowledge of customer perceptions and expectations of green marketing strategies used by hotels in New Zealand. The New Zealand context was chosen because there has been little (if any) research on this topic in New Zealand. Additionally, the reliance of New Zealand’s tourism sector on the natural environment makes this research topic particularly significant (see TIANZ, n.d).

This project is expected to benefit many parties. Industry operators will gain knowledge on how best to position their marketing strategies in alignment with customer needs and also how to anticipate whether their green investments are likely to be profitable. For the wider community, the study will develop a better understanding of hotels’ green marketing initiatives. For customers, this study will assist with a better interpretation of their opinions, expectations and understandings in relation to green marketing. This research project therefore seeks to accomplish the following objectives:

1. Explore hotel customers’ opinions of green marketing strategies; and
2. Explore hotel customers’ expectations of environmental best practices in green hotels.

1.4 Green marketing
The concept of green marketing (which proposes to neutralise negative perceptions), should not be confused with ‘green washing’. Green washing is the manipulation of information by industry to present themselves and products as environmentally friendly, whereas on scrutiny, it is found that only some components of their operations adhere to
the green concept (Jackson, 2010). In short, green washing is the making of false or misleading environmental claims (Peattie & Crane, 2005).

As noted, one of the ways to neutralise possible negative perceptions towards green practices is by disseminating a positive image through green marketing. The descriptions of green marketing in this section will start with definitions and concepts, before addressing hoteliers’ and customers’ perceptions about this marketing strategy.

1.4.1 Green marketing definition and concept
Several definitions of green marketing have been suggested. Pride and Ferrell (2006) defined ‘green marketing’ as efforts that consist of designing, promoting, pricing and distributing products that will not harm the environment. According to Peattie (1995), the term ‘green marketing’ also describes the process of identifying, anticipating and satisfying customer requirements for green products profitably. More recent definitions of green marketing emphasise the relationship with consumers while protecting the natural environment (Chamorro & Bañegil, 2006). All these definitions suggest a process of convincing customers to purchase green products to generate profit while at the same time, protect the well-being of the environment.

Several purposes of green marketing have been identified. According to Rex and Baumann (2007), green marketing is intended to address environmental issues so customers can consider this information in their purchasing decision. Kotler and Keller (2012) simplified green marketing programmes into three components: people, planet and profit. Ginsberg and Bloom (2004) broaden the aim of green marketing to include achieving an edge against hotel competitors. All of these are focused mostly on gaining short-term profits, and do not include educating customers to encourage environmentally friendly habits for long-term purposes. Even though one of the stated purposes of green marketing is to protect the environment, green hoteliers’ sincerity is therefore still questionable.

There are several differences between green marketing and traditional marketing, as presented in Table 1.1, which illustrates hoteliers’ increasing commitment to implementing green marketing initiatives.
Table 1.1 A comparison of traditional marketing and green marketing, adapted from Chamorro and Bañegil (2006, p.13).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Differences</th>
<th>Traditional marketing</th>
<th>Green marketing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parties involved in exchange</td>
<td>Company and customer</td>
<td>Company, customer and environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>Satisfaction of company objectives</td>
<td>1. Customer satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Satisfaction of company objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Minimise ecological impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate responsibility</td>
<td>Economic responsibility</td>
<td>Social responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reach of marketing decisions</td>
<td>From manufacture to product use</td>
<td>Entire product value chain from obtaining raw materials to post-consumption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological demands</td>
<td>Legal requirement</td>
<td>Beyond law; design for Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green pressure groups</td>
<td>Confrontation or passive attitude</td>
<td>Open relationship and collaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1.5 Synopsis of the method
This study is exploratory and employs a quantitative approach to help understand customers’ perceptions of green hotel marketing. The study uses a questionnaire to collect data from delegates who attended an environmental conference in New Zealand in April 2014. It was expected the respondents would have an interest in and informed knowledge of current environmental conditions in respect of green practices. They were also expected to have some understanding of hotels’ green marketing strategies. It was also anticipated that they would have different views from average customers with respect to the green marketing of hotels and could add new knowledge to the green marketing research area. This study targeted 80 delegates, and 40 of these completed the questionnaire. The study utilised a quantitative approach, and descriptive data analysis was used to analyse the data.

1.6 Outline of the structure
The overall structure of the dissertation takes the form of six chapters, including this introductory chapter. This chapter outlines the background of the study, how the research objectives arose, and a synopsis of the method employed for the project. The second chapter begins by reviewing the results of other studies that investigate customer
perspectives of green marketing in different countries, which is organised according to the 4 Ps of the marketing mix, namely, product, price, promotion and place. The third chapter is concerned with the research methodology, and the analysis of findings is presented in chapter four. Chapter five includes a discussion of the findings which is also organised according to the four Ps of the marketing mix. Finally, chapter six concludes by providing a brief summary, identifying the limitations of the study, and suggesting directions for future research.

1.7 Summary
The inconsistency between perceived willingness to purchase hotels’ environmentally friendly products and actual purchasing habits requires investigation. This inconsistency is assumed to have been caused by the weaknesses of green marketing strategies implemented by hoteliers, but this is not certain. The study therefore aims to explore customers’ expectations of green marketing strategies in a New Zealand context. Judgemental sampling is used to identify respondents with an understanding of this issue. The next chapter will introduce several important green marketing concepts and discuss past studies on green marketing.
Chapter Two - Literature review

2.1 Introduction
This chapter reviews literature related to green marketing practices in the hotel industry, beginning with an overview of the New Zealand tourism industry. The history of green consumers and green hotels follows, and then the concept of green marketing and the commitment of hoteliers to green marketing strategies are presented. As this research project aims to investigate customers’ perceptions of green marketing, studies of customers’ perspectives will also be included. Later, it concludes by identifying gaps in the previous research that this study intends to fill.

2.2 New Zealand tourism industry
New Zealand is a highly sought-after tourist destination. In the 2008 Lonely Planet Traveller’s Pulse survey, New Zealand ranked the fifth most popular destination in the world (New Zealand Herald, 2010). This indication of tourists’ intentions to visit New Zealand may be the result of the beautiful natural environment on which the tourism sector relies. Fairweather, Maslin and Simmons (2005) analysed international visitors’ perceptions of New Zealand’s environment, and found they had been motivated to travel to New Zealand because of its ‘clean and green’ reputation. Furthermore, New Zealand has marketed itself as ‘100% Pure’ to encourage international and domestic tourists to visit (TIANZ, n.d). With such reliance on the environment for tourism businesses, it is important for the New Zealand tourism sector to address environmental challenges wisely.

The tourism sector is the second largest contributor of foreign exchange earnings to New Zealand annually (New Zealand Tourism, 2013). Tourism data for the year ending March 2013 showed that the expenditure by international and domestic visitors increased 2.2 to 2.4 per cent from 2012 (New Zealand Tourism, 2013). These statistics indicate the New Zealand tourism sector has an opportunity to further increase revenue.

Both local and international visitors regard New Zealand as a clean and green country. The main reason for this is because New Zealand has a low population density which produces relatively light environmental pressures (Chapman, n.d.). In a survey that asked New Zealanders about environmental elements, such as soil, air, water and wetlands, from 2004 to 2008, respondents expressed dissatisfaction only about New Zealand’s air quality due to tourism activities, whereas they expressed satisfaction with
the rest of the elements (Hughey, Kerr, & Cullen, 2008). However, their satisfaction with other elements decreased annually during the period of the survey. This suggests that even though New Zealand is considered by some to be clean and green, prompt action must be taken to improve air quality while conserving the other elements of the environment.

As both the environment and the tourism sector are important for New Zealand, the government has introduced a ‘responsible tourism’ programme that aims to protect and enhance the environment without reducing the profit of tourism businesses (Tourism New Zealand, 2013). Supported by The Tourism Industry Association (TIA) and various associations, this ‘responsible tourism’ environmental-related programme involves:

- **Energy Efficiency Programme**: assisting tourism operators in using energy efficiently.
- **Qualmark Green**: encouraging tourism operators to apply for Qualmark’s assessment, which checks environmental practices and overall business operations
- **CarboNZero Programme**: helping tourism operators to measure and reduce carbon emissions.

An advantage is created by business operators if they participate in the ‘responsible tourism’ programme. These value-added products and services may translate into a marketing edge that can help tourism operators attract environmentally conscious consumers (TIANZ, n.d). Green consumers may be attracted to those responsible businesses which are committed to integrating environmental practices within their operations.

This section shows the importance and reliance of New Zealand’s tourism industry on a clean environment as its main asset to attract green consumers. As mentioned in Chapter One, there are inconsistencies between green consumers’ purchase intentions and actual purchasing, which have the potential to negatively affect New Zealand’s tourism spending in the future.
2.3 History of green consumers

Global studies show high levels of environmental concern in the majority of the population about ecological degradation (Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006), with particular concern developing in the late 1980s (Peattie, 1995). Recent issues such as global warming, ozone depletion, the greenhouse effect, climate change, mass extinction of species, deforestation and accelerating loss of natural habitats and acid rain (Kotler, 2011; Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006) have inspired the demand that this planet be conserved for future generations. This demand affects stakeholders such as customers, local communities, government, and environmental interest groups, all of whom need to encourage businesses to consider the ecological impact of business decision-making.

Some people have adopted more environmentally friendly lifestyles, which has led to new purchasing habits (French & Rogers, 2010). Some prefer to purchase products that have minimal impacts on the environment and work with firms that use environmental practices (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007). This emerging customer segment is referred to as green consumers, environmentally friendly customers or LOHAS (lifestyles of health and sustainability consumers) (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007; French & Rogers, 2010). The development of this consumer segment is associated with the creation of responsible business practices, also known as green practices, environmental initiatives, and so forth. This customer segment is selective in purchasing products and services, it prefers to purchase environmental friendly products and services from companies that are reducing their impact on the environment, or at least partly, on the basis of personal environmental criteria (French & Rogers, 2010; Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006). In the United States of America (US), this segment consists of 19 per cent of all adults, or 41 million people (Kotler, 2011) and is expected to grow in the future. This accounts for an estimated USD209 billion market in the US alone (Kotler, 2011).

This new trend of purchasing habits is affecting hotel businesses in a positive way. Customers with eco-friendly attitudes and concerns are favouring a green hotel over a normal one (Dalton, Lockington & Baldock, 2008; Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007), and some are willing to pay more for green products (Han, Hsu, & Lee, 2009). Whether or not they are genuinely interested in green issues however, is questionable. As noted in Chapter One, although consumption of green products and services by green customers has decreased over time, recent literature has reported a growing segment of these customers in the lodging industry. The opportunity therefore exists within the hotel.
industry, to encourage the development of green hotels, as described in section 2.4, paragraphs one and two.

2.4 Customers’ perspectives of green hotels

The growing segment of green consumers has affected the hotel industry worldwide. Their demand for environmentally friendly products has encouraged the development of a green marketplace and environmentally responsible business (Lee, Hsu, Han, & Kim, 2010; Baker, Davis, & Weaver, 2013). This green marketplace is developing in many parts of the world, delivering green products and services to green consumers (Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006). Hotels participating in the green marketplace are called ‘green hotels’. The concept of green hotels is articulated by the Green Hotel Association (GHA), which defines them as ‘environmentally friendly properties whose managers are eager to institute programmes that save water, save energy and reduce solid waste – while saving money – to help protect our one and only earth’ (Green Hotel Association, 2014). Preserving environmental quality should therefore be one of the priority areas on a business agenda. The green movement is encouraging changes to hotels’ products and services, processes, and policies (such as reducing energy consumption and waste generation), using environmentally friendly resources and instituting environmental management systems (Bansal & Roth, 2000).

In addition to preserving environmental quality, many other motives can be seen in this green movement: (1) Economic opportunities such as cost savings, competitive advantages, employee loyalty, increased customer satisfaction and retention; (2) regulatory compliance such as concerns about sanctions, fines and penalties and negative publicity; (3) minimisation of exposure to operational risks and (4) enhancement of a hotel’s image (Graci & Dodds, 2008; Ham & Choi, 2012; Aker, 2008). However, it is argued that cost-saving benefits always represent a primary driving force for the green movement. According to Manaktola and Jauhari (2007), this emphasis on cost issues may be due to the high fixed costs and low returns on investment that typify the lodging industry. Additionally, by instituting green practices, hotels are estimated to reduce about 20 per cent of their energy costs without any significant investment (O’Hanlon, 2005). In terms of waste materials, Bohdanowicz (2005) found that 50 to 60 percent of waste can be recycled or reused, which can result in considerable savings. Even so, the sincerity of hotels in instituting green practices has been the subject of debate.
Additionally, green practices are seen to be irresponsible towards other operational concerns in many cases. The business agenda of preserving a high quality environment and mitigating the negative effects to the environment, has contributed to rising criticism of existing tourism practices. Hotels are categorised among energy-intensive sectors, as they consume large amounts of water and energy and produce high levels of waste—more than any other category of the manufacturing and service industry of a similar size (Ham & Han, 2013; Leonidou, Leonidou, Fotiadis, & Zeriti, 2013; Ham & Choi, 2012). An overview of the interaction between hotels and the environment is presented in Figure 2.1. Therefore, the hotel industry is accused of worsening global environmental problems (Mensah & Mensah, 2013).

Many customers express their doubts about hotels’ intentions in relation to their green initiatives and the effectiveness of green practices on environmental well-being. Thus, some customers demand detailed information about the scope and effectiveness of environmental protection actions that businesses undertake (Grosbois, 2012). This detailed information about the effectiveness of green practices can be provided as part of green marketing initiatives.

2.5 Hoteliers’ commitment to green marketing strategies
It is important to acknowledge the commitment of hoteliers to green marketing strategies before discussing customer perspectives towards green marketing of hotels. Different companies have taken various approaches to green marketing. One approach is the use of marketing-mix tools in relation to product, price, promotion and place, as developed by Ginsberg and Bloom (2004). These authors suggested that green marketing strategies can be divided into four main categories: (1) the lean green strategy, (2) the defensive green strategy, (3) the shaded green strategy and (4) the extreme green strategy. These four strategies can be arranged according to the company’s commitment to engaging in an environmental conservation programme. Of the four strategies, the extreme green strategy is categorised as the strongest commitment—the company fully incorporates environmental issues and responsibility into their business strategy and addresses issues such as pricing, quality and manufacturing with regard to the environment. This requires investing in long-term, environmentally friendly processes that require financial and non-financial commitments (Ginsberg & Bloom, 2004). Employing Ginsberg and Bloom's (2004)
Figure 2.1 Schematic overview of a typical hotel facility’s interaction with the environment and negative externalities generated. Adapted from Jackson (2010, p. 220)

study, Chan (2013b) found large hotels in Hong Kong place a high importance on their green marketing strategies by choosing to adopt extreme or shaded marketing strategies (second strongest commitment). Therefore, most hotels give great importance to implementing green practices in their premises and the hope for increased profits.

Generally, chain-affiliated hotels or larger hotels are more likely to pay attention to environmentally friendly issues than small independent hotels (Bohdanowicz, 2005). They often incorporate environmental issues in their company policies, display statements of their environmental and social achievements, have better financial resources, and strive to maintain a good corporate brand image compared to individually owned and managed facilities (Bohdanowicz, 2005). Although Chan’s
(2013b) study took place in Hong Kong, since larger hotels are usually part of international hotel chains (Bohdanowicz, 2005), findings from Chan's research are applicable to the New Zealand hotel industry. Thus, it can be concluded that green hotels in New Zealand are likely to have a strong commitment to green marketing strategies.

The inconsistency between the decrease in the consumption of green products noted in Section 1.2 and the strong commitment to green marketing on the part of hoteliers outlined in this section also requires explanation.

### 2.6 Customers’ perceptions of green marketing

Although some researchers have indicated that hoteliers are confident in the success of green marketing, scholarly research and the media both report that marketing green products and services to consumers is on the decline (Peattie & Crane, 2005; Jackson, 2010). Rex and Baumann (2007) highlighted the weaknesses of hotel green marketing as the main reason for poor customer support for green products. Customers are often sceptical about claims of green products or green marketing, suspicious that companies prioritise economic opportunity and profit over responsibilities to reduce pollution and comply with regulations (Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006; D'Souza, Taghian, Lamb, & Peretiatkos, 2006). Hence, this study investigates customer perceptions of this inconsistency to help hoteliers develop better green marketing strategies.

Research identifies the four Ps of the marketing mix commonly used in the marketing area since the 1960s (Perreault et al., 2008) as these are proven to be still suitable for contemporary marketing applications (Anderson & Taylor, 1995). Specifically, this marketing mix, developed by McCarthy, consists of product, price, promotion and place as variables that can be used in developing a marketing strategy (see Figure 2.2) (Perreault, Cannon, & McCarthy, 2008). This study therefore applies the four Ps as the basis for consumers to review variables related to green marketing. See Section 2.6.1 to Section 2.6.4 describe customer perceptions with respect to the four Ps.
2.6.1 Green products

Green products are viewed as important marketing tools, with many hoteliers competing to provide green products that attract attention from customers (Jones, Hillier, & Comfort, 2014). Customers may look for tangible and intangible offerings of green hotels. Specifically, they look for features of the products, style, brand name, quality of services, company image and corporate reputation before choosing a hotel (Kotler & Keller, 2012; Graci & Dodds, 2008). In the case of green products or practices, the literature reveals that many hoteliers merely focus on the environmental implications brought by those practices rather than on what customers look for.

Green products and services are characterised by their ability to minimise environmental impacts or at least have less detrimental impacts on the environment than other similar products and services (iSustainableEarth.com, 2014). Manaktola and Jauhari (2007) found that green customers favour patronising green hotels that adopt green practices. D’Souza, Taghian, Lamb, and Peretiatkos (2006) found that customers positively evaluate their past experiences related to the purchase of and involvement with green products. The positive implications in protecting environmental well-being brought by green products are regarded as a major attraction which can increase the
intention of customers to purchase green products and services.

The literature describes attempts to find the best environmental friendly practices within the hotel sector. As a result, although in general green products are regarded as special, several green products or practices are most preferable and some are least preferable (Millar, Mayer, & Baloglu, 2012; Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007). Customers are likely to participate in green practices such as recycling programmes (recycling bins can be placed in either the lobby or in guest rooms) and towel or linen re-use programmes (customers can choose when to have their towels and linen washed) (Ham & Choi, 2012; Lee & Oh, 2014). These research results provide guidelines to the hoteliers on what customers prefer while staying at a green hotel.

Although several researchers have attempted to provide guidelines on which practices would succeed in convincing customers, customers tend to compare green products with traditional products found in standard hotels. In standard hotels, hoteliers offer products or practices according to convenience, availability, features, style, and brand name, with various prices from which customers can choose according to their financial ability (Kotler, 2011). In contrast, research shows that some hoteliers focus on providing only green products that sound environmentally friendly, instead of green products that customers want (Peattie & Crane, 2005; Rex & Baumann, 2007; Rettie, Burchell, & Chris, 2014). Hoteliers are seen to place a higher priority on profitability than reducing their operational impacts on the environment (D’Souza et al., 2006). Evidently, certain green products are viewed as a way for hotels to reduce costs, inconvenience as well as luxury (Baker, Davis, & Weaver, 2013). The use of recycled paper, options to re-use towels and linen for multiple night customers, are examples of green practices that customers view as cost-saving mechanisms that drop service standards and interfere with comfort (Baker, Davis, & Weaver, 2013; Robinot & Giannelloni, 2010; Two Tomorrows, 2014; Goldstein, Cialdini, & Griskevicius, 2008). Ginsberg and Bloom (2004) affirmed that green consumers want to be offered equal or higher level of quality of green products, services or practices compared with the usual services provided at a green hotel. In other words, green products must offer similar or better convenience, availability, price, quality and performance compared to that of traditional products. Thus, green hotels must include these attributes in their green products or practices in order to attract customers. These are also regarded as main weaknesses of green products compared to standard products (Peattie & Crane, 2005).
Despite negative and positive perceptions towards green products, neutral perceptions have also been recorded. Robinot and Giannelloni (2010) found that tourists who visit France evaluate products that protect the environment at a ‘basic’ level; that is to say, green products do not have a differentiating criterion likely to result in reduced satisfaction if evaluated unfavourably. Kasim (2004) found that tourists may be environmentally conscious at home, yet in choosing hotels, they consider hotels’ service quality, price, hotel architecture and ambience over their environmental image. Both studies suggest that green products are not as important as hoteliers’ view of them (see Section 2.5).

Further research is therefore required to clarify customer expectations related to green marketing strategies, as research on customers’ opinions about green products reveals inconsistencies.

### 2.6.2 Green pricing

The issue related to green pricing warrants further exploration because contradictory views are evident in the literature. Although much of the literature related to green marketing describes investigations this issue, especially on the customers’ willingness to pay a premium price for green products, findings are inconsistent and inconclusive (Myung et al., 2012). With regard to hoteliers, the implementation of green practices requires large, long-term financial investment and non-financial commitment (Ginsberg & Bloom, 2004) and accommodation with new regulations (due to the green movement) must be balanced with customers’ financial willingness to pay for their products in order to ensure return on investments for investors (Kotler, 2011). Therefore, it is suggested that hoteliers should have full information regarding this issue when developing a better pricing strategy to match with customers’ readiness to pay.

Customers are reported to be selective in purchasing green products and services and prefer companies committed to engaging in green practices (French & Rogers, 2010). Customers who are environmentally conscious at home are found to be willing to pay more for green products (Han et al., 2009), yet this finding contradicts that of Kasim (2004), who found that customers who are environmentally conscious at home have a negative influence on the selection of a hotel and financial contribution for those products. Differentiation of green products, overall image of the green hotels, high levels of environmental concerns and intention to support responsible businesses are indicators of the likelihood that those customers will choose the relevant products (Han
et al., 2009; Kotler, 2011). Apart from environmental conservation, most customers also expect responsible businesses to positively benefit society (Dutta, Umashankar, Choi, & Parsa, 2008). All benefits provided by purchasing green products are believed to convince customers to pay extra for those products.

Despite the aforementioned reasons for paying extra, a number of scholars argue that customer willingness to pay extra for green products is less than anticipated (Fairweather et al., 2005). The reluctance to pay more for green products was no doubt exacerbated by the recent 2008 Global Financial Crisis which means customers decreased their discretionary and travel spending (Kotler, 2011). Moreover, the weaknesses of certain green products which are viewed as a way for hotels to reduce costs, require customers to sacrifice their convenience, and reduce comfortable and luxurious conditions which they may well expect during their stay at a hotel (Baker et al., 2013). All of these are viewed as reasons for customers to be unwilling to pay a higher price for green products and services.

This section is a discussion of customers’ informed willingness to pay extra for green products. Inconsistencies between hoteliers perceived customers willingness to pay for green products and actual willingness need further investigation. This question creates challenges in developing accurate pricing strategy to attract green customers and obtain a good return on investments.

2.6.3 Green promotion
An effective promotional tool is to have a green marketing strategy. According to the European Commission (n.d), an effective green promotion includes raising awareness about what companies are doing, providing information regarding a company’s values, informing people about the products or services they bring to the market, and reaching the target audience. With regard to green hotels, it is important to choose the right communication tools to ensure that all of the above information, especially that which is related to green initiatives, reaches consumers. There are many ways of communicating green business practices, such as product labels (eco-labels), packaging, press relations, newsletters, issue-related events, reports (for example, yearly sustainability reports), guest books, media boards, in-house television, posters, flyers, leaflets, brochures, websites, advertisements, information packs, on-site sales activities and word-of-mouth (European Commission. n.d; Jackson, 2010). Prior to deciding which strategies to employ, the advantages of green promotional tools must be considered by the marketers. Various distribution channels have been used to attract customers. However,
in this study, only two green promotional strategies will be reviewed – eco-labels and corporate websites. These two channels are chosen, as research is inconclusive about their advantages and disadvantages.

Eco-labels are seen as an assurance of the quality of green practices implemented by the hoteliers. A tourism eco-label or environmental measure is defined as any form of certification used by businesses based on a known standard that enhances the environment or at least minimises environmental impacts (Fairweather et al., 2005). Eco-labels represent a sign of quality, which can advise customers that the hotel’s green practices comply with a series of criteria to ensure it has less environmental impact than standard hotel products (Fairweather et al., 2005; Chamorro & Bañegil, 2006). In a New Zealand study, 61 per cent of tourists preferred to choose a hotel with eco-label(s) (Fairweather et al., 2005). The eco-label is therefore seen as a reliable way for hoteliers to express their commitment to environmentally friendly practices.

There are various examples of eco-labels, including ISO 14001 (Certification for Environmental Management Systems), Green Globe 21 for global environmental standards including the lodging sector, Accor Planet 21, an initiative to change both production and consumption patterns in hospitality services towards environmental protection, and Earth Check assessment tools for Asia Pacific hotels, all of which are commonly used to promote green credentials (Lee et al., 2011; Chan, 2009; Organic Explorer, 2013; Accor Planet 21, 2013). In terms of hoteliers and the relative importance of the eco-label, Chan (2013b) found that many hotel groups such as Starwood Hotels and Resorts, Choice Hotels, Ibis and Shangri-La Hotels have plans to apply for ISO 14001 or to achieve ISO 14001 certification standards in their hotels. By integrating the eco-label, hoteliers can avoid some misperceptions (or ‘suspicions’) around green washing. One of the example of qualified responsible business in New Zealand industry is Langham Auckland Hotel which has awarded with Qualmark New Zealand (in 2011 and 2014), and Earthcheck Gold Certified (in 2012 and 2014) (Langham Hotels, 2015). However, some hoteliers claim that they engage in environmentally friendly practices by simply marketing ‘greenness’ without implementing any responsible practices (Pizam, 2009). Eco-labels can help hoteliers express their sincerity as they follow through with implementing environmentally friendly practices.
Nevertheless, the over-dependence of hoteliers on eco-labels in their marketing strategies might be one of the main problems of green marketing (Rex & Baumann, 2007). A paucity of information and standards about the implementation of environmentally friendly practices has caused interested customers to request more information about the sincerity of the hotels that are certified (Chan, 2009; Fairweather et al., 2005). Some customers see over-reliance on eco-labels merely as a marketing tool, instead of sincerity on the part of the hoteliers engaging in responsible business practices. As there are positive and negative perceptions of eco-labels, this study seeks to clarify those perceptions in order to promote green marketing strategies.

With advances in Internet technology and increasing numbers of Internet users, corporate websites as distribution channels have become a common marketing and communication tool. Leading hotel chains such as Wyndham, IHG, Accor, Whitbread, Hyatt, Rezidor, Sol Media, TUI and Scandic, all claim a strong commitment to sustainability by integrating environmental management into their businesses (Jones et al., 2014; Hsieh, 2012). Within websites, environmental issues such as water and energy conservation; climate change and greenhouse emissions; waste management and recycling; and biodiversity protection have been addressed (Jones et al., 2014; Grosois, 2012). Corporate websites can also be helpful in presenting information on environmental initiatives such as environmental policies, awards and recognition, and corporate sustainability reports. Thus, this medium is effective and efficient, as information related to hoteliers’ initiatives can be directly accessible by potential customers (Kotler, 2011).

Various customer perceptions regarding green promotions have been negative. Criticism relating to environmental problems resulting from hotel operations and benefits obtained instituting green practices influence customers’ negative perceptions of green promotions (Bohdanowicz, 2005). Hence customers perceive green promotions as one of the ways to attract them to purchase the products. Lack of detailed information about green promotions and green practices also tends to increase doubt and cynicism among customers (Sawani, Zain, & Darus, 2010). Some companies do not report actual business performance in their corporate websites (Sawani et al., 2010). According to Hsieh (2012), some hotel companies are not expected to have an environmental policy so they choose not to reveal this information. Additionally, some information is filtered by shareholders who may be selective in reporting issues related to their company because they fear that the information might affect their return on investment (Sawani et
Due to these issues, the accuracy of information on corporate websites is often questionable, and consequently, might cause difficulties when comparing and evaluating green practices among hotels. Doubts may also arise concerning the integrity of the hotel companies in integrating their environmental management into their businesses, which may affect their green marketing efforts.

Overall, there are many distribution channels that can be used with various levels of success, as each has certain advantages. Although eco-labels create some assurance, over-dependence could make customers uninterested. Moreover, the lack of detail about environmentally friendly initiatives on corporate websites is another problem identified in this review.

2.6.4 Green place or distribution
Green hoteliers need to consider where to locate their distribution facilities to maximise the effectiveness of their marketing strategies. Therefore, it is crucial for green hoteliers to locate their potential distribution channels to the right people (green consumers), at the right time and the right place to gain consumer commitment (Kotler & Keller, 2012).

The Internet is a common distribution channel used to inform people about their commitment to integrating environmental practices within their operations. One of the most common media used is a corporate website. On websites, hoteliers can present information regarding their environmental programmes, environmental policies, awards and recognition, and environmental reports (Grosbois, 2012; Hsieh, 2012). This distribution channel enables hoteliers’ initiatives to be directly accessible to customers and can reduce the amount of consumers driving to hotels (Kotler, 2011). In other words, customers can retrieve and compare information about different hotels without visiting each hotel. Therefore, the ability of the Internet to quickly generate publicity is regarded an effective tool for both green hoteliers and customers.

Some hotel operators choose to join central reservation associations (third party booking websites) to reach green travellers. These central reservation associations can assist with advertising and promotions for a fee and grant a membership (Pizam, 2009). For green hotels, the central associations should be consistent with the green image of the hotels, yet Pizam (2009) asserted that some have attempted to deceive the public by advertising unqualified hotels that do not use green practices. This needs to be considered by green
hoteliers when choosing to join central reservation associations to promote their commitments to green practices.

Partnering with various environmentally-related organisations can also be a green marketing strategy. According to Hsieh (2012), some hotels in the US partner with environmentally-related organisations such as the US. Green Building Council, Natural Step (a non-profit international organisation dedicated to advisory work, education, and research on sustainable development) and the US Environmental Protection Agency, for example, through its Energy Star programme (Hsieh, 2012). This selection is influenced by the image represented by the business partners, recent environmental issues, and consistency with the green image the hotels present (Chan, 2013a).

Understandings of the effectiveness of these distribution channels are mainly based on green hoteliers’ perceptions, without any input from customers. Thus, this study examines the effectiveness of green distribution channels from a customer perspective.

2.7 Theory of Planned Behaviour

This study has as its theoretical framework, the theory of planned behaviour developed by Icek Ajzen, which relates to predictions about human behaviour (Ajzen, 1991) (see Figure 2.3). According to this theory, “intentions to perform behaviours can be predicted with high accuracy from attitudes toward the behaviour, subjective norms, and perceived behavioural control; and these intentions, together with perceptions of behavioural control, account for considerable variance in actual behaviour” (p. 197). As this study will explore opinions and expectations of green marketing strategies and best practices in green hotels (see Section 1.3), the theory explains respondents’ behaviour toward purchasing green products and services. This prediction therefore, will help hotel practitioners to improvise their green marketing strategies and green practices toward attracting more customers to their hotels.
2.8 Summary

As discussed, green hoteliers are confident in the success of green marketing, but customers’ views of green marketing are still unknown. Most decisions related to green marketing strategies are made without considering the effectiveness of the marketing. Thus, a deeper understanding of customers’ desires and interest in green activities may lead to hotel organisations designing more efficient and effective green marketing programmes.

1. Inconsistencies between perceived willingness to purchase environmentally friendly products and actual purchase (see Section 2.6)

2. Inconsistencies between the commitment of hoteliers and customers’ consumption (see Section 2.5)

A clear understanding of customer perceptions about green marketing is needed to fill these gaps in the literature. Therefore, this study investigates and discusses in relation to customers’ perceptions about green marketing.
Chapter Three – Research methodology

3.1 Introduction
This chapter outlines the research methodology employed to fill the gaps identified in the literature review. It begins with an outline of the research paradigm, which has implications on the overall research methodology. The chapter then describes and justifies the research design, research instrument and structure, population and sample size, ethical considerations, data collection method and data analysis process.

3.2 Research objectives
This study investigates customers’ perceptions of green marketing strategies in the New Zealand hotel industry. As outlined in Chapter One, the research objectives for this study are as follows:

1. Explore hotel customers’ opinions of green marketing strategies (see Section 2.6); and
2. Explore hotel customer expectations of environmental best practices within green hotels (see Section 2.6.1).

These objectives were developed according to the gaps identified in Chapter Two (see Section 2.8). Based on the four Ps of the marketing mix, this study adopted 30 statements of green marketing-related activities established by Chan (2013a) to address Objectives 1. Objective 3 was proposed to identify suitability environmental best practices based on eleven common practices outlined in previous literature. Respondents were also encouraged to write down their additional preferences of environmental best practices.

3.3 Research paradigm
The choice of paradigm has important implications for an overall research methodology. According to Collis and Hussey (2003), a paradigm is a set of fundamental philosophies and assumptions about the world and the nature of knowledge which constructs and informs researchers’ behaviours and their ways of thinking. The choice of paradigm has a strong influence on research as it aligns to specific theoretical perspectives, research methodologies and methods used in collecting and analysing the data (Gray, 2009). Thus, it is important to identify which research paradigm is appropriate to meet the identified research objectives.
This research uses a positivist paradigm, which views reality as a concrete structure that exists externally to the researcher and can be measured directly through empirical observation upon fair samples of facts selected without bias (Collis & Hussey, 2003; Gray, 2009). This paradigm enables quantifiable findings to be developed (Altinay & Paraskevas, 2008). It was chosen because this study did not focus on feelings and how respondents react to specific conditions, but was designed to collect opinions and understandings of specific marketing strategies.

By applying this paradigm, the findings produced are specific and precise data, and therefore, results are expressed quantitatively (see Collis & Hussey, 2003). Quantitative data can be analysed in presented in tables, charts and graphs to readable illustration of information of what customers’ expectations towards green marketing and practices within New Zealand’s hotel industry.

3.4 Research design
Research requires a design or structure before data collection can begin. According to De Vaus (2001), the function of a research design is to ensure that the information collected enables the researcher to meet the research objectives as unambiguously as possible. Additionally, the research design must be aligned with the paradigm (Gray, 2009).

A case study design was selected for this study. Case studies involve the detailed and intensive analysis of a single case (Bryman & Bell, 2011), and as noted by Gray (2009), explore subjects and issues where relationships may be vague or uncertain. As no research has been recorded exploring the relationship between people with informed knowledge of the environment and hotels’ green marketing strategies, this study took the initiative to explore this issue in the New Zealand context. Respondents were expected to have different views from other customers on the green marketing of hotel firms, which would add new knowledge to the green marketing research area.

Although case studies are often equated with qualitative research, they can also be used in quantitative studies (Bryman & Bell, 2011, Gray, 2009). Thus, in this study, the positivism paradigm in which relies on empirical observations was employed on a group of conference delegates in order to obtain quantifiable findings.
3.5 Research instrument and structure
In positivist studies, it is essential to choose an accurate research instrument to produce reliable and valid quantitative data. The research instrument employed in this study was a self-administered questionnaire.

A questionnaire consists of a pre-determined and structured set of questions that can be used to obtain information from a sample population and record the findings (Altinay & Paraskevas, 2008). Using a questionnaire, information can be collected with ease and at a reasonable cost (Gray, 2009; Altinay & Paraskevas, 2008). In terms of data analysis, analysing close-ended questions is relatively simple, and responses can be coded quickly (Gray, 2009). A questionnaire also benefits respondents by allowing them to answer at the time and speed they prefer (Bryman & Bell, 2011). Furthermore, the questionnaire is the preferred research instrument to collect opinions and expectations of respondents (Collis & Hussey, 2003). This study addresses issues of reliability by asking exactly the same questions in an identical format, and recording responses in a uniform manner. In terms of reliability, the data collected represent a snapshot of environmental conference delegates’ opinions about green marketing and hotels, and are therefore not considered a reliable guide to views on these topics. The main purpose of this study was to explore these views, and not to generate data that could be generalised. Thus, a questionnaire was regarded as suitable for the research because it enabled the researcher to use structured questions, then gather, code, analyse and interpret the information generated.

In terms of research structure, the questionnaire used mainly close-ended questions with one open-ended question to collect objective information in relation to the questions asked and to facilitate easier analysis of results. The questionnaire consisted of three main parts: demographic questions, a section that required respondents to evaluate hotel green marketing practices, and a section asking respondents to identify green practices that they expect in green hotels. The estimated time taken to complete the questionnaire was about 10 to 15 minutes.

The demographic section of the questionnaire aimed to identify personal background information of the respondents, such as gender, place of origin, age, and employment status. Apart from providing personal profiles of the respondents, this part was crucial in identifying whether the respondents were suitable for this research. For example, respondents who identified as unemployed were excluded because they were not
expected to have the purchasing power needed for green products. The selection criteria are shown in Table 3.2. Furthermore, collecting demographic data meant that any relationships between respondents’ characteristics and their answers could also be analysed, and patterns identified.

Respondents’ perceptions of green marketing in the New Zealand context were explored in Part Two of the questionnaire. This section consisted of 30 statements related to green marketing activities, which were adapted from a study by Chan (2013a). This study was chosen because Chan (2013a) developed all 30 statements based on the four Ps of marketing mix (see Table 3.1 for the divisions of the 30 statements). Chan’s (2013a) study aimed to discover perceptions of both hotel managers and customers about green marketing strategies. In contrast, this study aimed to focus only on customers’ perceptions of green marketing strategies. In order to meet the research’s objectives, some amendments were made to the questionnaire, and definitions of certain terms were added to improve clarity for the local population. A five-point Likert scale was used, ranging from 1 (strongly disagree) to 5 (strongly agree). This scale was suitable for the evaluation of the relative importance of green marketing-related activities because it was easy for respondents to answer and the researcher could also easily code and interpret the responses (Altinay & Paraskevas, 2008).

Table 3.1 Divisions of the statements based on four Ps of marketing mix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Categories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 to 9</td>
<td>Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 to 15</td>
<td>Price</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 to 24</td>
<td>Promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 to 30</td>
<td>Place</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part Three of the questionnaire consisted of multiple-choice questions regarding customers’ perceptions of green marketing. In this part, eleven green practices in green hotels were listed. All eleven statements were developed from previous studies of green practices either in hotels or guest rooms. Respondents were allowed to choose multiple answers from the listed statements. Additionally, an open-ended question was given to encourage respondents to express their views on the best environmental practices in addition to the eleven given statements.
All three parts of the questionnaire were developed in consideration of the key research objectives seeking to add knowledge to research in the green marketing area. The questionnaire is attached in Appendix A.

3.6 Population and sample size
The sample of a research population can be selected by either adopting a probability or convenience sampling method. In this study, respondents were chosen using a convenience sampling technique due to accessibility to the researcher and probability of enhancing the response rate (Bryman & Bell, 2011). Convenience sampling is categorised as purposive or judgmental sampling. Purposive sampling is defined as a sampling technique in which respondents are selected according to the judgment of the researcher that those respondents have the required characteristics to be included in the study (Awang, 2012). According to Neuman and Kreuger (2003), purposive sampling can be used for exploratory research to select unique cases that may contain special information. Considering that little if any research has been conducted exploring the relationship between people with informed knowledge about the environment and hotels’ green marketing, this relationship was expected to provide insights which could help marketers develop better green marketing strategies. Hence, this study used purposive sampling.

To fill the gap in the existing research, this project investigated the viewpoints of delegates attending an environmental-related conference in Auckland, New Zealand, who were therefore expected to have informed views on green marketing. Respondents needed to be employed and must have previously stayed in New Zealand hotels. This is because these respondents would have the power to select and purchase green hotel rooms. Additionally, experience in New Zealand hotels would provide them with an overview of what New Zealand accommodation is like. As their conference discussed topics related to global environmental conditions, respondents’ exposure to the New Zealand hotel environment and their purchasing power of green hotel rooms were all expected to facilitate the collection of useful data for this study. The study excluded respondents who were unemployed and currently working in the hotel sector as these might affect their evaluation of green marketing. Unemployed people were excluded because their responses would be largely hypothetical (it was assumed that unemployed people would lack the discretionary income required to select a hotel on the basis of green products). It was anticipated that the selected group might have different views from average customers with respect to the green marketing of hotels and could add
new knowledge in the green marketing research area. To summarise, the selection criteria of the respondents is shown in Table 3.2.

Table 3.2 Selection criteria for the respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Those who have previously stayed in New Zealand hotels</td>
<td>Unemployed status (such as full-time students)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Those currently employed</td>
<td>Those currently working in a hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference attendee at an environmental conference.</td>
<td>Those under 20 years old</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These selection criteria were stated in the participant information sheet (PIS), which was given with the questionnaire to respondents. The participant information sheet is presented in Appendix B.

The population for this study was 80, based on the number of delegates at the environmental conference. Although the sample size is regarded as small, the sample size is not a sole determinant for a good survey (Kinnear & Taylor, 1996). He asserted there are many criteria in choosing the sample size, such as time-frame, cost, research objectives and using convenience sampling (Kinnear & Taylor, 1996). After consideration of all of these factors, this study targeted all 80 conference delegates to participate in the study.

3.7 Ethical considerations

Ethical research enables researchers to advance knowledge without harming human subjects of a study, such as participants, colleagues and members of society generally (Neuman & Kreuger, 2003; Gillespie, n.d.). There are three areas of possible risk in social research. Firstly, subjects must not be harmed as a result of their involvement. Secondly, the subjects must give voluntary consent to be involved in the study, and thirdly, the researcher must not falsify, plagiarise or abuse the confidentiality of data provided by the subjects (Neuman & Kreuger, 2003). All of these considerations are complementary in terms of respecting human subjects while producing quality research.

Participation was voluntary, and all information provided was confidential and only used in collated form for the purposes of this study. Respondents were informed that they had the right to withdraw from the research process before the completion of data collection. Confidentiality and anonymity were maintained in dealing with possible
associated risks and vulnerability of respondents. It was not anticipated that any ethically sensitive issues would arise in this study and confidentiality was extended to the name of the conference that subjects attended and the location of the hotel.

Ethical approval is needed when human subjects are involved (Gray, 2009), even though the level of interaction with respondents to this study was considered of low ethical risk. Ethics approval was obtained from the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee (AUTEC), and approved 18th March 2014 with AUTEC Reference Number 14/36. The ethics approval form is presented in Appendix C.

3.8 Data collection process
Data collection was conducted during a green-related conference in April 2014. As noted in Section 3.7, the subjects, including conference organisers and hotel managers (where the conference was held), were required to give voluntary consent to be involved in the study. Thus, respondents’ permission was obtained for the data collection process.

The list of New Zealand conferences held in 2014 was obtained from the Auckland Recording Service Ltd, and three conferences were selected from that list for potential participation. Organisers of the conferences were approached by email to assist with the questionnaire distribution. The questionnaire, along with the participant information sheet, was emailed to the organisers and the hotel managers (if applicable) seeking permission to distribute the questionnaire to delegates. One conference organiser gave a positive response, and was very co-operative and helpful.

A day before the conference was held, a small table was set up close to the attendee registration table on which the questionnaires, participant information sheets, pens and a box for collecting completed questionnaires were placed. This location was chosen due to the proximity of the respondents to the table during registration for the conference. Delegates who approached the table were given the questionnaire and participant information sheet. The conference organiser also assisted with the data collection process by notifying delegates about the questionnaire during the conference. In total, 80 questionnaires were delivered, and 40 were returned as completed, providing a response rate of 50 per cent.

3.9 Response rate
The sample size was considered sufficient for the purpose of the study, and as noted by Kinnear and Taylor (1996), sample size is not the sole determinant of quality research. Depending on the objectives of the research, a small sample may still yield statistical
precision at the desired level, and larger samples are not necessarily better than smaller ones (see section 3.6). Since the response rate was small, this study was categorised as a small exploratory study.

Although groups with low counts are generally included to avoid misinterpretation of results, several respondents who responded to the employment status question as ‘unemployed’ were removed from the data because this study assumed they would be unable to purchase a green hotel’s products, so their answers might not be realistic. In addition, one questionnaire was removed from the analysis, because the respondent selected more than one response to several Likert scale questions.

3.10 Data analysis
Data analysis began with coding of variables into a unique identity in a format that the IBM SPSS Statistics 20 software recognised. For example, 1 was code for male respondents and 2 was code for female respondents (see Neuman & Kreuger, 2003). Then, data from all 40 completed questionnaires were manually entered into the software. After that, the data were scrubbed. In this process, unanswered questions were treated as missing data. This cleaning process was crucial to prevent any errors that might skew the results (Altinay & Paraskevas, 2008). Then, the actual analysis process was carried out.

A descriptive statistics or exploratory data analysis was employed. Whereas descriptive statistics, a common type of data analysis, are concerned with describing the data, the findings can also be presented in tables, charts and graphs to identify patterns and relationships between variables (Collis & Hussey, 2003). In this study, three techniques were applied: frequency analyses, central tendency measures, and spread and comparative analyses.

3.10.1 Frequency distribution technique
The purpose of the frequency distribution analysis technique was to count the total number of observations (in actual numbers and percentages) for each category for the variables in the questions (Bryman & Bell, 2011; Collis & Hussey, 2003). Using this technique, to highlight the patterns and trends of the responses, data were presented in charts, graphs and tables.

The frequency distribution technique was carried out for two parts of the questionnaire: the respondent’s personal information (Part One) and expectations of green hotel practices (Part Three). For Part One, this analysis technique enabled the researcher to
identify the number of respondents in each demographic category, such as gender, place of origin, age and employment status. In Part Three, this technique helped determine which green practices in hotels were most preferable and which were least preferable. Using this technique, the findings could be summarised into a simple and readable format.

3.10.2 Central tendency technique
An analysis of central tendency was carried out to summarise the data into one figure of value (Bryman & Bell, 2011; Neuman & Kreuger, 2003). In other words, the measurement of central tendency is to seek an average of the distribution such as the mode, median, mean and standard deviation. In this study, the focus of measuring central tendency was the mean, and a 95% confidence interval of the mean, as these are the most comprehensive and widely used in results presentations (Neuman & Kreuger, 2003). A ‘95% confidence interval’ refers to ‘the range of values determined from using the selected coefficient’ (Lang & Secic, 2006, p.39).

The mean and 95% confidence interval of the mean were calculated to determine the distribution and ranking of each of the attributes, particularly the 30 statements of green marketing strategies. This ranking identified which statements were most important and which were least important in the eyes of the respondents. From this ranking, the important statements were regarded as effective green marketing strategies that encouraged the respondents to purchase green products. Similarly, the least important statements were regarded as green marketing strategies that might hinder their purchases. Using this analysis technique, this study was able to identify customers’ opinions about each green marketing strategy implemented by green hoteliers.

3.10.3 Comparative analysis
A measurement of association was carried out between three demographic variables and the four Ps of marketing strategy (product, pricing, promotion and place). Specifically, the analysis was carried by several types of techniques such as ANOVA, t-test and two-tailed tests. The one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) is used to compare three or more groups’ means of the response variable to determine whether a statistically significant difference exists between those groups (Lang & Secic, 2006). A T-test is usually used for social science studies, and is based on a symmetrical distribution of probabilities dividing the alpha level, usually 0.05 into two parts (Lang & Secic, 2006).
The analysis was carried out by comparing the outcome (product, pricing, promotion and place) of variables with two values (e.g. male and female) using an independent t-test, and a one-way ANOVA test was used to compare the outcome (product, pricing, promotion and place) between variables with three or more values (e.g. employed full time, employed part time, self employed and so forth). Two-tailed tests were used for all analyses, and the probability value of less than 0.05 (p-value < 0.05) was considered as statistically significant (McKillup, 2006).

From these analyses, the possible relationship between respondents’ demographic data and variables in developing a marketing strategy (product, price, promotion and place) could be compared. This relationship analysis may assist hoteliers to more effectively target their customers. For example, hoteliers might target female customers in their advertising as previous research has found that women are more concerned about green marketing or green hotels.

3.11 Summary
This chapter described the methodology and data collection methods used in this research, starting with the positivist theoretical paradigm, which underpinned the data analysis process. A questionnaire was distributed to environmental conference delegates and the selection of respondents were chosen using convenience sampling due to the accessibility to the researcher and the probability of enhancing the response rate. Delegates were expected to be more informed about global environmental conditions than ordinary customers. Using the questionnaire, mainly quantitative data were collected along with responses to a qualitative question to provide supporting information. The quantitative data were analysed using SPSS software. A further discussion of the analysis of patterns and trends will be described in chapter four.
Chapter Four - Results

4.1 Introduction
This chapter presents results obtained in the data collection, beginning with respondents’ characteristics, then 30 green marketing statements, organised according to the four Ps of the marketing mix and expectations of environmentally friendly practices in green hotels. Responses to the 30 green marketing statements helped provide an understanding of the respondents’ desires and interest in green marketing activities, and responses on their expectations of environmentally friendly practices offered information on their preferences for green practices in a green hotel.

4.2 Results
4.2.1 Respondents’ characteristics
Part one of the questionnaire requested personal background information of the respondents, such as gender, place of origin, age, and employment. These characteristics aimed to identify who answered the questionnaire and whether respondents were suitable for the study (see Table 3.2). Their suitability was important to ensure that they had the power to purchase green products in a hotel and were well-informed about New Zealand’s accommodation industry. The data were analysed using the frequency distribution analysis technique (see Section 3.10.1 for explanation) to simplify the information into a readable format.

Table 4.1 presents the frequency analysis for respondents’ characteristics. The ‘characteristics’ row shows demographic variables – gender, place of origin, age and current employment status, while the ‘n and percentage’ column shows the total percentage and actual numbers for each category.
**Table 4.1** Frequency analysis of respondents’ demographic characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>(%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>(40.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>(60.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nationality</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>(22.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(05.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuwait</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(02.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(05.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>(52.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(02.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(02.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(05.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(02.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age in years</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>(15.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>(17.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>(20.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>(32.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 and over</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>(15.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Current employment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Full Time</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>(70.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Part Time</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>(20.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self employed</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>(10.0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The demographic characteristics showed that the sample included:

- Mostly females, with more women (60%) than men (40%);
- Mostly New Zealanders (52.5%) and Australians (22.5%);
- Mostly mature respondents, with over one third (32.5%) identifying as 50-59 years old;
- Mostly those in full-time employment

Older New Zealand women were the typical respondents.

The research sample comprised mostly valid responses. All were currently employed (not in a hotel sector as the information regarding this issue was included within Participant Information Sheet (PIS) (see Appendix B) and had stayed in New Zealand hotels.
4.2.2 Green marketing

This analysis presents data on respondents’ reactions to 30 statements related to green marketing and is organised around each of the Ps of the marketing mix. Both tables and horizontal charts for each analysis are presented using a central tendency analysis (see Section 3.10.2 for explanation).

- Green products (*Table 4.3* and *Figure 4.1*).
- Green prices (*Table 4.4* and *Figure 4.2*).
- Green promotions (*Table 4.5* and *Figure 4.3*).
- Green place or distribution (*Table 4.6* and *Figure 4.4*).
- Overall – 30 statements of green marketing (*Figure 4.5*).

Tables present green marketing statements’ frequency and statements, mean and standard deviation (refer *Table 4.3, Table 4.4, Table 4.5* and *Table 4.6*). The statements were arranged according to the total. The graphs show complementary information to the tables (see *Figure 4.1, Figure 4.2, Figure 4.3, Figure 4.4* and *Figure 4.5*). Individual items within graphs are shown in *Table 4.2*.

*Table 4.2* Individual items within graphs (for *Figure 4.2, Figure 4.3, Figure 4.4, Figure 4.5* and *Figure 4.6*)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual item</th>
<th>Meaning/description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vertical line</td>
<td>Green marketing statement’s number. The full statements can be found within the table (e.g. <em>Figure 4.1 complements Table 4.3</em>). See Section 4.2.2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horizontal line</td>
<td>Mean scores for the Likert-scale responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green shading</td>
<td>Strongly agree and agree evaluations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blue shading</td>
<td>Unsure evaluations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red shading</td>
<td>Strongly disagree and disagree evaluations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black shading</td>
<td>95% confidence interval of the mean</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

See Appendix F and Appendix G for the table and graph of 30 statements of green marketing).
4.2.2.1 Green products (statements 1 to 9)

A central distribution analysis was carried out on responses to the nine statements about green products in order to show the ranking of each attribute. The analysis is presented in Table 4.3 and Figure 4.1, and the findings shown afterwards.

Table 4.3 Central distribution tendencies of green product-related statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean (SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Green hotel products and services may provide an opportunity for product differentiation.</td>
<td>4.30 (0.608)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Green hotel marketing should begin with green product and service design (such as room occupancy sensors that save energy in guest rooms).</td>
<td>4.18 (0.747)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Green hotels can elevate industry members’ image and reputation to attract green tourists who demand green accommodation when travelling.</td>
<td>4.05 (0.677)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Guests desire green hotel products and practices.</td>
<td>3.72 (0.686)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hotels are seeking to bring innovative green products and services to the market.</td>
<td>3.46 (0.790)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Green hotel product and service performance plays a key role in influencing customers’ revisit intention.</td>
<td>3.31 (0.893)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Hotel companies are carrying out the extensive product-specific market research necessary to ensure green product and service success.</td>
<td>3.15 (0.812)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hotels are sincere in instituting programmes that save water and energy, reduce solid waste, use resources economically and protect the planet’s ecosystem.</td>
<td>3.15 (0.975)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Hotels provide products and services that do no harm to human health.</td>
<td>2.97 (1.088)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4.1 Central distribution tendencies of green product-related statements
Table 4.3 and Figure 4.1 show that respondents strongly agreed/agreed with three green product-related statements:

- the green products are different from standard products (M=4.30, SD=0.608);
- hotels have green products before they launch their green marketing (M=4.18, SD=0.747); and
- hotels promote their green image and reputation (M=4.05, SD=0.677).

However, some respondents indicated they preferred not to choose green accommodation when travelling because:

- they view green products as harmful to human health (M=2.97, SD=1.088).

Respondents were unsure about six out of the nine statements. In particular, they did not have a clear idea about whether:

- they really want green products when travelling (M=3.72, SD=0.686);
- hotels are actively researching to improve their green products (M=3.46, SD=0.790);
- green products influenced customers’ revisit intention (M= 3.31, SD=0.893)
- hotels are active doing market research to ensure their green products are acceptable (M=3.15, SD=0.812); and
- hotels are sincere in instituting green practices within their premises (M=3.15, SD=0.975).

4.2.2.2 Green prices (statement 10 to 15)
Six green price-related statements were analysed using a central distribution tendency analysis. The findings are shown in Table 4.4 and Figure 4.2. Data indicate respondents’ opinions about the effectiveness of pricing strategies used by green hotels in New Zealand.
Table 4.4 Central distribution tendencies of green price-related statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>(SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Hotel customers who are more receptive to environmentally friendly products and services are more willing to pay extra for them.</td>
<td>3.58</td>
<td>(0.931)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Green hotel products and services are almost always priced at a premium relative to conventional offerings.</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>(0.876)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Green pricing (is an optional utility service that allows customers an opportunity to support a greater level of utility company investment in renewable energy technologies) works only when green products and services reduce hotel guest costs.</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>(0.766)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Customers are willing to pay a higher price if part of the amount paid is donated to green activities.</td>
<td>2.90</td>
<td>(0.900)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Hotel customers are willing to pay a higher price for eco-facilities.</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>(0.877)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Hotel companies should charge a premium for environmentally friendly products and services to recover the additional costs incurred in their production, marketing and disposal.</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>(1.010)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4.2 Central distribution tendencies of green price-related statements

Respondents evaluated three out of six statements related to green pricing as least effective. In particular:

- they disagreed with the statement that customers could be charged a premium to recover costs incurred by hoteliers from instituting green practices (M= 2.58, SD= 1.010);
- they were unwilling to pay a higher price for eco-facilities (M= 2.73, SD= 0.877); although
- part of the amount paid is donated to green activities (M=2.90, SD=0.900).

Responses suggest an uncompromising attitude with regard to their financial contribution to whatever additional costs may be on-charged to them.

Respondents did not have an opinion about whether:

- those regarded as green consumers would be willing to pay a higher amount for green products (M=3.58, SD= 0.931);
- green products are almost priced at a premium relative to conventional offerings (M=3.45, SD= 0.876); and
- green pricing works when green products reduce hotel customers’ costs (M=3.31, SD=0.766).

4.2.2.3 Green promotions (statements 16 to 24)
The findings on green promotions provide information on the effectiveness of green marketing promotions on the minds of the respondents. See Table 4.5 and Figure 4.3 for the details.

Table 4.5 Central distribution analysis of green promotion-related statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>(SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Hotel companies should collaborate with environmental groups to promote their green image more effectively.</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>(0.744)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Hotel companies often use eco-labels on packaging, and display them on their corporate web sites.</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>(0.791)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Hotel companies see simple compliance with environmental legislation as an opportunity to promote their green credentials.</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>(0.614)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Environmental labels create incentives for the hotel business to change the market.</td>
<td>3.63</td>
<td>(0.667)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Environmental labels (certificates for green hotel, such as, ISO 14001) are an effective promotional tool in the hotel industry.</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>(0.846)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Green promotions and advertisements influence hotel guests and industrial buyers because they reflect the hotel’s commitment to the environment.</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>(0.751)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Hotel customers are suspicious of environmental advertising and claims.</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>(0.846)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Hotel companies try to convince customers to be environmentally friendly during direct sales activities.</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>(0.842)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Environmental claims in advertisements are often met with criticism from competitors and consumer organizations.</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>(0.641)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents were unsure about all six green promotion-related statements. However, they mostly agreed with the statement about:

- collaboration with environmental groups to promote green image (M=3.90, SD= 0.744).

Respondents considered such collaboration useful in assisting the organisations’ efforts in preserving the environment.

Respondents were unsure about the use of eco-labels. Respondents were not sure about:

- the functionality of eco-labels in promotion (M=3.70, SD= 0.791);
- eco-labels may create incentives to change the market (M=3.63, SD= 0.667); and
- eco-labels as effective promotional tools (M=3.55, SD= 0.751).

This result suggests that, in the opinion of the respondents, the functions of eco-labels are unclear.
4.2.2.4 Green place or distribution (statements 25 to 30)

The six green place- or distribution-related statements were also analysed using a central distribution tendency analysis, and results presented in Table 4.6 and Figure 4.4.

Table 4.6 Central distribution analysis of green place- or distribution-related statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>(SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>The internet is an effective channel for marketing a hotel’s green initiatives directly to customers.</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>(0.540)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>The image of business partners, such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines, should be consistent with the green image that a hotel wants to project.</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td>(0.605)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>A hotel should use environmentally friendly distribution channels (path which hotel’s product and services travel from vendor to customers) to build a green image.</td>
<td>4.03</td>
<td>(0.707)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Joining commercial green marketing and central reservation associations that advertise and promote green hotels helps hotels to reach green travellers.</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>(0.630)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Some hotels have attempted to develop green certification programmes to gain green customer confidence.</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>(0.601)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>The selection of business partners, such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines, is influenced by environmental issues.</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>(0.913)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4.4 Central distribution analysis of green place- or distribution-related statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>(SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>4.03</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents agreed with three out of six statements related to green place or distribution. In particular:

- they agreed that the Internet is an effective channel in disseminating green initiatives to customers (M= 4.15, SD= 0.540);
- the image of business partners was also considered important as it needs to be consistent with the green image of green hotels (M=4.05, SD= 0.605); and respondents agreed that hotels should use environmentally friendly distribution channels, from vendors to customers (M=4.03, SD=0.707).

Respondents were unsure about three statements:

- green hotels joining third parties to assist hotels with green advertising (M=3.85, SD=0.630);
- developing green certification programmes on their premises (M=3.49, SD=0.601); and
- selecting business partnerships is influenced by environmental issues (M=3.24, SD=0.913)

indicating that respondents were uncertain about the effectiveness of these distribution channels.

**4.2.2.5 Overall – 30 statements of green marketing**

Respondents were also asked about their perceptions of green marketing statements. The central tendency analysis was carried out to observe which P (i.e. product, price, place or promotion) is the most effective and least effective strategy for green marketing. Figure 4.5 and Appendix H show the results of the analysis.
Of the four Ps of the marketing mix:

- green place-related statements were regarded as the most effective (M= 3.80, SD=0.420), perhaps indicating respondents agreed with the Internet distribution channel, that business partnerships need to be consistent with hotels’ green image and green products must come from environmentally friendly sources;
- respondents were unsure about green products (M= 3.59, SD= 0.477) and green promotions (M= 3.53, SD= 0.408); and
- green prices were evaluated as the least effective strategy (M= 3.09, SD= 0.506), suggesting an unwillingness on the part of respondents to pay extra for green products.

4.2.3 Demographic profiles and 4 Ps of the marketing mix
A comparative analysis (see Section 3.10.3 for explanation) was conducted to identify any associations between three of the demographic variables – age, gender and current employment status - and the four Ps.

All $p$ values were under 0.05, indicating a lack of statistical significance of the results in the cross-tabulation. That is, there were no statistically significant associations between the three demographic variables and the four Ps (see Appendix H and Appendix I).
4.2.4 Expectations of environmentally friendly practices within green hotels
A frequency distribution analysis (see Section 3.10.1 for explanation) was carried out on responses to Part Three of the questionnaire, to count the total number of observations for each green practice preferred by the respondents. As explained in Section 3.5, respondents were requested to choose one or more of eleven common green practices and add any additional preferred green practices (see Appendix A). These data were intended to determine which green practices in hotels were most and least preferable. Additional green practices were requested to identify new practices that may have been overlooked by hoteliers. Figure 4.6 presents the ranking of most preferable to least preferable of the environmentally friendly practices, and responses for additional environmentally friendly practices were as follows.

- Smart air-conditioning – i.e. solar thermal mass – passive cooling.
- Bathroom water supplies should deliver water at pre-set temps. No point in heating water, only to immediately add cold water.
- Solar energy will come in time … not sure (if) the technology is optimal currently for high-density building.
- Customers might expect that if they accept less service (towel and linen change) that it would result (in) less cost.
- Non-smoking facilities.
- No boiled water.
- The green image should match up with business practices.
Respondents evaluated most practices listed as suitable for green hotels except for two:

- advising customers of solar power generation via a monitor in the lobby (37.5%); and
- organic meals in the restaurants (35%).

More than 80 per cent of respondents favoured:

- recycling programmes (92.5%);
- linen re-use (90%);
- using green cleaning products (87.5%);
- energy-efficient lighting (87.5%);
- towel reuse programmes (87.5%); and
- key card systems (80%).
4.3 Summary

To summarise, the main findings, as detailed in this chapter, were as follows.

4.3.1 Respondents’ characteristics (see Section 4.2.1)

a) More than half of the respondents identified as New Zealanders.

b) All respondents were employed either full time, part-time or in self-employment.

c) The typical respondent was a New Zealand female, 50-59 years old.

4.3.2 Green marketing (see Section 4.2.2)

4.3.2.1 Green products (see Section 4.2.2.1)

a) Green products were viewed as different from standard products

b) Hotels should have green products in their premises before launching green marketing

c) Green hotels could enhance their green image and reputations to attract green tourists

d) Green products were viewed as potentially damaging to human health in the long term.

4.3.2.2 Green prices (see Section 4.2.2.2)

a) Respondents were resistant to being charged extra for eco-facilities to recover costs resulting from green practices (even if part of the amount paid were donated to green activities).

4.3.2.3 Green promotions (see Section 4.2.2.3)

a) Respondents considered hotels should collaborate with environmentally-related groups to promote their green image

b) Respondents uncertain about the effectiveness of eco-labels in promotions, how eco-labels may create incentives to change the green market and eco-labels as effective promotional tools.

4.3.2.4 Green place or distributions (see Section 4.2.2.4)

a) Respondents viewed the Internet as the most effective channel in promoting green initiatives.

b) Respondents were concerned about the suitability of business partners of green hotels.
c) Respondents considered hotels must use environmentally friendly distribution channels throughout the hotel’s operations.

4.3.2.5 Overall (see Section 4.2.2.5)

a) Among the four Ps of marketing mix, the most effective green marketing strategy was green place-related statements.

b) Green price-related statements were evaluated as the least effective strategy.

4.3.3 Demographic profiles and 4 Ps marketing mix (see Section 4.2.3)

a) All p-values were under 0.05, indicating a lack of statistical significance of results between demographic profiles (age, gender and current employment status) and 4 Ps marketing mix in the cross-tabulation.

4.3.4 Environmentally friendly practices in green hotels (see Section 4.2.4)

a) Most green practices listed were considered suitable for a green hotel (more than 65%) except two: advising customers of the hotel’s solar power generation via monitor and serving organic meals.

b) The five most highly rated green practices (more than 80%) were recycling programmes, linen reuse, towel reuse, green cleaning products and key card systems.
Chapter Five - Discussion

5.1 Introduction
This chapter will relate the research findings presented in chapter four to the three main objectives of this research: (1) explore hotel customers’ opinions of green marketing strategies and (2) explore hotel customers’ expectations of environmental best practices within green hotels.

The discussion will start with respondents’ characteristics, then the marketing mix. Finally, the discussion will overview green practices suitable for green hotels based on the study’s results.

5.2 Respondents’ characteristics
Domestic and international visitors to New Zealand are assumed to stay at accommodation or any hotels along their visits. Thus, in this study, international respondents who came to the environmental conference to discuss global environmental conditions needed accommodation for the duration of the conference. According to Table 4.1 in the results section, in terms of nationality, New Zealanders comprised half the respondents, followed by Australians, Asian, Americans, and British. Asians included respondents from China, the Middle East and South East Asia (see Table 4.1). Nationalities of the international respondents followed the same proportions as nationalities of International Visitors arrivals to New Zealand (IVA) statistics based on 2013. Specifically, the international visitors who were included within this statistic were overseas residents entering New Zealand for a stay of less than a year (Statistics New Zealand, 2014). The countries comprising the major source of visitors to New Zealand included Australia, People’s Republic of China, Japan, Republic of Korea, Singapore, Hong Kong, Thailand, India, United Kingdom, Germany, United States of America and Canada (Statistics New Zealand, 2014). The only omissions from this list among the countries of delegates to the conference were Canada and Germany. This suggests that the respondents’ origins were more or less representative of international visitors to New Zealand.
5.3 Customer perceptions of green-marketing strategies

This section compares results from respondents with informed knowledge about the environment (see Section 3.6) and findings from previous literature investigating average (i.e. not especially informed) customers from different countries. The subsections are organised around the four Ps variables which include green products, green pricing, green promotion and green place or distribution (see Table 3.1 for division of the statements).

5.3.1 Green products

Findings suggest that respondents may choose green accommodation when travelling when: (1) the green products are different from standard products; (2) hotels have green products before they launch their green marketing; and (3) hotels promote their green image and reputation (see Table 4.3). However, some respondents preferred not to choose green accommodation when travelling because they viewed green products as harmful to human health (see Table 4.3).

Respondents viewed green products as special compared to equivalent traditional products (see Table 4.3). This finding is consistent with those of Manaktola and Jauhari (2007), who found that Indian respondents viewed eco-friendly products as different, which encouraged their purchases at a green hotel. Specifically, the positive impacts provided by green products towards the environment and the use of an alternative source of energy such as solar energy and waste disposal led to a differentiation of green practices (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007). Nevertheless, it is not consistent with the findings of Robinot and Giannelloni (2010), who found that while customers view green attributes as complementary or normal for green hotels, it does not encourage customers to patronise green hotels, nor to influence their satisfaction while staying at a green hotel. The differences of previous findings may be because green products were seen as theoretically able to influence customers’ intentions due to their ability to protect the environment and due to innovations in energy sources (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007). However, some people viewed green products as failing to fulfil individual emotional benefits, such as purchasing options for different levels of convenience, price, quality and performance would provide (D’Souza et al., 2006; Ginsberg & Bloom, 2004).

Evidence of having or practising green practices is crucial to convince customers to purchase at a green hotel. Respondents from this study acknowledged that green marketing should begin with having actual green products in the hotels (see Table 4.3),
which suggests that customers look for evidence of serious commitment by hotels in instituting green practices before deciding to stay at a hotel. This is consistent with the findings of Peattie and Crane (2005) who also noted that actual green products are needed to avoid ‘green washing’, the deliberate manipulation of information to portray themselves and their products as environmentally friendly (Jackson, 2010). It is therefore important to implement green initiatives on the premises before disseminating information about them in the promotional activities.

In spite of tangible assets such as products offered, customers also look for intangible assets such as green image and good reputation. Findings show that respondents agreed with the statement of the ability of green hotels to promote their green image and reputation. In other words, green hotels convey an exceptional image due to their commitment to protecting environmental well-being (see Table 4.3). This is consistent with the findings of Han et al. (2009), who found that the overall image of green hotels plays a critical role in customers’ decision-making processes. As asserted by Graci and Dodds (2008), company image and hotel corporate reputation are two of the significant intangible assets which customers consider. They also added that an exceptional company image can lead to a competitive advantage in the market. Therefore, hotels must match every decision they make with the responsible image they present.

Although respondents viewed green products as different in terms of their ability to minimise environmental impacts, they also believed green products may harm human health (see Table 4.3). This contradicts the findings of SustainableEarth.com (2014), who state that green products are viewed as special because they have less of an environmental impact. In this study, respondents considered green products as both different and special, but at the same time possibly harmful to human health. This finding is inconsistent with that of Chan (2013a), perhaps due to hotel operations which consume various recyclable and non-recyclable natural resources and generate an enormous amount of waste, which alters the ecosystem, which therefore indirectly affects human health (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007; Jackson, 2010). Moreover, because hotels are operated in many different areas, such as metropolitan cities, suburbs, resorts and so forth, deforestation and transportation may be required to transfer materials from vendors to the hotels, which may also negatively affect human health (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007). The contradictory views about positive differences brought by green products and negative considerations of harmful effects from those products may require further investigation.
Respondents in this study were unsure about the influence of green products’ performance on their intention to revisit (see Table 4.3). This is contradictory to the findings of Ham and Choi (2012), who found customers who experienced green practices or products at a green hotel reported their next visit plan. In another study, Baker et al. (2013) added that perceptions of the lack of luxury diminished the intention to stay at green hotels. Ham and Choi (2012) recruited university undergraduate students as respondents, which may partly explain the difference in results, as undergraduate students were excluded from the current study because their responses would be largely theoretical. However, Ham and Choi’s (2012) respondents answered questions based on their imagining having purchasing power of green products at a green hotel. Thus, their answers are not necessarily valid.

Overall, there were three green marketing strategies that may have encouraged the respondents’ purchase intention: differentiation brought by green products compared to standard products, evidence of having or doing green practices in the premises by the hoteliers, and green image and reputation resulting from the green movement. Some respondents also believed that green products may harm human health in the long term. The contradictory views of positive and negative evaluations suggest further research is required.

5.3.2 Green prices
As outlined in Section 2.6.2, contradictory views have been recorded in the literature, especially on the customers’ willingness to pay a premium price for green products. Inconclusive opinions about this issue create difficulties for green hoteliers in developing green pricing strategies. Thus, this study explored the gap by asking six statements about the respondents’ views on this issue (see Appendix A).

Respondents expressed their disagreement with three statements: (1) customers should be charged a premium to recover the additional costs expended by the green hoteliers; (2) customers are willing to pay a higher price for eco-facilities and (3) customers are willing to pay a higher price for eco-facilities if a part of the amount is donated to green activities (see Table 4.4). The findings in this study are similar to those of Fairweather et al. (2005), who asked visitors to New Zealand about their willingness to pay extra for green products in a hotel, and their answers indicated they were unwilling to be charged extra. Manaktola and Jauhari (2007) found that the majority of environmentally conscious customers who favour a green hotel when travelling also expressed unwillingness to be charged extra for green products. This refusal is assumed to be due
to several reasons. Firstly, customers view participation with green products or services (for example, linen and towel re-use programmes) as having to put up with discomfort, giving up their ‘right’ to luxury and a way for hoteliers to cut costs (Baker et al., 2013). Secondly, customers believe that the savings and benefits generated from green programmes (such as, linen and towel re-use programmes) may reduce labour and laundry expenses and the additional costs (for example, by installing and maintaining green practices and marketing costs) incurred in instituting green practices can be recovered (Kotler, 2011; Pizam, 2009; GHA, 2014). As emphasised by Pizam (2009), through green programmes, average-size hotels could save hundreds of thousands dollars per year. Thirdly, customers might adjust their lifestyle according to their current financial situation. For example, the 2008 Global Financial Crisis has encouraged many to adapt to a lower level of income, and to reduce discretionary and travel spending (Kotler, 2011). Finally, whereas the location of the studies or the level of environmental consciousness of customers perhaps influences customers’ intentions to pay a premium for green products, on one hand, in two studies investigating North Americans, participants expressed willingness to pay a higher price for green products (Kotler, 2011; Han, Hsu, & Lee, 2009), while on the other hand, several studies in different countries (Malaysia, China, India and New Zealand) revealed contradictory results (Kasim, 2004; Fairweather, Maslin, & Simmons, 2005; Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007; Chan, 2013). In addition, customers who are environmentally conscious at home are reported to be willing to pay more for green products (Han et al., 2009). Americans are assumed to have a higher level of environmentally friendly behaviour. Thus, they present their support towards environmental well-being by their willingness to pay extra for green products. In general, respondents to this study would not translate their willingness to be charged a higher price nor to pay a premium for green products while staying at a hotel.

Overall, even though respondents had informed knowledge about current environmental conditions, findings show that they were uncompromising with respect to making financial contributions to purchase a higher price of green products.

5.3.3 Green promotion
Findings show that most respondents had little idea about the effectiveness of green promotion strategies implemented by green hoteliers (see Table 4.5), except for one strategy, which is that collaboration between green hotels and environmental groups can help to promote a green image more effectively. The findings are perhaps due to various
customers’ perceptions about the sincerity of the green hotels in offering and promoting their products and services and the lack of detailed information about the environment credentials of green products and services (Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006) (see Section 2.6.3).

Respondents acknowledged the importance of collaboration with environmental groups to promote a hotel’s green image more effectively (see Table 4.5). This is consistent with the findings of Hsieh (2012), who outlined that some hotels in the US partner with various environmentally-related organisations, which matches with their green image and recent environmental issues, in order to show their commitment to environmental conservation efforts. Fairmont Hotels and Resorts is an example of a hotel company that forges partnerships with the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) to address carbon emission (Green Lodging News, 2010). These collaborations may attract customers’ interest, as customers are interested in the overall image of green hotels (Han et al., 2009).

Findings show that most respondents were unsure about the effectiveness of eco-labels as promotional tools. Particularly, respondents were not sure about (1) the functionality of eco-labels in promotion; (2) incentives created by eco-labels to change the market and (3) eco-labels as effective promotional tools (see Table 4.5). This is consistent with the findings of Chan (2009) and Fairweather et al. (2005), who posited that customers question the standards and actual implementation of green practices and the capability of the hotels who have certifications with those eco-labels. Even though Fairweather et al. (2005) found that visitors who come to New Zealand question the capability of those eco-labels within the New Zealand hotel industry, they also found those visitors were looking for eco-labels as a sign of environmental practices while searching for a hotel, which is inconsistent with current finding No. 3 – eco-labels are still useful in promoting hotel’s green programmes. Thus, it can be concluded that while some customers acknowledge the importance of eco-labels, over-dependency of hotels on eco-labels in green promotion (Rex & Baumann, 2007), suggests a simplistic compliance of their green programmes with environmental legislation.

Overall, respondents saw over-dependency on eco-labels as poor advertising, which may create a lack of interest. In contrast, many believed collaborations with environmental groups shows a commitment to preserving environmental well-being. It is also assumed that a lack of detailed information about the environmental credentials
of green products and services may have encouraged respondents to evaluate most statements as ones they neither agreed nor disagreed with.

5.3.4 Green place or distribution

Limited input from customers in selecting accurate distribution channels to promote green initiatives has been recorded (see Section 2.6.4). The findings of this study indicate that (1) the internet is an effective channel to promote green products; (2) partners with groups which are consistent with the green image of the hotels is regarded as a reliable distribution channel; and (3) the green image of a hotel influences the respondents’ decision making on whether to stay at a hotel (see Table 4.6).

Respondents rated the Internet as an effective channel for marketing a hotel’s green initiatives directly to customers (see Table 4.6). This is consistent with findings of Chan (2013a), who found that customers evaluate the Internet as the most effective and efficient distribution channel to publicise green marketing information, as customers can access hotels’ information at any time and place. Kotler (2011) also mentioned that the amount of time used to retrieve information about hotels’ green initiatives can be reduced. In particular, hotels can use websites, email lists and social media tools such as Twitter and Facebook.com to promote their green marketing initiatives. Websites are useful for displaying information to target audiences at a lower cost and more easily updated compared to traditional paper methods (European Commission, n.d). Email lists can be utilised to offer information to regular customers who acknowledge their interest to be informed with updated information regarding hotels’ green initiatives (European Commission, n.d). In addition social media tools such as Twitter and Facebook.com are able to offer information to large numbers of interested people. In general, the Internet distribution channel benefits both customers and marketers, especially from an environmental perspective.

Respondents expressed the view that the image of business partners such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines should be consistent with the green image that a hotel wants to project (see Table 4.6). This is consistent with the findings of Hsieh (2012) and Pizam (2009), who posited that the selection of business partners is significantly important in order to gain customers’ confidence about environmental initiatives implemented by the green hotels. It is the right selection of business partners and collaborations that may assist hotels in building a positive image, and show companies to be good corporate civilians (Aker, 2008).
Respondents were also attentive to environmentally friendly distribution (starting from vendors and finishing with customers) chosen by the green hotels (see Table 4.6). This is consistent with the findings of Han et al. (2009), who found that customers considered the overall image of hotels. On one hand, the overall image, such as the economic and political aspects, ethical considerations and value-based decisions especially relating to green programmes instituted by hotels, are the key features that comprise decision-making by consumers (Graci & Dodds, 2008). On the other hand, this finding is inconsistent with the results of D’Souza et al. (2006), who found that green products, packaging, product labels and product ingredients do not influence customers’ perceptions of green marketing. They added that the only positive contribution is the past experience of customers staying at a green hotel (D’Souza et al., 2006). This difference is perhaps due to individual perceptions of the ability of green products influences customers’ satisfaction during the stay or word-of-mouth promotions before selecting a hotel.

A corporate website is the right place to establish information regarding green initiatives (Jones et al., 2014; Hsieh, 2012), such as the information of materials used within the business, the selection of business partners and collaborations and so forth. The availability of information on the corporate website also allows people to be informed and updated with green programmes or efforts implemented by the hoteliers. Thus, comprehensive evaluation is required, as customers pay attention to decision-making by green hotels.

Overall, availability of distribution channels to provide information and suitability of business partners are significantly important principles for gaining customer confidence in green programmes engaged in by green hotels. Additionally, hoteliers need to consider the impact of distribution channels chosen by them towards their overall green image. This is because customers always pay attention to the overall image of a hotel before selecting it.

5.4 Expectations of hotel environmentally friendly practices
This section discusses preferred practices, worst practices and best practices as evaluated by respondents in Part Three of the questionnaire (see Appendix A). A deeper understanding of customers’ desires in green practices can assist hotel organisations to design more efficient and effective green practices. Thus, there is a need to investigate current and new green practices in hotel premises to inspire a higher degree of
confidence among customers. A review of the literature revealed various views on the acceptability of green practices in green hotels (see Section 2.6.1). For example, Manaktola and Jauhari (2007) found that customers view green products as special compared to traditional equivalent products. However, Baker et al. (2013) noted that some customers see some green practices as inconvenient, creating a perception of cost-cutting and lowering of standards. Findings suggest that most of the common green practices reported in the literature were suitable for green hotels (see Figure 4.6). Additionally, respondents commented on other practices that could be beneficial to green hotels (see Section 4.2.4).

Nine out of the eleven practices in the study were generally regarded as suitable for green hotels (the two exceptions being solar power generation devices in the lobby, and organic meals) (see Figure 4.6). This finding is consistent with the findings of Manaktola and Jauhari (2007), who found that customers expect tangible demonstration of green practices. Over 65 per cent of respondents evaluated nine environmentally friendly practices (e.g. recycling programmes, linen re-use programmes etc.) as preferable. Leisure and business travellers in Millar et al.'s (2012) study also viewed some of these practices (e.g. energy saving light bulbs, recycling bins in the lobby and room, towel and linen re-use programmes, having green certification and key card systems), as complementary in green hotels. Hence, all nine practices are able to indicate a serious commitment of hotels to instituting green practices within their premises.

With respect to the nine practices mentioned, five were evaluated as most preferred. Specifically, more than 80 per cent of the respondents favour recycling programmes, linen re-use, using ‘green’ cleaning products, energy-efficient lighting, towel reuse programmes and key card systems. It is possible that customers favour green practices they can participate in, that offer convenience, and are ones they are already accustomed to at home. Referring to recycling programmes and linen and towel re-use programmes, these findings are in line with Ham and Choi (2012) and Lee and Oh (2014) who found that green customers favour green practices they can participate in. As these practices (except key card systems) also were usually practised at home, this may lead to greater involvement and acceptability of similar practices at hotels (Millar et al., 2012). The suitability of key card systems provides the respondents with convenience, which is one of the criteria in choosing a hotel, as noted by Kasim (2004). Therefore, all five green practices were evaluated as the most preferable green practices due to their ability to
involve guest participation, for their convenience and for their similarity to practices at home.

In terms of eco-labels, while several respondents agreed about its significance (65.0%) within green hotels, findings in Table 4.5 and Section 5.3.3 show three statements about the use and functionality of eco-labels as ones they were unsure about. Although respondents might be uninterested in over-dependency related to eco-labels within green marketing, eco-labels still offer assurance of quality of green practices instituted by the hotels (Fairweather et al., 2005). The application of eco-labels also demonstrates the commitment of hotels to upgrading the standards of their practices (Chan, 2009).

Surprisingly, respondents expressed the view that offering organic meals was not in alignment with green hotels’ practices. As reported by Ginsberg and Bloom (2004), the consumption of organic meals has increased over time because fresh and healthier meals represent individual emotional benefits. No particular explanation can be found for not rating organic food very highly, except the possibility that organic food is not generally considered a green product. As the literature does not support this however, further research would be required to determine the validity of this explanation.

Part three of the questionnaire also encouraged respondents to express their views on best practices. Firstly, several respondents suggested that green hotels should have smart air-conditioning, such as making of use of thermal mass, which encourages passive cooling. Secondly, bathroom water supplies should deliver water at a usable temperature. Thirdly, one respondent thought that solar energy was not optimal for high density buildings. Lastly, it was considered that hotels should provide non-smoking facilities on their premises. All of these suggestions are valuable for hotels in developing new green practices, as they come directly from respondents with informed knowledge about the suitability of these practices towards the environment and have expressed their desires as customers.

Overall, respondents favoured green practices they can participate in, such as recycling programmes and linen and towel re-use programmes which they are already involved with at home. Moreover recycling programmes, linen and towel re-use programmes and using green cleaning products do not interfere with their convenience while staying at a hotel. As such, their desires and guidelines can benefit hotel operators in evaluating current practices and developing new initiatives.
5.5 Theory of planned behaviour and findings

As noted earlier, this study's findings support the theory of planned behaviour, which relates to the prediction of human behaviour (see Section 2.7 and Figure 2.2), and partly explains respondents' intentions and behaviours when purchasing green products. This is because respondents ticked ‘disagree’ and ‘agree’ for many statements relating to green marketing strategies and practices (see Section 4.3). Thus, this study concludes that certain strategies will encourage respondents to purchase green products, while certain other strategies discourage purchasing of green products.

5.6 Summary

Overall, the research sample in this study is more or less representative of international visitors to New Zealand. Several marketing strategies were identified as relevant in attracting customers, especially on differentiation brought by green products and the chosen distribution channels to disseminate green initiatives to the green consumers. However, a pricing strategy of charging customers a premium price for a green practice was opposed by the respondents. Surprisingly, despite positive views on green products, respondents believed some green products may harm human health in the long term.

In terms of environmentally friendly practices, respondents favoured practices that they can participate in, that they are involved with at home (familiar), and do not interfere with their convenience while staying at a green hotel. All of these principles can be used as a guideline for best practices in developing and upgrading both current and new green practices in a green hotel. Findings recorded one least preferred green practice, which was organic meals, but no particular explanation could be found to explain the inconsistency of this finding with those of previous literature.
Chapter Six - Conclusion

6.1 Introduction
This chapter presents conclusions and implications for hoteliers as well as the limitations of the research project and recommendations for future research. It also returns to the research objectives, and explains how these were met.

6.2 Conclusion and implications for hoteliers
As an exploratory study, this research has been able to fill the gap identified in the literature by undertaking research in a New Zealand context to provide an understanding of customers’ perceptions in relation to green marketing strategies. To date there has been only limited research in this area and none that sought consumers’ perceptions, who ought to have an interest in and be well informed regarding current environmental conditions and issues. Hence, this research has added knowledge to this as yet limited research area of green marketing. Both objectives were successfully met, as the following section explains.

(1) Explore hotel customers’ opinions of green marketing strategies
As stated in the results chapter, respondents characterised green marketing strategies as effective, neither effective or ineffective, or ineffective. There is no doubt that green products or practices are seen as different compared to equivalent products. Mixed opinions were also recorded. Firstly, respondents were unsure about the effectiveness of eco-labels as promotional tools. Some viewed eco-labels as a crucial sign of assurance, whereas others viewed them as uninteresting promotional strategies. Secondly, in terms of pricing strategies, data indicated that customers are unlikely to want to pay extra for green products and services, despite justifications offered by hoteliers. Surprisingly, respondents even viewed some green products as still harmful to human health in the long term. In short, these two opinions contradict each other, and need further exploration.

Respondents considered two important aspects of green marketing strategies to be evidence of convenience and hoteliers’ commitment to environmental issues. Before green hoteliers claimed to be part of an environmentally conscious company, customers are likely to seek evidence of practices carried out at their premises. This needs to be supported by a suitable selection of business partners, and appropriately chosen
environmentally friendly distribution channels (starting from vendors and finishing with customers) which build a good overall image. All these are seen as evidence of a commitment to protect environmental well-being. Convenience is also an important factor. Thus, the Internet is seen as an effective promotional distribution channel as it is directly accessible to potential customers.

(2) Explore hotel customers’ expectations of environmental best practices within green hotels

In terms of green practices, respondents generally favoured tangible practices. However, they mostly preferred practices in which they could participate (for example, recycling programmes, linen and towel re-use programmes), those which they were involved with at home (for example, recycling programmes, linen and towel re-use programmes, using green cleaning products) and green practices that were convenient for them while staying at a hotel. Thus, they may not warm to green practices that are unfamiliar and inconvenient.

In summary, this study adopted a descriptive survey approach to investigate the current state of acceptance of green marketing strategies and practices in New Zealand’s hotel industry. The study provides some interesting results that can be explored further to gain a better understanding of this issue. A number of managerial implications arise from the findings.

6.2.1 Customer intention to purchase green products

The key challenges of green marketers is to increase perceptions of individual benefits by adding emotional value to green products (Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006). In this study, although respondents viewed green products as special compared to ‘non-green’ products (see Table 4.2), this positive view of products may be insufficient to increase consumption of green products. As noted, previous studies reported a decline of green consumption in the hotel industry (Peattie & Crane, 2005; Ginsberg & Bloom, 2004). The positive influence of this study’s findings on product differentiation, especially in relation to customers’ purchase intention and past experience of purchasing and usage of green products (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007; D’Souza et al., 2006), is based on the unique ability of green products to protect environmental well-being. Thus, it has been reported that there is a lack of emotional benefits associated with green purchases. Several studies reported that customers are intolerant of inconvenience, unavailability, premium price charges, low quality and low performance of green products served to
them (Ginsberg & Bloom, 2004; D’Souza et al., 2006). It is therefore crucial to increase the individual benefits of green products to increase customers’ intention to purchase green products.

6.2.2 Commitment of hoteliers in instituting green practices
Customers would like to see a commitment from green hotels to implementing green practices. Therefore, they expect to see a tangible demonstration of green practices (Manaktola & Jauhari, 2007), before green marketing information regarding those practices is publicised. These practices are required to avoid ‘green washing’ accusations, which means misleading claims of information to represent companies and products as eco-friendly (Jackson, 2010).

6.2.3 Internet technology
Customers may prefer to access environmental information from the Internet (see Figure 4.2). On one hand, customers can reduce the amount of time spent driving to hotels to obtain information about green initiatives (Kotler, 2011). On the other hand, hoteliers can promote their responsible entrepreneurship to customers with ease and update costs effectively compared to traditional paper methods (European Commission, n.d). The Internet is, therefore, one of the most efficient and relatively inexpensive promotional methods, and benefits both customers and hoteliers. Thus, it is suggested that hotel marketers consider utilising Internet technology such as corporate websites, mailing lists, Facebook.com and Twitter to show their commitment to environmentally friendly practices.

6.2.4 Pricing strategies
Premium charges for green products are viewed as strategies that can hinder purchase intention. In other words, customers are not interested in and will not tolerate higher-priced green products.

6.2.5 Eco-labels
In terms of eco-labels, whilst several respondents agreed with their significance (see Figure 4.1), over-dependency on eco-labels is seen as poor advertising which could weaken interest. The quality of green practices offered by green certified hotels is also questionable (Chan, 2009) and recognised as a simplistic compliance with environmental legislation. A lack of detailed information also encourages customers to doubt the sincerity of the hoteliers implementation of green practices (Hartmann & Ibanez, 2006). Therefore, it is necessary for green hotels to promote their ‘greenness’ and avoid over-dependency on eco-label usage.
6.2.6 Overall image of the green hotels
Customers look at the overall image of the hotels. Thus, the selection of business partners and collaborations may assist hotels in building a positive image, which shows companies as good corporate citizens (Aker, 2008). Additionally, Graci and Dodds (2008) asserted that economic and political aspects, ethical considerations and value-based decisions play a critical role in decision-making in hotel selections. In other words, company image and hotel corporate reputation are two of the most significant intangible assets which are looked at by the customers (Graci and Dodds, 2008). Therefore, it can be concluded that hotels must maintain their responsible image and consider the impact on this image of their decision-making.

6.2.7 Best practices in the green hotels
In terms of green practices in green hotels, customers favour green practices in which they can participate, and which do not interfere with their convenience while they are staying at a hotel. Nevertheless, individual customers might have different views on how they look at these practices. For example, Baker et al. (2013) outlined several barriers that hinder customers’ purchase intentions, such as inconvenience, perceptions of cost cutting and decreased luxury. Thus, hoteliers must continually investigate current and new practices.

The findings of this study can serve as a reference for the hotel industry regarding green marketing strategies, especially in New Zealand. Green hotels will find these implications helpful to improve their understanding of the importance of different green marketing ploys and formulating a suitable green marketing implementation strategy. For the wider community, the findings provide a better understanding of hotels’ green marketing. Finally, customer’s opinions, expectations and understandings of green marketing strategies have now been explored.

6.3 Limitations
Several limitations were identified during the research process. These limitations were recognised within the research design chosen by the researcher and the time-frame given by the university to complete this dissertation project.

Respondents were recruited from participants at an environmentally-related conference. They were regarded as having an interest in global environmental conditions and were expected to have informed knowledge of the topic. This group was expected to have a variety of different views related to green marketing compared to other customers. To
recruit this group, the researcher approached the organisers of three related conferences from the North Island of New Zealand between March and April yet a positive response was obtained from only one conference organiser. Even though Kinnear and Taylor (1991) stated that the sample size is not important if other criteria satisfy the research objectives, nevertheless, different results might have been obtained if respondents from all three environmental conferences had been able to participate in this research. This research is therefore classified as a case study design, and for this reason, the findings are limited, as results cannot necessarily be generalised to the larger problem being investigated (Gray, 2009).

The other limitation has to do with the development process of the questionnaire. Most questions were close-ended, which means it was necessary to develop the questions before turning them over to respondents. The development of the questions from previous studies might have weaknesses since research in the area of green marketing is limited (Myung, McClaren & Li, 2012). Even though there were discussions aimed at clarifying each statement on the questionnaire, several statements were still poorly worded. These statements were misleading as to their exact meanings, which may have lead to inaccurate information, especially on the suitability of the questionnaire in rating green marketing strategies for New Zealand hotels. Thus, the researcher had difficulty gathering data on the issues to be covered by the study. Additionally, the special characteristics of the respondents – having informed knowledge about global environmental conditions – had the potential to provide new knowledge about green marketing. However, the use of prepared questions may have limited their ability to provide comprehensive data. As emphasised by Collis and Hussey (2003), the questionnaire is not always the most effective way to obtain in-depth meaning of a specific phenomenon. Additionally, several respondents missed some questions. This might be due to the number of close-ended questions they were asked to answer, which may have hindered their interest in answering all of the questions. Thus, the usage of the questionnaire might have limited respondents’ responses on green marketing issues in a New Zealand context. The limited time-frame for the study is another limitation, because this project was undertaken as part of a three month dissertation project. Ideally such a project would operate for a longer period, enabling data collection from more respondents and from a wider area. However, as an exploratory study, the findings are still relevant.
Even though these limitations affected the process of the research project, they did not affect the findings, as all three objectives of the study were met. Additionally, as an exploratory study, this study has been able to add new knowledge regarding green marketing strategies in the New Zealand context.

6.4 Recommendations / Indication for future research

This research is seen as the beginning of an exploration into customers’ expectations and opinions of green marketing of New Zealand hotels. Several recommendations for future researchers are recommended to obtain more accurate information regarding customers’ perceptions in relation to this particular topic. Additionally, some findings were inconsistent with those in the literature. It is therefore suggested that future researchers carry out research on several important issues:

- A logical next step for future research is to analyse whether perceptions of green marketing related activities actually influence hotel selection, or customers’ satisfaction. Although this study analysed the views of respondents expected to have knowledge of current environmental issues, it did not take into account their actual behaviour and attitudes to eco-friendly habits in regards to green marketing related activities. Additionally, this study did not investigate hotel management perceptions of green marketing related activities and to what extent they may incorporate green marketing related activities into an organisation’s culture.

- The research would have been much stronger if it had assumed an attitude-behaviour model of hotel customer behaviour, and tested the relationships between customers’ attitudes and customers’ behaviours. Using such a model, the research might have been able to examine theoretical connections between consumers’ espoused green attitudes and their manifest green behaviour. Thus, more research is recommended to explore this connection.

- Referring to preferable green practices of green hotels (see Part Three of Appendix A), this kind of question can also be asked for specific hotel categories. Results may differ from luxury hotels and mid-scale hotels. In addition, the same type of question may be asked of food and beverage establishments, both within hotels and at independent facilities serving organic foods. Even though the meeting and event industry may also embrace green practices, there is little if any research assessing customers’ perceptions of green practices offered.

- Knowing customers want environmentally friendly products is not enough in developing green marketing and practices. It is not the same as knowing exactly
which products consumers are going to want and what kind of price-performance trade-offs they may be willing to accept. Accordingly, further research is necessary to explore the wider range of green consumers. A wider range of consumers can be addressed to enable hoteliers in developing a green marketing strategy for green consumers so they are able to offer the exact products green consumers want and charge accordingly.

- Most respondents did not have any idea or were unsure about statements of green promotional strategies. In other words, the effectiveness of current green promotional strategies appeared to be relatively low. It is recommended that promotional strategies be changed. For example, a hotel’s educational effort must be grounded in means-end theory (Gutman, 1982). The means-end theory asserts that customers decide to buy a product or service (means) to achieve the desired values (end). In this case, the ability of green products in protecting the environment is not quite enough. Thus, desired values can be referred to individual emotional benefits associated with green products. Examples of individual emotional benefits include convenience, fair price, and high quality of green products.

- Assessing customer interest towards green practices may provide further insights into a customer’s motivation. In this study, while there was no association recorded between the three demographic profiles (gender, age and current employment status) and the four Ps variables, several previous studies found mixed results in terms of the influence that they have on any sort of behaviour. Understanding guest behaviours in relation to green marketing and green programmes may assist hoteliers to encourage particular customers to purchase the programmes or services. Although several studies (Laroche, Bergeron, & Barbaro-Forleo, 2001) indicate that customer decision-making is strongly influenced by gender and age, this study failed to find any associations. Therefore, further research to investigate this issue is recommended.

- Finally, further research drawing on a larger population can be conducted employing a similar method to this study. Additionally, a qualitative approach which enables the researcher to collect in-depth information might be useful to provide a comparison with the findings.
6.5 Summary
It is critically important to gain a better understanding of customer desire with respect to green marketing related activities, which can enable hotels to design more effective and efficient green marketing and green programmes. This study is one of the few that has examined customer expectations on green marketing related activities and green practices. The study benefits hotel practitioners, customers, shareholders, communities and even the future of the planet. Even though this study explores a small sample of hotel customers’ current thinking, it is believed it can contribute to the future well-being of the planet. By taking into account the limitations and considering the recommendations, hoteliers could provide helpful assistance in the development of future green marketing strategies.
References


Appendices

Appendix A – Questionnaire

Green marketing of hotels

Information for Respondents

My name is Noor Amalina binti Mat Yusof and I am a student of Master of International Hospitality at the Auckland University of Technology. I am working on a research project for my dissertation, examining how people evaluate New Zealand’s hotels’ green marketing. This study is designed to help me understand your perceptions around hotel green marketing.

Participation in this study is voluntary, and your name will not be required, so your responses will be anonymous. Aggregated results will be used for my master’s qualification in hospitality management (MIHM), and journal and conference publications to inform industry operators and other tourism and hospitality researchers of what we find.

By taking the survey you are giving consent to be part of this research. Participation is voluntary - to participate, simply answer the questions below. We would appreciate it if you could complete this as accurately as possible. All questions are optional. The survey will take around 10 minutes to complete.

The results of the survey will be published on Scholarly Commons when the thesis is completed. If you wish to view them, please email Dr Poulston or Dr Liu in January 2015 for the URL.

Concerns regarding the conduct of the research should be notified to the Executive Secretary of AUTEC, Kate O’Connor, ethics@aut.ac.nz, 921 9999 ext 6038.

For further information about this research contact either of the project supervisors:

Dr Jill Poulston
School of Hospitality and Tourism
Auckland University of Technology
55 Wellesley Street East 1010
Private bag 92006
Auckland 1142
New Zealand
jill.poulston@aut.ac.nz
+64 9 921 9999 ext 8488

Dr Claire Liu
School of Hospitality and Tourism
Auckland University of Technology
55 Wellesley Street East 1010
Private bag 92006
Auckland 1142
New Zealand
claire.liu@aut.ac.nz
+64 9 921 9999 ext 6431

Approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee on 18 March 2014, AUTEC Reference Number 14/36.
PART 1: This section is about your personal information.

1. What is your gender? FEMALE/MALE

2. Where did you come from? ................................................

3. What is your age?
   A) Under than 20
   B) 20-29
   C) 30-39
   D) 40-49
   E) 50-59
   F) 60 and over

4. Which of the following best describes your current employment situation?
   A) Employed Full Time
   B) Employed Part Time
   C) Self employed
   D) Unemployed
   E) Other (Please specify) .................................................................
**PART 2:** This section asks you to rate the importance of 30 green hotel marketing-related statements about green products, green distribution, green pricing and green promotion.

Using the rating scale below, please circle the number beside the statement that matches your agreement with the statement. For example, if you strongly disagree with the statement, circle 1.

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree (SD)</td>
<td>Disagree (D)</td>
<td>Neither Agree or Disagree (N)</td>
<td>Agree (A)</td>
<td>Strongly agree (SA)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Green hotel marketing should begin with green product and service design (e.g. room occupancy sensors that save energy in guest rooms)</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Green hotel products and services may provide an opportunity for product differentiation</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Hotels are seeking to bring innovative green products and services to the market</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Green hotels can elevate industry members’ image and reputation to attract green tourists who demand green accommodation when travelling</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Green hotel product and service performance plays a key role in influencing customers’ revisit intention</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Hotels are sincere in instituting programmes that save water and energy, reduce solid waste, use resources economically and protect the planet’s ecosystem</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Guests desire green hotel products and practices</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Hotel companies are carrying out the extensive product-specific market research necessary to ensure green product and service success</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Hotels provide products and services that do no harm to human health</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Hotel customers are willing to pay a higher price for eco-facilities</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Customers are willing to pay a higher price if part of the amount paid is donated to green activities</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Green pricing (allows customers to support a greater level of investment in renewable energy technologies) works only when green products and services reduce hotel guest costs</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Hotel customers who are more receptive to environmentally friendly products and services are more willing to pay extra for the products and services</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Green hotel products and services are almost always priced at a premium relative to conventional offerings</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Hotel companies should charge a premium for environmentally friendly products and services to recover the additional costs incurred in their production, marketing and disposal</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Green promotions and advertisements influence hotel guests and industrial buyers because they reflect the hotel’s commitment to the environment</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Environmental labels (certificates for green hotels, e.g. ISO 14001) are an effective promotional tool in the hotel industry</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Hotel companies often use eco-labels on packaging, and display them on their corporate web sites</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Hotel companies should collaborate with environmental groups to promote their green image more effectively</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Hotel customers are suspicious of environmental advertising and claims</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Environmental claims in advertisements are often met with criticism from competitors and consumer organisations</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Environmental labels create incentives for the hotel business to change the market</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Hotel companies try to convince customers to be environmentally friendly during direct sales activities</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Hotel companies see simple compliance with environmental legislation as an opportunity to promote their green credentials</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Joining commercial green marketing and central reservation associations that advertise and promote green hotels helps hotels to reach green travellers</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Some hotels have attempted to develop green certification programmes to gain green customer confidence</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. The internet is an effective channel for marketing a hotel’s green initiatives directly to customers</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. The selection of business partners, such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines, is influenced by environmental issues</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. The image of business partners, such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines, should be consistent with the green image that a hotel wants to project</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. A hotel should use environmentally friendly distribution channels (paths through which product and services travel from supplier to customers) to build a green image</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART 3: This section asks about your expectations of business practices within green hotels.

- Green hotels have green certificates or environmental labels (e.g. ISO 14001)
- Green hotel customers can say no to daily linen change
- Green hotel customers can say no to daily towel change
- Green hotels apply effective recycling programmes
- Green hotels use low-flow toilets, faucets and showerheads
- Green hotels use energy-efficient lighting
- Green hotels use ‘green’ cleaning products with low chemicals
- Green hotels have key-card systems that control lights and heating or air-conditioning
- Green hotels have solar panel systems to reduce their carbon footprint
- Green hotels advise customers of their solar power generation via monitor set up in the lobby
- Green hotels offer organic meals in their restaurants
- Other expectations:
  .............................................................................................................................
  .............................................................................................................................
  .............................................................................................................................
  .............................................................................................................................
  ........................................
Appendix B – Participant Information Sheet

Participant Information Sheet

Date Information Sheet Produced:
25 February 2014

Project Title
Customers’ expectations of hotel green marketing: A New Zealand quantitative study

An Invitation
My name is Noor Amalina binti Mat Yusof. I am a student of the Master of International Hospitality programme at Auckland University of Technology. For my dissertation, I am researching how people evaluate New Zealand’s hotels green marketing. This research is designed to help me understand perceptions around hotel green marketing.

Participation in this research is voluntary, and all information provided to me is confidential and will only be used in collated form and for the purposes of this study only. This confidentiality extends to the name of the conference you are attending and the name of your hotel, if applicable.

What is the purpose of this research?
The purpose of this research is to examine the influence of green marketing on consumers. Aggregated results of the survey will be used for a dissertation for a master’s qualification in hospitality management (MIHM), and journal and conference publications to inform industry operators and other tourism and hospitality researchers of the findings.

How was I identified and why am I being invited to participate in this research?
If you are currently employed (but not in a hotel) and have experienced New Zealand’s hotel environment, you are invited to take part in this research project.

What will happen in this research?
We will complete a questionnaire which consist of three main parts: demographic questions, a section that will require you to evaluate hotel green marketing practices, and a section that will ask you to identify green practices you expect in ‘green hotels’ in New Zealand.

What are the discomforts and risks?
No risks or discomfort are anticipated in this study.

What are the benefits?
This research project is expected to benefit hoteliers, wider community, respondents and researchers. The hoteliers will benefit in terms of positioning their marketing strategies in alignment with customers’ needs and wants and also to anticipate whether their green investments will be profitable. For the wider community, the study will develop a better understanding on hotel’s green marketing.
Meanwhile, this project may benefit you by providing the opportunity to reflect on the importance of hotels’ green issues. Lastly, this project will benefit me in helping me obtain a master’s, and journal and conference publications.

**How will my privacy be protected?**
Your responses will be anonymous as your identity and other identifying information will not be asked.

**What are the costs of participating in this research?**
This questionnaire requires 8-10 minutes of your time.

**What opportunity do I have to consider this invitation?**
If you wish to participate, please complete the questionnaire and return it folded up to the box on the registration table.

**How do I agree to participate in this research?**
Your completion of the questionnaire will be deemed agreement to participate.

**Will I receive feedback on the results of this research?**
If you would like feedback, please leave your email contact details on the list at the registration table so that a link to the final report can be sent to later.

**What do I do if I have concerns about this research?**
Any concerns regarding the nature of this project should be notified in the first instance to the Project Supervisors, Dr Poulston or Dr Liu. Their email contacts are below.

Concerns regarding the conduct of the research should be notified to the Executive Secretary of AUTEC, Kate O’Connor, ethics@aut.ac.nz, 921 9999 ext 6038.

**Whom do I contact for further information about this research?**

*Project Supervisor Contact Details:*

Dr Jill Poulston  
School of Hospitality and Tourism  
Auckland University of Technology  
Private Bag 92006  
Auckland 1142  
jill.poulston@aut.ac.nz  
+64 9 921 9999 ext 8488

Dr Claire Liu  
School of Hospitality and Tourism  
Auckland University of Technology  
Private Bag 92006  
Auckland 1142  
claire.liu@aut.ac.nz  
+64 9 921 9999 ext 6431

Approved by the Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee on 18 March 2014, AUTEC Reference number 14/36.
Appendix C – AUTEC approval

18 March 2014

Jill Poulston
Faculty of Business and Law

Dear Jill

Re Ethics Application: 14/36 Customers, expectations of hotel green marketing: A New Zealand quantitative study.

Thank you for providing evidence as requested, which satisfies the points raised by the AUT University Ethics Committee (AUTEC).

Your ethics application has been approved for three years until 17 March 2017.

As part of the ethics approval process, you are required to submit the following to AUTEC:

- A brief annual progress report using form EA2, which is available online through http://www.aut.ac.nz/researchethics. When necessary this form may also be used to request an extension of the approval at least one month prior to its expiry on 17 March 2017;
- A brief report on the status of the project using form EA3, which is available online through http://www.aut.ac.nz/researchethics. This report is to be submitted either when the approval expires on 17 March 2017 or on completion of the project.

It is a condition of approval that AUTEC is notified of any adverse events or if the research does not commence. AUTEC approval needs to be sought for any alteration to the research, including any alteration of or addition to any documents that are provided to respondents. You are responsible for ensuring that research undertaken under this approval occurs within the parameters outlined in the approved application.

AUTEC grants ethical approval only. If you require management approval from an institution or organisation for your research, then you will need to obtain this. If your research is undertaken within a jurisdiction outside New Zealand, you will need to make the arrangements necessary to meet the legal and ethical requirements that apply there.

To enable us to provide you with efficient service, please use the application number and study title in all correspondence with us. If you have any enquiries about this application, or anything else, please do contact us at ethics@aut.ac.nz.

All the very best with your research,

Kate O’Connor
Executive Secretary
Auckland University of Technology Ethics Committee

Cc: Noor Amalina binti Mat Yusof rynnacute@yahoo.com
Appendix D - Table of frequency distribution of respondents’ expectations of business practices within green hotels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$n$</td>
<td>$(%)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Green hotels apply effective recycling programmes.</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>(92.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Green hotel customers can say no to daily linen change.</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>(90.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Green hotel customers can say no to daily towel change.</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>(87.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Green hotels use energy-efficient lighting.</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>(87.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Green hotels use ‘green’ cleaning products with low chemicals.</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>(87.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Green hotels have key-card systems that control lights and heating or air-conditioning.</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>(80.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Green hotels use low-flow toilets, faucets and showerheads.</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>(75.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Green hotels have solar panel systems to reduce their carbon footprint.</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>(67.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Green hotels have green certificates or environmental labels (e.g. ISO 14001).</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>(65.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Green hotels advise customers of their solar power generation via monitor set up in the lobby.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>(37.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Green hotels offer organic meals in their restaurants.</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>(35.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Other</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>(12.5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix E - Table of central distribution (mean and 95% Confidence Interval of the mean scores) for each attributes with questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>(SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2  Green hotel products and services may provide an opportunity for product differentiation.</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>(0.61)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1  Green hotel marketing should begin with green product and service design (e.g. room occupancy sensors that save energy in guest rooms).</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>(0.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 The internet is an effective channel for marketing a hotel’s green initiatives directly to customers.</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>(0.54)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 The image of business partners, such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines, should be consistent with the green image that a hotel wants to project.</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>(0.60)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4  Green hotels can elevate industry members’ image and reputation to attract green tourists who demand green accommodation when travelling.</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>(0.68)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 A hotel should use environmentally friendly distribution channels (path which hotel’s product and services travel from vendor to customers) to build a green image.</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>(0.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Hotel companies should collaborate with environmental groups to promote their green image more effectively.</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>(0.74)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 Joining commercial green marketing and central reservation associations that advertise and promote green hotels helps hotels to reach green travellers.</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>(0.63)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7  Guests desire green hotel products and practices.</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>(0.69)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Hotel companies often use eco-labels on packaging, and display them on their corporate web sites.</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>(0.79)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Hotel companies see simple compliance with environmental legislation as an opportunity to promote their green credentials.</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>(0.61)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 Environmental labels create incentives for the hotel business to change the market.</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>(0.67)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Hotel customers who are more receptive to environmentally friendly products and services are more willing to pay extra for them.</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>(0.93)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>(SD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Environmental labels (certificates for green hotel, e.g. ISO 14001) are an effective promotional tool in the hotel industry.</td>
<td>3.6 (0.85)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Green promotions and advertisements influence hotel guests and industrial buyers because they reflect the hotel’s commitment to the environment.</td>
<td>3.5 (0.75)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 Some hotels have attempted to develop green certification programmes to gain green customer confidence.</td>
<td>3.5 (0.60)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Hotels are seeking to bring innovative green products and services to the market.</td>
<td>3.5 (0.79)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Green hotel products and services are almost always priced at a premium relative to conventional offerings.</td>
<td>3.5 (0.88)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Hotel customers are suspicious of environmental advertising and claims.</td>
<td>3.5 (0.85)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Green hotel product and service performance plays a key role in influencing customers’ revisit intention.</td>
<td>3.3 (0.89)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Green pricing (is an optional utility service that allows customers an opportunity to support a greater level of utility company investment in renewable energy technologies) works only when green products and services reduce hotel guest costs.</td>
<td>3.3 (0.77)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 The selection of business partners, such as travel agencies, tour operators, wholesalers and airlines, is influenced by environmental issues.</td>
<td>3.2 (0.91)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Hotel companies try to convince customers to be environmentally friendly during direct sales activities.</td>
<td>3.2 (0.84)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Hotel companies are carrying out the extensive product-specific market research necessary to ensure green product and service success.</td>
<td>3.2 (0.81)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Hotels are sincere in instituting programmes that save water and energy, reduce solid waste, use resources economically and protect the planet’s ecosystem.</td>
<td>3.2 (0.98)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 Environmental claims in advertisements are often met with criticism from competitors and consumer organizations.</td>
<td>3.1 (0.64)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Hotels provide products and services that do no harm to human health.</td>
<td>3.0 (1.09)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>(SD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Customers are willing to pay a higher price if part of the amount</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>(0.90)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>paid is donated to green activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Hotel customers are willing to pay a higher price for eco-facilities.</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>(0.88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Hotel companies should charge a premium for environmentally</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>(1.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>friendly products and services to recover the additional costs incurred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in their production, marketing and disposal.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix F-Table of central distribution (mean and 95% Confidence Interval of the mean scores) for each attributes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>$n$</th>
<th>Missing</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error of Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>95%</th>
<th>Lower</th>
<th>Upper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>.160</td>
<td>1.010</td>
<td>0.313</td>
<td>2.262</td>
<td>2.888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>.139</td>
<td>.877</td>
<td>0.272</td>
<td>2.453</td>
<td>2.997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.90</td>
<td>.142</td>
<td>.900</td>
<td>0.279</td>
<td>2.621</td>
<td>3.179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>.174</td>
<td>1.088</td>
<td>0.341</td>
<td>2.633</td>
<td>3.316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>.103</td>
<td>.641</td>
<td>0.201</td>
<td>2.902</td>
<td>3.304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>.154</td>
<td>.975</td>
<td>0.302</td>
<td>2.848</td>
<td>3.452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>.130</td>
<td>.812</td>
<td>0.255</td>
<td>2.899</td>
<td>3.409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>.135</td>
<td>.842</td>
<td>0.264</td>
<td>2.967</td>
<td>3.495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>.148</td>
<td>.913</td>
<td>0.290</td>
<td>2.946</td>
<td>3.527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>.143</td>
<td>.893</td>
<td>0.280</td>
<td>3.027</td>
<td>3.588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>.123</td>
<td>.766</td>
<td>0.240</td>
<td>3.067</td>
<td>3.548</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>.138</td>
<td>.876</td>
<td>0.271</td>
<td>3.179</td>
<td>3.721</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>.134</td>
<td>.846</td>
<td>0.262</td>
<td>3.188</td>
<td>3.712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>.126</td>
<td>.790</td>
<td>0.248</td>
<td>3.214</td>
<td>3.709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>.096</td>
<td>.601</td>
<td>0.189</td>
<td>3.298</td>
<td>3.676</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>.119</td>
<td>.751</td>
<td>0.233</td>
<td>3.292</td>
<td>3.758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>.134</td>
<td>.846</td>
<td>0.262</td>
<td>3.288</td>
<td>3.812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.58</td>
<td>.147</td>
<td>.931</td>
<td>0.288</td>
<td>3.287</td>
<td>3.863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.63</td>
<td>.106</td>
<td>.667</td>
<td>0.207</td>
<td>3.418</td>
<td>3.832</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>.098</td>
<td>.614</td>
<td>0.193</td>
<td>3.500</td>
<td>3.885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>.125</td>
<td>.791</td>
<td>0.245</td>
<td>3.455</td>
<td>3.945</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>.110</td>
<td>.686</td>
<td>0.215</td>
<td>3.503</td>
<td>3.933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>.101</td>
<td>.630</td>
<td>0.198</td>
<td>3.648</td>
<td>4.044</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>.118</td>
<td>.744</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>3.669</td>
<td>4.131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.03</td>
<td>.113</td>
<td>.707</td>
<td>0.222</td>
<td>3.804</td>
<td>4.247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td>.107</td>
<td>.677</td>
<td>0.210</td>
<td>3.840</td>
<td>4.260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td>.097</td>
<td>.605</td>
<td>0.190</td>
<td>3.861</td>
<td>4.241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>.086</td>
<td>.540</td>
<td>0.169</td>
<td>3.984</td>
<td>4.323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>.118</td>
<td>.747</td>
<td>0.232</td>
<td>3.943</td>
<td>4.407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>.096</td>
<td>.608</td>
<td>0.188</td>
<td>4.112</td>
<td>4.488</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix G – Horizontal graph of central distribution analysis
Appendix H - Table of central tendency (mean and 95% Confidence Interval of the mean scores) for product, price, promotion and place

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Missing</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Error of Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>95%</th>
<th>Lower</th>
<th>Upper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Price</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.08006</td>
<td>.50635</td>
<td>0.157</td>
<td>2.931</td>
<td>3.244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>.06450</td>
<td>.40794</td>
<td>0.126</td>
<td>3.406</td>
<td>3.659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>.07541</td>
<td>.47693</td>
<td>0.148</td>
<td>3.447</td>
<td>3.743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>.06731</td>
<td>.42037</td>
<td>0.132</td>
<td>3.671</td>
<td>3.935</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix I – Table of Comparison of means for product, price, promotion and place

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Product Mean (SD)</th>
<th>Product p-value</th>
<th>Price Mean (SD)</th>
<th>Price p-value</th>
<th>Promotion Mean (SD)</th>
<th>Promotion p-value</th>
<th>Place Mean (SD)</th>
<th>Place p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>3.6 (0.48)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.1 (0.47)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5 (0.41)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.8 (0.42)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>3.5 (0.45)</td>
<td>0.372&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.0 (0.36)</td>
<td>0.646&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.5 (0.35)</td>
<td>0.541&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.8 (0.43)</td>
<td>0.601&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>3.7 (0.50)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.1 (0.59)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.6 (0.45)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.8 (0.42)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age, years</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>4.0 (0.56)</td>
<td>0.057&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.2 (0.34)</td>
<td>0.164&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.9 (0.46)</td>
<td>0.180&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4.2 (0.49)</td>
<td>0.127&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>3.8 (0.69)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.2 (0.84)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5 (0.60)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.7 (0.57)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>3.5 (0.25)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.7 (0.50)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.6 (0.33)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.7 (0.25)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>3.5 (0.34)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.2 (0.38)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5 (0.29)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.7 (0.32)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 and over</td>
<td>3.3 (0.35)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.1 (0.14)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.3 (0.32)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.7 (0.38)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current employment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Full Time</td>
<td>3.6 (0.48)</td>
<td>0.525&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.0 (0.59)</td>
<td>0.757&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.5 (0.42)</td>
<td>0.902&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3.8 (0.45)</td>
<td>0.555&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Part Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>3.6 (0.53)</td>
<td>3.2 (0.19)</td>
<td>3.6 (0.44)</td>
<td>3.8 (0.37)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Part Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self employed</td>
<td>3.3 (0.37)</td>
<td>3.2 (0.14)</td>
<td>3.5 (0.29)</td>
<td>3.6 (0.29)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: SD = Standard Deviation; aIndependent t-test; bOne-way ANOVA.*