How do Chinese Print Media in New Zealand present ideas of Chinese Cultural Identity?
-- A research of Chinese print media in New Zealand

David Gang Lin

A thesis submitted to Auckland University of Technology in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Communication Studies (MCS) 2007
Table of content

Certificate of authorship.......................................................................................iii
Acknowledgements...............................................................................................iv
Abstract..................................................................................................................v

Chapter 1: Introduction..........................................................................................1
  1.1 The meaning of Chinese-ness ...........................................................................6
  1.2 Chinese Identity...............................................................................................7
  1.4 Background to Chinese Print Media in New Zealand......................................10

Chapter 2: Methodology......................................................................................12

Chapter 3 Literature Review................................................................................17
  3.1 Communities and Diaspora............................................................................17
  3.2 Chinese & Chinese-ness................................................................................21

Chapter 4 Case Studies.......................................................................................27
  4.1 Case Study one: Face, Shame and Prostitution..............................................27
  4.2 Case Study two: Laughing at Mao................................................................34

Chapter 5. Analysis of Case Studies.................................................................41

Chapter 6. Conclusion..........................................................................................49

References............................................................................................................53

Bibliography.........................................................................................................57

Appendix...............................................................................................................79
The Attestation of Authorship

"I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person (except where explicitly defined in the acknowledgements), nor material which to a substantial extent has been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning."

Signed:

David Gang Lin
August 2008
Acknowledgements

In the recognition of the support, guidance, and encouragement that assisted me in the writing of this thesis, I would like to thank following people:

To my supervisor, Peter Hoar, thank you for your great advice, inspiration, encouragement and patience.

To Dr Rosser Johnson, the Head of Postgraduate Studies, thank you for your perceptive observations, ongoing support and generosity.

To Jessie Hsu, thank you for your great help, inspiration and smile.

To my parents, thank you for all your support and encouragement.
Abstract:

This thesis is a study of the free newspapers that form a significant part of the media consumed by Chinese people in New Zealand. In it I examine how these newspapers reflect and portray ideas of identity as expressed by members of the Chinese community. Little work has been done on Chinese print media in New Zealand and the free newspapers have often been regarded as ephemeral and of little interest to media scholars. However, in this thesis I argue that they offer insights into the experiences and attitudes of the Chinese people in New Zealand both those who have been settled here for many years and also more recent immigrants. This study is intended to show how these varied newspapers reflect ideas about cultural identity in a diasporic setting. Two case studies are used to examine and elaborate the idea of how the Chinese print media in New Zealand present Chinese cultural identity. Chinese readers pick up the newspapers to read and discuss various controversial stories. People argue about important questions such as “who we are” “what we are doing here” and “what is our identity”. By studying these newspapers, we can gain insights into how the Chinese cultural identity is transformed by the experience of immigration.
Chapter 1: Introduction

On a typical Friday evening, a Chinese family, the Lins, came to Taiping. This is one of the largest Chinese supermarkets in Auckland. It is very busy with families shopping. This is one of the Auckland markets, where they can get Chinese foods and products. There is another reason for them to come to Taiping. After they have checked out from the cashier, they pick up several of their favourite Chinese newspapers, such as The Chinese New Zealand Herald, The Mirror, and The Mandarin\(^1\). There are at least twelve different types of Chinese newspapers located next to the check out counter. They are all free. Why are there so many different kinds of Chinese newspapers? Do these newspapers reflect the various voices of Auckland Chinese community? How do these Chinese newspapers report on issues? Are there any controversial perspectives? All these questions led me to investigate these free newspapers.

The purpose of this thesis is to study Chinese print media in New Zealand. More specifically, it examines the free Chinese newspapers given away in shops, supermarkets and other locations where Chinese people gather. Do Chinese people use the media to maintain their cultural identity or to adapt to a new environment? The Chinese community in New Zealand is varied due to the diversity of its origins and the different stages at which its members have arrived. The Chinese in New Zealand show many differences in countries or regions of birth, languages, dialects, religions, values, behaviour and cultural identities. This thesis reflects some of my own experience of being a new Chinese immigrant in New Zealand. My cultural background gives me insights into the acculturation process of Chinese immigrants in New Zealand, and the strategies they use to maintain or represent their cultural identity through community media.

\(^1\) Explain: Please note that that all the names of any publications including newspapers, magazines, books and the title of articles and the Act will use italic format throughout this thesis.
Little work has been done on Chinese print media in New Zealand. Language barriers represent obstacles for academic studies of these newspapers. Many people are unaware of the existence of these newspapers. The Chinese print media are varied. Many New Zealanders regard the Chinese community as homogenous. They do not know how many different kinds of Chinese newspapers there are in New Zealand and why Chinese migrants have so many of them. Chinese are aware of the many differences within their community. Chinese migrants in New Zealand group themselves after their arrival according to their origin, values, religions, dialects, and behaviours. It is unlikely that one Chinese newspaper could meet all these different needs. Such varied groups of Chinese need their own papers to express their ideas, attitudes, values and argument. This study is intended to show how these varied newspapers reflect ideas about cultural identity in diasporic setting.

Another important factor is how the Chinese print media react to an issue or social events and how readers respond. Chinese readers pick up the newspapers to read and discuss various controversial stories. People argue about important questions such as “who we are” “what we are doing here” and “what is our identity”. By studying these newspapers, we can gain insights into how the Chinese cultural identity is transformed by the experience of immigration.

To understand what the Chinese are doing here in New Zealand, we need to go back a little bit to the historical background. Chinese came to New Zealand as just one part of a global diasporic movement. They originally came to New Zealand to work in the gold fields during the 1860s. Many of these immigrants were peasants and often illiterate. New Zealand was not a particularly welcoming place for them. They were seen as alien, due to their appearance, language and mannerisms. Early Chinese settlers were often subject to harassment both informally and through legislation, such as The New Zealand Chinese Immigrants Act 1881. This introduced a poll tax. This was an entry tax on Chinese settlers which controlled the flow of the immigrants (Ip, 1999, p. 287). In 1935 the Labour Government rescinded the Act (Huo, 1999, p.3). In 2002 Prime Minister Helen Clark issued a formal apology to the Chinese Community on behalf of New Zealand for the poll tax (Young, 2002).
A new immigration act was passed in 1987 by the Labour government. This began a new wave of immigration comprised many ethnic and national groups. The New Zealand’s Chinese population alone had doubled by 1996 to be approximately two percent of the country’s population of 3.6 million (Ip, 1999, p. 290). The new arrivals were not necessarily from mainland China, but from Singapore, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Malaysia, and other Southeast Asian areas. Even though they came from different parts of the world, they still had something in common. They shared the admittedly contestable, meaning of “Chinese-ness”.

This wave of immigration aroused many and varied reactions in New Zealand. Some saw the Chinese immigrants as vital stimulants for a somewhat moribund national economy. They contributed to business and provided investment capital. However, some elements of New Zealand society reacted with fear and hostility. Some organisations such as the New Zealand Defence Movement mobilised to stem Chinese immigration. They claimed to be protecting the interests of Maori and Pakeha against a perceived “Asian invasion”. Such responses ranged from mild fear to outright xenophobia. They illustrated the tensions inherent in the transition New Zealand is undergoing to a multicultural society.

As mentioned the Chinese immigration to New Zealand was and remains just one part of a wider global Chinese Diaspora. The definition of the word “diaspora” has traditionally been centred on the notion that diasporic communities were forced away from home into exile. They were poor, uneducated, oriented to physical labour and often regarded as inferior to those in the mainstream of their host countries (Cohen, 1997, p. ix). “Diaspora” carries connotations of the loss of homeland, uprootedness, expulsion, oppression, moral degradation, a collective memory of the homeland and a strong desire to return to it one day (Safran, 1991, p. 83). From this perspective, it is clear that the word ‘diaspora’ signifies a process of population spreading to new places, and a process full of emotion. Wang (1999b) argued that Chinese migrations involved pull and push factors. Throughout history, these migrations can be described using terms like “chain migration, forced migration, labour migration, free migration,
student migration, seasonal migration, illegal migration, return migration, secondary migration (or re-migration) and so on.” (p. 60)

Pan (1999) analysed the Chinese diaspora under six broad categories. The following headings were used to categorise the forms of migration: trade, coolies, chain, students, re-migration and illegal immigration. The first of these, trade diaspora, is seen as form of cultural as well as economic exchange. It involved the physical relocation of merchants to new countries. Modern versions of this exchange may not require physical relocation on the same scale as formerly due to the rise of digital telecommunication, banking and financial networks. Many Chinese are in New Zealand for business reasons and the Chinese newspapers address their concerns.

The second category was the Coolie Trade. This was a labour diaspora and involved the relocation of often illiterate manual workers to provide a cheap and often exploited workforce. This was seen in New Zealand during the nineteenth century gold rushes. Although this was the first wave of Chinese immigration to New Zealand and China is still a major source of migrant labour (much of which is recruited through government channels). The coolie trade is not important in contemporary New Zealand. Patterns of labour migration are no longer dependant on blatant exploitation of manual workers (Pan, 1999, p. 61). Therefore this version of Chinese diaspora in New Zealand is not relevant to my research.

Chain immigration was Pan’s third category. This involves Chinese settlers using their links and networks to their home countries to facilitate the further immigration of relatives, friends and colleagues. Organisations such as friendly societies and Chambers of Commerce may work to this end while informal networks of families and friends also act as links in chain immigration. As Pan states: “Since most migrants have traditionally relied on people from the same native place already settled in their destination countries to help them adjust and find work, a strong correlation exists between the choices of destination of emigrants and the locations of their fellow townsmen” (Pan, 1999, pp. 61-62). Much Chinese immigration to New Zealand works in this way. The Chinese language newspapers are used to address financial
and personal aspects of these migrants. Tensions and differences among such settlers are at times addressed by local Chinese print media and the case studies used in this thesis highlight conflicting ideas about cultural identity and the roles and status of migrants in New Zealand.

People who enter a country for further education are usually granted a student visa that allows them to stay in a country for the duration of their studies. This “student diaspora” is the fourth of Pan’s categories and is particularly important in New Zealand. From the early 1990s, thousands of Chinese students have come to New Zealand. They have stimulated business in New Zealand. Many new businesses have been set up which rely on the Chinese students. These include language schools, finance companies, immigration agencies, and travel agencies. Even the universities have developed new programmes to accommodate these students. They often seek opportunities to stay longer or gain permanent residence. This group is of particular interest for this thesis as many of the newspapers I have examined are aimed at them.

The fifth category that Pan defined is re-migration diaspora (Pan, 1999, p. 62). This involves migrants alternating residence between two or more counties which may include their country of origin. Many Chinese in New Zealand spend significant parts of their lives in several counties due to family or business interests. Such migrants move in and through several cultures which can lead to ambiguities in their sense of cultural identity or, in other words, what it means to be Chinese. These ambiguities are an important part of the present research and I would argue that they are sometimes played out and contested in the Chinese newspapers of New Zealand.

The final category was described by Pan as clandestine migration. This is illegal immigration as seen by most governments. This does not appear to be a major component of Chinese migration to New Zealand due to New Zealand’s geographic isolation as small group of islands in a large ocean along with strict and well policed points of entry. This form of Chinese immigration in New Zealand is not important for the present study.
This taxonomy is valuable in that it illustrates the many and varied forms of the migrations that constitute the Chinese global diaspora. Some aspects are more relevant for the Chinese experience in New Zealand. I have included this discussion to highlight the varieties and disparate forms of Chinese culture and experiences within New Zealand. It illustrates the idea that there are many ways to be Chinese and these forms of “Chineseness” are discussed in the newspaper I have examined.

1.1 The meaning of Chinese-ness

If there are many ways to be Chinese then there are also many ways in which Chinese people refer to and understand themselves. To understand how these senses of “Chineseness” are articulated through the New Zealand Chinese print media it is useful to draw out some aspects of the terminology Chinese people use to differentiate their understandings and concepts of cultural identity, solidarity and belonging.

Some scholars such as Ang (2001) argued that speaking Chinese is not a necessary condition for Chinese identity. “Chineseness” worldwide is open and subject to renegotiation and redefinition both inside and outside territorial China. It is not a fixed state predicated imply on the speaking of Chinese. Rather, it is a fluid and changing cultural status that is assigned according to local circumstances and conditions.

A similar argument is found in the work of writers such as Ong and Nonini (1997). They find contemporary Chinese identity to be based in China itself but these identities have become more fluid and varied due to the cultural influences experienced by Chinese in the course of their global diaspora. The idea of identity as geographically grounded is questioned in the same ways in which notions of identity as language based have been undermined. Ideas of Chinese identity and culture, under the influence of diaspora, can therefore become parts of “constructed landscapes of collective aspirations [that are] now mediated through the complex prism of modern media” (Appadurai, 1990, p. 2).

Here the argument is that identities are not things people are born with, but that they are constructed in and through representations of culture and identity that are in turn
reflected and refracted by media such as the Chinese language newspapers along with the mainstream media of the New Zealand host culture. For a Chinese New Zealander to be Chinese is a reflection of the way “Chineseness” or “non-Chineseness” has been represented by other Chinese New Zealanders, European New Zealanders, Maori, and other local groups. This ongoing process of definition and redefinition occurs within the Chinese community in New Zealand and can be used as a gate keeping mechanism to maintain an idea of cultural identity that perhaps benefits some groups more than others. One aim of this study is to show this process in action and in turn highlight the fluid and variable nature of cultural identity in the context of global diasporic movements.

1.2 Chinese Identity.

An important aspect of the framing of identity in the Chinese newspapers is through language. These are after all text based media and so the contesting and discussion of identity is to a large degree a linguistic process. Semantic discussions of Chinese identity have been put forward by scholars such as Wang who noted that the definition of Chinese identity should be emphasised. He further explained that the English word ‘Chinese’ is too simple to capture the many meanings represented by Chinese language definitions and terms that refer to identity. The Chinese phrase ‘Zhongguo minzu’ (中国民族) could refer to either ethnicity, people, or mainland China. Another phrase might be used, ‘Zhongguoren’ (中国人) which refers more specifically to citizens of the Chinese state (G. Wang, 1991, in Chan, 1998, p.3-4).

The single English word ‘Chinese’ also ignores other Chinese language terms that refer to identity. ‘Hanren’ (汉人) or ‘Huaren’ (华人) refers to the ethnic Chinese that make up to ninety-five percent of ‘Zhongguoren’ (中国人). ‘Han’ (汉) refers

2 Explain: Please note that all instances where Chinese characters are used I first give the English transliteration, then the characters in parentheses, then explain the concept in its nearest English meaning.
to the first great dynasty and empire, the ‘Han’ (汉) (206BC to 220BC), while ‘Hua’ (华) connotes Chinese culture and civilisation.

Further, an important distinction is made in the People’s Republic of China between those who are citizens of the People’s Republic of China ‘Zhongguoren’ (中国人) and those around the world, outside of China, who claim a common ancestry with the ‘Hanren’ (汉人) or ‘Huaren’ (华人) but who are not citizens of the People’s Republic of China. And it is they, as ‘Hanren’ (汉人) or ‘Huaren’ (华人), who are members of the Chinese diaspora. Chan (1998) added the notion of the ‘Huaqiao’ (华侨) which refers to the members of the Chinese communities that dwell outside mainland China. These people maintain strong ties with the ‘zuguo’ (祖国 the ancestral country), through the media, and personal and professional links. Contrasting with these groups are the ‘Huayi’ (华裔), communities of people of Chinese ancestry whose ties to the ‘zuguo’ (祖国 the ancestral country) are tenuous. The ‘Huayi’ may prefer to assimilate their identities into the host community but are unable to lose what Chan refers to as the "corporeal malediction of their imposed identity as Chinese". They are Chinese by descent but do not speak, read, or write Chinese. They construct "Chinese-ness" for their own purposes and according to local circumstances (Chan, 1998, p. 4).

This discussion of the ways in which Chinese refer to their identities is intended to illustrate the relative linguistic poverty of the English word ‘Chinese’. It shows that there are many nuances of meaning that the English word ignores. When analysing the construction of Chinese identity within the newspapers this thesis examines it is useful to understand the richness of terms used in Chinese to refer to identity.

In addition to linguistic aspects of Chinese “identity”, historical and social factors have also shaped (and continue to shape) notions of Chinese-ness. Scholars such as Huntington (1996) have suggested that factors such as the opening up of China’s economy to the world markets during the late 1970s, the return of Hong Kong in 1997 and the rapid economic development have affected the ways in which contemporary
Chinese identities are constructed. Another important factor for this study is the Chinese diaspora.

Several factors shape the characteristics of diaspora of Chinese communities in countries like New Zealand. They include: political and economic development in the homeland; discrimination against Chinese; immigration policies; and globalised networks of communications and economics (Ma, 2003, p. 9). However, the modern Chinese diaspora is more atomised than in the past. Immigrants come from a wide variety of countries and settlement patterns are often more widespread. Additionally, Chinese diasporic communities divide into internal sub-ethnic populations even within the same country of settlement (Cox & Mair, 1991; Massey, 1990; Massey & Jess, 1995; Warf, 1993, in Ma, 2003, pp.12-25).

These new diasporic patterns give rise to novel forms of discourse about Chinese identity, or Chinese-ness. One such approach is taken by J. Kotkin who sees Chinese as a “global tribe”, one which, like Jews, Japanese and Indians, have among other things “a global network based on mutual trust that allows the tribe to function collectively beyond the confines of national or regional borders”. Overseas Chinese are portrayed as part of an “empire of guanxi” and the mainland as “the repository of virtually all the cultural heritage of the tribe” (Kotkin, 1993).

Wang (1991) believes that what “Chinese-ness” means is very complicated and differs among Chinese in different places. This points to the importance of factors that shape cultural identities and to the complexity of Chinese-ness (Wang, 1999). Further the relationship between spatial mobility and identity is highly controversial (Lin, 2003) and, of course, “a host state’s policies toward ethnicity and ethnic relations strongly affect the lives of diasporic Chinese” (Ma, 2003, p. 35).

---

3 Here the homeland of Chinese refers to the place that the Chinese origin comes from; it might be China, Malaysia, Singapore or Taiwan.
4 Guanxi 关系: Human relationship.
Chinese notions of identity are rich and complex not only in a purely linguistic sense but also with respect to the effects of economic, social and political factors within both home and host countries. In this thesis I have tried to capture a sense of the fluidity and dynamism of ideas of Chinese cultural identity as they play out within the diasporic communities print media within New Zealand. Although it is important to understand some of the complexities about Chinese identity that scholars like Kotkin (1993) and Wang (1991) have explicated, these cannot be viewed as definitive. Cultures and societies are in a state of constant flux. One of the values studying everyday media such as the free Chinese newspapers is that they often reflect this flux.

1.4 Background to Chinese Print Media in New Zealand

The first Chinese language newspaper in New Zealand was published in 1921 (David find title of first newspaper) It concentrated on mainland China’s politics and the interest of the Chinese community within New Zealand. After 1947, with a new wave of Chinese immigration, many more newspapers began to be published. These included Wellington Chinese Free School Magazine, New Zealand Chinese Growers’ Monthly Journal and Wellington Chinese Sports and Culture Centre Newsletter (Murphy, 1997, pp. 273-275). Typically, these newspapers had small print runs and were written in Chinese.

In 1989, Sing Tao Group, the Hong Kong-based media giant, established its first New Zealand Chinese-language newspaper Sing Tao Daily (David check it) in Auckland (Murphy, 1997, p. 274). The Wilson and Horton Group⁵ launched its first Chinese newspaper in 1994, (name of this one) but it only lasted for 28 months. Today, there

⁵ The publisher of the New Zealand Herald
are more than 20 newspapers (Huo, 1999, p. 71) and magazines, with a combined circulation of up to 90,000 copies. Most of these are given away for free. They carry a lot of advertising and this is how the publishers make their profits. These newspapers typically feature editorials, news stories, cartoons, photographs and letters to the editors sections. They report on local news of interest to New Zealand’s Chinese communities. They also feature news about mainland China, often taken from variety of Chinese websites and other sources. International news is also featured. They are mainly available from Chinese markets, shops and community centres in Auckland, Wellington and Christchurch.

These newspapers have been little studied. This may be due to language barriers. They are also not collected by libraries and other institutions which makes a difficulty for researchers to gain access to long print runs. Some scholars regard these publications as too trivial and ephemeral to warrant attention. However, these newspapers play important roles as media in the lives of the members of New Zealand’s Chinese community. For many Chinese immigrants who have English as a second language the mainstream print media in New Zealand are of little value or interest. These free Chinese newspapers provide immigrants with information, perspectives and news that link them to New Zealand, their home countries and the world in general as well as their own local community. The purpose of this study is to use these undervalued resources as a means of exploring how changing ideas of Chinese identity are enacted, contested and inscribed within the context of a diasporic community.

_____________________________________

* Internal publications issued by various organizations are not counted here.
Chapter 2: Methodology

The basis for this study is a collection of material taken from several Chinese language newspapers published in Auckland, New Zealand from 20 February to 15 November 2006. This material formed the building blocks of raw data from which the thesis has been built. It is fundamentally a historical project in that I am examining several key moments in the recent history of the Chinese community of Auckland and examining how these were reported in the newspapers. These reports have been analysed to see how ideas about cultural identity were challenged and mediated through these publications. The archive I have built up of these newspapers from this period illustrated various facets of these processes of contesting and mediating ideas about cultural identity and cultural meanings within a diasporic community. I have chosen to approach this material as an historical archive from which meanings may be teased out. Discourse analysis was not felt to be a good approach due to the difficulties of dealing with material in Chinese and English as well as the large amount of material available. In a sense this is a preliminary mapping out of some ideas about the ways in which identity is negotiated in New Zealand’s, or at least Auckland’s, Chinese community. Future studies may build on this material and apply techniques such as discourse analysis to smaller and more nuanced subsets of the material.

B. L. Berg (1998, p. 212) defined a community as a “geographically delineated unit within a larger society”. Although the Chinese community is a small community in New Zealand, its members have to consider their Chinese cultural or subcultural homogeneity among themselves, or between the community and mainstream society, so that the members could create social identifications of their own (Berg, 1998).

Berg (1998, p. 219) further indicated that a case study of a community can be a systematic way of approaching and gathering information with a suitable understanding of the daily routines of the members in the community. Community case studies can specifically focus on some particular aspect of the community. For
example, I may consider how the Chinese community in New Zealand represent their *Chinese-ness, i.e. cultural identity, through its print media.

Yin (1984) and Hagan (1993) further suggested that the various data collection strategies can be used in community case studies: development; histories; documents; interviews; and observation. Since a community’s print media can easily be analysed make use of case studies, those media provide evidence of what goes on in the community. They also show why and how these things happen, who takes part in these activities, and what social forces may bind together members of this community (Berg, 1998).

The purpose of this case study is to bring together various elements in order to create a bigger picture. Together these elements establish an understanding of the Chinese community in New Zealand. The research utilises primary and secondary sources, including historical literature surrounding the subject, because it requires a thorough historical knowledge of the Chinese community and of the development of the community both in New Zealand and globally. Due to the difficulties of conducting extensive research across multiple areas of media, this thesis will be limited to print.

The case study approach can provide a fundamental understanding of the meaning of Chinese-ness, and the roles of Chinese print media in New Zealand. In order to answer the research question “How do the Chinese print media represent Chinese cultural identity?” I will approach the research in an historical manner and give historical answers to the question. As part of the research, I had to create my own archives from the papers that I examined. From these archives, I have chosen two case studies.

When the research subject had been decided, I then had to collect the relevant material. The time frame for collection was from 20 February until November 2006. I
chose the most popular Chinese supermarket\textsuperscript{7} in Auckland to collect the newspapers from. All the newspapers were available free of charge.

Table 1 Newpapers selected and their publication frequency.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand Mirror 镜报</td>
<td>Every Friday (one issue per week)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand Chinese BizLink 新华商报</td>
<td>Every Tuesday and Friday (Two issues a week)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Mandarin Pages 华页</td>
<td>Monday to Saturday (six issues a week)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand Chinese Herald 新西兰华人先驱报</td>
<td>Three issues a week. (Tuesday / Thursday / Saturday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Express 中文一族</td>
<td>Every Tuesday (once a week)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTV Magazine 中视</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iBall</td>
<td>Every fortnight</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table one lists the newspapers selected for this study. There are several reasons that I chose these newspapers. Firstly, most of the articles in these newspapers were written by journalists working for these newspapers or are translations of articles that have been published in the mainstream media. Secondly, most of these newspapers have a publishing history that goes back several years. For instance, by the end of November 2006, The Mandarin Pages had reached 2035 issues at six issues per week. This is a time period of over six years. The Chinese Express had published 670 weekly issues and The New Zealand Chinese Herald, published three times a week, had reached 775 issues by November 2006. The Chinese Mirror is a new publication and has strong links with mainland China. It includes articles and columns from the Beijing Youth Daily. iBall is important as it is published in English. There are other newspapers but they have been ignored for this study as they do not have regular publication dates. I have also ignored advertising booklets and focused on “true”, if free, newspapers.

\textsuperscript{7} Tai Ping Supermarket on Custom Street in the centre of Auckland City
The newspapers were scanned and material selected according to (a) how well they illustrated conflicting points of view between the Chinese community and (b) the attitudes of mainstream society to New Zealand Chinese. Many of the chosen articles were too broad to reflect ideas of Chinese cultural identities. For example, focusing on “Changing Lifestyles” or “Concepts of Home” was not relevant as both contemporary and historical concepts of home were too general to be included in the research. Therefore, after searching for key issues I had to further define specific case studies.

After a long process of collecting data, I selected two case studies because they were clear examples of events that generate discussion about Chinese identity in the Chinese community. The first case study concerns reports about Chinese students working as prostitutes. This was reported in the English language newspaper iBall on 12 May 2006. The second case study concerned Chinese newspapers’ responses to a cartoon of Chairman Mao which was on the cover of the student newspaper Chaff on 18 May 2006. Both were controversial and the issues relates to being “Chinese” and to cultural identity.

The first case study concerned allegations about Chinese student prostitution. This is particularly important because of the idea of “losing face”. Some reaction to Lincoln Tan, the editor of iBall, publishing the story was that New Zealand Chinese “lost face”. Therefore Tan was seen a not pure Chinese or “second class Chinese”. This is fascinating, because some in the community made distinctions about who was really Chinese and who was not based on media coverage. Analysis of this case study can shed light on how tensions surrounding identity were played out in the diasporic Auckland Chinese community. This case study is also important because iBall is the only English language newspaper in Chinese community. So, unlike other Chinese language newspapers iBall has a much wider potential readership. I suspect that is one of the reasons that there was a strong reaction to iBall’s reports. It suggests that people were more sensitive to the issue because they could have been read by many
outside the Chinese community. For these reasons, this case study was an important one for this research.

The second case study was substantially different. The concerns a cartoon that appeared on the cover of the Massey University magazine *Chaff* in May 2006. This cartoon made fun of Chairman Mao in a way that many Chinese found offensive. The ensuing discussions in the Chinese print media highlighted differences in the ways in which the diasporic community regarded its leaders and the ways in which the host community approached political satire.

What emerged from these discussions was on the one hand a more conciliatory approach than that shown in the first case study and on the other a sense of ideas about collectivism and individualism. These responses illuminated some of the ways in which ideas about Chinese identity were being changed to some extent by the cultural influences of the host community.

Of course, since the initial stimulus of this issue came from a non-Chinese source, their case study is different from the first. However, since the underlying controversy here relates so strongly to identity formation, this case study provides an interesting counterpoint to the student prostitution issue. It is likely that the origin of the controversy (i.e. whether the issue surfaces in “Chinese” or “mainstream” media) is less important than the perceived cultural importance of the underlying issues of the events reported on.

However, there is a limitation to this historical research in that I could not look back further into the history of the Chinese community, as very few print sources have been archived. This was one reason why I had to build my own archive. So the two case studies that have been analysed are recent and have been selected as they provide significant insights into the research question concerning Chinese diasporic identity. Each case study generated valuable data regarding cultural identity, both within community media and in local mainstream society. Each case is an example of crisis and public tension. They illustrate the importance of words and their meanings in the...
construction and maintenance of cultural identities and the important roles media such as newspapers play in mediating these struggles over meanings. The public dialogue conducted in the pages of the print media illustrates wider ideas about the contestable meaning of Chinese-ness in contemporary New Zealand.

Chapter 3 Literature Review

The literature relating to the fields of study this thesis is concerned with is large and varied. I have divided the material into two broad categories. The first concerns material that deals with the ideas of diaspora and community. I have concentrated here on several key works that are particularly relevant to my study. The second section is about the literature on the ideas of “being Chinese” and “Chineseness”, i.e. how Chinese identity is constructed.

3.1 Communities and Diaspora

One of the key thinkers on the idea of national communities and groups is Benedict Anderson. His seminal work *Imagined Community* (1983) focused on how cultural communities were formed. Anderson argued that concepts such as nationality, nationhood and nationalism can best be explained as cultural products. He investigated how these cultural artefacts have been created historically and concluded that they were able to be transplanted to and merged into other or different social and national contexts.

Anderson proposed the definition of a “nation”: “It is an imagined political community and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign” (Anderson, 1983, p. 6) It is “imagined”, because Anderson believed that people of a country do not
really know all their fellow-countrymen, never meet them or hear from them. The connection is in the mindset. Therefore communities can be defined by the “style” in which they are imagined. “Imagined community” is a concrete and powerful idea and one for which, over many centuries, millions of people sacrificed their lives.

For my purposes, the significance of Anderson’s research is that he gave a clear definition of community as existing in people’s minds rather than physically. He also reminds us that this imagined community is fluid.

Anderson’s research used the colonial period to demonstrate the relationships between media (newspapers in particular) and imagined communities. He found that the original function of newspapers in colonial countries was to spread news from home countries. In this way, the imagined community was naturally created among fellow-readers who shared information from the homeland. Anderson’s findings suggest that even today, newspapers could still be important in creating imagined communities despite the prominence of media such as television, radio and the internet. My study builds on Anderson’s emphasis on print media.

Appadurai refined and developed some of Anderson’s insights into imagined communities (Appadurai, 1990). He emphasised the role the imagined nation plays in the construction of social structures. Appadurai extended Anderson’s theory of “imagined community” into “imagined world”. He argues that “imagined community” is not sufficient for the world we live in today and that the concept of the “imagined world” will allow us to point to the fluid, irregular shapes of contemporary social cultural landscapes. The second idea that Appadurai offered is that of a framework for examining the “new global cultural economy a complex, overlapping, disjunctive order that cannot any longer be understood in terms of existing center-periphery models” (Appadurai, 1990, p. 32).

He used the suffix “scape-“ to combine with prefixes such as “ethno-; media-; techno-; finance-; and ideo-”. Appadurai used these terms to test the limitations of Anderson’s imagined community. He demonstrated this using examples of different diasporic
groups, such as Turkish workers in Germany and Korean migrants in Philadelphia. Through studying such groups’ use of media Appadurai further suggested that such conjunctions of media and migration meant that what is imagined is no longer the “imagined community” of a nation state, but numerous “diasporic public spheres” (Appadurai, 1990, p. 4). In his later work, Appadurai extended his position and further developed the various “scapes”. His main argument placed “mediascape” as the core with the others in support of it (Appadurai, 1996).

Another significant point is that Appadurai highlighted a clear definition of collective identity and individual identity (Appadurai, 1996, pp. 140-141). He stated that all groups involve a strong feeling of “we-ness” based on a shared language or territory. This kind of emotional drive binds groups together in powerful ways. On the other hand, individualism is seen to work against the idea of the collective identity. These definitions provide a foundation for understanding my research which analyzes the conflict between Chinese collective identity and European individualism.

Cohen (1997) attempted to provide a basis for studying diaspora. The word diaspora has been used in a variety of ways. According to Cohen, historically it referred to people or tribes exiled from their homeland. Today it also refers to migration or immigration. Cohen’s work investigated a large number of exiled or migratory groups. He tried to discover features that diasporic groups had in common in an attempt to formulate a definition of diaspora. He points out that such communities develop collective identities. These identities reflect a collective commitment to the preservation and maintenance of cultural identity. This cultural identity is usually rooted within the linguistic, cultural, religious and social practices of the home country. These practices are maintained as best as they can be in host country, but will undergo changes as the diasporic community interacts with new cultures. This is important to my research as I am trying to illustrate changes of ideas about cultural identity within the New Zealand Chinese community. Cohen’s work emphasizes the contingent and fluid nature of cultural identity.
Tsagarousianou (2004) reviewed recent debates on theories of diaspora. In particular she focussed on ways in which the concept of diaspora could be critically evaluated, and the key issues of ‘ethnicity, mobility and displacement’ (p. 53). She argued further that imagined communities are continuously reconstructed and reinvented, and that diasporic identities are reproduced and transformed via media technologies (p. 60). This provides a basis for my research to investigate how the Chinese diasporic media play crucial roles for New Zealand Chinese.

From reviewing how the definition of ‘diaspora’ was generated, Tsagarousianou shows how the concept has been employed as a theoretical framework for different perspectives in the study of human migration. She also investigated different perspectives of the relationship between Diaspora and home and concluded that not every mobile population can be identified as a ‘diaspora’. She adds, “it is their keenness to hold themselves within the transnational imagination and self mobilise around awareness of a diaspora, that leads to the categorisation” (Tsagarousianou., 2004, pp. 56-58). In reviewing Appadurai’s five “scapes”, Tsagarousianou (2004, p. 61) found that there are dynamic interactions between migrant groups and societies of settlement as well as between migrant groups and the homeland. In terms of diasporic communication, Tsagarousianou (2004, p. 63) highlighted Mandaville’s idea (2001) that the media continually construct, debate and reimagine concepts like cultural identity, the meanings of identity and the virtual territories of diasporic community.

In Tsagarousianou’s conclusion (pp. 63-64), she argued that the concept of diaspora is a controversial transnational one and refers to “complex multidirectional flows of human beings, ideas, culture, and other forms of interaction”. Diaspora as a concept is improved by linking it with the concept of connectivity and by focusing on cultural politics. Linking concepts of diasporic communities to Anderson’s idea of “imagined communities”, Tsagarousianou raises novel and productive modes of thinking about diasporic communities.

The connections between diaspora, mobility, connectivity, and communications that Tsagarousianou made are important for my research. The roles of diasporic media in
constructing imagined diasporic communities are emphasized in her conception of diaspora. I have drawn on work such as this to foreground the role of local Chinese print media in New Zealand as used by the Chinese community.

3.2 Chinese & Chinese-ness

Wang (1991) reviewed social science concepts of identity and ethnicity and applied them to the Chinese experience in the United States. Wang pointed out that Chinese identities were intricate and complex as seen from various points of view, (for example, ethnic, national, local, cultural, and class). Wang stated that apart from biology, Chinese-ness is related to the Chinese word gen 棟 (roots) (L. C. Wang, 1991, p. 183). It is used to symbolize the ancestral birth place from which one derives one’s identity. Wang proposed five types of identity among the Chinese diaspora: “the sojourner mentality; assimilator; accommodator; ethnically proud, and uprooted” (L. C. Wang, 1991, p. 192). Each of these types of identity corresponds to gen (the roots), which relate to: ancestral village, Chinese race, China nation, the Chinese government, and Chinese culture. The article tries to express a traditional Chinese belief: “a tree may grow a thousand feet high, but its leaves fall back to the roots – a person residing away from home eventually returns to his native soil” (L. C. Wang, 1991, p. 193). And the ultimate root is China. However, her research is limited to the United States so it is hard to generalise to the entire Chinese diaspora. However, this summary of the main aspects of the construction of Chinese identity is a useful overview that informs many aspects of my thesis.
Wu reviewed the history of Chinese immigration and argued that for Chinese all around the world, although their ancestors originally came from China, later generations might not remember where their original land was or even have basic language skills (Wu, 1991, pp. 163-165). These later generations might describe themselves as American Born Chinese (ABC), or simply deny that they are Chinese at all. However, Wu (1991, pp. 176-177) believes that language ability cannot be the only criterion for cultural identity. Everything, including language, can be changed except for Chinese sentiments which strongly connect people to shared beliefs and traditional customs. Wu further explained that both Zhongguoren (中国人) - Chinese people- and zhonghua minzu (中华民族) - Chinese ethnicity- represent Chinese identity (i.e. Chinese-ness) based on the concepts of cultural and historical implementation rather than nationality or citizenship. Finally, Wu concluded that the meaning of “Chinese-ness” changes, but diasporic Chinese keep themselves within the acceptable definition of “Chinese-ness” and engage other members within the Chinese community in preserving Chinese culture from non-Chinese influences.

Wu and Wang provided overviews of Chinese identity and how this is an historical construction that changes over time. Political, social and cultural changes (such as the Chinese diaspora) affect the ways in which Chinese communities construct and mediate their ideas of identity or Chinese-ness. This study builds on and applies these ideas of identity as a construct rather than a given within the context of the Chinese community in New Zealand.

There has been a certain amount of scholarly work on the Chinese community within New Zealand but little of this has been concerned with the role of local Chinese print media within the development and maintenance of identities. Ip’s work approached the Chinese in New Zealand from a social development and an historical perspective. She delineated the prejudices and hardships faced by Chinese in New Zealand since the early days of their immigration in the nineteenth century. Ip used interviews and historical analysis of pictorial evidence such as photographs and cartoons to highlight aspects of the Chinese experience in New Zealand. From these materials, Ip analysed issues like transnationalism, historical development, relationships, education and
assimilation. She is concerned to point out that Chinese immigration should not be treated as an isolated issue, but as one that relates to New Zealand’s future relations with Asia, and the nature of its own developing national identity. Her analysis provided much useful background for this study but she has little to say about the use of modern newspapers by the latest groups of Chinese immigrants.

Some work on Chinese print media in New Zealand can be found in the major survey of New Zealand print cultures that was published in 1997 (Griffith, Harvey, & Maslen, 1997). This not only focused on English or Maori publications within New Zealand, but also investigated the print cultures of other languages in New Zealand – Chinese, Croatian, Dutch, French, Gaelic, German, Greek, Latin, Polish, and Scandinavian. The two essays that discussed Chinese print culture examined the older Chinese newspapers and publications from the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

Murphy’s essay (1997) reviewed the historical development of Chinese immigration to New Zealand and discussed the newspapers published by these communities. It provided valuable historical background for my research and illustrates the roles these newspapers had in the historical development of Chinese community in New Zealand.

Murphy (in Griffith et al, 1997) divided twentieth century Chinese print culture into three periods: 1900-49, 1949-87, and post 1987 (p. 271). During the first period, China experienced revolution and Chinese in New Zealand quickly developed patriotic sentiment, gave financial support to the Nationalist Kuomintang (KMT) and in 1921 the KMT newspaper, the Man Sing Times 民醒时报 (p. 272) became the first New Zealand’s Chinese-language newspaper. Published in Wellington every ten days, the paper informed readers about the revolution in China and advocated support for the KMT. In 1937, the Sino-Japanese war began and the Chinese community itself started its New Zealand Chinese Weekly News in Wellington. It contained both war news and reports about the local Chinese community. A similar paper, the Q Sing Times, was set up in 1938 in Auckland. Both papers were in a handwritten format and ended in 1946 when the war was over.
In the second period, New Zealand Chinese focus moved onto social issues such as discrimination and family reunion (Murphy in Griffith et al, 1997, p.273). Another feature of this period was continued political involvement with the newspaper industry. The KMT set up *The New Zealand Chinese Monthly Special* in 1950 and *The Kui Pao / Chinese News Weekly* in 1951 while the Chinese Communist Party published a monthly newsletter to persuade people to maintain relationships with mainland China. By the 1970s, overseas political issues receded as Chinese increasingly identified themselves as New Zealanders and Chinese papers were written in English and focused on community based news.

In 1987, the Labour Government opened the door to a new wave of Chinese immigrants, most of whom settled in Auckland (Murphy in Griffith et al, 1997, p.274). By 1996, there were at least eight Auckland papers published in the community, including *Sing Tao Daily* and *New Zealand Chinese Weekly* (which changed its name to the *New Zealand Chinese Herald*). There was only one magazine (*Hwa Hsia*), which was for Taiwanese immigrants. However, all these publications contained local and overseas news with useful information about New Zealand customs and settlement. The papers also carried large amount of advertising. By the 1990s there were several newspapers published in other parts of New Zealand, such as *the Christchurch Chinese Monthly News* and *the Dunedin Asian Monthly News*.

The other essay in Griffith’s collection is by Ng (1993, in Griffith et al, 1997) who believes that the earliest waves of Chinese immigrants to New Zealand were mainly comprised of labourers, many of whom were illiterate or had minimal education. Therefore, oral transmission of news and information was more important to them than printed media. This is perhaps borne out by the small number and circulation of Chinese newspapers in New Zealand in those times. The only known ‘Chinese’ newspaper produced in New Zealand in the late 1800s was *Weekly Kam lei Tong I Po* (1993, p. 269), which first appeared on 12th May, 1883. From the 1880s to the 1890s, some other overseas Chinese newspapers and magazines circulated in New Zealand. These included *China Mail*, *Chinese Australian Herald*, *Review of the Times*, *Missionary Review*, *Chinese Illustrated News*, *the Chinese Globe Magazine*, and
Kwang Pao, Wa Tz Yat Pao. No copies of these paper appear to have survived in New Zealand archives (p. 270).

These surveys of Chinese newspapers provided much useful historical background and context to the present study. However, they do not directly address the contemporary issues of identity and culture as played out in modern Chinese newspapers. Griffith pointed out that little or nothing had been written on the social history of the Chinese community in New Zealand. A major difficulty for researchers has been that few of the historical publications have been preserved. This present study is concerned with contemporary publications and even these are not preserved on a large scale by libraries or archives. In the present case, I have overcome this by building my own archive. Griffith called for more studies to be done on Chinese media in New Zealand and this thesis is one such attempt.

Sinclair et al (in S. Cunningham & J. Sinclair, 2000, pp.35-90) also investigated the issue of Chinese cultural identity within the Australian context. Their research analysed the processes by which Chinese in Australia maintained their cultural identity while negotiating with the local host culture. The research found that consciousness of difference was important to Australian Chinese (Sinclair, Yue, Hawkins, Pookong, & Fox, 2000 in Cunningham & Sinclair, 2000, pp.36-39). Chinese immigrants wanted more news than the mass media gave them about the outside world, especially news that related to their home countries. The research concluded that members of Asian diasporic communities took a long time to negotiate with host societies and that they maintained strong cultural ties to their home countries. Sinclair’s research examined a wide range of media including TV, radio, film, the internet, magazines, newspapers and books. This took a wider view than my study and raised difficulties when trying to assign particular roles in identity formation to any one medium. While Australian society is in some respects similar to that of New Zealand there are important differences that make it difficult to apply such work directly to local conditions.
Another study from Australia was that by Wanning (2005). She was concerned with the formation of the diasporic Chinese mediasphere. She argued that Chinese-language media in Australia play three roles (2005, p. 73). First, diasporic media provide a stage for expressing different points of view within the community. Second, Chinese-language media are useful channels through which the host society can reach those community members who do not understand English. Lastly, Chinese media report on mainstream society from a Chinese viewpoint. While Wanning discussed the wider media landscape as opposed to just newspapers, her ideas are relevant for the present study as they highlight the uses which Chinese language media are put to in diasporic contexts. This threefold process is complex and multi-directional and an examination of it can illustrate the roles of the media in identity construction.

The last few years has seen a significant amount of research into Chinese diasporic media. However, much of this has been concerned with America, Southeast Asia, or Australia. There is still a real need for much work on New Zealand Chinese media. This thesis is an attempt to examine the role of Chinese print media in identity formation in New Zealand’s Chinese community.
Chapter 4  Case Studies

4.1 Case Study one: Face, Shame and Prostitution

For several months in 2006, starting in May, there was much discussion in the local Chinese print media about what it meant to be Chinese in New Zealand. The cause of this controversy was a report on Chinese students working as prostitutes that was published in the newspaper *iBall*. This report sparked off a series of claims and counter-claims, accusations and heated debates that not only played out in the pages of the Chinese language newspapers but also spilled over into the mainstream media. This case study gives an account of this debate and highlights some of its key points that reflect contested ideas about Chinese identity. A full analysis of this is given in Chapter Five.

On 12 May 2006, the newspaper *iBall* published a five page report about Chinese students working as prostitutes. The article was written by *iBall’s* owner and editor, Lincoln Tan. This report included interviews, an editorial and a provocative image on the front page (see Appendix 1). This illustration was example of the sort of sexualized image normally found in tabloid journalism. The image featured two “Asian” women posing in sexual manner. The headline identified Asian students as the focus of the report. The cover was designed to attract attention, as was the headline, by playing on fears concerning female sexuality. It should be noted that *iBall* is printed in English. It is designed to appeal to a wider community than Chinese speaking people. Some of the reactions to *iBall’s* report must be seen in the light of this wider distribution of the newspaper beyond the Chinese community.

The *iBall* report featured interviews with sex workers, local authorities, health workers and members of the Chinese community. Concerns were raised about the health of the sex workers. It was alleged that they lacked knowledge about contraception and sexually transmitted diseases and did not register with the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective because of shame. The report gave the impression that young Chinese women in New Zealand could drift into prostitution when their parents or relatives in China stopped sending money.
On the same day that \textit{iBall} published this report, the \textit{New Zealand Herald (NZH)} also featured investigation about Chinese students involved in prostitution. This report was co-authored by Herald reporters Julie Middleton and Lincoln Tan. As mentioned previously Lincoln Tan was the owner, publisher and editor of \textit{iBall} but he also wrote a regular column for the Herald about the Chinese community in New Zealand. These reports on prostitution and Chinese students were thus simultaneously published in the mainstream media as well as a newspaper that, while written in English, was widely read in the Chinese community. This wider diffusion of the stories of young Chinese women working as prostitutes seemed to have been an important factor in the controversy that ensued in the Chinese press.

One notable factor that may have stimulated strong reactions from some members of Chinese community was the use of word “Chinese” in the Herald’s headline. The headline in \textit{iBall} ran as follows; “Asians cash in on porn boom”\textit{(iBall, 12 May 2006, p.1)}. The Herald’s headline was more specific; “Chinese students take on sex for cash” \textit{(NZH, 12 May 2006, p.A7)} This change of identity made the Herald article seem less ambiguous and switched the focus from the “Asians” to the Chinese community. This change seems to have been one of the key points that angered some members of the Chinese community. This Herald article added little that was new to the report in \textit{iBall}. In fact, it was more or less a straight forward reprint. The same sources were interviewed, the same points were raised and the same conclusions were reached. The main difference was the more specific headline and that the Herald is a national newspaper that reaches a far greater readership than \textit{iBall}.

Within four days of these reports appearing, Chinese language newspapers also carried articles about Chinese women and prostitution. While adding little new information, these reports emphasized (and deemphasized) certain aspects of Tan’s original articles that subtly altered their original meanings.
The Mandarin Pages (MP) combined the iBall and Herald reports into one article for their issue of 13 May 2006. The headline for this article ran as follows; “有报道指奥克兰华人娼妓数目急升 -- 以留学生为主 Some media point out that the number of Hua Ren prostitutes has increased dramatically in Auckland – Most of them are International Students” (MP, 2006) The title used “有报道指” (“some media point out”) to inform its readers that the news is not from them, they have just translated and reprinted the material from other newspapers. The headline used term “华人” or Hua Ren which refers to the Chinese people in general. The sub-heading used term”留学生” or international students with the clear implication that these were Chinese.

The body of the article contained information that had appeared in the iBall and Herald articles. While omitting the interviews with sex workers, the article featured the same spokespeople from the NZPC and local authorities. It raised the same concerns about sexual health, contraception and access to such information by sex workers. This article explicitly linked the increase in Chinese sex workers with international students from Mainland China;

有报道指出，奥克兰的国际留学生卖淫问题日趋严重，当中又以中国留学生占大多数。

Translation: Some media point out that the issue of international students selling sex is becoming more and more serious, most of them are international students from China. (MP, 13 May 2006, p.1)

This may have indicated some concerns about the behaviour of international students from China felt by the older, more established community members.

Three days later on 16 May 2006, another Chinese language newspaper reported on the issue of Chinese students and prostitution. The Chinese Express (CE) article once again recycled material from the iBall and Herald articles. It discussed the role of students in prostitution but also claimed that some Chinese women were coming to
New Zealand on tourist visas specifically to work as prostitutes. This article used the same interviewees as *iBall* and *Herald* but suggested that the Prostitution Reform Act of 2003 was encouraging young Chinese to become sex workers\(^8\). It went on to further suggest that there had been an overall increase in the number of international sex workers in New Zealand since the bill was passed.

The report did not itself directly identify cultural background or ethnicity of these workers but it quoted interviewee’s who pointed to an increase in Chinese Sex workers and used the phrase “华人” (Hua Ren) in its translation of these statements. For example, Bronwyn Schofield, a nurse from a health service organisation, was quoted in Mandarin;

她接触了三十八位不具有永久居民身份的性工作者，其中[大概三分之二]是华人妇女，其中许多人是十八岁至二十四岁的学生
Translation: I have been contact with 38 sex workers who are non permanent residents in New Zealand during past two years. Two thirds of them are Chinese (Hua Ren) women. Most of them are students of 18 to 24 years old. (*CE*, 16 May 2006, p.A5)

As with the article in *Mandarin Pages*, an explicit link was made here between Chinese students and prostitution. The appearance of these articles in Chinese language newspapers brought *iBall’s* investigation to the attention of many in the Chinese community who did not read or follow the English language mainstream media. A strong reaction to these articles from many in the Chinese community then followed.

Following these articles, Lincoln Tan used his *NZH* column of 22 May 2006 to discuss some of the responses to *iBall’s* original article. In his column he quoted an

\(^8\) These international students believe that this Act could protect them as legal sex workers.
email to *iBall* that accused him of being a traitor to Chinese people. He also mentioned a reporter from a Chinese language newspaper who had asked Tan how he viewed his responsibilities to the Chinese community as a Chinese journalist.

To the first comment, Tan responded by writing that he never thought of himself as Chinese. He identified himself as Paranakan (Straits-born Chinese), which means that somewhere in his ancestry he had a great-great grandfather from Malaya. He further argued that there is a distinction in the Chinese language between being a “华人” (Hua Ren or Ethnic Chinese) and “中国人” (Zhong Guo Ren or Chinese national). He put himself in ethnic Chinese (华人) category. He found it hard to identify with Chinese from mainland China but he became more Chinese in New Zealand than he was in Singapore. He also found the mainstream society put him in the Chinese community without any thought.

As to the query about the role and responsibilities of a Chinese journalist in New Zealand, Tan stated that; “It’s not the job of a journalist to support blindly the community from which he springs.” The reporter who asked this question, according to Tan, implied that this responsibility was to protect Chinese face, i.e. to spare members of the Chinese community any shame. The publication of the reports in English language media and mainstream media at that was seen here as bringing shame to the Chinese community. Tan argued that as journalist his job was not to become the guardian of Chinese “face”. He believed that helping mainstream media in New Zealand to rise above ignorance and tokenism is a more important role for Chinese journalists than being “face protectors” for a community that has survived criticisms and attacks for thousands of years (Tan, 2006). The *NZH* followed up this column with an editorial on 23 May that argued that the Chinese community should be positive about negative but true news reports, thus showing its support for Tan.

What had begun as a report into Chinese students working in the sex industry had turned into a debate about the nature of Chinese identity and the role of the media in maintaining that identity in a diasporic context. The following reactions concentrated further on these ideas rather than the original discussion about young Chinese people in New Zealand and prostitution.
On 26 May 2006, the Chinese Mirror (CM) published an article entitled “Of Intuitive Knowledge of the Chinese Print Media in New Zealand” 《也谈纽西兰中文媒体的良知》 (Nan-Tai-Jing-Wa 南太井蛙, 2006). The article began by discussing the social functions and responsibilities of the media, especially the Chinese print media in New Zealand. It went on to question the motives of the reporters who had investigated the issue of Chinese student prostitution. The writer felt that the Chinese community was not a strong and united group and that it had been attacked by these articles. Such sensationalistic reporting was seen here as using the Chinese community to sell newspapers.

On 3rd of June 2006, the New Zealand Chinese Herald (NZCH) entered the discussion with a strongly worded editorial entitled: “iBall, What Are You Doing?” The editorial directly attacked iBall and its managing editor Lincoln Tan and also raised many points about how some sections of the Chinese communities felt about identity and regarded the role of the media (see Appendix 11).

The editorial began by emphasizing the special responsibilities and position of iBall and Lincoln Tan. Tan was the first Chinese columnist writing about the Chinese community in the mainstream media i.e. the New Zealand Herald. It was felt that his articles could foster understanding about the Chinese community in New Zealand. iBall, as the first English language newspaper of Chinese community, could fulfil a similar role.

Concerning the reactions from the Chinese community about the articles on prostitution, the editorial argued that it was natural to have a debate in any society and community when a newspaper reported on any sensitive issue. But because the Chinese community has a very complicated structure and community members come from different parts of the world. iBall couldn’t expect all Chinese to agree with Tan. Some would laugh at what he wrote, some might agree and some would criticize. (Mao_毛凡, 2006).
Finally, the editorial argued that it was very good to report the dark side of the Chinese community if the facts were true and wouldn’t harm most community members. The editorial stated that as journalists they understood the importance of “Freedom of Speech” (Mao_毛凡, 2006). But, the editorial argued that *iBall* had no intention of seeking that truth, but was more concerned with reinforcing mainstream prejudices about Chinese immigrants and especially students. So Lincoln Tan would gain favour with mainstream society. It questioned Tan’s knowledge of the Chinese community by pointing out that he had denied to be identified as Chinese. In effect, this editorial seemed to argue that only certain sorts of Chinese people were allowed to comment on the Chinese community.

Along with the articles, editorials and features written by journalists that discussed ideas about Chinese identity following *iBall*’s original report, members of the Chinese community also contributed by writing letters to the editor. In particular, *iBall* received a number of these that contained both criticism and praise. These letters further illustrated conflicting ideas about Chinese identity in New Zealand.

There were personal criticisms directed at Lincoln Tan that were based on his ethnic origins. Some felt that as he was born in Singapore he was not a “true” Chinese. Willie Li wrote that “You are not Chinese and do not have authority to write any news about Chinese students. We think you are just second class Chinese.” (Li, 12 May 2006, p.11) However, others defended *iBall* and accused its critics of ignorance and prejudice. The idea that “true” Chinese are those born in mainland China was rejected by members of the diasporic community in New Zealand. One correspondent, Victor Ong, wrote about the contributions of overseas born Chinese (hua qiao) and added that: “it’s a pity that younger generation of Chinese students like Willie Li are ignorant about this. To him, overseas-born Chinese a second class. Proud to be hua qiao.” (Ong, 26 May 2006, p.11) Contests over identity can be seen here as having generational as well as ethnic elements especially.

Furthermore, Tan’s report upset some Chinese community members because they felt that the articles had shown the dark side of the Chinese community. Some Chinese
felt that these reports brought shame onto the community and that meant they caused Chinese people to lose face. They believed that such journalism, particularly in an English language newspaper, played to the prejudices held by some in mainstream New Zealand society. John Siew hoped that *iball* would “go further and not merely report about the evils of the Asian community but also the good, the morally upright and the things that are worthy of praise among the Asians in New Zealand.” (Siew, 26 May 2006, p.12) He, for one, was concerned about the image of the Chinese community in New Zealand and that its members might be shamed by media reportage about subjects such as prostitution or crime.

However, some writers felt that the idea of shame or “losing face” was not such an important part of Chineseness in the diasporic community in New Zealand. One example was provided by Mary Lim who condemned the division of Chinese into first and second classes based on ethnic origin. She questioned the importance of saving face and challenged “the self-proclaimed first class Chinese” to change their attitudes towards other Chinese, to ignore negativity in the media and not to be “so hung up about face.” (Lim, 9 June 2006, p.11)

These reports, editorials and letters reflect a debate about the meaning of “Chineseness”. Chinese with different backgrounds hold different perspectives on the meaning of “Chinese-ness”. Different ideas of how to be, or to act as real “Chinese” in New Zealand society were discussed in the wake of these reports. This material provides insights into the dynamic nature of identity in the New Zealand Chinese community. These will be further discussed in Chapter Five.

### 4.2 Case Study two: Laughing at Mao

The issue of the Massey University student magazine *Chaff* for 16 May 2006 featured a cover that made fun of communism. With the fake title “Commropolitan” making a none too subtle reference to the fashion and lifestyle magazine *Cosmopolitan*, it featured headlines such as “Reds in the bed! Sealed section inside”, “273 ways to conform to mass standardization while staying fabulous” and “I’m not touching that!
How to deal with your boyfriend’s bourgeois individualist penis”. This might seem to have been just another example of undergraduate humour but this cover caused much controversy in the Chinese language newspapers. The reason for this was the illustration that featured Mao Ze-dong’s head photoshopped onto a young women’s body (see illustration 1).

This image angered many Chinese students and others in the Chinese community. The New Zealand Chinese Herald (NZCH) reported disturbances at Massey University. A protest was lodged at the university by angry students who compared the image to anti-Muslim cartoons that had caused worldwide controversy in February 2006 (Mai Ji_麦吉, 2006). An article appearing in the Chinese Biz Link (CBL) the previous day had quoted Xing Tang, one of the student protestors at Massey, as tearfully stating that “to us Mao Ze-dong as the same as your God. We pay over $20,000 for study fees to the university, and in return we got this racist treatment from the school” (CBL, 19 May 2006, p.A5). The Chaff cover was widely commented on in online forums such as skykiwi.com where many Chinese students in New Zealand expressed their anger. They tended to regard the use of Mao’s image as a racist attack on Chinese rather than a political satire on Communism9. The controversy attracted attention from non-New Zealand media with reports appearing on Fox news10 and in the Chronicle of Higher Education11 (Fox News, 21 May 2006, online at http://www.foxnews.com; Chronicle of Higher Education, 23 May 2006, online at http://chronicle.com)

Retrieved on 13 September 2006

10 online at http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,196390,00.html retrieved on 13 September 2006
While some Chinese students at Massey reacted with anger and staged a protest, the Chaff staff responsible for the cover felt that the students were overreacting to a light hearted joke. Chaff News Editor Matt Russell told the Manawatu Standard that the image of Mao was an arbitrary choice; “We were looking for a picture of Marx or Lenin and we couldn’t use Castro because he had a beard and it just didn’t work. I didn’t think it would offend.” He added that Chinese students in New Zealand should be aware that ‘a good sense of humour is part of Kiwi culture” but did not explain exactly what constituted such a sense of humour (Manawatu Standard, 18 May 2006, online at http://www.stuff.co.nz)

Several Chinese newspapers carried reports of the protest and controversy at Massey University that occurred when the cover was published. Three newspapers, Oriental Times, New Zealand Chinese Herald and Chinese Biz Link all carried articles that explained why Mao was so important for people from Mainland China. They explained that as the founder of the People’s Republic of China, Mao is regarded as one of the most important people in Chinese history. He is regarded as a spiritual leader of the Chinese as well as a political figure. The Chaff staff had ignored this spiritual dimension when they published the offending cover. This spiritual aspect of Mao in Chinese culture makes the image of him important for Chinese when they think about cultural identity (NZCH, 20 May 2006, P.A5)

An important and large article appeared in the New Zealand Chinese Herald on 27 May 2006. It canvassed many viewpoints and suggested the wide range of responses to the Chaff cover that were felt in the Chinese community. It pointed out that many Chinese believed that the media should be mainly concerned with social responsibility rather than the right to freedom of speech because this right should not harm others’ self-esteem or emotions. But the Chaff cover had vilified Mao in way that hurt Chinese emotionally, especially those who were community leaders. They felt, along with the Chinese Massey students, that Chaff should apologise to all Chinese in New Zealand. However, Chaff had released a public letter indicating that an apology would not be necessary. The main reason given was that the image was a political
opinion and this was not a racist issue. The *New Zealand Chinese Herald* stated that this attitude was the same behind the incident of September 2003 when prominent radio host Paul Holmes referred to the United Nations Secretary General Kofi Annan as a “Cheeky darky”. In that case many in the New Zealand media and social mainstream regarded these comments as a joke just as the *Chaff* cover was seen as lighthearted satire.

The article quoted some comments that had been left on Websites where Chinese people, especially students, commented on issues. A person identifying themself as a New Zealander had left a question on skykiwi.com that suggested that if the Chinese students were entitled to an apology over the Mao image then Russians and Germans were owed apologies for critical comments about Joseph Stalin and Adolf Hitler. This was replied to by equally rhetorical questions about the possible reaction if *Chaff* had made fun of the Maori Queen on their cover. Many writers on the website, along with the Massey students, saw the issue as being one of racial discrimination in that the mockery of Mao was seen as an attack on Chinese culture in general. They felt, according to the *NZCH* report, that mainstream society did not understand or respect Chinese culture.

The article featured an interview of Jian Yang, Senior Lecturer in Political Studies at the University of Auckland, whose comments were used to explain the varying attitudes of both mainstream New Zealand society and the Chinese community. Each had different attitudes towards politicians. The individualistic ideas of New Zealanders meant that they had less respect for politicians. Political satire and mockery of them is part of the political process in New Zealand. Chinese, on the other hand, have a more collective spirit. Most Chinese believe that the individual is only a small part of the group or nation. In the Chinese language, the word for nation (国家) contains the meaning that it is an extension of the family. So the leader of the nation is in effect also the head of the family and must be respected. While mockery of politicians is seen as normal and healthy in the West, it is seen as disrespectful in China.
Yang (NZCH, 27 May 2006, p.A1) also believed that the Chaff issue indicated that people have difference ideas about Mao’s role as a historical figure. Much has been published in the West that portrays Mao as an autocratic dictator. They do not understand how the Chinese have respect for Mao who they believe brought death and disaster to China. However, as Yang pointed out, many Chinese do not accept comments on their families when made by outsiders. Many Chinese do not agree with what Mao has done, but they do not let non-Chinese criticize him as in a symbolic sense he is the head of the Chinese national ‘family’ (as the founder of the modern Chinese state). Any vilification of Mao, by extension, also vilifies the Chinese people just as any criticism of the head of a family is felt by family members to be criticism of the family itself.

This article was perhaps the most important response from the local Chinese newspaper to the incident of the Chaff cover and will be analysed more fully in the next chapter.

Another Chinese response came in the Mandarin Pages (MP) of 20 May 2006. Dong Li, Senior Lecturer in Chinese at Massey University, argued that Chinese students should know more about Mao and his role in Chinese history. He said Mao had been venerated as the most respected leader in Chinese when he was actually a murderer and that Chinese students have been brainwashed by the government. Dong Li pointed out that millions of Chinese had lost their lives under his regime. He also agreed with the Chinese students at Massey New Zealand society has racist attitudes to Chinese people but he did not support the protest against Chaff. He believed that the students should accept diverse opinions and need to focus on more than practical subjects such as science, finance and economics. They should take the opportunity to understand more about China and its history (MP, 20 May 2006, P.A1;A5)
Illustration 1; *Chaff*, 16 May 2006, Cover.
Chapter 5. Analysis of Case Studies

A storm of abuse in the Chinese print media greeted iBall’s news report about Chinese prostitution in Auckland. The Mandarin Pages viewed it as a “disappointment”, “a shock”, a “calamity”, “a scandal and a disaster” (MP, 13 May 2006, p.A1). The New Zealand Chinese Herald, in a special editorial, felt that the report would “accelerate the deterioration of the Chinese community’s development in New Zealand”, and sternly accused the editors of betraying the trust of Chinese community (NZCH, 17 May 2006, p.B5). The Chinese Express saw the publication, iBall, and its report as “deplorable”, “a flagrant example of journalistic irresponsibility” and “a serious blow to the cause of good Chinese community newspaper” (CE, 16 May 2006, p.A5). In a similar way, the Chaff cover mocking Mao also evoked strong responses in the Chinese print media. The two case studies presented above illustrated tensions within the Chinese community about ideas of identity. This section is intended to analyse how these case studies can show such tensions and concerns within this particular diasporic community.

Cohen (1997, p. ix) argues that as all diasporic communities settle outside their natal (or imagined natal) territories, they acknowledge that the “old country” always has some claim on their loyalties and emotions. The cartoon of Mao clearly presented problems for some Chinese immigrants. In Chinese custom, a leader, especially a national leader, is not ridiculed. But this cartoon of Mao was obviously satirical. Something that seems so normal and routine as political satire in New Zealand society caused problems for many Chinese people. There was an obvious clash between the values of the host society and the traditional expectations of parts of diasporic Chinese community within New Zealand.

It was a clash of customs, loyalties and emotions. This was also clear in the case of iBall’s report about prostitution. Chinese regard prostitution as dirty and shameful. Some members of the New Zealand Chinese community believed that the reports about prostitution brought shame to the entire community. In effect the reports caused loss of face for the Chinese people in New Zealand. Fear of public shame or loss of
face is an important part of traditional Chinese social ethics. The phrase tiu mien tzu 丢面子 or “losing face” refers to public events where social performance has fallen below acceptable levels (Ho, 1976). It was felt by some that Chinese should show a clean face in public and that anyone who disagreed was not showing loyalty to the Chinese community. Further, according to this view the Chinese diasporic print media have a responsibility to protect the community. As Cohen (1997, p. ix) stated, a member’s adherence to a diasporic community is demonstrated by an acceptance of an inescapable link with their customs and history and a sense of co-ethnicity with others of a similar background. This clearly applies in this case. The Chinese custom is that people should never wash dirty laundry in public but iBall seemed to have done just that.

Some scholars such as Sklair (2001, pp. 255-288) have argued that globalization has an impact on people’s opinions and, through these opinions, on their identity. This is because people identify themselves with the opinions they hold and these opinions locate them in a group or society. Based on this concept of identity formation, it is possible to examine the likely significance of the New Zealand Chinese print media in shaping opinions and identity on the basis of these case studies.

According to Sklair holding similar “opinions about certain issues groups the opinion holders together, while different opinions tend to belong to either lower class or outsiders” (Sklair, 2001, p. 255). In the case study about Chinese student prostitution, Chinese who believed that iBall’s report shamed the Chinese community identified themselves as “pure” Chinese, regarding others who held different opinions as second-class Chinese or non-Chinese. On the other hand, Tan and many who wrote to support iBall, believed that he had the right to report on social issues even when they cast the Chinese community in a bad light. These people argued that they didn’t have to be “pure” Chinese to comment. They grouped themselves together as “English Educated” Chinese; white Chinese or Singaporean Chinese. Here, the reactions in the Chinese print media reflected the differing opinions and ideas of sub-cultural groups within the wider Chinese community who used the newspapers to contest dominant
ideas about identity that were being upheld by those who felt their identity depended on the maintenance of traditional Chinese values.

Sklair also points out that the print media shape and influence opinions as part of a person’s identity. In the case study concerning the Chairman Mao cartoon, many Chinese reacted strongly (such as the Massey students who staged a protest and the many people who commented on websites). Chinese newspapers discussed this issue by highlighting the importance of Mao in Chinese culture. As the founder of modern China he is more than a political figure to many Chinese. His status is something like that of “the father of the nation” and he is seen as an important spiritual leader in China. However, having pointed this out, most of newspapers reports then went on to suggest that Chinese people, particularly students, would benefit from gaining different views and knowledge about Mao while they were outside China as Western society treats Mao as an historical figure who can be questioned and criticised. The newspapers often pointed at the humorous nature of the cartoon and that understanding it was part of understanding the host culture of New Zealand. Here we can see this print media acting as a buffer between the diasporic community and host culture. The newspapers were explaining to the Chinese community that while many of them may put great importance on the veneration of Mao as part of their cultural identity, this identity was not being threatened by political satire such as the Chaff cover.

Culture can be thought of an umbrella that covers a wide range of activities. Qiu (2003, pp. 155-156) summarizes that such cultural continuity can be demonstrated at both the macro level, (such as the tradition of a nation) and micro level (as in a common lifestyle in a particular group). To promote this cultural continuity at both levels is exactly what Chinese print media do in their efforts at building an “imagined community”, especially since efforts have been made to mobilize common experiences and Chinese culture.

On the macro level, the Chinese who come to New Zealand from different parts of the world share common traditions, such as festivals and food. Such traditions will be
carried from generation to generation as long as they remain important. And often it does not matter if people are ethnically Chinese or whether they can speak Chinese. They carry on the traditions, and so they are regarded as under the umbrella of Chinese culture.

On the micro level, the Chinese community is divided into several layers by lifestyle, native language, modes of thinking and religions. When Malaysian Chinese re-immigrate to New Zealand, they bring a lifestyle from Malaysia which is different from those of China, Taiwan and Hong Kong. And a Taiwanese Chinese might have quite different political views from a Chinese from Mainland China. This is why in my case studies, some journalists and readers make such fine distinctions on the micro level as first class, or “pure”, and second class Chinese (David & Li, 2006; Li, 2006; J. Lim, 2006; M. Lim, 2006). Tan regarded himself as an ethnic Chinese (hua ren 华人). However, his identity was not the thing he was born with. His Chineseness was constructed by his reaction to his surrounding’s representations. For instance, he felt more Chinese in New Zealand than in Singapore. And as he stated, most New Zealanders regard him as Chinese even though English was his only language. On the other hand, from the case study, the Chinese people addressed Lincoln Tan as second class Chinese.

Furthermore, in Chinese culture, Chinese can “discern a unity of spirit” to which they find no parallel in Western Culture (Chai, 1957, pp. 47-50). This reflects the issue of collective versus individual cultural identity. Chinese heritage is built on a collective cultural identity. Many Chinese, especially those from mainland China, believe that Chinese people everywhere are part of one “family”. This family has a leader, (or imagined spiritual leader) who is Mao. This is based on Confucian teachings where any citizen should respect their governors, sons must respect elders, wives must respect husbands and so on. These ideas had ruled Chinese society for millennia and are undoubtedly part of Chinese cultural identity.

However, Western culture is more individualistic. Western people do not judge others by who they are or their social or political rank or status, but by what abilities they
have. For example, local New Zealanders would not blindly respect Helen Clark just because she is the prime minister. They would form judgements on the basis of her actions and policies. Mockery and satire are not seen as disrespectful of leaders in the same way that they are in Chinese culture.

One assumption about collective identity is that it simply reflects sentiments that connect families and kinship groups. Appadurai (1996, p. 35) explained that group sentiments that involve a strong sense of group identity draw on “smaller” attachments. Another is that like individuals, large groups have an “unconscious” that is the repository for every slight and injury experienced over time and that this is an expression of negative experiences (Appadurai, 1996, pp. 42-43).

These ideas can be linked. When Chaff mocked Chairman Mao it inflamed the Chinese “unconscious” because these people were away from their homeland and they turned to their traditional sense of collective identity and respect for Mao. Even if it was a joke, some Chinese took it as a racist attack and assumed the local mainstream society were against them. In China, people certainly joke about Mao. But, once they leave China, the diasporic group dynamics play out against a background where every slight and injury is remembered and traditional ideas of identity take on a heightened role.

According to Wanning “in general the formation and sustenance of any given collective Chinese identity outside China usually requires the healthy and continuous functioning of three institutions” (Wanning, 2005, p. 73). Firstly, there are Chinese social and business networks. Second, there is an education system which permits or even supports Chinese-language schools. Third there is a Chinese-language media industry with credible claims to sizable circulation and community representation. Suryadinata (1997, in Wanning, 2005, p.74) believes that these three pillars exist in conjunction with one another.

All three pillars apply to the New Zealand situation but with locally determined differences. The Chinese community in New Zealand have business and social
networks that have been existence for over one hundred years (Chou, 2000). New Zealand has a relatively small number of native Mandarin speakers. However, within New Zealand’s mainstream education system, students can learn Chinese as second language in some high schools and outside the mainstream education system, there is a range of private schools where Chinese is studied and taught. As for the third of Wanning’s pillars, there is a sizeable Chinese-language media industry in New Zealand. The New Zealand Chinese Herald has a Circulation of 15,000 copies per issue, and 45,000 copies per week and “The Chinese Express” Weekly circulation is over 14,000 copies which are delivered to over 300 shops.

Since these three pillars exist in New Zealand, it would seem that the diasporic Chinese community in New Zealand form and sustain a strong idea of its identity. As A. Appadurai has pointed out, the conjunction of media and migration means that what is imagined is no longer the “imagined community” of the nation-State, but numerous “diasporic public spheres” (1990, p.1). In Auckland, there are varied groups of Chinese, including migrants from old and new generations as well as re-immigrants from various Southeast Asian countries. Auckland is also the temporary home to many Chinese tertiary, secondary and language school students. Some of these aim to become permanent residents in New Zealand.

Besides eating Chinese food and speaking a Chinese language these people can practise “being” Chinese through Chinese language media and cultural products. More specifically, the conjunction of Chinese diasporic media and Chinese immigration means the Chinese community is possibly no longer an “imagined community” in New Zealand, but a “diasporic public sphere”. In my case studies Chinese newspapers provided channels for Chinese immigrants to express ideas and opinions and to mobilise in support or against certain social issues. Chinese

newspapers and other Chinese media reconstruct and reform ideas about the Chinese community. In Auckland, there are approximately ten different kinds of Chinese newspapers, Sky TV has variety of Chinese speaking channels from mainland China, Taiwan, Hong Kong and Singapore and www.Skykiwi.com is the most popular Chinese community website for both immigrants and students. Additionally many Chinese DVD shops exist in different parts of Auckland. All of these form the framework of New Zealand’s “Chinese (diasporic) public sphere”.

Sun Wanning (2005, p. 73) indicated that diasporic print media continue to play a central role in the life of various Chinese migrant groups in Australia. Australia and New Zealand are in some ways similar countries with reasonably similar histories of Chinese immigration and settlement patterns. It would seem that Wanning’s general proposition may also apply to New Zealand. For instance, the Chinese Mirror (镜报) is a mainland Chinese based newspaper which has links with Beijing Youth Daily (北京青年报) in order to get the latest news from and about China. On the other hand, the Mandarin Pages, a local content focused newspaper, attracts old immigrants and those from Hong Kong and Taiwan. Further, iBall serves those immigrants who cannot read Chinese and New Zealand born Chinese. All these newspapers serve different groups of Chinese within the wider community.

Secondly, all these newspapers relate to each other. For example, when iBall first reported on prostitution by Chinese students it received much criticism from other local Chinese newspapers. This controversy indicated the important role that this print media played in the diasporic community. It highlighted and played out competing ideas about shame, the public image of the Chinese community and the roles of the media. Those groups in the community who held traditional views on the “loss of face” and the face that they would like to present to the mainstream New Zealand community, felt their identity threatened by the publication of such articles and responded by denying the Chinese-ness or identity of the journalists who wrote them.

However, in the second case study, the Chinese print media took the role of “the voice of the Chinese community”. The response to the mocking of Mao on the part of some
Chinese, especially the students at Massey, was angry and hostile. The Chinese print media seemed to take on the role of peacemaker by using their pages to explain and explore the different attitudes held by the various groups involved. Rather than advocating a limited and particular version of Chinese identity, the newspapers tried to help their readers understand that such actions as the *Chaff* cover were not threats or insults but simply normal actions of the host culture. In effect, the Chinese newspapers here were explaining a form of cultural identity to a group who had felt their own sense of identity under threat. Taken together, the case studies clearly demonstrate how particular issues can be central to a diasporic group.
Chapter 6. Conclusion

The case studies analysed in this thesis reflected particular conflicts within the Chinese community and sites of negotiation between this community and mainstream society. The core arguments focused on the meaning of “Chinese-ness” and how to be Chinese in New Zealand. The two cases clearly presented the idea that the diversity of Chinese origins and the different stages at which they have arrived mean that Chinese groups in New Zealand are a microcosm of the differences in the Chinese diaspora.

The research has illuminated Cohen’s (1997) theory about some aspects of diasporic communities. Specifically, his idea that the loyalties of a diasporic community maybe claimed by a nation that is often buried deep in the language, religion or customs maintained by the diasporic community in the host country. Alternatively the case studies show how meanings are contested around issues of particular importance.

Nonetheless, the discussion of the idea of “pure Chinese” from the case studies highlighted Cohen’s point. Lincoln Tan was regarded by some as a “second class Chinese” or not really Chinese after he reported on an issue that some saw as shameful to the Chinese community. They saw him as betraying his loyalty to this imagined community. This was an issue involving a perceived lose of “face”, an idea that is very important in traditional Chinese culture. It may have been “buried deep” as Cohen would say but Tan’s articles brought it to the surface as still an important component of identity for many in New Zealand’s diasporic Chinese community especially when that community felt under threat. Similarly, the controversy of the cartoon of Chairman Mao showed Chinese ideas and customs about collectivism and respect to leaders clashing with Western ideas about individualism and political satire.

Furthermore, these case studies illustrated some of the ways in which members of the Chinese community located and identified themselves in this community through the opinions they expressed in the pages of the Chinese newspapers. As Sklair has pointed out, the opinions expressed were both a part of and means of constructing this identity. The process, a conjunction of media and migration, indicated that the
imaginary being constructed here was not so much a unified national one but rather a co-existing set of diasporic public spheres. This plurality of public spheres as mediated in the newspapers reflects a similar diversity of emerging notions of Chinese identity as they have been shaped under the social, political and economic conditions of the modern Chinese diaspora.

The issue I raised in the case studies concerned how the members of Chinese community positions themselves in New Zealand. And the local Chinese media provide a stage for them to express their points of view. The local Chinese media play vital roles for new immigrants, for the Chinese students studying in New Zealand, and for older immigrants maintaining their position in the Chinese community. However, there are a number of ‘gaps’ in this study of Chinese diasporic media. In terms of local Chinese newspapers, there are over twenty different kinds of newspapers in Auckland and there are many differences between their owners. Hence, their newspapers would almost certainly represent Chinese culture and identity differently. My research has not been able to investigate this to any great degree. However, if we take Chinese newspapers in New Zealand as a whole, they are going to play the function of enculturation or acculturation.

Throughout the history of New Zealand Chinese, every new wave of immigrants strengthened the community’s cultural identity through economic factors, providing news from “home” and reinvigorating traditional culture, and after the 1990s (when where was a very strong “wave”) Chinese community media built up very quickly. Now there are various kinds of newspapers, two radio stations, many magazines and CTV 8 (Chinese TV channel eight). No doubt, all these media play very vital functions in the Chinese community and there are several potential growth areas for research. For instance, controversial ideas about Chinese cultural identity appear on these. How do broadcast media deal with conflict? Do broadcast media help Chinese community members to acculturate or keep their identity as “pure Chinese”? How do Chinese media exist or co-operate with mainstream society?
Moreover, this thesis only focused on the Chinese newspapers in Auckland. But the Chinese community in other parts of New Zealand have their own newspapers, such as NZ Messengers (信报) in Christchurch, and Capital Chinese News (首都华文报) in Wellington. None of these newspapers was used in my study. But for future research, it would be very interesting to investigate how these newspapers represent local Chinese cultural identity and how this compares to my results for Auckland.

Apart from newspapers, there are also other media in the Chinese community. There are two main Chinese radio stations; AM936 and FM90.6 (FM 90.6 is Cantonese while AM936 is Mandarin). Some of the programs are very popular in the Chinese community and these tend to focus on current issues and migration. In terms of television, the community puts lots of efforts into Triangle TV (a community channel). Furthermore, web-blogs are very popular in the community, especially among Chinese students. Skykiwi.com is the most important here. Apart from posting some commercial information, it also provides for arguing, debating and discussing current issues in New Zealand. It not only involves all “kinds” of Chinese in New Zealand, but also engages some members of mainstream society and even Chinese in China or other parts of the world. Thus Skykiwi recedes the nation’s (land-scape) boundaries. My research would serve as a starting point for future investigation on radio, TV and web-blog representing the Chinese cultural identity.

And this thesis could also lead the further study to compare the New Zealand Chinese print media with other parts of the world. It would be very interesting to look into and compare the ways that New Zealand Chinese newspapers represented cultural identity with similar newspapers in the other parts of the world, (such as the United States of America, Australia).

The newspapers studied in this thesis may seem ephemeral and lightweight as print media. They are usually given away for free, they carry significant advertising and often employ very few reporters. To some they may not even be newspapers in the traditional sense of the word. However, they are important for many in the Chinese community and play varied roles. They can act as a site where the Chinese
community can negotiate issues with the mainstream community by bringing its own perspectives, ideas and language to the complex two-way flows of information that constitute these negotiations. This study has been a preliminary study of just some of the ways in which these publications are important for members of the Chinese community. Even in an age of digital global communication networks, print media can still play vital roles in the social and cultural lives of many communities.
References


Bibliography

Sociology, 32(3), 557-580.
Transnational Anthropology', in R.G. Fox. Interventions:
Anthropology of the Present.
globalization (Vol. v. 1). Minneapolis, Minn.: University of
Minnesota Press.
American Political Science Review, 70(2), 393-408.
Wadsworth Publishing Co.
A small price to pay: refugees from Hitler in New Zealand,
Zealand. In M. Ip (Ed.), Re-examining Chinese Transnationalism
in Australia - New Zealand (pp. 25-44). Canberra: CSCSD,
Australian National University.
Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences (3rd ed.,


David, & Li, S. (2006, 23 June). We are a greedy, envious, selfish and corrupted people. iBall, p. 11.


Lim, J. (2006, 10 July). Letter to the Editor: Pure chinese don't give a damn about democracy. iBall, p. 11.


Mitra, A. Diasporic Web Sites: Ingroup and Outgroup Discourse. 14(2), 158.


OT. (2006, 23 May). Massey University Chinese students protest: "This is not humour, it is abuse!" 梅西大学学生校园抗议: “这是玷污不是幽默”.


Roughan, J. (2006, 27th, May). All dirty laundry has much the same look. the New Zealand Herald.


Siew, J. (2006, 26 May). Letters to the Editor: Refreshing but don't forget the good things Asians are known for. iBall, p. 12.


Tan, L. (2006, 5 June). Minorities have a vital role in mainstream society. the New Zealand Herald.

Tan, L. (2006, 10 July). What, I'm Chinese? Banana forum to also discuss gay issues. iBall, p. 8.
Tan, L. (2006, 12 May). Why they became sex workers -- I want to show Mom I don't need her money. iBall, p. 4.


Williams, R. (1976). Keywords: a vocabulary of culture and society (Rev. and expanded ed.). London: Fontana.


Appendix

1. The front page of iBall on May 12, 2006

Hi Mom you cut me off
now I'm a hooker

It's better than kidnap or murder, say Asian students turning to sex work for "easy" money  Pgs 3-4

In NZ Herald: DANGER ZONE

They worry about face, but what about Sexually Transmitted Infections and other dangers of working in the sex industry. Julie Middleton reports in The NZ Herald.
Easy money too tempting for desperate people

SBD 134. Desperate Chick. Up to her neck in debt and several weeks behind in her rent, she has run out of friends whom she can ask for yet another loan.

With evictions staring her in the face as winter approaches, she is frantically considering a job in a massage parlour. Doesn’t matter that she knows next to nothing about bringing relief to aching muscles through shiatsu or acupressure. She can earn big bucks offering “special services.”

This is a real story, a tragedy that is unfolding. People in my office know this Asian girl who is thinking of becoming a sex worker when the solution to her problems is just a telephone call away.

This girl, let’s call her Mox X, is reluctant to call her mom for financial help because they had a falling out over her Pakistan ex-boyfriend who introduced her to P. She does not want to return to China because her mother is trying to marry her off to a man she does not love.

So far, her desire to be independent and self-sufficient has not been matched with an ability to hold down a job and the discipline to live within her means. Whatever earned was spent on expensive clothes and accessories and partying in trendyusty nights with her friends.

Now that she is broke, she is learning who her real friends are. Her homestay, the very people she used to hobnob with, have turned their backs on her. If she cannot pay her share of the rent, she is out in the cold.

There are many young women like Mox X who have come to NZ, ostensibly to study English and acquire other work skills so they can land better jobs after returning home. Sadly, quite a number of them fail to attain their objectives and face tough choices trying to overcome financial difficulties.

It’s also obvious that many of them have kept their parents in the dark about how they are really coping in NZ.

As recent incidents in NZ have shown, some make Asian students have resorted to criminal activities including extortion and kidnapping to resolve their financial difficulties.

In the case of some female Asian students, it would seem sex-for-sale is the answer. The hard choices Mox X has to make to overcome her financial difficulties bring into sharp focus the issue of growing Asian involvement in New Zealand’s sex industry.

As our reports (Pages 3, 4 and 5) indicate, an increasing number of Asian women including students are turning to the world’s oldest profession to earn quick money, taking advantage of the Labour Government’s prostitution law reform.

It would also seem that many of the Asian sex workers are not part of the New Zealand Prostitutes’ Collective, preferring to operate on their own in apartments or townhouses shared with others.

The wisdom of such impulsive ventures remain to be seen. According to the NZPC, they are exposing themselves to unnecessary risk of sexually transmitted infections (STI) and the overall deterioration of NZ health.

The Asian presence in the sex business has also taken on a new profile with the recent launching of a porn magazine featuring pictures of Asian girls in the nude and engaging in sex acts.

In this issue of iBall, we also highlight the wonderful Mother’s Day gift which long-time Takapuna resident Mary Norton received from her daughter Fiona and son Davey (Page 59).

As Kirsten booms her mom with Mother’s Day gifts and other treats, one may ask: What’s the present a Mother can get from her child half a world away?

Yes, a gift from NZ would be nice. But perhaps the best present a Mother can have is to hear her only child’s voice on the phone, expressing her gratitude for sacrifices made by her parents and pleading to work even harder. Knowing her child is alive and doing well is the best present.

As hope Mox X will listen to her friends. Swallow your pride, pick up that phone and call your Mom.
3. iBall: Asian cash in on porn boom

Asians cash in on porn boom

By Lincoln Eto

The Asian flavour in New Zealand’s sex industry is getting stronger now the legislation of prostitution.

An increasing number of women from China, Korea, Thailand, Malaysia and even Singapore are selling sex in Auckland through newspaper ads and Internet.

Many are making their own unlicensed single person operated brothels from central city apartments and suburban houses.

Auckland’s First Chinese pornographic magazine was released earlier this month.

Four interviews held with a number of Asian hookers, it would seem that they were motivated by easy money to support their lavish lifestyle rather than sex as normal jobs paying to buy food.

Chinese student, 21, said she became a sex worker when she ran out of options to finance her stay in New Zealand. She was also an act of defiance against her mother.

“Prostitution is legal in New Zealand. I put my body for money, so what?” she said in Mandarin. She said stripping and kooking are of Chinese tradition.

Hor (last name not given) got into sex work eight months ago when the police stopped her supporting her financially and it forced her to return to China. She was selling $150 in Auckland.

“My mother and father want me to have a Korean boyfriend, and that is why I dropped him, she said. I was giving me more money, she said. She told her that she could make me with money and I will find any way to earn money. I was in love with her, I didn’t need her or eat money.

Dora, 23, said she was selling $100 in Auckland to support her lifestyle, which included going out and kooking and being a “quality fashion accessories player” in the center city.

Resident living in an area where the brothels flourish and safety is generally for their safety, because men were returning at the same time, and drivers were being blocked.” He said, “In a family environment, and people should not be subjected to such facts.

A lot of the Chinese students come here are using it to get money, and when first few steps, they don’t know what to do.” He said. “They turn to prostitution, and sometimes even commit to criminal acts such as stealing and kidnapping to get money, but girls are forced into working as an ATM card to gain easy access to cash.”

One Chinese prostitute said that “like myself, many Chinese students are selling sex, because they want to get money,” she said. “So far, I have received some for money, and think it is a better choice than doing minimum wage.”

Sue (last name not given), 19, said that her clientele were mainly Pakeha and the reason she preferred Asian prostitution was because “we are cheaper” and not prepared to do drugs.

She said nearly of her clients were willing to pay a premium for sex without wasting condoms at any other form of payment.

This gives the main business normally transmitted infections (STI).

“The Chinese girls are changing more for low protection, and in our experience (tells), we found one woman having to work hard, had to wash clothes, and in another, there were caught in the act, one had to wash hands, she said.”

On a mood note, said Robertson. That is extremely dangerous.”

He added, NZPC’s committee included various age groups, and many of the Chinese girls lack knowledge of sexual health.

There is also a reluctance among them to join organizations such as the New Zealand Prostitutes’ Collective for fear that they would be involved.

“We Chinese are more concerned about that fact that sex is safe,” he said. “We are groups with the NZPC, it means that we are officially a prostitute and there will be a burden to say that we are one. We make our own safety demands on our clients.”

Keele Eto, an official of the NZPC in Auckland, says that Chinese sex workers are likely to be more cautious than others.

10 years ago, most Asian women were Chinese, and Chinese who need to increase as a reflection of the growing Chinese population.

She is concerned over the sexual activity of women who allow sex, without a condom because they can’t afford to any evidence of disease, and think that is OK.

Students on temporary visas can work 15 hours a week but are explicitly banned from working in brothels under the Immigration Act.

On the issue of students in prostitution, Catherine Hardy, an NZPC Wellington said.

“It’s not just Chinese. I think there are always people, but are explicitly banned from working in brothels under the Immigration Act.”

“Students need to be aware of their rights,” she said.

Chinese women who are sex workers and students have the right to work and study and live in New Zealand as sex workers.

People think that it’s OK but they have to be aware of their rights.”

Prostitute in Auckland is working as an ATM card to gain easy access to cash.”

On a mood note, said Robertson. That is extremely dangerous.”

He added, NZPC’s committee included various age groups, and many of the Chinese girls lack knowledge of sexual health.

There is also a reluctance among them to join organizations such as the New Zealand Prostitutes’ Collective for fear that they would be involved.

“We Chinese are more concerned about that fact that sex is safe,” he said. “We are groups with the NZPC, it means that we are officially a prostitute and there will be a burden to say that we are one. We make our own safety demands on our clients.”

Keele Eto, an official of the NZPC in Auckland, says that Chinese sex workers are likely to be more cautious than others.

10 years ago, most Asian women were Chinese, and Chinese who need to increase as a reflection of the growing Chinese population.

She is concerned over the sexual activity of women who allow sex, without a condom because they can’t afford to any evidence of disease, and think that is OK.

Students on temporary visas can work 15 hours a week but are explicitly banned from working in brothels under the Immigration Act.

On the issue of students in prostitution, Catherine Hardy, an NZPC Wellington said.

“It’s not just Chinese. I think there are always people, but are explicitly banned from working in brothels under the Immigration Act.”

“Students need to be aware of their rights,” she said.

Chinese women who are sex workers and students have the right to work and study and live in New Zealand as sex workers.

People think that it’s OK but they have to be aware of their rights.”
4. iBall: Why they became sex workers

5. iBall: Happy hooker still studying for business degree

Why they became sex workers

I want to show Mom I don't need her money

She'll now a position and Momo her mother in China for 9.

"I once had a Kiwi boyfriend. She could not accept that and thought she offered sex money to control me," Dora said. "I want to prove to her that she cannot do that and I don't need her money."

Dora (her stage name), 21, came to Auckland from Shanghai two years ago. She knows English and later she does business studies at a private school, which she did not complete. Her monthly allowance from her parents was then about $10,000.

She had a 64-year-old Kiwi boyfriend and wanted to bring him back to China to meet her mother. That's what Dora told him after that "I will make love to you."

"My mother wanted me to have a Chinese boyfriend and said the woman wanted to go back to China. Unfortunately, if I continued seeing my Kiwi boyfriend," Dora said, "she told me that she would ask my dad to change the money."

Her parents stopped sending money to her about 10 months ago and she has stopped considering their offers.

Dora said she felt lost after her parents stopped sending money and worked as a supermarket manager for minimum wages. She now could not feel her daughter's pain included living in a central city studio apartment, drinking her booze in the morning, and doing some daily tasks.

In the future, Dora's boyfriend will her another Chinese girl and she wants her to start earning money from other things but they stopped when they found out she was in the position to pay them back.

Dora was introduced to sex work by a friend who worked at a national city police. She started advertising her services in the local English paper because she was told "Kiwi men are better."

"Selling sex is just like any other business but money is not enough," Dora said. "I think in New Zealand, we are not doing anything wrong."

Eight months ago, she had her first client - a European man, about 40, or her regular client. She got paid $500 for about 20 minutes. Dora says she always book them that fixed appointment to attract more clients and she went up to eight clients a day.

Apart from the work, Dora is a student at the University of Auckland, doing a business degree.

She says she has now a "physical doctor" on call to do his job, "I'm not worried or fear for her performance as a sex worker."

She still believes that is "no worrying" herself with organizations like the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective, she is not an "outfit" prostitute and will not have a record of having been one when she eventually leaves NZ.

"I never make sure for me what I am doing. I just think I am lucky and have a handsome body and it is a shock to her."

Dora said.

Happy hooker still studying for business degree

FROM high school student to part-time prostitute while she pursues a degree in Business Management - Sure is making the best of an unusual situation.

She went to New Zealand with her parents in 2012 and attended an Auckland high school. When her father could not get work and her mother's small business failed, they wanted her to move back to Korea with them for an extended family. The plan failed after experiencing the freedom she got from every city bar on not only as a family, but also love money to send back to her parents for Korean New Year.

After finishing high school, she worked in an Asian grocery shop, where the woman worked. This was not enough to pay $150 weekly and the woman left for business.

One of her friends suggests the industry.

"I was looking at ways where I can get fast money and I found out it was classifieds, there were 900 ads for work at night," she said. "But if it is for the girls, they just become a community.

Since I know how to work in the community, I may be able to find out to do a lot of things to keep myself healthy." She bought a pre-prepared mobile phone and that can earn her at least $800 in the classifieds. She said, "I can't think if the girl is not for the fun."

Since I know how to work in the community, I may be able to do a lot of things to keep myself healthy."

Such claims are a challenge to character and "men's people of their town."

"If I'm there they're going to pay me, I won't even give them my name."

"I have never been in an "outfitting" myself with organizations like the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective, she is not an "outfit" prostitute and will not have a record of having been one when she eventually leaves NZ."

"I have my own job to do and I think I am lucky and have a handsome body that pays me well," she said. "I need to have to watch the money I spend."

Although she is aware of the New Zealand Prostitutes Collective, she said that she is not approaching them for help and that the sex workers are not registered as a "pimp."

"I don't want my friends to know, they will think I am a prostitute and I'm not the fact that I am selling my body," she said. "I am happy doing what I do and I don't want any bad things to happen to me."

I run a good paying business job one day"
They said NO

Shandong stunner resists temptation for sake of my future husband

By Vivian Loy

Sioux Student Sarah Wang has
been offered a director and her
university
family
became a ‘little wild’, as a
response.

Another man offered the
tall, petite part-time model $20,000 to
be her boyfriend for a week.

Last year, she was offered $2,000 to
be a model in New Zealand.

She declined all the offers, but
she was not surprised that some girls
were tempted.

"I think it’s a bit much," she said.

She is currently studying business
and is planning to study law in the
future.

Kiki runs for cover from nude pix offer

A student at AUT said she was
"absolutely disgusted" when she
was offered the nude photos.

"Why me?" she said. "I just want to
earn some pocket money." She
said the nude photos were illeagle
and had been sold to a local
magazine.

"I know some Chinese girls who
have been approached by porn
magazines," she said.

"I think it’s a bit much," she said.

She said it was a bit scary, but
she was happy that the
magazine had been shut down.

"I think the media is a bit too
realistic," she said.

"I know some Chinese girls who
have been approached by porn
magazines," she said.

"I think it’s a bit much," she said.

She said it was a bit scary, but
she was happy that the
magazine had been shut down.

"I think the media is a bit too
realistic," she said.

"I know some Chinese girls who
have been approached by porn
magazines," she said.

"I think it’s a bit much," she said.

She said it was a bit scary, but
she was happy that the
magazine had been shut down.

"I think the media is a bit too
realistic," she said.
Chinese students take on sex for cash

A growing number of young Chinese women who come to Auckland as students are turning to prostitution. Julie Middleton and Lincoln Tan investigate.

This story is a joint investigation by Julie Middleton of the Herald and Lincoln Tan, the managing editor of Shill, a fortnightly English-language Asian newspaper, available in Auckland. Its latest edition, out today, investigates Chinese prostitution.

The number of foreign prostitutes in Auckland has jumped in the last three years, as young Chinese students look beyond the classroom. A study shows a 25 per cent increase in foreign sex workers since prostitution was legalised by the Prostitution Reform Act in 1998. One in 10 young Chinese women are sex workers, according to the study.

Many of those were students aged between 18 and 20, who told the Herald they were drawn to prostitution as a means of earning extra money while they worked on their homework and part-time jobs. In an extended interview, Shill reporter Li Min, 22, who works in a massage parlour, said her clients often asked her to provide sexual services.

"These are my friends, and they are all doing it," she said. "I think they are doing it because they want to earn some extra money."

Others, such as Su Juan, who has been working in a massage parlour for two years, said they were lured into the industry by the promise of an easier lifestyle.

"I used to work in a restaurant, but it was very hard," she said. "I wanted to make more money, so I started working in a massage parlour."

According to the study, the number of young Chinese women working in prostitution has increased by 30 per cent in the last three years. The study also found that an increasing number of young Chinese women are turning to prostitution to support themselves financially.

"They are trying to make ends meet," said Li Min. "They are trying to pay their rent and their tuition fees."

Despite the increase in the number of young Chinese women working in prostitution, the study found that many were not aware of the legal framework that governs the industry. Many said they were unaware of the legal requirements that must be met to operate as a sex worker.

"I didn't know anything about the law," said Su Juan. "I just started working in a massage parlour and I didn't think about the legal requirements."

The study also found that many young Chinese women were being exploited by massage parlour operators, who charged them high fees for their services.

"They charge me a lot of money," said Su Juan. "I only get a very small amount of the money that I earn."

The study recommended that more education be provided to young Chinese women about the legal framework that governs the industry, and that more resources be dedicated to supporting young Chinese women who are struggling to make ends meet.

"We need to provide more support for young Chinese women," said Li Min. "They need to be able to earn a living without resorting to prostitution."

At the same time, the study found that many young Chinese women were not aware of the risks associated with prostitution, and that they were not able to make informed decisions about their participation in the industry.

"They don't know the risks," said Su Juan. "They don't know the consequences of their actions."

The study recommended that more resources be dedicated to providing education and support to young Chinese women, in order to help them make informed decisions about their participation in the industry.

"We need to provide more education and support," said Li Min. "We need to help young Chinese women make informed decisions about their lives."

All the same, the study found that many young Chinese women were not experiencing the same risks as other sex workers, and that they were not being exploited by massage parlour operators.

"They are not being exploited," said Su Juan. "They are not being taken advantage of."

The study recommended that more resources be dedicated to supporting young Chinese women, and that more education be provided to them about the legal framework that governs the industry.

"We need to provide more support and education," said Li Min. "We need to help young Chinese women make informed decisions about their lives."

All the same, the study found that many young Chinese women were not experiencing the same risks as other sex workers, and that they were not being exploited by massage parlour operators.
有报道指奥克兰华人娼妓数目急升 -- 以留学生为主

（華資訊）有報道指出，奧克蘭的國際學生現成問題日趨嚴重，曾有數以百計的中國留学生在當地犯罪。讀者指出，中國留學生在當地犯罪的數目急升，以留學生為主。
女留学生和旅游者为钱来奥克兰当妓女误为合法

1. 中国女留学生在中国和美国的大学中学习，并且在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

2. 据报道，这些女留学生和旅游者为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

3. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

4. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

5. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

6. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

7. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

8. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

9. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

10. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

11. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

12. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

13. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

14. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

15. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

16. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

17. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

18. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

19. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。

20. 这些女留学生和旅游者在中国和美国的华人社区中找到了工作。她们中的许多人为了赚取额外的钱，开始在奥克兰从事性服务。虽然她们知道这在奥克兰是非法的，但她们仍然在这样做，因为她们需要钱。
也谈紐西蘭中文媒體的良知

作者：南太井醚（摘自新西兰中文《世界日报》）

我们都知道，媒体是一种社会公器，其职责是引领社会正义。但近年来，中文媒体却在纽西兰等地出现了一系列令人担忧的情况。新闻从业人员及读者的知情权、言论自由权等基本权利被侵犯，而一些媒体则成为了政治工具，甚至成为某些利益集团的代言人。

在纽西兰，中文媒体的良知问题已经引起了广泛关注。一些媒体为了追求商业利益，不惜牺牲新闻的公正性。这种行为不仅违背了媒体的基本职责，也违反了新闻职业道德。

作为媒体从业人员，我们应该清醒地认识到，媒体的职责不仅仅是传播信息，更重要的是引导社会舆论。只有公正、客观的报道，才能赢得读者的信任。

我建议，我们应当建立一个长期的、系统的媒体监督机制，以确保媒体能够真正履行其职责。同时，我们也应该加强对媒体职业伦理的教育，提高从业人员的职业素养。

让我们一起行动起来，为纽西兰中文媒体的良知发声。

81
New Zealand Chinese Herald: iBall what are you doing?
iBall在做什么？

在《亚洲新闻台报导》的评论中，Lincoln Tan先生批评了政府在处理学生问题上的不足，认为学生与警察之间的冲突实际上是由于政府未能有效沟通和处理学生诉求所导致的。Lincoln Tan先生提到，学生与警察之间的冲突是在政府未能有效沟通和处理学生诉求所导致的。Lincoln Tan先生认为，政府应该更加积极地与学生沟通，了解他们的需求和诉求，以避免类似冲突再次发生。

Lincoln Tan先生还指出，政府应该更加积极地与学生沟通，了解他们的需求和诉求，以避免类似冲突再次发生。他强调，政府应该采取更加开放和包容的态度，尊重学生的权利和诉求，以促进社会的和谐发展。
Selective trials

WTV: Selective Trials

最近紐西蘭媒體對華裔族群的報導越來越多，使得WTV社區似乎也開始關注與她們一起生活多年的華人社群。但是這樣的報導往往讓我感到困惑。這些報導常被視為對華人社群的不公，但是從報導內容上來說，這顯示出華人社群並沒有受到同等的報導待遇。

這些報導往往被認為是為了報導華人社區的社會問題，但是這些報導往往被視為是為華人社群製造負面形象。例如在報導華人社區的社會問題時，往往会被報導為是因為華人社區的犯罪率過高，而不是因為華人社群的經濟困境。

報導會被誤解為是華人社群的問題，而不是因為報導本身的原因。例如在報導華人社區的犯罪率時，報導會被誤解為是因為華人社群的犯罪率過高，而不是因為報導本身的原因。例如在報導華人社區的犯罪率時，報導會被誤解為是因為華人社群的犯罪率過高，而不是因為報導本身的原因。例如在報導華人社區的犯罪率時，報導會被誤解為是因為華人社群的犯罪率過高，而不是因為報導本身的原因。例如在報導華人社區的犯罪率時，報導會被誤解為是因為華人社群的犯罪率過高，而不是因為報導本身的原因。例如在報導華人社區的犯罪率時，報導會被誤解為是因為華人社群的犯罪率過高，而不是因為報導本身的原因。
It is not the job of a journalist to support blindly the community from which he springs.

A few individuals took it upon themselves to become the guardians of Chinese face. They felt that a report on Chinese minorities was an attack on the entire community and they went on the offensive — through phone calls to the media, emails and online.

On one Chinese website the discussion forums were filled with angry accusations that the Herald was attacking the Chinese community and there were calls from its members to "stand back the Chinese". In another, there was a call for all Chinese from Taiwan, Hong Kong and beyond — to stand united to "save the face of Chinese" by speaking out against New Zealanders.

The tone and some of the language was comparable to white supremacist websites. The words used were divisive and emotive.

A Chinese website editor insists that the discussions were harmless and that the forums were just an avenue for a community largely ignored by mainstream media to "let off steam".

He said many Chinese here suffered from low esteem because they could not get jobs in line with their qualifications and experienced difficulties in integration. The internet provided a platform for them to express their thoughts without the need to "expose their identities".

Perhaps that might explain the email sent under the banner of "United China" to off.shelf saying: "They say you are Chinese but they don't treat Chinese, so if you want to be one of us you must unite with us. I hope you consider your colour and stand united with the people of China in NZ so you can one day become first class Chinese to us and stop taking tithe of white people."

I observed this email to the Chinese website operator and he commented sadly that some Chinese still believed in the myth of China's inherent superiority.

He said that there was no such thing as a "United China". On his website forums he found that Southern Chinese resented Northerners, local Chinese disagreed with international students on most things, and older Chinese had completely different views to younger ones. How can anyone be a spokesperson or the protector for the entire community?"
To live our parents’ dreams

New Zealand is seen as a ticket to a better life; to good academic qualifications that could lead to important jobs.

“Some have been sidetracked from the simple privileged tasks their parents sent them here for — to study, enjoy New Zealand and get a head start.”

will be their children’s ticket to a better life giving them good academic qualifications that could lead them to prestigious jobs. Perhaps also get a New Zealand passport allowing them to travel the world freely.

They must hope that in future their children will not be allowed to get away with anything, that they will be held accountable for their actions.

I still recall the day when my sister opened a letter and was so excited that she had been accepted into Singapore’s university.

As if it were a mid-life crisis, I went to see Mom and Dad and shared my joy. I was so excited that I wanted to share it with my parents.

I never knew the sacrifices Dad had made for us, because life had been good for me and I was growing up never having had any hunger. I was so used to being well-fed.

It is easy to believe that if we were well-fed it would be easy to get through life. It is easy to believe that if we were well-fed it would be easy to get through life.

I have always wanted to be a writer, to be able to express my thoughts and feelings. I have always wanted to be a writer, to be able to express my thoughts and feelings.

As a father I am maritally understanding — and was reminded of this when recently working on stories relating to Chinese students in New Zealand.

The students we see around us are the first batch of Chinese to reach adulthood since the implementation of the one-child policy in the 80s. They are precious to their parents.

As Nancy Hu, the president of the NZ Chinese Students’ Association, puts it: “Because the law only allows one child, Chinese parents would sacrifice everything and place all their hopes for the future on their only child. ”

Unlike Dad, their sacrifices may not be financial. But letting go of their only child, entrusting them to the unknown, must be difficult.

But like Dad, their parents will be living their own dreams in these students. Going overseas for further studies or learning English in a Western country must surely have been their dreams, too.

They must hope that New Zealand will be their children’s ticket to a better life giving them good academic qualifications that could lead them to prestigious jobs. Perhaps also get a New Zealand passport allowing them to travel the world freely.

With me living in New Zealand, Dad now gets to live his dreams when he makes regular visits.

Some of these students would be in a position where they, too, can help their parents live their dreams — and perhaps repay them a little for the sacrifices that they have made.

I dropped off my son Ryan at school. I think I finally understood what Dad told me about his dreams behind leaving Singapore. Parents do live their dreams in their children.

To Ryan, I am living my dream, as I watch him grow in a land with green pastures and mountains to climb — to the things that I, too, only dreamed of doing as a child.

I dream that one day, after he has run around the playground, he will climb the highest mountain, say he is ready.

Then, when he plays the flag, I will be standing beside him, his very proud dad.

— Lincoln Tan is managing editor of iSilal, a free fortnightly English language Asian newspaper.
Real news better for minorities

It takes courage for a minority to accept open public discussion of its problems. People want to be heard. If people are heard, they will learn to accept and respect the views of others.

New Zealand Herald: Real news better for minorities

15. New Zealand Herald: Real news better for minorities
What, I'm Chinese?

Banana forum to also discuss gay issues

By Lincoln Tan

ANOTHER "banana conference" is aimed at exploring the shifting nature of multiple identities confronting people of mixed parentage.

We spoke to journalist Joanna Wei, whose mixed background as a Chinese New Zealander was not an issue when she was growing up.

"I was born in New Zealand and spent most of my time in New Zealand," she said. "My Chinese heritage was never a problem." But she said her parents were always proud of her Chinese heritage.

The conference, called "Going Banana: Multiple Identities in New Zealand," will also address the issues of identity and assimilation. It will be held on Aug. 12.

"The conference aims to explore the diversity of New Zealand's Chinese community and how it has evolved over the years," said speaker Ken Lui, a professor at Auckland University.

Lui said the conference will bring together Chinese from different backgrounds to discuss the challenges of being Chinese in New Zealand.

The conference will be held at the University of Auckland on Aug. 12. For more information, visit www.gocic.org.nz.
Time to pull together

We have the numbers to make them take notice of us

By Linda Tan

This Chinese community has become major players in New Zealand business alongside their entry into community associations and even elected representation.

‘Doing so will make mainstream New Zealanders see them in a different light – as dynamic Kiwis with strong connections to Asia, which is an important market for the country’s exporters than Europe or America.’

With a population of more than 160,000, young and senior are beginning to have the numbers to make an impact in NZ, says lingering in an executive professor of Asian Studies at Auckland University.

‘Having the numbers speak louder, businesses and media will respond to the Chinese community growing a different light,’ she said. ‘It’s not surprising that this community are the more visible than ever before.’

The New Zealand Chinese

The Chinese (25 per cent) are ‘new Asians’ who arrived after 1981 from countries like Hong Kong, Taiwan, Malaysia, Singapore and Hanseland China.

‘Our generation is familiar to the old settlers and new immigrants. We are already developing a new identity and a new community.’

A man representing the long-established local born community felt that he should be spoken for. ‘I was born here. My ancestors were founded into the 1800s,’ he said.

However, a new generation of Hong Kong, the medical doctor of Professor, had a different opinion. ‘How can you speak for the Chinese? You can’t even speak Chinese properly.’

Professor is said that the new generation of Chinese community members should work in order to work towards a common goal for all.

But New Zealand also has to change its outlook towards Asian race.

“Asian communities have given New Zealand a chance to develop a diverse and multicultural society could be like,” Professor tip said. But, they are still treated as ‘strangers’ rather than ‘foreign citizens’ by New Zealand’s.

She said New Zealand should embrace the Chinese and Asians here, otherwise “we are only including strangers in our environment.”

The economies of China and East Asia are growing fast, and the new Asian community can be the link New Zealand needs to build networks and trade relationships with Asia.

* Map of the world was provided by Auckland, China and immigration to New Zealand in the 1950s. She is a professor of Chinese at the Auckland University, and is a Young Chinese member of the Chinese community. She’s current research is on interaction between Maori and Chinese.

89
18. Chairman Mao’s Cartoon