Growing up in a western country: How applicable is the theory of second individuation to second generation Chinese youths? Implications for psychotherapeutic practice.

Christine Chi Hang Wong

A dissertation submitted to Auckland University of Technology in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Health Science (MHSc)

Primary Supervisor: Brigitte Puls
Department of Psychotherapy

2011
Table of Contents

Attestation of Authorship. .................................................................4

Acknowledgments .......................................................................5

Abstract .......................................................................................6

Chapter 1 Introduction
Psychotherapy with Minority Chinese Adolescents .....................8
Chapter Overview .................................................................12

Chapter 2 Methodology
Research Methods ....................................................................14
Formulating the Research Question ........................................15
Sampling ..................................................................................16
  Searching data bases ............................................................17
  Non systematic literature search ..........................................19
Selection Process .......................................................................19
  Inclusion/exclusion criteria .................................................19
    Alterations made to the inclusion criteria in the course of research ......20
  Quality criteria for each research ........................................22
Synthesis: Extracting, Analysing and Presenting the Evidence ......22
  The thematic analysis process ............................................24
Researcher’s Bias .....................................................................26
Ethical Approval ......................................................................27
Summary ..................................................................................28

Chapter 3 Theoretical Influences and Concepts
Theory: The Second Individuation Process (SIP) .................30
Empirical Findings of the SIP .................................................32
Shortcomings of the SI Theory .............................................35
Summary ..................................................................................37

Chapter 4 Adolescent Development across Chinese Societies
Individualistically Orientated Societies ..................................40
Collectivistically Orientated Societies ....................................40
The Aspects of Confucian Philosophy that Influence Chinese People’s Ideas of Personhood……………………………………………………………………………41
Family as the basic unit of society………………………………………………………….42
Harmonious relationships and attitudes towards emotions……………………………43
Roles and responsibilities……………………………………………………………………………44
Role of the parent…………………………………………………………………………………45
Distinctiveness of the self………………………………………………………………………..47
Autonomy………………………………………………………………………………………48
Summary…………………………………………………………………………………………50

Chapter 5 Negotiating Two Cultures
Development of MCYs……………………………………………………………………..52
Identity and Ethnic Identity Formation………………………………………………………54
Social and Contextual Factors that Influence Development…………………………….56
Summary…………………………………………………………………………………………60

Chapter 6 Implications for Therapeutic Practice
The Culturally Competent Therapist………………………………………………………63
The therapeutic model…………………………………………………………………………..64
Transference and counter-transference……………………………………………………65
The role of the therapist…………………………………………………………………………66
Dealing with emotions…………………………………………………………………………66
Balancing autonomy and interdependence………………………………………………67
Facilitating ethnic and bicultural identity………………………………………………69
Working with the family………………………………………………………………………70
Summary…………………………………………………………………………………………72

Chapter 7 Limitations, Future Research Directions and Concluding Remarks
Limitations of the Dissertation…………………………………………………………..74
Future Directions for Research…………………………………………………………..76
Concluding Remarks………………………………………………………………………78

References……………………………………………………………………………………80

List of Tables
Table 1 Literature search between March - August 2011………………………………18
Attestation of Authorship

“I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person (except where explicitly defined in the acknowledgements), nor material which to a substantial extent has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning”.

Signed:

Christine Wong

Date:
Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Brigitte for her guidance and support, Gudrun for helping me “whip” this dissertation into shape, and Brian and Kathryn for “polishing” the final manuscript.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my fiancé, Florian, for constantly showing me the light at the end of the tunnel.

Wàn fèn gǎn xiè (萬分感謝).
Abstract

The objective of this dissertation is to explore the applicability of the theory of “second individuation” (SI) to the second generation minority Chinese during the life cycle phase of adolescence (MCY) and the implication for psychotherapeutic practice. Using a modified systematic literature review methodology, several major findings emerged.

The primary finding is that the SI theory has many socially constructed concepts that describe the development of a person living in an individualistically orientated environment. For instance, the development of “a self” which is based on separation and differentiation from others, with the development of autonomy and independence as a central developmental goal, is an individualistic ideal. However, these concepts do not describe the developmental goals of people who are immersed in the traditional Chinese culture. Exposed to both “East” and “West” values, the self development of the MCY is both individualistically and collectively orientated, rendering some aspects of MCY’s developmental goals incompatible with the goals depicted in the SI theory. These incompatible aspects include retaining and valuing interdependence as well as togetherness and loyalty with their parents and family. Further, not predicted by the SI theory, external factors such as parental beliefs and acculturation levels, the social economic status of the family and society’s reception of minority youth, were found to strongly govern how the MCY negotiate their self and identity development. This dissertation demonstrates that the SI theory has its limitations when it is applied to the MCY population. Psychotherapists who entertain the idea of using the theory of SI as
part of their therapeutic formulation and goal setting with their MCY clients will need to make adjustments to the theory to cater to the MCY’s collective ideals.

The dissertation highlights that the therapeutic process with MCYs will need to incorporate the developmental goals of both worldviews in order to honour the needs of the family and the youth. A culturally competent therapist needs to have a sound understanding of the contractual interpersonal relationships and interactions within the Chinese population, display sensitivity to the culturally determined emotional expressions and forms of emotional management within the Chinese society, demonstrate the ability to understand both cultural worldviews, and be able to hold the tension of both. There is a need for psychotherapists to be aware of the cultural biases inherent in practice and develop the culturally competent skills needed to provide appropriate services to the MCY population.
Chapter 1 Introduction

Psychotherapy with Minority Chinese Adolescents

New Zealand has a long history of immigration and its population is a colourful mix of people originating from many nationalities (Bell, 2005). Chinese New Zealanders are the 5th largest ethnic group and make up about 4% of the population (Ho, Au, Bedford & Cooper, 2003). In the 1990s, due to the immigration reforms of New Zealand in 1987 and the political changes that occurred in Hong Kong, there was a steady influx of highly skilled and affluent Chinese immigrants from Hong Kong (Pang, 2003). In recent times, as a result of a combination of New Zealand’s move to be classified as an Asia-Pacific nation and the changing socio-economic-political climate in China, there has been a continual movement of people from mainland China and Taiwan migrating to New Zealand (Pang, 2003).

Given the well established migration pattern of the Chinese people, health and mental health professionals in New Zealand may soon face the prospect of working with the “second generation” minority Chinese youths (MCY). These are Chinese youths who have spent their entire life in the Western society but at home they are also exposed to their parents’ Chinese culture. Growing up in an environment where there are differences in perception of human development between the West and Chinese societies, it is likely MCYs will seek psychological help to deal with conflicting ideas inherent in both cultures.
Human development consists of changes in physical, psychological and social behaviour as experienced by individuals across the lifespan from conception to death (Gardiner & Kosmitzki, 2008). One of these important lifespan changes is the transition of an individual from late childhood to emerging adulthood, commonly known as adolescence. In studies that focus on cultural similarities and differences in human developmental processes, Gardiner and Kosmitzki, (2008) find that the developmental stage of adolescence is negotiated differently in different cultures and the concept of what constitutes a well-adjusted individual differs vastly between cultures.

Yet not all cultures embrace the notion of adolescence (Chatterjee, Bailey & Aronoff, 2001). Kwan (1994) claims that adolescence as a developmental stage is a concept that is derived from Western models of human development whereas in the traditional Chinese society, the notion of adolescence does not exist. In traditional Chinese society human lifespan is perceived as consisting of infancy, childhood, adulthood and old age. There is no additional stage in between childhood and adulthood. According to Lam (2005), the difference in conception of human development stems from the differences in the values, beliefs and ideals of adulthood, which in turn translate to differences in developmental goals. The main difference between the Chinese society and the Western society is that traditional Chinese society is based on an agrarian state, with roots in agricultural economy (Lam, 1997). In an agrarian state members of the society are collectively organised and each member has a responsibility to contribute to the wealth and prosperity of the collective (Chatterjee, Bailey & Aronoff, 2001). When the society is organised in this collective way, children are seen as an asset that can help boost the wealth and
prosperity of the family (Kagitcibasi, 2007). When people are viewed as an asset, naturally it will be more desirable for adolescence to be a short transition from childhood to adulthood. This in turn brings a society of people with early marriages, childbearing, and responsibilities for the economic support of the family (Chatterjee et al., 2001; Kagitcibasi, 2007). Despite recognising the considerable differences amongst cultures and ethnic groups, many Western psychological theories assume universality of adolescent development and are used to explain psychological, emotional, and social changes during adolescence (Sigelman & Rider, 2003).

Theories are useful as they provide clinicians with a framework from which to develop therapeutic goals and to view the issues presented by their clients (Gerldard & Gerldard, 1997). However, theories become problematic when practitioners use, for example, Western concepts of adolescence on individuals from Chinese societies without consideration of the differences and incompatibilities between the societies (Ringel, 2005). Psychological theories used under those circumstances could not only hinder the direction of therapy and the therapeutic process but also harm clients.

My interest in the applicability of psychological theories came about during my studies to become a child psychotherapist. I noticed that some of the theories, as well as concepts within the theory, did not resonate with my experiences as a Hong Kong Chinese who had migrated to New Zealand since the age of nine and my background as a child of medically trained parents. I realised that my reaction stems from the fact that all the
theories used in child psychotherapy were created by Western theorists and a number of them assume a position of universality.

During my studies, I found myself switching backwards and forwards between my Chinese understanding and the Western principles taught in the course. One theory in particular that I found myself alternating the most is the “second individuation” (SI) theory. My shifting of cultural perspectives led me to decide on testing the SI theory’s applicability to the Chinese society by making it the topic of this dissertation. The SI theory is conceived by Peter Blos (1962, 1967) and represents a core aspect of the psychoanalytic and psychodynamic paradigm. It describes the psychological changes in the self and identity of an adolescent. Knowledge about how MCY negotiate “adolescence” and how applicable the Western theory of SI is to Chinese youth will inform therapists orientated in the Western therapeutic framework of the appropriate approaches to take when working with Chinese youths and their families.

In addition to my personal reasons for engaging in this topic, there is another reason for conducting this study. I hope that the findings of this study contribute to informing culturally competent psychotherapeutic practice. As a result of global movement of people, therapists are likely to work more and more with culturally different clients (Hinman, 2003). Being culturally aware, practitioners will be able to avoid applying theories developed in and for Western society to clients who belong to different cultural groups. Thus the present dissertation endeavours to answer two research questions. The first is: what is the applicability of the psychodynamic theory of second individuation
process to second generation minority Chinese youths? The second question is: what are the implications of using the SI theory in psychotherapy with second generation MCY?

Chapter Overview

Chapter Two will concentrate on the methodology that has been used to answer the research questions, discuss the reasons for choosing this methodology, describe the selection process, discuss the extraction, analysis and synthesis process, and clarify the decision making process.

Chapter Three looks at the applicability of the theory of SI to MCY by setting the parameters on how the literature will be explored. This chapter will introduce the theory of SI and discuss the empirical studies of the theory. The shortfalls of the theory will be investigated by highlighting the individualistically orientated bias that exists within the theory.

Chapter Four focuses on the cultural differences that exist in the conception of personhood and how these differences impact on the development of selfhood. This exploration will pave the way to investigate the question of the applicability of the SI theory to a society that is not individualistically orientated. The impact Confucian philosophy has on what constitutes an ideal person in the Chinese society will be outlined, followed by highlighting the similarities, differences and incompatibilities that exist between the Chinese people and those of the individualistically orientated society. This
chapter closes with a discussion on the implications the cultural similarities and differences have on using the SI theory with the Chinese population.

Chapter Five concentrates on the MCY population. The chapter discusses how the MCY population negotiates between the two different cultural values, standards and ideals for personhood, and highlights the issues that arise for this group, their specific developmental needs and where the theory of SI fits into the MCY’s developmental pathways.

Chapter Six proposes implications of the findings for psychotherapeutic practice and offers suggestions of how a culturally competent therapist can use these findings for practice with the MCY population. It clarifies the conditions under which the SI theory can be used with minority Chinese youth.

Chapter Seven concludes the dissertation by exploring the limitations of the present literature review, and suggesting directions for future research.
Chapter 2 Methodology

In this chapter I will discuss the methodology used to answer the research questions.

Included in the chapter are the reasons for choosing this methodology, a description of the selection process and a detailed discussion on the extraction, analysis and synthesis process.

Research Methods

To answer the research questions, I decided to conduct a systematic literature review. As part of the movement towards evidence based practice, a quality systematic literature review can offer clinicians the best available information for clinical decision making (Mulrow, Cook, & Davidoff, 1997). Originally developed in the medical field, a quality systematic literature review mainly uses quantitative research designs for evaluation and synthesis, with random control trials as the gold standard in research designs.

Mays, Pope and Popay (2005) define a literature review as the process of bringing together a body of evidence drawn from research and other sources. Literature reviews can be conceptualised as having several stages: (1) formulating the research question; (2) sampling/ searching the databases; (3) selection process; and (4) analysing, synthesising the findings.

According to Mays et al. (2005), conducting a literature review is not a linear process; rather it is a dynamic process in which each stage inter-relates with another. This was
evident in the present dissertation. At times, reading of evidence also fed back into the refinement of the search terms used and the research question. Details of the steps taken to create this dissertation and the decisions made along the way are detailed below.

Formulating the Research Question

A preliminary search of the topic was conducted between January and February of 2011, using the search engine GoogleScholar. The initial search term was Asians AND adolescence AND separation-individuation. Based on the initial reading, the question was formulated as: “How applicable is the psychodynamic theory of “second individuation” to second generation Asian adolescents living in a country different from their parents’ childhood: Implications for psychotherapeutic practice”.

After starting the systematic search, the above question was refined to the applicability of the theory of second individuation to second generation Chinese adolescents because “Asian” is a very broad term that incorporates many sub-ethnicities such as Chinese, Vietnamese, Korean, and Japanese. Although they belong to the category of Asian, there are cultural differences among the sub-ethnicities. Given the cultural differences, to include all the sub-ethnicities in the analysis would likely confound interpretation of the findings. The decision to focus only on the Chinese adolescents, and not the other sub-ethnicities, stems from my personal interest and experiences as a minority Chinese.

Apart from the two changes highlighted above, no other changes were made to the research question.
Sampling

In this systematic literature review, I have chosen to include and use both qualitative and quantitative evidence. In a quality systematic literature review, quantitative research design is considered as the gold standard. However, the current topic is based on psychoanalytic theory and psychotherapeutic practice and majority of psychotherapy research is conducted using qualitative research methodology (Dallos & Vetere, 2005). Further, in this field, therapeutic practice and theoretical advancement is facilitated by the use of case studies and expert opinions. Fonagy (2003) suggests that a modified systematic literature review, including qualitative research methodology, is better suited to the field of psychotherapy. This would allow for the gathering of a wider range of topic related research, as well as eliminating biases towards studies only using a quantitative research methodology. Seen in this light, the present research question will be answered using a modified systematic literature search.

In more recent times, it is becoming common for reviewers to gather information from a wide range of sources including information derived from non-research to research and evidence from quantitative and qualitative design methodology (Mays et al, 2005). Traditionally, data from disparate research methodologies are not synthesised together. However, Mays et al.(2005) argues that while there may well be multiple descriptions or explanations of phenomena, these descriptions or explanations have one underlying reality or truth. This is called the “subtle realism” position. Thus, synthesising disparate
research methodologies would promote further understanding of the topic at hand. The present review was conducted from a subtle realism position.

According to Mays et al. (2005), rigorous systematic reviews using both qualitative and quantitative evidence are still at an early stage. No guidelines are written on the best way to synthesise the evidence. However, these authors claim that the most important aspect is the ability to demonstrate critical thought together with transparency and explicitness about methods, which this present review has endeavoured to follow.

**Searching data bases.** Research material was primarily sourced from the major electronic databases including PsychInfo, Psychoanalytic Electronic Publishing Archive (PEP), Psychology and Behavioural Sciences Collection (EBSCO) and Counselling and Psychotherapy Transcripts, Client Narratives and Reference Work.

Search terms were based on the key words in the research question. As new information related to the second individuation process began to surface, additional search terms derived from key words of pertinent articles were included. These include: autonomy, psychological differentiation, and youth. The use of these terms added to more in depth understanding of the topic. The details of the search are shown in Table 1, on the following page.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>Literature search between March-August 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Search terms</strong></td>
<td><strong>Data Base</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;second generation asian adolescents&quot;</td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“second generation asian”</td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“second separation-individuation”</td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Counselling and Psychotherapy transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“second separation-individuation and “Chinese”</td>
<td>PEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“autonomy” and “Chinese adolescents”</td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“autonomy” and “Chinese”</td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Counselling and Psychotherapy transcript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“psychological differentiation” and “Chinese youths”</td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Adolescence” and “Chinese”</td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PEP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Counselling and Psychotherapy transcripts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“adolescence” and “New Zealand”</td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Chinese” and “migration” and “New Zealand”</td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PsychInfo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EBSCO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Non systematic literature search. To expand on the literature already chosen, the AUT library catalogue and web engines such as Google Scholar were also explored. Search terms included: second separation-individuation, biculturalism AND separation-individuation AND Chinese youths, and Chinese immigrants AND New Zealand, Psychotherapy AND Chinese.

Reference lists and citations of relevant articles and books, essays and book chapters were explored for further literature. Literature suggested by dissertation supervisor and AUT lecturers were also considered and were included when relevant.

Selection Process

Mays et al. (2005) noted that it is the responsibility of the reviewers to be systematic in how evidence is gathered and critical about the quality of the evidence. In this review, systematic gathering of evidence was demonstrated by using inclusion/exclusion criteria. The quality of the evidence was assessed using quality assessment guidelines.

Inclusion/exclusion criteria. The following inclusion criteria were used:

(1) Material related to the theory of second individuation
(2) Material related to second generation Chinese adolescents
(3) Application of the separation and individuation theory in English as well as Chinese speaking countries. Articles written in both simplified and traditional forms of Chinese were included
(4) Psychotherapy with second generation Chinese adolescents

(5) Literature on immigration relevant to the second individuation process

(6) Material written in New Zealand about minority Chinese youth development

Alterations made to the inclusion criteria in the course of research. Due to the limited number of research articles that specifically focussed on the SI process of second generation Chinese youths, research pertaining to first generation minority Chinese was also included. The decision to use the data derived from both populations was supported by Akhtar’s (2011) statement that other than issues with translocation, similar issues arise in both the first and second generation groups of individuals. I acknowledge that including the first generation minority Chinese population could confound the interpretation and applicability of the findings to the second generation Chinese population and a discussion of this can be found in the Limitations of the dissertation section in Chapter 7. Given that the first and second generation are both used, the term “minority” has been used throughout the dissertation to refer to the inclusion of first generation.

In the course of the literature search, I found that a majority of the research was conducted on minority Chinese ranging from late adolescence to beginning adulthood. In the selection of the material, I focused on the second individuation process itself rather than the age at which this process takes place. Thus, material on beginning adulthood was also included. Given that I used the material on beginning adulthood, the term “youth” has been used throughout this dissertation rather than adolescents.
The review question is a narrow one but material related to the SI process spans different schools of thought. To consider all the schools of thoughts in detail would expand this dissertation to unmanageable proportions. The exclusion of literature was guided by their relevance to the research question. Because the review was intended to focus on the second individuation process in the general population of minority Chinese, articles written and research conducted on psychopathology and mental disorders on this population were excluded from this analysis.

Lastly, the SI theory originates from psychoanalytic theory (Kroger, 2004). However, in the course of the literature search, it was found that the majority of contemporary research on minority Chinese youth and the SI process focused mainly on one aspect of the theory. The one aspect of the theory that is more studied in the literature is the process of restructuring and reorganising the internal representation of the self. Thus, following the trend of the contemporary research and to keep the dissertation in manageable proportions, I made the decision to focus on the restructuring and reorganising aspect of the SI theory in the present dissertation. In his original theory, in addition to the restructuring aspect of the theory, Blos (1967) also notes the significance of revisiting the oedipal complex and the development of sexual identity during adolescence. Given the decision to focus on one aspect of the theory, the materials that are written about the oedipal complex in the Chinese population and sexual identity development of minority Chinese youths were excluded from this review.
**Quality criteria for each research.** In this review, judgments about the quality of each selected research were guided using quality criteria relevant to the research tradition to which each research belonged. As previously mentioned, when both quantitative and qualitative design methodology are used for the synthesis of a literature review, it is important for the reviewer to be explicit about quality issues (Mays et al., 2005). Quality issues encompass issues that would affect the interpretation and use of the evidence. These include: researcher bias, sampling biases, explicitness of methodology and analysis. To make judgements about quality issues, Mays et al. (2005) suggests the use of documented guidelines and criteria for the respective research methodology.

In this review, quality issues in each piece of evidence were judged according to documented guidelines. For quantitative research, the criteria given by the Cochrane Handbook (Cochrane Statistical Methods Group & Cochrane Bias Methods Group, 2008) were used. For qualitative research, the guidelines given by Fossey, Harvey, McDermott, & Davidson (2002) were used. As a result, no research was eliminated from the analysis due to poor quality.

**Synthesis: Extracting, Analysing and Presenting the Evidence**

According to Mays et al. (2005), synthesis of findings is at the heart of every systematic review. Synthesis is a stage of review when evidence is brought together using a set of methods. These methods guide the extraction and analysis of findings from the selected pool of evidence (Dixon-Woods, Agarwal, Jones, Young, & Sutton, 2005) and dictate how evidence is presented in a written report. In this dissertation, I have chosen to use the
narrative research methodology for the synthesis of findings. Traditional narrative reviews consist of summarising, explaining and interpreting evidence on the given topic (Dixon-Woods, et al., 2005). It has the advantage of being flexible in allowing for different types of evidence.

In the present dissertation, it was found that although the research questions were narrow in focus, the material selected for synthesis came from different schools of thoughts. These include: psychoanalysis, self psychology, psychotherapy, counselling, family perspectives, and research on cultural sociology. Each of these has a different theoretical orientation. The material selected also came from both quantitative and qualitative research methodologies.

Within narrative review methodology several methods can be used to extract, analyse and bring information together. One of these methods is thematic analysis. According to Dixon-Woods et al. (2005) and Braun and Clarke (2006), thematic analysis involves the search across a set of evidence to identify the recurrent patterns such as the most important themes or issues. It has the advantages of being flexible, allows for integrating qualitative and quantitative evidence, can highlight similarities and differences across the data set, and can generate unanticipated insights (Braun & Clarke, 2006). In the present dissertation, given that the selected pool of evidence was from disparate schools of thoughts and contained both qualitative and quantitative research methodologies, the thematic analysis, as detailed in Braun & Clarke (2006), was chosen to guide extraction, analysis and synthesis of the material.
The thematic analysis process. In this dissertation, the thematic analysis was driven by the theoretical framework of the SI theory. According to Dixon-Woods et al. (2005), within a thematic analysis, specific review questions will shape the themes identified. In this dissertation, the search for themes and repeated patterns of meanings was conducted using the concepts detailed in the SI theory. For instance, the SI theory describes the development of the autonomous and independent self and the process of how the self develops, therefore concepts such as autonomy, independence, the process of developing the self served as a parameter to analyse the selected pool of evidence. In addition to the above, as the research question relates to applicability to minority/second generation Chinese youths and implications to therapeutic practice, the question of applicability and implications to therapy further shaped the theme derived from the pool of evidence. Given these overarching parameters, the thematic analysis can be conceptualised as consisting of four major stages.

In the first stage of the analysis, from the selected pool of evidence, four broad categories or themes were chosen based on the inherent information being relevant to answering the research questions about applicability and implications of findings to practice. These categories or themes include: the SI process, the Chinese culture, the minority/second generation Chinese youths, and common issues in migrant children. These categories formed the basis of Chapters 4, 5 and 6 of this dissertation. The topic of ethnic identity was noted but was put aside at this stage as it did not seem to answer the research question.
In the second stage, following the research question, articles were read with the question of applicability in mind. Conceptual difference and commonalities related to the key concepts depicted in the SI were noted down. These were categorised into five areas: autonomy, definitions and meaning of the “self” concept, “self in relation to the other”, facilitating environments and socio-political context. It was noted that different schools of thought used different operational definitions of concepts, for example the definition of the concept of autonomy differs between scholars. The reviewer used personal judgment to determine if the operational definitions of each piece of literature had enough similarities to belong within the category.

In the third stage, the subcategories were reviewed repeatedly and the relationship of the concepts of autonomy, definitions and meanings of the “self” concept, “self in relation to the other”, facilitating environment and socio-political context were diagrammatically mapped with the broader chapter categories such as the SI process, the Chinese culture, the minority/second generation Chinese youths, and common issues in migrant children. Further searches were conducted on “autonomy” because I uncovered new insights that were not covered in previous readings. The understanding of autonomy was revised and the new understanding was reviewed as to how it related to the other subcategories and the broad chapter categories. From the reading of the material, a pertinent key word of “psychological differentiation” was found. A new search was conducted using the search term “psychological differentiation”, however, the information derived from the search did not bring any more new information to the selected pool of evidence. As a result, the
term “psychological differentiation” was not explored further. The new information derived from this search was incorporated into the subcategories of the meanings of self concept and self-in-relation to the other.

In the fourth stage, the topic of ethnic identity, derived from the reading, was again checked for relevance to the research questions and further investigated. There was little research that specifically detailed how the process of ethnic identity development and the SI process are linked for minority Chinese youth. However, ethnic identity appeared to be an important part of the development of the self. The literature alluded to similar underlying processes between the second individuation process and ethnic identity development. Due to the lack of direct evidence, a latent level of thematic analysis was used in the rereading of the topic. According to Braun & Clarke (2006), the latent level of analysis goes beyond the semantic content of the evidence and examines the underlying ideas, assumptions, and conceptualisations that shape the semantic content of evidence. Thus a latent level thematic analysis involves interpretation. In this dissertation, with the research questions of applicability and implications to practice in mind, a latent level thematic analysis was conducted in rereading evidence about ethnic identity development. Reviewer’s judgment was used in the extrapolation of this material. Taken together, stages two to four form the content of the dissertation.

**Researcher’s Bias**

According to Mays et al. (2005), in bringing together quantitative and qualitative evidence, “the reasoning underpinning the judgement made need to be made clear so that
it can be discussed, if necessary and reviewed if found wanting” (p. 18). In the present
dissertation, efforts have been made to explain the reasoning underpinning the choices
made. However, as highlighted in the synthesis section above, I have made a number of
choices based on my own judgments. These are likely to contribute to a bias in themes
chosen for the dissertation.

According to Milton (2002), researcher’s biases may be an “inescapable” part of the
research process. Nevertheless, to ensure transparency in the methodology, I have
detailed my bias that is most relevant to the current research. I believe that knowledge is
socially constructed. Different worldviews lead to different perspectives on the nature of
psychological, emotional and social problems. Further, my understanding and
interpretation of the pool of evidence is likely to be strongly informed by my own
experience as a minority Chinese youth training to become a child psychotherapist which
was detailed in Chapter 1. Taken together, these beliefs and experiences could contribute
to a bias in my analysis and synthesis of the pool of evidence. In order to keep these
personal biases from affecting the findings, efforts have been made to check and recheck
the themes derived from the synthesis process to look out for any biases.

**Ethical Approval**

Ethical approval was not required as no human subjects were involved in the research
process.
Summary

In this Chapter, I described the methodology used to answer the research questions. The findings of this dissertation were derived from a modified systematic review. Given that a quality systematic review requires transparency and explicitness, in this chapter I discussed the process of formulating the research question and the alterations made. I provided an account of the selection process. I discussed the database used, the selection criteria and detailed the quality of the research used in this review. Further, the extraction, analysis and synthesis process using the thematic analysis methodology was discussed in detail. Lastly, I clarified the decision making process and highlighted the management of any biases that may exist in this dissertation. In detailing the information above, I have fulfilled the criteria that a quality systematic review requires.
Chapter 3 Theoretical Influences and Concepts

In this chapter I will introduce the theory of ‘second individuation’ (SI) and discuss the empirical studies of the theory as it relates to healthy adolescent development. The aim of the chapter is to set the parameters and premises of how the literature will be explored and interpreted laying the basis for answering the research question about the applicability of the psychodynamic theory of SI to minority Chinese youth (MCY).

The SI theory came out of Mahler’s theory (Mahler, 1963; Mahler, Pine, & Bergman, 1989) of the separation-individuation process. The first separation individuation describes a rudimentary process in which a totally dependent baby becomes less dependent on parents for emotional support and needs by internalising their parent or caregiver’s way of soothing and ministrations. The infant develops a rudimentary self that is more and more separate from that of the parent and leading to increasing independence in carrying out age appropriate activities on their own (Mahler et al., 1989). The difference between the first and the second individuation process is that the first separation-individuation process takes place between 0 to 3 years of age whereas the SI process takes place during the transition into the adulthood preparing the adolescent to function in society as an independent and autonomous being.

Even though the theory of SI was developed through clinical work, it was extended to describe universal adolescent development (Kroger, 2004). The theory of SI was considered an influential theory guiding scholars’ conceptualisation of adolescent psychological, social, and emotional development. (Lam, 2001). The influence of the
theory appear to be wide ranging from setting the parameters for researchers to formulate empirical research questions, to therapists using the theory to set therapeutic goals with their adolescent clients. Therefore it is an important theory to consider in detail which I will do in the following part.

**Theory: The Second Individuation Process (SIP)**

The Second Individuation theory was conceptualized by Peter Blos (1962, 1967). His theory describes the psychological development of “self” during adolescence. The theory refers to the self as an internal representation or image of the self. For ease of reference, I will call this the “self entity”. The theory first describes the development of the content and substance that makes up the self entity, for example personality and identity. Secondly, the development of the independent function of the self entity is described, for example taking adult responsibility, and making independent decisions.

The SIP assumes that the internal representation of self entity is built up from the person’s own childhood experiences, as well as through values and attributes displayed by their parents. Blos (1967) theorised that during adolescence two important changes take place to the self entity. The content and the representation of the self become more distinct and the functioning of the self becomes more independent.

The underlying mechanism in the development of the self entity is described in both intrapersonal and interpersonal terms. Intra-personally, the adolescent is thought to let go of the childhood aspect of self entity, especially the relinquishment of parental introjects internalised as aspect of the self (Kroger, 2004). Concurrently, the adolescent begins to
discover and build new aspects of the self. In so doing, the individual creates an internal distance and distinctiveness between internal representation of the self and the internal representation of the “other”, usually the caregiver. In the literature (Hung, 2006; Kroger, 2004), this internal distance and distinctiveness is termed psychological separation or psychological differentiation.

Scholars (Blos, 1967; Kroger, 2004) have noticed that the process of psychological separation or differentiation goes hand in hand with emotions such as fear, guilt, anger, and ambivalence towards the parent. Kroger (2004) believes when adolescents become aware of a discrepancy between personal desire and perceived expectations from their family they want to separate or escape from the expectation of their families. Concurrently, the adolescent also fear the psychological separation from his or her parents because it requires the adolescent to let go of his or her childhood securities. Later, having withstood the fear of letting go, the adolescents’ innate desire for exploring their own potential is usually coupled with feelings of guilt of having gone too far on one’s own. Kroger (2004) concludes that the ability to stand the fear and guilt is central to successful formation of the self entity even though the innate desire to separate whilst fearing letting go and the desire to explore ones potential coupled with guilt is thought to cause great ambivalence and anger within the adolescent.

With the growing distinctiveness and autonomy of the self, the interpersonal relationship between parents and adolescents also changes. Blos (1967) theorized that during the SIP the self entity begins to assume more responsibility for the adolescent’s actions and
decision making, allowing them to function more autonomously and independently from parents. Interpersonally, renegotiation of parental authority and personal autonomy takes place. Interpersonal conflict and disharmony with parents are thought to be the product of this renegotiation process (Blos, 1967).

According to Kroger (2004), successful negotiation through the SIP entails a development in which individuals become psychologically and emotional independent from parents and other adults and have a distinct separateness from their family, while at the same time, individuals continue to participate as members of the family and transition to mature self-reliance by acquiring a set of values and ethical systems that guide their responsible social behaviour, and develop mature relationships outside the home and family structure.

**Empirical Findings of the SIP**

Taking a look at how SI theory is viewed and studied in the literature, there appear to be two lines of research. The more traditional line of research focuses on validation of the theory. They study the health benefits of achieving psychological separation and individuation. More recently empirical research focuses on studying the facilitating environments that support the goals of SIP.

In the traditional lines of thinking, Blos (1967) postulates that the health of one’s adult personality and social relationships is determined by the degree to which an individual is successful in negotiating experiences that form the SIP. Empirical research (Holmbeck & Wandrei, 1993; Lapsley & Edgerton, 2002; McClanahan & Holmbeck, 1992), highlights
that successful negotiation of the experiences are related to higher levels of self-esteem, quality of family relationships, success in peer relationships, while at the same time lower levels of depression and anxiety.

Research on the SIP (Holmbeck & Leake, 1999; Kroger, 2004; Kroger & Haslett, 1988; Rice, Cole, & Lapsley, 1990) has found that those individuals who have successfully negotiated this internal process have more optimal psychosocial adjustment. Specifically, how an individual learns to manage closeness and distance in interpersonal relationships appears to be important to the adolescent’s adjustment and psychosocial outcomes (Holmbeck & Leake, 1999). For instance, Rice et al. (1990)’s study of American college students found that positive adjustment to university life was related to students who were non-anxious and non-resentful to a variety of separation experiences with their parents. However, those who had angry feelings related to separation from their parents had more difficulties managing adjustment to college life.

Further, in support of the developmental goals of gaining autonomy whilst remaining a member of the family, research findings (Holmbeck & Leake, 1999; Kroger, 2004) suggest that for adolescents the presence of both autonomy and relatedness with their parents is linked to a range of positive outcomes. These include self-reported better adjustment to separation, greater resistance to peer pressure, better self-esteem, greater emotional well-being, healthy identity development, and lower rates of reported loneliness after leaving home to attend college (Kroger, 2004).
In a more recent line of research, authors (Goossens & Beyers, 2003; Gnaulati & Heine, 2001; Kroger, 2004) highlight that in addition to understanding the health benefits of successfully negotiating the SIP, the context in which adolescents develop is also an important element to consider when studying and working with adolescent development. The research highlights that the parents, the family, and the dynamics within, are an important contributing factor in adolescent health and psychosocial outcome (Bush, 2000; Kroger, 2004).

More specifically, research such as Zinner (as cited in Kwan, 1994) found that developmental outcome is determined by adolescent internal development as well as by parental factors such as parent’s psychological make-up, how they deal with separation and the parents’ own attachment style. For instance, a parent who is uneasy about their adolescent’s growing separateness and autonomy may encourage and promote dependency needs within their adolescent to counteract their own unease. Parent’s encouragement of dependency can in turn hinder their adolescent achieving their developmental task. According to Holmbeck and Leake (1999), parent’s encouragement of separation and autonomy, and the family’s promotion of separateness while concurrently encouraging the adolescent’s continual participation as members of the family is a good predictor of healthy adolescent development.

Other empirical research (Goossen & Beyers, 2003; Montemayor, 1986) found that parenting styles are another factor that contributes to adolescent psychological development. For instance, an authoritarian style of parenting, which is warm and
supportive, best promotes a secure relationship between the parents and the adolescents, which in turn promotes and facilitates the developmental goals of staying connected yet achieving autonomy and independence.

**Shortcomings of the SI Theory**

In spite of the empirical evidence that support the importance of the SIP, it is argued that the concepts within the SI theory are culturally biased (Kwan, 1994; Lam, 2001). Blos (1967) assumed the universality of the SIP and implied that successful mastery of issues that arise in the SIP are critical developmental task for every adolescent. However, the research available does not demonstrate the universal importance of the SIP. According to Kwan (1994) and Lam (2001), a majority of the SI research conducted have been with a population mainly consisting of white middle class American college students. The pool of literature used in the writing of this section of the dissertation concurs with their claims. All empirical research reviewed for this section was conducted with samples of college students. Thus, it is not known if the SI theory extends to populations other than students attending college. Given this unknown variable, one cannot claim the universal importance of the SIP.

Researchers from different cultures (Kagitcibasi, 2007; Kwan, 1994) have found that the theory is individualistically oriented and may not be generalisable to subjects from a non-individualistic cultural environment. According to Lam (2001) and Kagitcibasi (2007), a “self” which is based on separation and differentiation from others, with the development of autonomy and independence as a central developmental goal, is an individualistic ideal.
Kagitcibasi (2007) contends that not all societies value individuals who are autonomous and function as separate entities from their parents or family of origin. For instance, in some societies, such as the Chinese, it is highly valued for the self to exist in and be grounded on collective ideals and interdependent relationships which expand from the family to wider relational networks (Markus & Kitayama, 1999). When expectations and ideals of personhood differ, the developmental goals towards a healthy and well-adjusted youth differ. Various cultural scholars (Kagitcibasi, 2007; Kwan, 1994) have found that, contrary to the predictions of the SI theory, in relationally orientated societies, the development of the relationally orientated self does not necessarily lead to maladjustment within the individual.

Given the societal differences in ideals regarding the healthy development of the self, it can be argued that the SI theory may only be applicable if the person’s social environment and cultural context support individualistic ideals. The use of the SI theory to societies that do not aspire to individualistic ideals can potentially confound empirical research interpretations and therapeutic formulations. For example, scholars or therapist who ascribe to the universal importance of the SIP may misinterpret adolescents from a relationally orientated society as delayed or “stuck” in their development.

To investigate the possible bias in the use of the SI theory in a population that is not individualistically oriented, I plan to explore in detail the possible use of SI theory in the Chinese society. To do this, in the next chapter I will compare and contrast the values and the cultural and philosophical makeup that constitutes the ideal person in Chinese
society to see how the main concepts in the SI theory are similar or in conflict with the developmental goals of Chinese society.

**Summary**

This chapter provided an overview of the second individuation process, its origins, and the shortcomings of the theory in a multi-cultural context. I have introduced the concepts of the SI theory that emerged from the psychoanalytic tradition, more specifically from Mahler’s separation-individuation theory.

It was outlined that the successful negotiation of the SIP leads to the development of an internal representation of the self that is distinct and separate from the internal representation of the other (usually the main caregiver). Thus, a self that functions as an independent entity, acts and makes decisions on the basis of self attributes and without coercion from others.

The empirical research that validate the claims of the theory showed that achieving psychological separation and individuation is linked to healthy adult personality, better adjustments in interpersonal relationships, and psychological health. Parents, the family, the dynamics within both, as well as the quality of the relationship between parents and their adolescent were shown to be contributing factors to healthy psychological separation and individuation.
Mainstream literature demonstrates that the process of SI is an important developmental process during adolescence. However, not all adolescent development scholars agree with the universal importance of SIP for adolescents form different cultural backgrounds. The outcome of this literature review will inform clinicians orientated in the western framework of the appropriate approaches to take when working with Chinese youths and their families. In the following chapter, I will discuss what implications different societal norms have on the second individuation theory.
Chapter 4 Adolescent Development across Chinese Societies

In Chapter 3, I gave an overview of the SI theory, including inherent assumptions within the theory and highlighted the theory’s shortcomings. In this chapter I will give an overview of the differences that exist between societies. By doing this, I will give a framework of how to conceptualise the differences between cultures and highlight where the cultural biases exist in the SI theory. Then I will go on to explore the development of youths in the Chinese society by investigating the impact of Confucian philosophy on what constitutes an ideal person in the Chinese society, how the philosophy dictates the role of its members, the interpersonal relationships, and how the self functions within the society. I will compare and contrast the similarities and differences between main principles of the Chinese societies and individualistically orientated societies and highlight the implications, the similarities, and differences this has on the applicability of the main concepts within the SI theory.

Each society has a set of values and morals that is highly regarded by a majority of its members. These set of values are passed down by the cultural, philosophical, and religious past of that society and can be observed as attitudes, belief systems, and patterns of behaviours within the society. In this dissertation culture is used as an encompassing terminology to describe a particular society’s highly endorsed set of attitudes, belief system and or patterns of behaviours. Literature and research about culture (Kagıtçibası, 2007; Schwarz, 2006; Triandis, 1995) often describe societies as being on a spectrum, with individualistically orientated societies at one end and the collectivistically orientated societies at the other.
**Individualistically Orientated Societies**

Individualistically orientated societies emphasise the self as the central unit of the society. The self is perceived as an autonomous, rational, non-contradictory and private entity that is distinct from others (Markus & Kitayama, 1999). The self asserts freedom of choice and decision making ability concerning basic rights. A strong sense of self is aimed for in individualistically orientated youths and encouraged within the family (Kagitcibasi, 2007). People in the society are equal and have equal rights, also termed egalitarian. In an individualistic society, people are seen to make decisions primarily after rational analysis of the situation (Markus & Kitayama, 1999). North American societies, such as America and Canada, are thought to be individualistically orientated.

**Collectivistically Orientated Societies**

In contrast, collectivistic orientated societies view the group as the central unit of society (Markus & Kitayama, 1999). The self is perceived as relationally orientated to which duties and roles are attached. There are clear lines of authority and respect for the status of others while personal agendas are subordinated to the good of the group (Tang, 1992), and decisions are highly influenced by the group rather than by the individual. This sense of self is thought to be strived for and encouraged by the family. Asian countries such as Korea, Japan and China are thought to be representative of collectivist society.

With such differences between individualistic and a collective society’s views of the “self entity”, the intrapersonal and interpersonal distance between the self entity and the other entity, it could be argued that the theory of SI cannot be applied to the development
of collectivistically orientated youths. To obtain a better understanding of the differences I will discuss the main principles of Chinese society in the following section.

The Aspects of Confucian Philosophy that Influence Chinese People’s Ideas of Personhood

Each collectivist society is guided by the country’s history and philosophical belief system (Lam, 1997). According to Tang (1992), there are three philosophies that guide Chinese people’s ways of being and thinking: Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism. The most commonly described philosophy in literature, and the most relevant to the present research question, is Confucianism. Confucianism is more relevant to the present dissertation because compared to the two other philosophies the concepts within Confucianism matches the themes depicted by the SIP. Confucianism relates more to guiding the Chinese people’s interpersonal relationships and depict the intrapersonal make up of the self within the Chinese society (Liu & Leung, 2010) which in essence is the main theme of the SIP.

Considering the spread of Chinese people over vast areas it is not surprising that they do not form a homogenous group (Tang, 1992; Ward & Lin, 2010). Slight variations in value systems may exist between people from China, Taiwan, and Hong Kong as a result of different geological locations, political structures, and economic markets of the country (Ward & Lin, 2010) as well as social and economic class of the family and whether the family is urban or rural (Zhang & Fuligni, 2006). Ward and Lin (2010) assert that these variations will be reflected in the values systems and parenting goals of the
family contexts. Despite these variations, there are overarching principles that identify and address a more global sense of the Chinese society, which will be addressed in the following section.

**Family as the basic unit of society.** Confucianism assumes that the central unit of society is the family, not the individual (Leung, 2010; Tang, 1992). Confucius lived in a period when China was a feudal society, a time of war and uncertainty. He saw that the way to peace and prosperity lay in harmonious relationships amongst family members. According to Tang (1992), within the Chinese psyche, the world outside of the family is viewed as a cold, harsh and unpredictable environment. The family not only provides economic security for the individual but also satisfies social needs (Tang, 1992).

Tang (1992) states that within Chinese families, the individual’s actions are not considered his own but are representative of the family within the time-continuum of past present and future. That is, the actions of the person today can bring shame upon or enhance the family’s reputation be it in the past, the present or the future. The primary identity of the Chinese child is orientated towards the family or larger group.

Tang (1992) contends that very young children in Chinese society still develop a rudimentary self entity by similar mechanisms to that of young children in individualistic societies. Similar to the individualistic societies, the mother is thought to provide the facilitating and responsive environment in which their children’s needs and spontaneous gestures are appropriately responded to. Within this environment, very young Chinese
children start to build up an internal representations of the self based on their interactions with their mother and their family. However, within the Chinese society the idea of the self as separate from the family is anathema since the primary identity of a child and his sense of self is dependent on how his family is regarded. In his commentary paper, Tang (1992) alludes to the idea that in Chinese families, psychological distance between the child’s internal images of the “self in relation to the other” is closer, psychologically, than depicted in his or her individualistically orientated counterparts. Bush, Peterson, Cobas, & Supple, (2002) has shown that in the Chinese society, emotional distress or depression is found to be related to psychological separateness and drawing clear boundaries between self and the family. This is in contrast to research conducted in American families where emotional distress was found when boundaries were less defined between adolescents and their families (Kwak, 2003).

**Harmonious relationships and attitudes towards emotions.** In Confucian philosophy, harmonious relationships are valued and the ability to maintain harmony, in spite of differing opinions, is thought to be the mark of a mature person (Tang, 1992). Confucianism assumes harmonious relationship within the family creates peace and prosperity within the nation (Tang, 1992). Thus, given that both parents and their offspring ascribe to their roles and duties, often interpersonal conflict, disharmony and negative emotions that arise between the Chinese parent and their child are minimised.

Emotions are considered to be a private affair that should be kept out of interpersonal relationships because they infringes on other people (Yik, 2010). A sign of maturity is to
maintain control of one’s emotions and uphold an agreeable nature in the interest of maintaining harmony and preserving the dignity of the other (Tang, 1992). Yik (2010) explains that in the Chinese psyche, negative emotions are “suppressed” or rationalised. It is thought that the more a person understands, the more he can reduce his emotions (Tang, 1992). Thus, it is very common for Chinese parents to use culturally appropriate explanations in the parenting of their children to avoid and dissipate their off-spring’s negative emotions towards them (Wang & Chang, 2010).

**Roles and responsibilities.** As members of a Confucian orientated family, children are born with a set of responsibilities to their family (Tang, 1992). The highest achievement and true mark of maturity are demonstrated by the ability to conform to one’s duties (Tang, 1992). This responsibility for a youth is known as filial duties and include behaving in a proper, respectful manner towards parents, seniors, and elders, pursuing an education and scholarly status as a means of character development and advancement of the family in the society, and development of good moral standards (Leung, 2010; Tang, 1992).

Seen in this light, the content of the self entity is theorised to grow in and through relationships with others. Markus & Kitayama (1999) categorise this self entity as the interdependent self. In contrast to the individualistic orientation of becoming more distinct, Confucian philosophy encourages growing into the roles and expectations of one’s society (Tang, 1992). As such, the function of the self, especially in major life goals for example career decision making, comes more under the influence of the close
relationships with parents and other members of the extended family (Lam, 1997; Nelson, Badger, & Wu, 2004). Furthermore, Confucian philosophy values the fulfilment of societal roles and responsibilities whereby the role of the young person is to focus on scholarly pursuits. Therefore, renegotiation of psychological separation or differentiation is dependent on or dictated by the parents and society at large, rather than an initiative of the self entity.

**Role of the parent.** Within a traditional Chinese household, it is believed that there is a contractual quality implied in each of the hierarchical relationships. Both parents and the child have responsibilities and duties to perform for the other (Tang, 1992). The role of parents is to steer their children on the “right” path in society. The right path includes respecting elders and authority, ensuring their children take part in scholarly pursuits and ensuring their children have good character (Wang & Chang, 2010).

The concept of “guan” is used in traditional Chinese parenting. Guan is defined as a form of monitoring and guiding offspring in the “right” direction. According to Wang and Chang (2010) parents are actively involved in their offspring’s activities, especially academic pursuits. Assertion of parental authority is coupled with culturally appropriate explanations. It is commonly reported in the literature (Kwan, 1994; Lam, 2001), that compared to the individualistic orientated society, Chinese parents are often viewed as overly involved with and controlling of their child’s life. However, according to Wang & Chang (2010) and Zhang & Fuligini (2006), this style of parenting is interpreted by
parents and their off-spring as a sign of care, love and support. Bush et al. (2002) pointed out that within the Chinese family, this type of parenting is linked to their offspring’s self-esteem.

In more recent writings, Wang and Chang (2010) found that in addition to the traditional concept of guan, authoritative actions that convey acceptance and respect towards their children promote positive and secure relationships with their children which are similar to individualistic societies. The positive and secure relationship in turn facilitates Chinese youth’s positive development.

Unlike the renegotiation process that takes place in the individualistically orientated society, the transition to adulthood and the changes in the nature of the parent child relationship in Chinese families is dictated by parents and family traditions. According to Russell, Chu, Crockett and Lee (2010), Chinese youths are given contingent autonomy when Chinese adults, especially males, have proven that they are able to take the “appropriate” actions and responsibility. They then are granted freedom and autonomy while female youths still uphold the notion that parents know best.

Thus, unlike the individualistic society where conflict between parents and their offspring is related to challenges of parental authority, in the Chinese family conflict is thought to arise when parents are not performing their duties. Tang (1992) explains that within Confucianism, there is room for disagreement and revolt on the condition that the “ruler” does not conform to his role and become tyrannical or negligent in his duties.
Distinctiveness of the self. The previous section has highlighted the significant difference in values between Chinese society based on Confucian philosophy and Western philosophy. Kwan (1994) questions whether Chinese youths go through the relinquishment and reorganisation process depicted in the individualistically orientated theory of SI. In Chinese youth, the underlying mechanism in the development of the content of the self entity is described to be different. A noticeable difference in shaping the development of the self is in the attitude towards child rearing.

In Chinese society, children are given a period of indulgence and leniency until the age of four or five, in which their physical needs are anticipated and catered to (Tang, 1992). They are also given a freedom to do what they want with the exception of a few matters such as physical aggression, body exploration, and masturbation, which are strictly prohibited. Tang (1992) pointed out that this period of indulgence is good enough for children to develop their true self, the initial content of the self entity. The rationale for this period of indulgence is due to the belief that before the age of four or five the children are too young to understand the “ways of the world”. They are therefore not expected to think for themselves. Thus, as part of the implied contract between parents and their children, it is the responsibility of the mother to have complete responsibility over their children’s physical care and well-being (Kwan, 1994). After this period, the development is geared towards forming, developing and maintaining appropriate ritual responses rather than the exploration of inner feelings.
Given the difference in child rearing practices, Chinese writers (Kwan, 1994; Lam, 1997) question whether changes explained in the individualistic orientated theories are applicable to the developmental processes in Chinese youths. They assert that the content of the self as becoming more distinct can not be applied to the Chinese population. In Chinese youths, who are guided by the value of conformity and role fulfilment, the self is theorised to grow to be less distinct.

**Autonomy.** In individualistically orientated society, guided by the values of democracy and egalitarianism, the self entity of the adolescent seeks to assume more responsibility for the actions or decision making, and functions more autonomously and independently from parents (Kwan, 1994). In contrast, Chinese children are seen as fitting into a fixed hierarchy, and are taught early on their proper hierarchical relationships to everyone in the family based on age, sex and kin (Tang, 1992). Lam (2005) theorised that Chinese youths retain following of parental authority because of the hierarchical nature of Chinese society, Confucian philosophy of deference to elders and seniors, and the guiding role that the parents have. Autonomy and desires that differ or challenge those of the family are seen as a character flaw that needs to be overcome (Tang, 1992). It is not uncommon that personal desires are sacrificed for the good of the family.

Even though this is true for many Chinese, empirical findings supporting this claim have been mixed (Chen, 2011; Wang & Chang, 2010). In a study conducted by Zhang & Fuligini (2006) and Zhang, Wang, & Fuligni (2006) in Beijing, it was found that in spite
of filial obligations, male urban Chinese may create low levels of conflict by asserting autonomy and challenging parental authority. In fact, the assertion of autonomy was found to be linked to increased closeness in intergenerational relationships in urban males (Zhang et al., 2006). Zhang et al. (2006) discovered that Chinese parents encourage increasingly encourage autonomy and independent thinking in their children, indicating that the value system is changing in China and that the nation is looking more towards individualistic values. Yet, Zhang & Fuligni (2006) also showed that in rural China, traditional Confucian ideals were still upheld. Parental authority was respected and decisions about life goals were made with consideration based on obligations and filial piety to parents and other people to whom the individual has close ties.

Seen in this light, the renegotiation of parental authority and personal autonomy, as a result of growing independence and autonomy from parents, may take a different path in the Confucius orientated or traditional Chinese family. In fact, given the hierarchical relationships within the traditional Chinese family and society, growing independence and autonomy is usually dictated by family values of personhood and the parents’ perception of their role as a parent (Yeh and Yang, 2006).

To conclude, given the highlighted differences between the individualistically orientated developmental goal depicted in SI theory and those of the traditional Chinese society, the theory of SI can be considered as incompatible for use for those who are immersed in the traditional Chinese society. To use the SI theory, practitioner will need to make
significant adjustments to cater to the traditional philosophical beliefs system of the Chinese people.

Summary

This chapter provided an overview of Chinese society, as compared and contrasted to an individualistically-orientated society vis-à-vis the main concepts of the SI process. It was highlighted that the differences in societal ideals will influence the developmental goals of the people in the society. Chinese concepts of personhood are largely based on Confucian philosophy. The main principles of Confucius philosophy were discussed to indicate the potential conflict with the principals from individualistically orientated societies.

The family has been identified as the central unit whereby personal wishes and desires take a less distinct and important place compared to the desires and wishes of the family. Following Confucian philosophy the ideal structure of interpersonal relationships that exist within traditional Chinese families emphasises interpersonal relationships that are harmonious and hierarchically structured where each person has an assigned role within the family hierarchy. The ideal person within the Chinese society recognises and fulfils his or her role within the family. Given the family structure, instead of the self growing more distinct, autonomous and independent like those in the individualistic society, the self in Chinese society grows less distinct and the desire for autonomy and independence is not something that is considered. Instead of expressions of personal opinions, the maturity of Chinese youth points towards self restraint and controlling emotions to maintain harmony. With such differences, the individualistically orientated
developmental goal depicted in SI theory is considered as incompatible with the developmental goals of the traditional Chinese person and will require adjustment if is to be used in psychotherapeutic practice.

In the next chapter, I will explore how the differences in cultural worldviews clash and are negotiated within Chinese youths who have come to grow up in a Western society.
Chapter 5 Negotiating Two Cultures

In chapters 3 and 4, I described the self development of the youths and their family whilst living in a culture that supports their standards and ideals of personhood. In this chapter I will explore the self development of youths with migrant parents. Migration presents people with different social standards and new sets of ideals to negotiate, especially for Chinese people who have moved to a society more individualistically orientated (Ward & Lin, 2010). When developing and living with different social standards, MCY and their families will be required to negotiate the two value systems which are at times diametrically opposed to one another. This negotiation process will be discussed in this chapter.

Development of MCYs

Little is written about MCYs in psychodynamic orientated literature, especially the research that specifically explores the SIP. To arrive at a deeper understanding of the issues minority Chinese youth face as they develop in the host country, extrapolations and inferences will be made from research of different theoretical orientation.

Studies that explore the self development and identity development of MCY, have come to the consensus that MCY blend or integrate the developmental goals of both cultures (Costigan, Su, & Hua, 2009; Stroink & Lalonde, 2009; Russell, Chu, Crockett, & Lee, 2010; Ying, Coombs & Lee, 1999). They concluded that even though independence and autonomy is desired by MCY, the achievement of autonomy occurs at a later age than
their North American counterparts (Russell, Chu, Crockett, & Lee, 2010; Yeh, 2006).

Ying et al. (1999) find that although MCY engage in individualistically orientated developmental goals such as developing an ethnic identity that differs from those of their parents, in the case of intergenerational relationship, they retain an Eastern orientation such as maintaining cohesion and emotional closeness of the Chinese family network as well as deference to parents.

Most authors use the term “bicultural” for the blending of the values systems. Scholars (Belanger & Verkuyten, 2010; Hong, Morris, Chiu, & Benet-Martinez, 2000; Stroink & Lalonde, 2009) who explored the self development and identity development have indicated that children who have been exposed and grown up with two worldviews seem to develop a flexible and multiple sense of self and identity. These children see and operate from multiple perspectives depending on the context and settings they find themselves in (Russell, Crockett, & Chao, 2010; Stronik & Lalonde, 2009). People with a flexible and multiple sense of self and identity may in certain situations be able to operate as a separate self entity and focus on internal attributes whereas in other situations they will accommodate more the interdependent aspects of interpersonal relationships (Hong, Morris, Chiu, & Benet-Martinez, 2000). Such flexibility of the self could be advantageous in today’s global social-economic climate where people are more likely to come into contact or deal with people coming from another cultural background (Pang, 2003). However, in addition to general maturational processes, developing a bicultural self could also pose extra challenges for a young person because the MCY will have to negotiate two conflicting value systems (Akhtar, 2011; Stroink & Lalonde, 2009).
Regarding the New Zealand context, Chinese identities are no longer constructed in New Zealand alone but are determined by multiple influencing factors. Contemporary Chinese youths are connected to New Zealand, their homeland and the global networks (Pang, 2003). They are capable of flexible extension across political, economic, cultural and geographical borders (Pang, 2003). Thus, the development of the youth’s identities is likely to be influenced by all three areas: New Zealand, their homeland and the global networks. As this is a relatively new area, much more research is needed to understand how the multiple contexts will affect the development of the New Zealand MCY.

Identity and Ethnic Identity Formation

In the literature on developmental goals of MCY, the focus of the research seems to surround identity development. Kroger & Haslet (1998) argue that the SIP and identity development have points of similarities. From a “self” development perspective, identity can be conceptualised as developing an aspect of the “self entity”. According to Costigan et al. (2009), the process of identity development involves discovering and constructing an identity that defines the individual as distinct from others as well as belonging to a specific social group. Thus, the essential element in common between identity process and that of SIP is a process of introspection, discovering and constructing all elements related to the self (Kroger & Haslett, 1988). Given the commonalities in the processes between SIP and identity development and the lack of research on the SIP or MCY, it is important to explore the literature on identity development in order to answer the research question.
Research for identity development of MCY (Costigan et al., 2009; Fu, 2002; Lay & Verkuylen, 2002) mostly focuses on the development of ethnic identity as the core aspect of identity development. Ethnic identity is thought of as one part of or an aspect of the overall development of an identity. Ethnic identity in this dissertation is defined as how much a person identifies with a particular ethnic group. Through a process of exploring, discovering and making commitments to one’s ethnicity, the person develops an understanding of himself or herself as a member of the ethnic group (Costigan et al., 2009). That is, ethnic identity is achieved by exploring aspects of the self that are related to Chinese culture and ethnicity.

Developing a strong sense of one’s ethnic identity has also been linked to helping individuals negotiate two culturally different environments (Stroink & Lalonde, 2009). Ethnic identity gives people who are developmentally on the search for a self a solid base from which they can venture out in the world and discover other aspects of the self. Further, it is not surprising that, having found a cultural home in one’s ethnic identity has been linked to high self esteem and high academic achievement (Costigan et al. 2009; Costigan, Hua, & Su, 2010). However, Kwan (1994) cautions the differences between individualistic and Confucian orientated values system often cause confusion for the young person.

A person’s ethnicity is an important part of who they are was demonstrated in a Canadian research of Chinese youths conducted by Lay & Verkuyten (1999). The study indicated
that the more positive the MCY felt about the Chinese group and their membership as Chinese, the more they felt positive about themselves.

However, Lay and Verkuyten’s (1999) sample also highlighted the importance of considering social and contextual factors when studying MCY and their development. They found that the positive link between ethnic identity and self esteem was only present in the first generation MCY but not the second generation. For the second generation Chinese, ethnic membership plays a less important role in their personal identity and how they evaluate themselves. The first generation group felt less integrated and perceived more prejudice from the Canadian society than the second generation group. When there is less integration and more perceived prejudice, naturally one would feel less belongingness to the Canadian society. Thus one’s ethnicity and finding home in one’s ethnic group becomes more salient and more important to representing who one is and how one feels about oneself. Therefore Lay and Verkuten (1999) speculate that integration and perceived prejudice are important factors that influence whether there is a link between ethnic identity and self esteem. The study of Lay and Verkuyten (1999) highlights that not just the developmental processes need to be considered, the social and contextual factors also play an important part in influencing the MCY’s negotiation of two culturally different worlds.
Social and Contextual Factors that Influence Development

Migration creates many complex combinations of variables that influence a person’s development (Ward & Lin, 2010). In addition to one’s own characteristics and personality, social contextual factors play an even more important role in influencing how MCY negotiate the two different world views (Fu, 2002; Ward & Lin, 2010; Ying, 1995). Kwak (2003) found that MCY are also strongly influenced by their parents’ acculturation levels and their parents’ belief and values structures.

If parents are bicultural in beliefs or have a high level of acculturation with the host society minority Chinese youths will have a smoother transition to developing a bicultural self (Russell, Crockett, & Chao, 2010). In her study of Canadian Chinese, Lam (2001) gave an insight into the mechanism by which bicultural beliefs in parents promote bicultural values in their adolescents. In parent-adolescent dyads where the parents came from Hong Kong, the research found that the parents of Canadian-Chinese youths recognised they need to parent their children in a different manner and that the parenting skills from their home country would not work in parenting their own children. In fact, the researcher found that these parents developed skillful and tactful ways to parent their adolescents. These parents have taken a combination of both Chinese principle of harmonious living, face saving and the individualistic principle of democracy, egalitarian relationship and mutual respect. In this way, the adolescents co-operated with their parents. Although seemingly giving the youth space to express their views and choice, the parents were able to subtly guide and steer their children in the “right” direction. Lam
(2001) termed this way of parenting “covert control”. Covert control can be seen as a way of maintaining the operation of an interdependent self within the family. She concluded that adolescents co-operated with their parents’ covert control out of guilt. Guilt was found to be sublimated into an adherence to the indigenous value of indebtedness to parents and the need to reciprocate this as part of filial obligation.

The matching of the acculturation level between the MCY and those of their parents also plays an important role in the personal adjustment to life stressors of the MCY (Fu, 2002; Coombs, Ying, & Lee, 1999; Kwak, 2003; Ward & Lin, 2010; Ying, 1995). Researchers on American Chinese youths (Kim, Chen, Li, Huang and Moon, 2009; Ying, 1995) have found that maladjustment arises when there is a difference between the parents’ and the child’s level of acculturation. For example, according to Kim et al. (2009), distress and maladjustment is found in MCY when the parents are more affiliated with the Chinese value system and the youth is more affiliated with the American system. When value systems of parents and adolescents clashed, distress and maladjustment were usually due to a perceived lack of parental support (Kim et al., 2009).

Another important environmental influence that determines the developmental path of the adolescent is the level of affluence of the family (Kagtcibasi, 2007). In general it is found that more affluent families are more likely to encourage bicultural ways of being while less affluent families are associated with staying with and supporting traditional values (Kagtcibasi, 2007). Of course, the affluence of a family can vary vastly and can
be placed on a wide ranging continuum explaining that different combinations of these factors will lead to different developmental ideals and outcomes.

Not to underestimate in the development of MCY is the attitude host societies have towards immigrants. Some writers (Akhtar, 2011; Costigan et al., 2009; Kagıtcıbası, 2007) have alluded to the fact that the host society’s attitude towards immigrants will influence which world views and personhood or selfhood are valued. Hostility of the host society towards the Chinese ethnic group will influence the developmental pathways of the adolescent in significant ways. For instance, when the host country displays hostility towards immigrants, the latter are forced to take extreme positions. Under those circumstances it may be more adaptive for immigrants to reject the host culture’s ways of being, retain the ways of being and the culture of one’s country of origin and avoid interacting with people of the host country. According to Costigan et al. (2009), a country’s openness to immigration allows for the development of a bicultural self whereby the immigrant family is able to retain their ethnic culture as well as learn to incorporate the culture of the host nation.

New Zealand has a social-political climate of considering itself as a bicultural nation which consists of Māori and Pakeha (Schwartz, 1999). This bicultural attitude was derived from the colonisation history of New Zealand in which the colonisers (Pakeha) signed a Treaty with the native Māori people in 1840 (Orange, 2011). Since then it has been disputed that the main treaty principles of partnership, protection and participation have not been observed by the Crown, which lead to the establishment of the Waitangi
Tribunal in 1975 to address any injustices (Orange, 2011). In more recent times, to rectify historical injustices, the New Zealand government has taken an increasingly bicultural approach in its government policies (Ip & Pang, 2005). As a result, there has been much debate about the perceptions that this bicultural approach has on recent immigrants of many different ethnicities to the nation (Ward & Lin, 2005). With this socio-political history, the term Pakeha seems to refer to only the decedents of the early colonisers and recent immigrants can find it difficult to identify or relate to the term Pakeha and as a result can perceive New Zealand as “excluding” and unwelcoming. Such excluding perceptions may impact on acculturation and ethnic identity of migrant families and their children by pushing them to identify more with their own ethnicity rather than wanting to become part of New Zealand society. Thus far, little is known about how this bicultural system and government attitude influences development of the MCY.

Summary

In this chapter I explored the dynamics MCY face when they negotiate the views of their country of origin as well as those of the host country.

MCY’s are not a homogenous group that follows a predictable and set pathway of self-development. The MCY population on the whole follows a combination of developmental processes that are individualistic as well as collective. Both independent autonomy and expressions of personal needs as well as harmonious relationship with others and deferent relationships with seniors or elders were found to be present in the population of MCY. A majority of the studies point out that developing ethnic identity is
important for Chinese youth’s ability to negotiate the two worlds. Further, it was
highlighted that the development of ethnic identity has commonalities with the SIP in that
both processes involve a mechanism where introspection and reconstruction of the self
are involved.

Unlike populations, in which youths grow up in an environment that is similar to their
families’ value systems, the external social factors play an even more important role in
MCY negotiating two worldviews. External factors such as parental beliefs and
acculturation levels, the social economic status of the family and society’s reception of
minority youth, strongly govern how the MCY negotiate their self and identity
development.

In the next chapter, I will discuss the implication of these findings on the
psychotherapeutic process. I will also explore whether the SI theory helps and or hinders
understanding how youths grow up within two different worldviews.
Chapter 6 Implications for Therapeutic Practice

The previous chapters have highlighted the importance of understanding the cultural and socio-political context in which MCY develop. It was highlighted that MCY have to negotiate diametrically opposing cultural values and philosophies as they integrate aspects of an individualistic as well as a collective society. It was shown that ethnic identity development, parental factors, and the socio-political climate of the host nation can help as well as hinder the MCY’s negotiation process. This chapter will discuss how culturally competent therapists can use these findings in their clinical practice with the MCY population, and outline the conditions under which therapists could be guided by the SI theory.

In the absence of research conducted in New Zealand that explores either the second generation MCY or the use of SIP in MCY, the literature reviewed in this dissertation mostly stems from North America and Canada. Nonetheless, there are general points made that culturally competent therapist will have to consider. This becomes even more important when considering therapists whose practice is underpinned by SI theory. The SI theory comes from the psychoanalytic tradition and is largely used by psychoanalytic and psychodynamically oriented therapists. Given that this dissertation is about the SI theory, the “therapist” or “therapeutic practice” discussed in this chapter refers to psychoanalytically and psychodynamically orientated psychotherapist or psychotherapeutic practice.
The Culturally Competent Therapist

When “Western” therapists work with clients from a Chinese background, cultural differences between the worldviews of the “East” and the “West” can help or hinder the therapeutic process (Chu, 2009). Culturally competent therapists will need to be aware of the cultural orientation of their clients, their own cultural orientation, and of the dynamics between them. Given the cultural differences between the “West” and the “East”, roles of parents, role of the child, family structure, and the cultural background of the therapist should be examined and managed properly throughout therapy (Tseng, 2004). If the therapist’s own cultural views, beliefs, attitudes and value systems are not managed, the therapist would risk contaminating the therapeutic formulation and setting of therapeutic goals with their own cultural beliefs (Tseng, 2004). For instance, given that the “West” and the “East” have differences in the developmental goals for their members, if therapists are unaware of the Western “universalistic” bias that is inherent in their thinking, they may as a therapeutic goal encourage their MCY clients to be more independent from their family and open in their expressions of feelings. Concurrently, therapist may find that their MCY clients become even more distressed by their intervention. Whilst independence and open expressions of feelings may seem like valid developmental goals, they are goals for adolescents developing in the individualistic society and conflicts with the developmental aims and family relationships of the traditional Chinese society. As such, to encourage individualistic goals to their MCY clients may alienate their clients further from the important family support network system inherent in the Chinese society.
The therapeutic model. Taking the above into consideration, the therapeutic process is in general very much influenced by the client’s unique circumstances (Tseng, 2004). Rather than being able to rely on hard and fast rules, each client comes with issues that stem from their unique history, environment, and factors influenced by their personality and character (Tseng, 2004). Ringel (2005) who has written and researched on how to work cross culturally advises that knowledge of clients’ values, culturally specific developmental goals, and family structures will enable therapists to better place their Chinese clients in the context of their cultural and familial history as well as assist clients to balance their family’s traditions and values with those of the host country.

Because training and personal belief systems often go hand in hand, culturally competent therapists will need to know the biases inherent in the theoretical model they subscribe to (Tseng, 2004). This dissertation explored whether the theory of SI, with its set of individualistically orientated ideals in personhood and interpersonal relationships, is a useful theoretical framework for working with MCYs. It emerged that in the area of identity development SI theory is applicable to the MCY population. However, in aspects of the theory relating to interpersonal relationships is incompatible with the developmental goals of the MCYs.

As MCYs have to negotiate and integrate at least two worldviews in the process of self-development, therapists whose practice is underpinned by the theory of SI may need to make modifications or allowances to incorporate Chinese values of interdependent relationships, closeness and cohesion within the Chinese family, and the strong influence
of the family. Specific issues and considerations related to using the theory within the MCY population are detailed below.

**Transference and counter-transference.** Transference and counter-transference are phenomena common to all psychotherapy approaches (Lanyado & Horne, 1999). When working with clients from a different culture awareness of cultural factors will enable the therapist to better detect and manage ethnic or race-related transference and counter-transference responses that take place between the therapist and the client (Ng, 1984). As part of the therapeutic process, psychoanalytic and psychodynamically orientated therapists pay attention to and if appropriate interpret transferential and counter-transferential responses to work through clients’ historical relationships and experiences and the tangled emotions associated with them (Ng, 1985). In a transference response, a client is understood to feel about and react to the therapist as an emotionally significant person from his or her past (Geldard & Geldard, 1999). For adolescent clients the emotionally significant person is usually a member of their family. In a counter-transferential response, it is the therapist who feels or reacts to the client ‘as-if’ he or she is an experience or a significant person from the therapist’s personal history (Geldard & Geldard, 1999).

Understanding transference and counter-transference will help the therapist to emphasise and understand the client’s position (Lanyado & Horne, 1999). However if unchecked during therapy, transferential and counter-transferential misinterpretations by the client or the therapist can become a significant hindrance in the therapeutic process.
The role of the therapist. When working with MCY, therapists may have the impression they act, behave and have developmental goals that are similar to young people in their host country. However, Russell, Crockett and Chu (2010) find that MCY has a tendency to retain aspects of parental views that are based in Chinese values, such as deference to authority figures and elders. Tseng (2004) points out that in the Chinese culture, hierarchical relationships and authority of seniors are vital principles to consider, thus the culturally accepted attitude is for the therapist to act authoritatively. If the therapist relates to the MCY client with a fundamental spirit of equality whilst the client expects the therapist to take the active role as a healer, the client might struggle to trust the therapist because the relationship does not fit the client’s culturally expected model (Tseng, 2004). Thus, when working with MCY, Chu (2009) and Tseng (2004) suggest that sensitivity towards a culturally relevant therapist-patient relationship is greatly needed and might mean that therapists have to take a stance they would not otherwise take.

Dealing with emotions. In addition to reconsidering the role of the therapist, Chu (2009) suggests that therapists will also need to adjust their expectations of their Chinese client’s emotional expressions and management of emotions. MCY clients who have been raised within a Chinese value system may show self restraint in displaying emotions and refrain from direct confrontation with parents or authority figures. Given that psychoanalytically and psychodynamically orientated therapy emphasises emotional expression and focuses on exploring historical relationships with significant others,
usually the parent or extended family, some authors (Liu & Leung, 2010; Tseng, 2004) suggest that this type of therapy may not suit the client’s cultural expectations of working through issues.

In her psychoanalytic work with clients, Ng (1985) found that her Chinese clients were open to the interpretation of historical relationships and the associated emotions. However, therapists will need to be aware of the culturally appropriate way of emotional expressions and management. According to Tseng (2004), Chinese commonly manifest and communicate their problems and emotions through their bodies. Chinese language has a number of organ phrases to express various emotional conditions. For example, when a person feels angry or irritated they say they have an “elevated liver fire”.

Western therapists may be surprised to learn that the most commonly used culturally appropriate coping strategy to manage emotions for Chinese clients is “passive aggressiveness” (Tseng, 2004). A culturally competent therapist will need to have an understanding of the unique Chinese way of expressing emotions and have sensitivity to and adjust to these cultural differences, in order to prevent from making culturally biased judgments and becoming mis-attuned to the client’s emotional needs.

**Balancing autonomy and interdependence.** The previous chapter demonstrated that, given the strong and close family ties are retained, Chinese youth seek autonomy even though they may risk possible alienation from their family.
Autonomy and independence are the core developmental goals of SIP reflecting values commonly encountered in Western therapeutic approaches. Although aspects of the SIP could be applicable to the MCY’s developmental process, it has been shown by Stroink & Lalonde (2009) and Costigan et al. (2009), that the developmental focus of the MCY is slightly different to those of their host peers. MCY’s developmental needs are negotiating and integrating at least two cultural systems. Therapists will need to address the conflict between the youth’s desire for autonomy on the one hand and fear of isolation from their family on the other hand. Therapists who are guided by a framework of SIP might miss the cultural significance of keeping close ties with one’s family. Therapy that focuses only on the goal of autonomy and does not consider Chinese values and family structure would leave the client even more estranged from their family. Even though Ying et al. (1999) assure that autonomy is often adaptive for Chinese youths because it helps them to display autonomous functioning in the education system and the mainstream environment, MCY’s desire for autonomy may be viewed as betraying or going against the family.

If, after careful consideration with their client, therapists are confident that developing autonomy and independence of the “self” is of central importance, they can consider applying the theory of SIP with added awareness of the emotional conflict it may cause. Offering insight to the MCY and their family that developmental push for autonomy is adaptive and does not necessarily equate to betraying the family could ease the conflict and allow the process of developing autonomy and independence to take its course.
Facilitating ethnic and bicultural identity. Culturally competent therapists will be aware of the complexity of the development of MCY, which is determined by a combination of developmental processes that are found in individualistically orientated as well as collectivistically orientated societies.

Continuing from the previous discussion of the conflict that arises from the push for autonomy and the fear of alienation, it is prudent for therapists toanticipate that the MCYs may struggle with a wide range of feelings related to issues of not belonging to, alienation from either culture, or difficulties straddling the two cultures (Kwan, 1994). Knowing that a strong sense of ethnic identity could smoothen the progress of negotiating the two worlds, Ying (1995) advises therapists to help MCY clients to realise that it is possible to belong to both cultures and that exploring their Chinese heritage is a pathway to easing feelings of alienation and not belonging.

Given that identity and ethnic identity development in the MCY population are believed to have similar internal processes as depicted in SIP, such as reconsidering and relinquishing culturally related parental values, therapists may consider using the SIP as part of their framework for facilitating their client’s self-development. However, therapists need to be aware of the incompatibilities between values promoted in the theory of SIP and those in the traditional Chinese culture, namely the incompatibility between development of individualistic self and that of the interdependent self. Culturally competent therapists would also understand that in addition to promoting ethnically related self explorations, they also need to keep in mind the development of the culturally
appropriate interdependent self such as filial piety, deference to parents or elders, and
closeness and loyalty to the family (Chu, 2009). Sensitivity to these traditional Chinese
concepts and their significance for MCY will greatly enhance and help balance the SIP
approach to self-development.

**Working with the family.** As highlighted in the previous chapter, family and
parental factors greatly impact on the MCY’s negotiation of two cultures because it is the
family and the parents who provide a facilitating environment in which their children
thrive and develop (Russell, Chu, Crokett & Lee, 2010). In immigrant families the
facilitating environment may be disrupted due to mismatched acculturation levels of
parents and children (Kim et al., 2009). For example, parents may hold traditional views
of parenting such as clinging to the notion of “guan” and the filial child whilst their
adolescent does not. This can create a mismatch in expectations of developmental goals
and ways of being.

Given such a strong influence of the family, the MCY’s therapeutic progress may be
hindered or sabotaged by a lack of facilitating environment for the MCY to come home
to. Thus, in addition to working with the minority Chinese youth, therapists could work
in tandem with the parents with the goal of recognising and mitigating cultural conflicts
within the family to help restore the facilitating environment.

Working with Chinese parents may be seen as difficult given the perceived disclosure
patterns of keeping personal emotions and family troubles to themselves (Ng, 1985).
Therapists’ attempt to unravel personal ideas, emotions, and difficulties from Chinese parents, is bound to meet strong resistance. However, Ng (1985) offers insights that may be very helpful for the therapeutic process. According to Ng (1985), Chinese as a rule do not disclose personal problems to strangers; they do to their family members because of the close-knit nature of the family unit.

The key is to understand the role the therapist plays in the Chinese family (Ng, 1985). When a good therapeutic relationship has been established with the family, the therapist is perceived ‘as if’ he or she is a family member and will receive disclosures and emotional expressions from the family. It cannot be disputed that this transference response may happen more easily for a therapist from a Chinese background. However, for a therapist from a “Western” background, knowledge in the Chinese family structure, understanding of the family’s expectations for the therapist and from therapy, and sensitivity to the Chinese people’s style of emotional expressions will facilitate building a good therapeutic relationship with the Chinese family.

As soon as a working relationship has been established with the family, therapists may explore separately with the parents their understanding and their personal meaning of Chinese values and of the host culture’s values. Such exploration may assist parents to have a better understanding of their cultural position and of the position of their adolescents. Achieving such understanding would help ease the cultural tension within the family and restore the facilitating environment.
Summary

This Chapter has explored the therapeutic implications that arise in the work with MCY as they navigate through the developmental process of living in one culture while their family is culturally still living by the values and morals of their culture of origin. The therapeutic process will need to incorporate the developmental goals of both worldviews to honour the needs of the family and the youth. A culturally competent therapist needs to have a sound understanding of the contractual interpersonal relationships and interactions within the Chinese population, display sensitivity to the culturally determined emotional expressions and forms of emotional management within the Chinese society, demonstrate the ability to understand both cultural worldviews, and be able to hold the tension of both.

In addition to understanding the youths and their family, a culturally competent therapist needs to be aware of his or her own cultural background and of the values inherent in the therapeutic model such as the psychoanalytic and psychodynamic psychotherapy to avoid imposing their own biases and value system onto the MCY.

It became apparent that the SIP could be useful when formulating developmental processes of the MCY population such as developing autonomy and an ethnic identity. However, the theory of SI is less suited for incorporating the importance of family involvement and the development of an interdependent self. In applying the theory to therapy with MCYs, therapists will need to make modifications in their theoretical thinking and incorporate the importance of the interdependent relationships, closeness and cohesion to family, and the strong influence of the family.
In the next chapter I will conclude the dissertation, discuss the limitations of the present dissertation, and suggest further research needed to improve the understanding of working psychotherapeutically with MCY in New Zealand.
Chapter 7 Limitations, Future Research Directions and Concluding Remarks

In this dissertation I investigated the applicability of the theory of SI to second generation MCY youths and examined the implications of these findings to psychotherapeutic practice. I found that the answer was complex and influenced by a wide range of cultural, social, interpersonal, and intrapersonal factors. In this concluding chapter, I will discuss the limitations of the present dissertation and suggest future directions for research.

Limitations of the Dissertation

In spite of my findings and interpretations, the present review has quality issues that can limit the validity, generalisability and use of the evidence. Mays et al. (2005) advise that in a quality systematic review it is the reviewers’ responsibility to be explicit about quality issues that will limit interpretation and use of the findings. Following their advice, in the next section, I will discuss the limitations of the dissertation.

One of the limitations of this literature review is the validity and reliability of the findings. The findings are compromised by the methodology used to guide extraction, analysis and synthesis of the material. In order to answer the research question, the framework of thematic analysis was used. The selected pool of literature included, not only came from disparate schools of thoughts, but also contained both qualitative and quantitative research methodologies. This way of extracting, analysing and synthesising the material brings with it the danger of researcher’s bias influencing the outcome, because it requires
the researcher to make a number of choices based on his or her own judgments which will be influenced by their own beliefs and personal experiences.

In this dissertation, I used my own judgements to group together similar concepts and create the relevant themes. Although efforts have been made to explain the reasoning underpinning the choices made, possible shortcomings due to the researcher’s own bias could have been balanced out through collaboration with another reviewer using the same pool of literature. Such collaboration would have improved the validity and reliability of the present findings.

Another limitation of this dissertation that limits the generalisability and use of the findings is related to the sampling of the literature reviewed. Most studies available grouped together Chinese youths born in the host nation with recent immigrants. Although the focus of the present review was to look at the second generation Chinese, due to the lack of studies that specifically focus on second generation Chinese youths, I have included the first generation Chinese youth in my selected pool of literature. Having acknowledged this in the Methodology chapter that this limitation will confound the interpretation and applicability of the presented findings to the second generation Chinese population, additional care had been taken to extrapolate the information belonging to the second generation Chinese youths.

Another limitation of the present review may be that the available literature mostly describes the experiences of Chinese Youths in the United States of America and Canada.
Thus far it is not known how the New Zealand socio-political context and its history impact on the self development of the New Zealand born MCY. However, given the societal differences between New Zealand and the North American countries, the developmental pressures faced by New Zealand MCY is likely to differ slightly to those of their North American peers. Consequently, findings of the present review may have limited generalisability to the New Zealand context.

**Future Directions for Research**

In the course of conducting this literature review, I had found a number of gaps in the literature on MCY that deserves attention to improve the delivery of psychotherapy services to MCYs. My hope is that the findings from the present review will stimulate directions for research in the second generation Chinese youths to confirm or dispute my conclusions. To advance knowledge in understanding the development of MCY in New Zealand, future research could aim to test the generalisibility of the findings of studies made overseas to the New Zealand born MCY population.

In the course of the literature search, it became apparent that the majority of contemporary research on MCY and the theory of SI focused predominantly on one aspect of the theory, the process of restructuring and reorganising the internal representation of the self. That was also the focus of the present dissertation. However, Blos (1967) expresses that in the theory of SI, revisiting the oedipal complex and the development of sexual identity are equally significant in the developmental process. These were not explored in the present dissertation. Future literature reviews could
explore the areas of oedipal complex and sexual identity to further our understanding of the applicability of these concepts in SI theory to MCY population.

Further, I found that lacking in the literature is the emotional expression and management of emotions associated in the self and identity development of the MCY. From a psychoanalytic and psychodynamic framework, emotions are an integral part of SIP and therapeutic work with clients (Ng, 1985). Given that in general Chinese people’s expression and management of emotions could be different than expected in Western countries (Tang, 1992), further research investigating the possible relationship between culturally appropriate emotional elements and individualistically orientated developmental processes such as ethnic identity development in the MCY population will be invaluable to therapist working with a SIP framework.

Finally, the recent advance of a global community may impact significantly on identity formation and self development of MCY (Pang, 2003). Rather than constructing an identity in both the host nation and their country of origin, youth, especially MCY in New Zealand, increasingly find that they develop an identity and a self within global networks (Pang, 2003). As this is a relatively new area, it is not known how multiple contexts will affect the development of New Zealand MCY. Global group membership requires a different emphasis on the ideal personhood and what is required of the person. Future research how global group membership may impact on developmental goals of MCY will help uncover any new issues that may arise.
Concluding Remarks

As emphasised in previous chapters, research on MCY is still at its infancy. Although, the present dissertation offers a narrow view of development in minority Chinese youth, being restricted to the parameters of the SI theory, it has added and contributed to the growing body of knowledge and understanding of MCY’s development and how to work therapeutically with this group of people.

The ethnically Chinese population is one of the fastest growing populations in New Zealand (Ho et al., 2003). It is likely that in times to come practitioners will face a generation of Chinese youths who are born in New Zealand and face growing up in an environment that is different from their parent’s childhood. These youths will have to tackle issues related to negotiating at least two worldviews (Pang, 2003). Therapists will be challenged with the dilemma of applying Western developmental theories such as the SI theory to MCYs. Thus, bridging the gap in understanding how New Zealand’s MCY develop will be urgently needed to help New Zealand therapists practice competently. As long as this research is not available, Ringel (2005) advises that the culturally competent therapist makes an effort to understand MCYs’ values, family structure, culturally specific developmental goals, and the personal meaning that they attach to them. In doing this, therapists will be able to help their clients to balance developmental pathways valued by their familial traditions with those commonly practiced in the host society.

Concluding, I hope that the present dissertation has stimulated thinking about and awareness of issues that arise when working cross-culturally with Chinese youths and
will generate more interest in conducting more research of New Zealand’s MCY population.
References


